Eighteenth-Century Music 4/1, 7–25 © 2007 Cambridge University Press
doi:10.1017/S1478570607000681 Printed in the United Kingdom

HEROIC HAYDN, THE OCCASIONAL WORK AND 'MODERN' POLITICAL MUSIC

NICHOLAS MATHEW

ABSTRACT

Several compositions by Haydn from the 1790s appear to reflect, both directly and indirectly, the newly martial and patriotic atmosphere generated by the war with France. While this has long been recognized by music historians – in particular with reference to 'Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser' – Haydn scholars have yet to describe or explain this trend adequately. Only Beethoven scholars have considered this music in any depth, portraying Haydn as the Viennese progenitor of the so-called heroic style. The paradox of this teleological Beethovenian reading of Haydn's music from the 1790s is that the type of compositions that music historians have traditionally denigrated with the label 'occasional works' are portrayed as the ancestors of some of the most vaunted symphonic masterworks in the canon: historically situated music somehow creates the very pieces that supposedly instantiated the historically resistant 'work concept' in the period around 1800. Yet this paradox points to a growing tension within Haydn's public identity and music in the 1790s – a tension between the emerging ideal of aesthetic autonomy and the reality of political appropriation during the revolutionary and Napoleonic Wars. Indeed, this very tension allowed Haydn and his music to enter political life and political discourse as never before, articulating a relationship between music and contemporary events that cannot adequately be described by the notion of the 'occasional work'. Haydn's emergence as a cultural hero, on a par with contemporary war heroes, and the attribution to his music of a sublime power analogous to worldly, even political, powers meant that his music could be heard as possessing a voice in its own right – a voice that could thus speak independently, and persuasively, on behalf of institutions and ideologies, rather than merely echoing them.

THE 'HEROIC' 1790S

> Wenn die Theater das untrügliche Barometer des Nationalgeistes sind, so ist der unsrige jetzt im höchsten Grade marzialisch.[1]
>
> (If theatres are the infallible barometer of national spirit, then ours is now militaristic to the highest degree.)

These were the words of the stage correspondent of *Der Neue Teutsche Merkur*, reporting on theatrical events in Vienna in February 1797. This month saw the unveiling of Haydn's song of Habsburg loyalty 'Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser' in theatres across the empire on the Kaiser's birthday. The first performance of the *Missa in tempore belli* (Mass in Time of War) had taken place the previous December in Vienna's Piaristenkirche.

Music historians seem to agree that something changed in the Viennese music of the 1790s – and that this change had something to do with the tumult of post-revolutionary history and politics. Yet there is much less consensus on how to describe or explain such a change. Haydn scholars could scarcely overlook the patriotic and bellicose mood that settled on Viennese music at this time – although it sits uncomfortably with long-standing critical constructions of Haydn's music as genial and approachable. For this reason, perhaps, it has taken Beethoven scholars – surely more given to sensing post-revolutionary fluctuations in the *Zeitgeist* – to speculate most adventurously on the causes and consequences of the new musical tone of the 1790s. The last decade of the eighteenth century belongs to an existing Beethovenian teleology in any case: the 'Eroica' is just around the corner, and with it the combination of epic scale and dramatic musical process

1 F. L. Hederich, *Der Neue Teutsche Merkur* (April 1797), 391.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

that Romain Rolland was to call the heroic style.[2] As critical opinion would have it, this style emerged as if from a confluence of French innovation and Viennese tradition: the 'Eroica' allowed Beethoven 'to take the "tone" that existed already in French music and appropriate it in the symphonic spirit', explains Carl Dahlhaus.[3] Maynard Solomon in turn hears Beethoven sublimating what he calls the 'explicit ideological and ethical function' of revolutionary music with symphonic technique.[4] The universalizing role of the German element in this interaction is all too familiar, the surface features of ephemeral French social function meeting the more durable principles of German form.

