

---

## Poisson and Other Discrete Distributions

The Poisson distribution arises as a limit of the binomial distribution. This chapter contains a brief discussion of some of its fundamental properties as well as the Poisson limit theorem for null arrays of integer-valued random variables. The chapter also discusses the binomial and negative binomial distributions.

### 1.1 The Poisson Distribution

A random variable  $X$  is said to have a *binomial distribution*  $\text{Bi}(n, p)$  with parameters  $n \in \mathbb{N}_0 := \{0, 1, 2, \dots\}$  and  $p \in [0, 1]$  if

$$\mathbb{P}(X = k) = \text{Bi}(n, p; k) := \binom{n}{k} p^k (1 - p)^{n-k}, \quad k = 0, \dots, n, \quad (1.1)$$

where  $0^0 := 1$ . In the case  $n = 1$  this is the *Bernoulli distribution* with parameter  $p$ . If  $X_1, \dots, X_n$  are independent random variables with such a Bernoulli distribution, then their sum has a binomial distribution, that is

$$X_1 + \dots + X_n \stackrel{d}{=} X, \quad (1.2)$$

where  $X$  has the distribution  $\text{Bi}(n, p)$  and where  $\stackrel{d}{=}$  denotes equality in distribution. It follows that the expectation and variance of  $X$  are given by

$$\mathbb{E}[X] = np, \quad \text{Var}[X] = np(1 - p). \quad (1.3)$$

A random variable  $X$  is said to have a *Poisson distribution*  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$  with parameter  $\gamma \geq 0$  if

$$\mathbb{P}(X = k) = \text{Po}(\gamma; k) := \frac{\gamma^k}{k!} e^{-\gamma}, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0. \quad (1.4)$$

If  $\gamma = 0$ , then  $\mathbb{P}(X = 0) = 1$ , since we take  $0^0 = 1$ . Also we allow  $\gamma = \infty$ ; in this case we put  $\mathbb{P}(X = \infty) = 1$  so  $\text{Po}(\infty; k) = 0$  for  $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$ .

The Poisson distribution arises as a limit of binomial distributions as

follows. Let  $p_n \in [0, 1]$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , be a sequence satisfying  $np_n \rightarrow \gamma$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , with  $\gamma \in (0, \infty)$ . Then, for  $k \in \{0, \dots, n\}$ ,

$$\binom{n}{k} p_n^k (1 - p_n)^{n-k} = \frac{(np_n)^k}{k!} \cdot \frac{(n)_k}{n^k} \cdot (1 - p_n)^{-k} \cdot \left(1 - \frac{np_n}{n}\right)^n \rightarrow \frac{\gamma^k}{k!} e^{-\gamma}, \quad (1.5)$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , where

$$(n)_k := n(n-1) \cdots (n-k+1) \quad (1.6)$$

is the  $k$ -th *descending factorial* (of  $n$ ) with  $(n)_0$  interpreted as 1.

Suppose  $X$  is a Poisson random variable with finite parameter  $\gamma$ . Then its expectation is given by

$$\mathbb{E}[X] = e^{-\gamma} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} k \frac{\gamma^k}{k!} = e^{-\gamma} \gamma \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{\gamma^{k-1}}{(k-1)!} = \gamma. \quad (1.7)$$

The *probability generating function* of  $X$  (or of  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$ ) is given by

$$\mathbb{E}[s^X] = e^{-\gamma} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{\gamma^k}{k!} s^k = e^{-\gamma} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(\gamma s)^k}{k!} = e^{\gamma(s-1)}, \quad s \in [0, 1]. \quad (1.8)$$