Haydn has an important mediating role in this Beethovenian story, as the most prominent composer in the Viennese milieu to match the Napoleonic tub-thumping of French musicians: 'Slowly but inevitably, Viennese music responded to the reverberations of the French Revolution and the onset of the Napoleonic Wars', writes Solomon in the causal language of *Geistesgeschichte*. He summarizes Haydn's music of the 1790s like this:

> The music of Haydn began to take on a new character: he wrote one symphony (1794) titled *Military*, another (1795) called *Drum Roll*, and in 1796 he wrote the hymnlike anthem, 'Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser' (God Save Emperor Franz), which became the rallying cry of Austrian patriotism. Also in 1796, Haydn composed incidental music to *Alfred oder der patriotische König* (Alfred, or the Patriotic King), followed several years later by an aria, 'Lines from the Battle of the Nile', inspired by Nelson's victory at Aboukir Bay. But it was in two full-scale masses with trumpets and kettledrums, the *Mass in Time of War* (1796) and the *Nelson Mass* (1798), that Haydn approached most closely what would later become Beethoven's heroic style.[5]

Thus Solomon, enlisting in his support the acquired nicknames of a pair of London Symphonies and a mass, gives Haydn a kind of 'heroic phase' in miniature.[6] Yet despite his undisguised Beethovenian teleology, Solomon's concise account of Haydn in the 1790s is perhaps worth considering: 'Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser', whose continuing political function in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries has guaranteed it considerable scholarly attention, takes its place in a more coherent aesthetic trend in Haydn's works.[7]

But how can one describe this trend? The pieces that Solomon cites have no single musical or generic feature in common, but a family resemblance founded on martial topics and imitative effects, an emphasis on trumpets and drums, and monumental choral writing. Symphony No. 103 is the most dubious inclusion, perhaps; it seems to have snuck into the list only because of its eponymous drumroll – hardly a match for the full military percussion orchestra that famously marches into the Allegretto of the earlier London

---

2 See Romain Rolland, *Beethoven the Creator*, trans. Ernest Newman (New York: Garden City Publishing, 1937). The single account of the heroic style from the perspective of style history is Michael Broyles's *Beethoven: The Emergence and Evolution of Beethoven's Heroic Style* (New York: Excelsior, 1987); Scott Burnham has articulated the place and importance of the heroic style in Western musical thought in his *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995).

3 Carl Dahlhaus, *Ludwig van Beethoven: Approaches to His Music*, trans. Mary Whittall (Oxford: Clarendon, 1991), 27.

4 Maynard Solomon, *Beethoven* (New York: Schirmer, 1977; revised edition, 1998), 71; see also 179–180.

5 Solomon, *Beethoven*, 251–252. Implicitly revealing that these works contradict prevailing popular and critical conceptions of Haydn's music, this passage in the first 1977 edition of Solomon's book begins: '*Even* the music of Haydn began to take on a new character' (*Beethoven*, 193; my emphasis).

6 The notion of Beethoven's 'heroic phase' has been theorized most influentially in Alan Tyson, 'Beethoven's Heroic Phase', *The Musical Times* 110 (February 1969), 139–141; it has since been explored and problematized by Lewis Lockwood in his 'Beethoven, Florestan, and the Varieties of Heroism', in *Beethoven and His World*, ed. Scott Burnham and Michael P. Steinberg (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000), 27–47.

7 From an extensive literature on 'Gott erhalte' and its subsequent appropriations see the essays edited by Rudolf Bockholdt as *Joseph Haydns "Kaiserhymne" und die Folgen* in *Musiktheorie* 17/3 (2002); O. E. Deutsch, 'Haydn's Hymn and Burney's Translation', *The Music Review* 4 (1943), 157–162; and Albrecht Riethmüller, 'Joseph Haydn und das Deutschlandlied', *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 44 (1987), 241–267.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

symphony.[8] The *Missa in tempore belli* and *Missa in angustiis* (Mass in [Time of] Anguish or 'Nelson' Mass) both combine a trumpets-and-drums-dominated sound with monumental writing for chorus – a combination that would also surface, in various forms, in the *Creation* and *Seasons*, of course. The bellicose character of the *Missa in angustiis*, scored only for strings, organ, trumpets and timpani, surfaces most clearly in the abrupt fanfare that concludes the Benedictus. Meanwhile, the brooding Adagio of the Agnus dei of the *Missa in tempore belli* famously incorporates menacing rumbles in the timpani that have elicited a group of related critical readings – as the imitation of distant gunfire, or the advance of an army. As for Haydn's incidental music to *Alfred*, the last of the three numbers is a rousing C major *Kriegerischer Chor*.

But it is not Solomon's intention to measure the *Zeitgeist* with trumpets and drums. The topical characteristics of Haydn's 'heroic' compositions appear in many ways to be manifestations of new political meanings and ceremonial functions. 'Gott erhalte' is the clearest example of functional music on Solomon's list, perhaps, its hymn-like melodic design alluding simultaneously to devotional traditions, folk-like popular tunes and songs of political loyalty – contemporary French songs as well as 'God Save the King'. But several of Haydn's other 'heroic' compositions also served to mark public or court occasions, and often reflect this function in their grand musical rhetoric and martial topical character. Granted, some only relate in the most general terms to the unfolding events of the revolutionary and Napoleonic Wars; yet all were ripe for political appropriation. The 'Lines from the Battle of the Nile', a song for voice and piano celebrating Nelson's recent victory in Egypt, represents the most overt kind of political music. A setting of excerpts from a rather turgid seventeen-stanza 'Pindaric ode' by Lady Emma Hamilton's travelling companion, Ellis Cornelia Knight, the song was composed in Eisenstadt when Nelson and his entourage visited in early September 1800.[9] Knight recorded that Lady Hamilton herself performed it with Haydn at the piano.[10] As one might expect, martial topics are Haydn's musical staple in this piece: the principal section, an 'Air' in B flat major, is constructed almost entirely from dotted rhythms and fanfare figures, which are foreshadowed in the introductory recitative on the words 'Britannia's Hero gives the dread command' (see Examples 1a and 1b). By contrast, the *Missa in angustiis* relates only obliquely to current events, although its connection with Nelson is more famous; it has been supposed – though without any conclusive evidence – that the mass was performed in Eisenstadt during Nelson's brief stay.[11] Whatever the case may be, it was appropriated in Nelson's name soon after his visit.

Indeed, constant appropriation and reappropriation is the story of most of Haydn's 'heroic' compositions from the 1790s. The incidental music to *Alfred, König der Angelsachsen* (Alfred, King of the Anglo-Saxons), a drama adapted from Alexander Bicknell's play about Alfred the Great, was first performed in Eisenstadt as part of the festivities marking the name-day of Princess Marie Hermenegild Esterházy on 9 September 1796.[12] But its chorus of victorious warriors resurfaced even as late as Napoleon's defeat – reprinted with a piano reduction of the orchestral part and a modified text in the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* in 1814 (see Figure 1). The editors were clearly attuned to the potential uses of its triumphalist

8 That said, Leonard Ratner does argue that bars 109–134 in the slow movement comprise a battle episode; see *Classic Music* (New York: Schirmer, 1980), 26. Solomon appears not to have had this in mind, however.

9 Nelson, Lady Hamilton, and their entourage reached Vienna on 18 August 1800 on their return journey to Britain; they stayed for four days at Eisenstadt from 6 September. See Otto Erich Deutsch, *Admiral Nelson and Joseph Haydn*, ed. Gilta Deutsch and Rudolph Klein (Norwich: The Nelson Society, 2000) and H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn: Chronicle and Works*, volume 4: *The Years of 'The Creation' 1796-1800* (Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1977), 558–562. The entirety of Knight's ode is reprinted in Deutsch, *Admiral Nelson and Joseph Haydn*, 151–156.

10 Ellis Cordelia Knight, *The Autobiography of Miss Knight*, ed. Roger Fulford (London: William Kimber, 1960), 74.

11 Landon concludes that the mass probably was performed. An elaborate mass certainly was celebrated – and receipts suggest that the Te Deum for Empress Maria Theresa (which features trumpets and kettledrums) was also played; see *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 562.

12 For information on Haydn's incidental music and the play it was composed for, see Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 106–109 and 183–189; also Thomas Tolley, *Painting the Cannon's Roar: Music, the Visual Arts and the Rise of an Attentive Public in the Age of Haydn, c. 1750–c. 1810* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2001), 261–262.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

72

stood a-loft con- fest.

Tempo primo (Allegretto)

76

Brit- an- nia's He - ro gives the dread com-mand;

Example 1a 'Lines from the Battle of the Nile', HXXVIb: 4, recitative: 'Britannia's hero gives the dread command', bars 72–78 (*Joseph Haydn Werke*, series 29, volume 2, *Verschiedene Gesänge mit Begleitung des Klaviers*, ed. Marianne Helms (Munich: Henle, 1988)). Used by permission

rhetoric, remarking 'Vielleicht wendet man ihn eben jetzt, bey so vielen Gelegenheits-Concerten und Gelegenheits-Schauspielen um so lieber an.'[13] (Perhaps one can use it all the better at just this time, among so many occasional concerts and occasional dramas.)