It follows that the *Laplace transform* of  $X$  (or of  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$ ) is given by

$$\mathbb{E}[e^{-tX}] = \exp[-\gamma(1 - e^{-t})], \quad t \geq 0. \quad (1.9)$$

Formula (1.8) is valid for each  $s \in \mathbb{R}$  and (1.9) is valid for each  $t \in \mathbb{R}$ . A calculation similar to (1.8) shows that the *factorial moments* of  $X$  are given by

$$\mathbb{E}[(X)_k] = \gamma^k, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0, \quad (1.10)$$

where  $(0)_0 := 1$  and  $(0)_k := 0$  for  $k \geq 1$ . Equation (1.10) implies that

$$\text{Var}[X] = \mathbb{E}[X^2] - \mathbb{E}[X]^2 = \mathbb{E}[(X)_2] + \mathbb{E}[X] - \mathbb{E}[X]^2 = \gamma. \quad (1.11)$$

We continue with a characterisation of the Poisson distribution.

**Proposition 1.1** *An  $\mathbb{N}_0$ -valued random variable  $X$  has distribution  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$  if and only if, for every function  $f: \mathbb{N}_0 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_+$ , we have*

$$\mathbb{E}[Xf(X)] = \gamma \mathbb{E}[f(X+1)]. \quad (1.12)$$

*Proof* By a similar calculation to (1.7) and (1.8) we obtain for any function  $f: \mathbb{N}_0 \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_+$  that (1.12) holds. Conversely, if (1.12) holds for all such functions  $f$ , then we can make the particular choice  $f := \mathbf{1}_{\{k\}}$  for  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , to obtain the recursion

$$k \mathbb{P}(X = k) = \gamma \mathbb{P}(X = k - 1).$$

This recursion has (1.4) as its only (probability) solution, so the result follows.  $\square$

### 1.2 Relationships Between Poisson and Binomial Distributions

The next result says that if  $X$  and  $Y$  are independent Poisson random variables, then  $X + Y$  is also Poisson and the conditional distribution of  $X$  given  $X + Y$  is binomial:

**Proposition 1.2** *Let  $X$  and  $Y$  be independent with distributions  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$  and  $\text{Po}(\delta)$ , respectively, with  $0 < \gamma + \delta < \infty$ . Then  $X + Y$  has distribution  $\text{Po}(\gamma + \delta)$  and*

$$\mathbb{P}(X = k \mid X + Y = n) = \text{Bi}(n, \gamma/(\gamma + \delta); k), \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_0, k = 0, \dots, n.$$

*Proof* For  $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$  and  $k \in \{0, \dots, n\}$ ,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{P}(X = k, X + Y = n) &= \mathbb{P}(X = k, Y = n - k) = \frac{\gamma^k e^{-\gamma}}{k!} \frac{\delta^{n-k}}{(n-k)!} e^{-\delta} \\ &= e^{-(\gamma+\delta)} \binom{n}{k} \left(\frac{\gamma}{\gamma + \delta}\right)^k \left(\frac{\delta}{\gamma + \delta}\right)^{n-k} \\ &= \text{Po}(\gamma + \delta; n) \text{Bi}(n, \gamma/(\gamma + \delta); k), \end{aligned}$$

and the assertions follow.  $\square$

Let  $Z$  be an  $\mathbb{N}_0$ -valued random variable and let  $Z_1, Z_2, \dots$  be a sequence of independent random variables that have a Bernoulli distribution with parameter  $p \in [0, 1]$ . If  $Z$  and  $(Z_n)_{n \geq 1}$  are independent, then the random variable

$$X := \sum_{j=1}^Z Z_j \tag{1.13}$$

is called a  $p$ -thinning of  $Z$ , where we set  $X := 0$  if  $Z = 0$ . This means that the conditional distribution of  $X$  given  $Z = n$  is binomial with parameters  $n$  and  $p$ .

The following partial converse of Proposition 1.2 is a noteworthy property of the Poisson distribution.