Understandably, perhaps, the most notable examples of political appropriation belong to the performance history of Symphony No. 100, which rapidly became the centrepiece of an emerging repertory of patriotic Viennese concert music. Haydn himself oversaw its transplantation from London to the often bellicose environment of Vienna, directing it in 1799 alongside Salieri's curious cantata-cum-battle piece *Der tyroler Landsturm* (The Tyrolese Territorial Reserves) – incidentally, one of many contemporary political compositions to quote 'Gott erhalte'. The 'Military' is also likely to have been the symphony that appeared some three years earlier in a series of concerts featuring Franz Xaver Süssmayer's patriotic cantata *Der Retter in Gefahr* (The Saviour in Peril).[14] The symphony even followed Nelson from Eisenstadt in the autumn of 1800, opening a musical evening at Laibach in his honour.[15] Almost ten years later it remained a fixture on programmes of Viennese patriotic music, featuring in a succession of 1809 concerts that culminated with Heinrich von Collin's 'Österreich über alles' (Austria above All Else) – one of a collection of poems celebrating the newly formed Austrian *Landwehr* or conscription army, set to music by Haydn's godson Joseph Weigl.[16] Given its performance history, it seems probable that the 'Military' was the Haydn symphony

13 *Allgemeine Musikalische Zeitung* 8 (23 February 1814), columns 139–140.

14 For a quick reference to a limited number of sources that report these concerts see Mary Sue Morrow, *Concert Life in Haydn's Vienna* (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon, 1989), 302 and 290–293.

15 See Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 562.

16 Morrow, *Concert Life*, 354–355; see also Walter Langsam, *The Napoleonic Wars and German Nationalism in Austria* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1930), 101–102. Sketches for an earlier version of Collin's 'Österreich über alles' survive by Beethoven; see Douglas Johnson, Alan Tyson and Robert Winter, *The Beethoven Sketchbooks: History, Reconstruction, Inventory*, ed. Douglas Johnson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), 187–188, 192.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

116 Allegretto

f [*f*]

119

123

Blest

p

127

lea - der, blest lea - der! fore - most in re - nown of

Example 1b 'Lines from the Battle of the Nile', HXXVIb: 4, air: 'Blest leader', bars 116-131

that began the second half of one of the grandest celebratory concerts in the Zeremonien Saal during the Congress of Vienna.[17]

17 The concert took place on 21 December 1814, as shown in the Hof-, Haus- und Staats-Archiv, Zeremoniell Protokoll 1814; see also the Congress timetable included in the exhibition catalogue *Denmark and the Dancing Congress of Vienna: Playing for Denmark's Future* (Copenhagen: Christinsberg Palace, 2002), 326.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

No. I.
Beylage zur allgemeinen musikalischen Zeitung.

Kriegerischer Chor,
aus
Joseph Haydns Nachlass.

Allegro assai.
Pianoforte.
Soprano.
Tri-umph! Tri-umph! Tri-umph steig' zum Himmel! Die Schlacht ist ge-
Tenore e Basso.
Tri-umph! Tri-umph! Tri-umph steig' zum Himmel! Die Schlacht ist ge-
kämpft! die Schlacht ist ge-kämpft! des Feindes Uebermuth ge-dämpft! Wir stürmen mit
kämpft! die Schlacht ist ge-kämpft! des Feindes Uebermuth ge-dämpft! Wir stürmen mit

Figure 1 Transcription of ‘Kriegerischer Chor’ from *Alfred*, with a modified text (*Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* 8 (23 February 1814). Oxford, Bodleian Library). Used by permission

Bearing in mind the defining features of Haydn’s ‘heroic’ music – namely, its combination of a martial and monumental tone with a broadly political function – one could add a handful of compositions to Solomon’s list. An obvious candidate is another piece performed during Nelson’s stay in Eisenstadt: the magnificent C major Te Deum that Haydn apparently composed for Empress Marie Therese. It appears that the work was performed as part of the name-day celebrations for Princess Marie, although, since settings of the Te Deum were traditionally used in thanksgiving ceremonies after military victories, it seems likely that