**Proposition 1.3** *Let  $p \in [0, 1]$ . Let  $Z$  have a Poisson distribution with parameter  $\gamma \geq 0$  and let  $X$  be a  $p$ -thinning of  $Z$ . Then  $X$  and  $Z - X$  are independent and Poisson distributed with parameters  $p\gamma$  and  $(1 - p)\gamma$ , respectively.*

*Proof* We may assume that  $\gamma > 0$ . The result follows once we have shown that

$$\mathbb{P}(X = m, Z - X = n) = \text{Po}(p\gamma; m) \text{Po}((1-p)\gamma; n), \quad m, n \in \mathbb{N}_0. \quad (1.14)$$

Since the conditional distribution of  $X$  given  $Z = m + n$  is binomial with parameters  $m + n$  and  $p$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{P}(X = m, Z - X = n) &= \mathbb{P}(Z = m + n) \mathbb{P}(X = m \mid Z = m + n) \\ &= \left( \frac{e^{-\gamma} \gamma^{m+n}}{(m+n)!} \right) \binom{m+n}{m} p^m (1-p)^n \\ &= \left( \frac{p^m \gamma^m}{m!} \right) e^{-p\gamma} \left( \frac{(1-p)^n \gamma^n}{n!} \right) e^{-(1-p)\gamma}, \end{aligned}$$

and (1.14) follows.  $\square$

### 1.3 The Poisson Limit Theorem

The next result generalises (1.5) to sums of Bernoulli variables with unequal parameters, among other things.

**Proposition 1.4** *Suppose for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  that  $m_n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $X_{n,1}, \dots, X_{n,m_n}$  are independent random variables taking values in  $\mathbb{N}_0$ . Let  $p_{n,i} := \mathbb{P}(X_{n,i} \geq 1)$  and assume that*

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \max_{1 \leq i \leq m_n} p_{n,i} = 0. \quad (1.15)$$

Assume further that  $\lambda_n := \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} p_{n,i} \rightarrow \gamma$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , where  $\gamma > 0$ , and that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} \mathbb{P}(X_{n,i} \geq 2) = 0. \quad (1.16)$$

Let  $X_n := \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} X_{n,i}$ . Then for  $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$  we have

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(X_n = k) = \text{Po}(\gamma; k). \quad (1.17)$$

*Proof* Let  $X'_{n,i} := \mathbf{1}\{X_{n,i} \geq 1\} = \min\{X_{n,i}, 1\}$  and  $X'_n := \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} X'_{n,i}$ . Since  $X'_{n,i} \neq X_{n,i}$  if and only if  $X_{n,i} \geq 2$ , we have

$$\mathbb{P}(X'_n \neq X_n) \leq \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} \mathbb{P}(X_{n,i} \geq 2).$$

By assumption (1.16) we can assume without restriction of generality that

$X'_{n,i} = X_{n,i}$  for all  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $i \in \{1, \dots, m_n\}$ . Moreover it is no loss of generality to assume for each  $(n, i)$  that  $p_{n,i} < 1$ . We then have

$$\mathbb{P}(X_n = k) = \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq m_n} p_{n,i_1} p_{n,i_2} \cdots p_{n,i_k} \frac{\prod_{j=1}^{m_n} (1 - p_{n,j})}{(1 - p_{n,i_1}) \cdots (1 - p_{n,i_k})}. \tag{1.18}$$

Let  $\mu_n := \max_{1 \leq i \leq m_n} p_{n,i}$ . Since  $\sum_{j=1}^{m_n} p_{n,j}^2 \leq \lambda_n \mu_n \rightarrow 0$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , we have

$$\log \left( \prod_{j=1}^{m_n} (1 - p_{n,j}) \right) = \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} (-p_{n,j} + O(p_{n,j}^2)) \rightarrow -\gamma \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty, \tag{1.19}$$

where the function  $O(\cdot)$  satisfies  $\limsup_{r \rightarrow 0} |r|^{-1} |O(r)| < \infty$ . Also,

$$\inf_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq m_n} (1 - p_{n,i_1}) \cdots (1 - p_{n,i_k}) \geq (1 - \mu_n)^k \rightarrow 1 \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty. \tag{1.20}$$