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Figure 1 *continued*

Haydn's new composition would also have served to honour Nelson.[18] One might also add an unfinished composition from Haydn's second London sojourn: the cantata known as the *Invocation of Neptune*, probably begun for the Earl of Abingdon but quietly set aside with the earl's imprisonment in 1795. Based on the introductory stanzas prefixed to Marchimont Nedham's translation of Selden's work on the sovereignty of the sea entitled *Mare Clausum*, Haydn's *Invocation of Neptune* celebrates British sea power in almost

18 See Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 562 and 604–615.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Figure 1 *continued*

jingoistic terms. Besides its somewhat eccentric text, which gloats over Britain's riches and takes the trouble to disparage the Belgians, the D major chorus 'Thy great endeavours' is reminiscent of the choruses of the *Missa in angustiis*: opening with a monumental orchestral fanfare, it conjures up a Handelian kind of ceremonialism with its alternation of grand homophonic choral sonorities and boisterous counterpoint.[19] Its text runs:

19 See H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn Chronicle and Works*, volume 3: *Haydn in England 1791-1795* (Bloomington and London: University of Indiana, 1976), 317–318. My thanks to Balázs Mikusi for sharing with me his research into Haydn's fragment.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

30

bur - ly, war nor death can him dis-please,

Example 2a 'Sailor's Song', HXXVIa: 31, bars 30–35 (*Joseph Haydn Werke*, series 29, volume 1, *Lieder für eine Singstimme mit Begleitung eines Klaviers,* ed. Paul Mies (Munich: Henle, 1960)). Used by permission

> Thy great endeavours to increase
> the marine power to confess
> thou act'st some great design!
> which had Seventh Henry done, before
> Columbus launch'd from Spanish shore
> the Indies had been thine!
> Yet do thy seas those Indian mines excel
> In riches far. The Belgians know it well.

Other pieces by Haydn allude more obliquely to the sound and function of his 'heroic' compositions. The 'Sailor's Song', from the second book of *Original Canzonettas* of 1795, for example, is a celebration of British marine power on a smaller scale than the *Invocation of Neptune*. A kind of sea shanty, with strong downbeats and flute-like semiquaver runs, it reveals a more bellicose tone with the refrain 'war nor death can him displease', which the piano accompanies with rising fanfare figures and dotted rhythms (see Example 2a). This tone reaches a particularly bombastic pitch with the line 'the roaring cannon loudly speaks, 'tis Britain's glory we maintain': the repetition of the second half of the line has the voice extend the word 'glory' over two bars, while the piano crashes away with dense dotted-rhythmic chords (see Example 2b). The 'Sailor's Song' thus transplants the 'public' rhetoric of both music and politics into a domestic genre, transforming martial gestures and patriotic sentiment into a kind of musical picturesque.[20]

20 It is all the more surprising, therefore, to discover that, among the canzonettas, perhaps the most melancholic and sentimental one became the most politicized: Haydn's gloomy G minor setting of Anne Hunter's 'The Wanderer'. Nelson's victory in Aboukir Bay prompted the Leipzig publishers Breitkopf and Härtel to issue a German version, the text by Daniel Jäger, entitled 'Buonaparte oder die Wanderer in Ägypten' (Bonaparte; or, the Wanderer in Egypt) – an intriguing appropriation of an inward-looking, 'gothic' aesthetic by a sabre-rattling public discourse. (This version of the song was also published in 1798 by Artaria in Vienna as No. 2 of *Sechs Lieder*.) One could also argue that Haydn bridged the worlds of public ceremony and private music-making in his various arrangements of 'Gott erhalte', which, besides the version for solo voice and piano, appeared in the well-known variation movement of the String Quartet Op. 76 No. 3 – a movement that was itself arranged for solo piano. Of course, other composers were regularly to quote 'Gott erhalte' in both domestic and public genres during the Napoleonic Wars. For literature on 'Gott erhalte' as a song and a quartet movement see three articles from *Musiktheorie* 17/3 (2002): Veronika Giglberger, 'Die Kaiserhymne' im Streichquartett: Haydns Variationssatz aus dem Quartett Op. 76 Nr. 3 und seine Klavierfassung', 245–258; Christian Speck, 'Vokal und Instrumental im Variationensatz von Haydns 'Kaiser-quartett' Op. 76 Nr. 3', 225–230; and Petra Weber-Bockholdt, 'Gott! erhalte. . .' als Lied unter Joseph Haydns Liedern', 215–224.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

60

'tis Brit-tain's glo - - - - -

65

- ry we - main - tain.

Example 2b 'Sailor's Song', HXXVIa: 31, bars 60-68

Granted, these examples of 'heroic' Haydn come from a range of works and genres, each with a distinct relation to political ideas, contexts and institutions; yet one might argue that these examples share an apparent awareness – which often manifests itself on the level of musical style and rhetoric – of the increasingly charged and martial public sphere in which they were produced and performed.

HISTORY, FUNCTION AND AESTHETIC AUTONOMY

One might ask what is truly new about this music, however. It would be a tall order, after all, to maintain that the combination of a martial tone and a ceremonial function was a new development in the 1790s. Haydn had composed an earlier C major setting of the Te Deum in the 1760s in any case, long before any Napoleonic *Zeitgeist* could call forth the trumpets and drums. Yet Beethovenian historiography tends to require that the tone and function of Haydn's music of the 1790s be innovations. In the context of Beethoven scholarship and its most cherished narratives about the history of musical aesthetics, there is considerable irony in this: Solomon and others trace the spirit and style of Western music's most vaunted symphonic masterworks to the kinds of compositions that music historiography and criticism have traditionally denigrated with the label 'occasional works' – pieces whose meaning and aesthetic viability remain bound to specific historical periods or events. Indeed, an unintended consequence of Solomon's brief account of the provenance of Beethoven's heroic style is a complete inversion of the received wisdom about the emergence of the 'work concept' in the years around 1800 – the idea that music became notionally autonomous from historical forces, concomitant with the professional emancipation of composers from court, state and church.[21]

21 The best known philosophical and historical account of the emergence of the work concept remains Lydia Goehr, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1991). See also Daniel Chua, *Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999) and Carl Dahlhaus, *The Idea of Absolute Music*, trans. Roger Lustig (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1989).

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

In consequence, Solomon is compelled to formulate a new claim about the relationship between Beethoven's heroic style and contemporary history. Just as the 'Eroica' ostensibly universalizes a French tone of voice, so Beethoven expurgates the crude historicity of Haydn's earlier heroic music, or at least sublimates it into a more elevated sort of structural abstraction. 'Beethoven was the first composer fully to fuse the tempestuous, conflict-ridden subject matter of the emerging heroic style with the sonata principle', claims Solomon.[22] The sonata principle thus becomes a symbol of Beethoven's supposedly unprecedented creative independence; as Alfred Einstein once put it, 'Beethoven was the first example, and a dangerous one, of the "free artist" who obeys his so-called inner compulsion and follows only his genius'. This claim had its historiographical corollary: 'even Haydn and Mozart hardly ever wrote music that did not have some . . . defined purpose'.[23] In other words, until Beethoven, all works were occasional works.

Music historians have since defined and historicized the work concept more thoroughly than this, of course, but with the consequence that some critics would perhaps endorse Einstein's claim, even as they would reject his implicit denigration of functional or occasional music. Mozart scholars such as Neal Zaslaw have been particularly keen to transform their original genius into a master craftsman, an expert purveyor of *Gebrauchsmusik*.[24] This critical project often takes the form of a polemical debunking of the high ideals and improbable metaphysics of the autonomy aesthetic, in which historical occasions reclaim masterworks that have supposedly eluded them.

Haydn scholars have been reluctant to follow suit, however. James Webster, for example, writes in his recent *New Grove* article: 'Notwithstanding their semi-private function for the Esterházy court, Haydn's six late masses are consummate masterworks that exhibit no trace of provinciality or the "occasional".'[25] This reaction reflects a desire to avoid the pejorative connotations of the concept of the 'occasional work', of course, which has so often marginalized Haydn's music for court and church at the expense of his symphonies and chamber works. But it is hard to escape the feeling that Haydn scholars' reluctance to embrace the term 'occasional work' comes from a perception – reflected even in Solomon's historiographical recourse to Napoleonic *Zeitgeist* rather than, say, a more concrete history of institutions – that Haydn's 'heroic' compositions articulate a more sophisticated relationship with contemporary history than the blunt conceptual instrument of the 'occasional work' can describe.