Finally, with  $\sum_{i_1, \dots, i_k \in \{1, 2, \dots, m_n\}}^\#$  denoting summation over all ordered  $k$ -tuples of distinct elements of  $\{1, 2, \dots, m_n\}$ , we have

$$k! \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq m_n} p_{n,i_1} p_{n,i_2} \cdots p_{n,i_k} = \sum_{i_1, \dots, i_k \in \{1, 2, \dots, m_n\}}^\# p_{n,i_1} p_{n,i_2} \cdots p_{n,i_k},$$

and

$$\begin{aligned} 0 &\leq \left( \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} p_{n,i} \right)^k - \sum_{i_1, \dots, i_k \in \{1, 2, \dots, m_n\}}^\# p_{n,i_1} p_{n,i_2} \cdots p_{n,i_k} \\ &\leq \binom{k}{2} \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} p_{n,i}^2 \left( \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} p_{n,j} \right)^{k-2}, \end{aligned}$$

which tends to zero as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Therefore

$$k! \sum_{1 \leq i_1 < i_2 < \dots < i_k \leq m_n} p_{n,i_1} p_{n,i_2} \cdots p_{n,i_k} \rightarrow \gamma^k \text{ as } n \rightarrow \infty. \tag{1.21}$$

The result follows from (1.18) by using (1.19), (1.20) and (1.21). □

### 1.4 The Negative Binomial Distribution

A random element  $Z$  of  $\mathbb{N}_0$  is said to have a *negative binomial distribution* with parameters  $r > 0$  and  $p \in (0, 1]$  if

$$\mathbb{P}(Z = n) = \frac{\Gamma(n + r)}{\Gamma(n + 1)\Gamma(r)} (1 - p)^n p^r, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_0, \tag{1.22}$$

where the *Gamma function*  $\Gamma: (0, \infty) \rightarrow (0, \infty)$  is defined by

$$\Gamma(a) := \int_0^{\infty} t^{a-1} e^{-t} dt, \quad a > 0. \quad (1.23)$$

(In particular  $\Gamma(a) = (a-1)!$  for  $a \in \mathbb{N}$ .) This can be seen to be a probability distribution by Taylor expansion of  $(1-x)^{-r}$  evaluated at  $x = 1-p$ . The probability generating function of  $Z$  is given by

$$\mathbb{E}[s^Z] = p^r(1-s+sp)^{-r}, \quad s \in [0, 1]. \quad (1.24)$$

For  $r \in \mathbb{N}$ , such a  $Z$  may be interpreted as the number of failures before the  $r$ th success in a sequence of independent Bernoulli trials. In the special case  $r = 1$  we get the *geometric distribution*

$$\mathbb{P}(Z = n) = (1-p)^n p, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_0. \quad (1.25)$$

Another interesting special case is  $r = 1/2$ . In this case

$$\mathbb{P}(Z = n) = \frac{(2n-1)!!}{2^n n!} (1-p)^n p^{1/2}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}_0, \quad (1.26)$$

where we recall the definition (B.6) for  $(2n-1)!!$ . This follows from the fact that  $\Gamma(n+1/2) = (2n-1)!! 2^{-n} \sqrt{\pi}$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}_0$ .

The negative binomial distribution arises as a mixture of Poisson distributions. To explain this, we need to introduce the *Gamma distribution* with *shape parameter*  $a > 0$  and *scale parameter*  $b > 0$ . This is a probability measure on  $\mathbb{R}_+$  with Lebesgue density

$$x \mapsto b^a \Gamma(a)^{-1} x^{a-1} e^{-bx} \quad (1.27)$$

on  $\mathbb{R}_+$ . If a random variable  $Y$  has this distribution, then one says that  $Y$  is Gamma distributed with shape parameter  $a$  and scale parameter  $b$ . In this case  $Y$  has Laplace transform

$$\mathbb{E}[e^{-tY}] = \left( \frac{b}{b+t} \right)^a, \quad t \geq 0. \quad (1.28)$$

In the case  $a = 1$  we obtain the *exponential distribution* with parameter  $b$ . Exercise 1.11 asks the reader to prove the following result.