Beethoven scholarship, perhaps because it is has more often had cause to reflect on the contradiction between a romanticized view of Beethoven's creative freedom and the undeniable political complicity of many of his compositions, has once again taken up the hermeneutic burden with respect to Haydn – this time, striving to articulate the changed nature of the relationship between music and political life in the 1790s. Among recent studies, Esteban Buch's 'political history' of Beethoven's Ninth is particularly relevant, because it presents 'Gott erhalte' and Haydn's other wartime compositions as part of a historical process that Buch calls 'the birth of modern political music' – a process that begins with Handelian pomp, runs through French revolutionary ceremony and concludes with the music of the Congress of Vienna.[26] Nevertheless, aside from the passing attention that Buch gives to the emergence of defining modern institutions such as the nation state, he never fully explains what is 'modern' about 'modern political music'. In consequence, it is sometimes hard to distinguish the character or function of modern political music from the occasional

22 Solomon, *Beethoven*, 252.

23 Alfred Einstein, 'Beethoven's Military Style', in *Essays On Music* (London: Faber, 1958), 244.

24 See in particular Neal Zaslaw's 'Mozart as a Working Stiff', in *On Mozart*, ed. James Morris (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 102–112; also his *Mozart's Symphonies: Context, Performance Practice, Reception* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1989). Despite his professed rejection of Zaslaw's brand of historicism, Richard Taruskin also argues, from the perspective of performance and text-based criticism, that the strong concept of the musical work is alien to much of Mozart's music; see in particular his 'A Mozart Wholly Ours', in *Text and Act: Essays on Music and Performance* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), 273–291.

25 James Webster, *The New Grove Haydn* (New York: Macmillan, 2002), 54.

26 Esteban Buch, *Beethoven's Ninth: A Political History*, trans. Richard Miller (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003), 11–86; on Haydn, 45–65.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

music of earlier centuries. Buch observes, for instance, that political music from Handel to Beethoven was 'employed to buttress the legitimacy of constituted power and express attachment to the established order'; yet this was surely the main purpose of state music before Handel's time.[27]

It seems to me that this problem arises in part because Buch overlooks the tension between art and politics that has so often troubled 'modern' aesthetics, at least since the late eighteenth century – indeed, this is a tension that Buch's study reproduces rather than explores. In arguing that the Ninth is a political work even at its point of origin, Buch appears to engage in just the sort of historicizing 'debunking' that has characterized some recent Mozart scholarship: a supposedly timeless Beethovenian masterwork is reclaimed by its history. But Buch cannot simply domesticate the Ninth by outing it as a kind of disguised occasional work; as he admits in his conclusion, 'the Ninth remains the prime musical symbol of the moral value of art'.[28] He appears to suggest, in other words, that the aesthetic ambitions of the Ninth continue to overwhelm his own historicizing project – which is to say that the aesthetic of the Ninth appears to recognize the modern idea that the greatness of art is measured precisely by how successfully it transcends its own time.[29] Thus, while one might claim, with Zaslaw and others, that the concept of the work is either foreign to much of Mozart's music or at least only nascent in his musical culture, one cannot so easily call upon a mediating conception of social purpose and an attendant craft ethic in order to reconcile the aesthetic and historical dimensions of Beethoven's music. In Beethoven's time, the aesthetic is often sundered from the historical: 'Away with you, nobler and loftier plans – our striving is infinite, but vulgarity makes everything finite!', wrote Beethoven in 1813, self-consciously calling upon the rhetoric of the unworldly romantic artist even as he began work on a series of patriotic compositions in advance of the Congress of Vienna.[30] In short, it would be simplistic to infer a functionalist aesthetic from the politically charged contexts in which many of Beethoven's works appeared: in the age of the work concept, all works might have occasions, but not all are occasional works.

I want to argue that this aesthetic and historiographical problem presents itself with Haydn's music too – and that, consequently, what is new about Haydn's music from the 1790s hinges on the distinctly 'modern' tension between the ideal of aesthetic autonomy and the reality of political appropriation, between the work concept and its other, the occasional work. Indeed, a look at Haydn's changing social status and its reflection in his music's changing aesthetic context suggests that the tension between the occasion and the work allowed Haydn's 'heroic' music to become political in a characteristically modern way.

HAYDN HERO

It is not by chance that Solomon situates Haydn's new-found complicity with historical forces in the decade that marked the composer's greatest independence from institutional pressures. Indeed, several historians, Thomas Tolley the most recent of them, have argued that Haydn was busy establishing the model of the Promethean culture hero even before Beethoven had left Bonn.[31] Haydn's experience of England was crucial in this respect: 'Haydn oftentimes repeated that he had become famous in Germany only by way of England', remarked Griesinger.[32] Indeed, Haydn's lucrative sojourns in the 1790s saw him complete his emergence,

27 Buch, *Beethoven's Ninth*, 2.

28 Buch, *Beethoven's Ninth*, 266.

29 Lydia Goehr defines the work concept largely by what she calls 'the Beethoven paradigm'; see *The Imaginary Museum*, chapter 8.