**Proposition 1.5** *Suppose that the random variable  $Y \geq 0$  is Gamma distributed with shape parameter  $a > 0$  and scale parameter  $b > 0$ . Let  $Z$  be an  $\mathbb{N}_0$ -valued random variable such that the conditional distribution of  $Z$  given  $Y$  is  $\text{Po}(Y)$ . Then  $Z$  has a negative binomial distribution with parameters  $a$  and  $b/(b+1)$ .*

## 1.5 Exercises

**Exercise 1.1** Prove equation (1.10).

**Exercise 1.2** Let  $X$  be a random variable taking values in  $\mathbb{N}_0$ . Assume that there is a  $\gamma \geq 0$  such that  $\mathbb{E}[(X)_k] = \gamma^k$  for all  $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$ . Show that  $X$  has a Poisson distribution. (Hint: Derive the Taylor series for  $g(s) := \mathbb{E}[s^X]$  at  $s_0 = 1$ .)

**Exercise 1.3** Confirm Proposition 1.3 by showing that

$$\mathbb{E}[s^X t^{Z-X}] = e^{p\gamma(s-1)} e^{(1-p)\gamma(t-1)}, \quad s, t \in [0, 1],$$

using a direct computation and Proposition B.4.

**Exercise 1.4** (Generalisation of Proposition 1.2) Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  and suppose that  $X_1, \dots, X_m$  are independent random variables with Poisson distributions  $\text{Po}(\gamma_1), \dots, \text{Po}(\gamma_m)$ , respectively. Show that  $X := X_1 + \dots + X_m$  is Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma := \gamma_1 + \dots + \gamma_m$ . Assuming  $\gamma > 0$ , show moreover for any  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  that

$$\mathbb{P}(X_1 = k_1, \dots, X_m = k_m \mid X = k) = \frac{k!}{k_1! \cdots k_m!} \left(\frac{\gamma_1}{\gamma}\right)^{k_1} \cdots \left(\frac{\gamma_m}{\gamma}\right)^{k_m} \quad (1.29)$$

for  $k_1 + \dots + k_m = k$ . This is a *multinomial distribution* with parameters  $k$  and  $\gamma_1/\gamma, \dots, \gamma_m/\gamma$ .

**Exercise 1.5** (Generalisation of Proposition 1.3) Let  $m \in \mathbb{N}$  and suppose that  $Z_n$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , is a sequence of independent random vectors in  $\mathbb{R}^m$  with common distribution  $\mathbb{P}(Z_1 = e_i) = p_i$ ,  $i \in \{1, \dots, m\}$ , where  $e_i$  is the  $i$ -th unit vector in  $\mathbb{R}^m$  and  $p_1 + \dots + p_m = 1$ . Let  $Z$  have a Poisson distribution with parameter  $\gamma$ , independent of  $(Z_1, Z_2, \dots)$ . Show that the components of the random vector  $X := \sum_{j=1}^Z Z_j$  are independent and Poisson distributed with parameters  $p_1\gamma, \dots, p_m\gamma$ .

**Exercise 1.6** (Bivariate extension of Proposition 1.4) Let  $\gamma > 0, \delta \geq 0$ . Suppose for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  that  $m_n \in \mathbb{N}$  and for  $1 \leq i \leq m_n$  that  $p_{n,i}, q_{n,i} \in [0, 1]$  with  $\sum_{i=1}^{m_n} p_{n,i} \rightarrow \gamma$  and  $\sum_{i=1}^{m_n} q_{n,i} \rightarrow \delta$ , and  $\max_{1 \leq i \leq m_n} \max\{p_{n,i}, q_{n,i}\} \rightarrow 0$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Suppose for  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  that  $(X_n, Y_n) = \sum_{i=1}^{m_n} (X_{n,i}, Y_{n,i})$ , where each  $(X_{n,i}, Y_{n,i})$  is a random 2-vector whose components are Bernoulli distributed with parameters  $p_{n,i}, q_{n,i}$ , respectively, and satisfy  $X_{n,i}Y_{n,i} = 0$  almost surely. Assume the random vectors  $(X_{n,i}, Y_{n,i})$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq m_n$ , are independent. Prove that  $X_n, Y_n$  are asymptotically (as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ) distributed as a pair of indepen-

dent Poisson variables with parameters  $\gamma, \delta$ , i.e. for  $k, \ell \in \mathbb{N}_0$ ,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(X_n = k, Y_n = \ell) = e^{-(\gamma+\delta)} \frac{\gamma^k \delta^\ell}{k! \ell!}.$$

**Exercise 1.7** (Probability of a Poisson variable being even) Suppose  $X$  is Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma > 0$ . Using the fact that the probability generating function (1.8) extends to  $s = -1$ , verify the identity  $\mathbb{P}(X/2 \in \mathbb{Z}) = (1 + e^{-2\gamma})/2$ . For  $k \in \mathbb{N}$  with  $k \geq 3$ , using the fact that the probability generating function (1.8) extends to a  $k$ -th complex root of unity, find a closed-form formula for  $\mathbb{P}(X/k \in \mathbb{Z})$ .

**Exercise 1.8** Let  $\gamma > 0$ , and suppose  $X$  is Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma$ . Suppose  $f: \mathbb{N} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}_+$  is such that  $\mathbb{E}[f(X)^{1+\varepsilon}] < \infty$  for some  $\varepsilon > 0$ . Show that  $\mathbb{E}[f(X+k)] < \infty$  for any  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ .

**Exercise 1.9** Let  $0 < \gamma < \gamma'$ . Give an example of a random vector  $(X, Y)$  with  $X$  Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma$  and  $Y$  Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma'$ , such that  $Y-X$  is *not* Poisson distributed. (Hint: First consider a pair  $X', Y'$  such that  $Y'-X'$  is Poisson distributed, and then modify finitely many of the values of their joint probability mass function.)

**Exercise 1.10** Suppose  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and set  $[n] := \{1, \dots, n\}$ . Suppose that  $Z$  is a uniform random permutation of  $[n]$ , that is a random element of the space  $\Sigma_n$  of all bijective mappings from  $[n]$  to  $[n]$  such that  $\mathbb{P}(Z = \pi) = 1/n!$  for each  $\pi \in \Sigma_n$ . For  $a \in \mathbb{R}$  let  $\lceil a \rceil := \min\{k \in \mathbb{Z} : k \geq a\}$ . Let  $\gamma \in [0, 1]$  and let  $X_n := \text{card}\{i \in [\lceil \gamma n \rceil] : Z(i) = i\}$  be the number of fixed points of  $Z$  among the first  $\lceil \gamma n \rceil$  integers. Show that the distribution of  $X_n$  converges to  $\text{Po}(\gamma)$ , that is

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(X_n = k) = \frac{\gamma^k}{k!} e^{-\gamma}, \quad k \in \mathbb{N}_0.$$

(Hint: Establish an explicit formula for  $\mathbb{P}(X_n = k)$ , starting with the case  $k = 0$ .)

**Exercise 1.11** Prove Proposition 1.5.

**Exercise 1.12** Let  $\gamma > 0$  and  $\delta > 0$ . Find a random vector  $(X, Y)$  such that  $X, Y$  and  $X + Y$  are Poisson distributed with parameter  $\gamma, \delta$  and  $\gamma + \delta$ , respectively, but  $X$  and  $Y$  are not independent.