30 *The Letters of Beethoven*, volume 1, ed. and trans. Emily Anderson (London: Macmillan, 1961), no. 427.

31 See Tolley's *Painting the Cannon's Roar*, chapter 5, 201–206, in particular. Tia De Nora has also recognized Haydn's part in creating the role of cultural hero in *Beethoven and the Construction of Genius* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), although she is keener to emphasize Beethoven's paradigmatic status; see 107–109.

32 Georg August Griesinger, 'Biographical Notes Concerning Haydn', in *Haydn: Two Contemporary Portraits*, ed. and trans. Vernon Gotwals (London: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), 36.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

begun a decade earlier with his independently negotiated entry into the fledgling Viennese publishing market, from a creative life based almost exclusively around the Esterházy court. 'Oh, my dear gracious lady! how sweet this bit of freedom really is!', wrote Haydn to Maria Anna von Genzinger from Hertfordshire on 17 September 1791:

> I had a kind Prince, but sometimes I was forced to be dependent on base souls. I often sighed for release, and now I have it in good measure. I appreciate the good sides of all this, too, though my mind is burdened with far more work. The realization that I am no bond-servant makes ample amends for all my toils.[33]

While aristocratic patronage remained a reality of Haydn's working life until his death, and there remained many institutional continuities between the 1760s and the 1790s, one could argue nonetheless that the aesthetic context of even his most apparently 'occasional' court music had changed by the time he came to compose his last six masses.

Haydn's celebrity was a valuable commodity in London's vibrant civil society: 'My arrival caused a great sensation throughout the whole city, and I went the round of all the newspapers for three successive days', wrote Haydn to von Genzinger on 8 January 1791.[34] Deeply aware of his public image, Haydn kept press cuttings among his personal effects until his death. In his new role, Haydn was transformed from a servant of princes into a prince of music: 'Haydn! Great Sovereign of the Tuneful Art!', read the opening address of Charles Burney's poem of welcome, sold in London as a shilling pamphlet.[35] Indeed, in the 1790s Haydn began to acquire the trappings of a Napoleonic musical sovereign: in 1793 a monument was erected in his birthplace of Rohrau; before his death he was presented with a number of medals, including one from 142 Parisian musicians in 1801, another from the Parisian Municipal Council in 1803, and yet another from the Philharmonic Society of St Petersburg in 1808; and at the famous 1808 performance of *The Creation*, Haydn was honoured with a poem by the laureate of the Austrian *Landwehr* Heinrich von Collin ('Du hast die Welt in deiner Brust getragen' (You have borne the world in your bosom), began his verse).[36] When a rumour of Haydn's death reached Paris in 1805, Cherubini composed a funeral hymn in his honour, as he had for other Napoleonic heroes. In the same year, Johann Friedrich Reichardt made the implication explicit, naming Haydn as one of the foremost 'heroes of art' in the *Berliner Musikzeitung*.[37]

Haydn himself was very taken with contemporary war heroes: he had purchased an engraving of the Battle of Aboukir Bay while in London and also owned Johann Niedl's 1798 engraving of Daniel Orme's portrait of Nelson, sold in Vienna by his publisher Artaria. By the time Nelson arrived in Eisenstadt, however, Haydn had become a hero in his own right. (In fact, in 1795, Niedl had engraved Johann Zitterer's painting of Haydn for Artaria.) Knight's autobiography demonstrates the fascination that the most famous composer in Europe aroused even among Nelson's entourage.[38] When the two heroes finally encountered one another, they did so almost as parallel figures in music and war. An exchange of gifts underscored the equivalence: Nelson gave Haydn a gold watch, requesting in return a worn pen, an intimate personal relic

33 *Joseph Haydn: Gesammelte Briefe und Aufzeichnungen*, ed. Dénes Bartha (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1965), no. 163, 260–261; translation from *The Collected Correspondence and London Notebooks of Joseph Haydn*, ed. H. C. Robbins Landon (London: Barrie and Rockliff, 1959), 118.

34 *Gesammelte Briefe*, no. 157, 251; *Collected Correspondence*, 112.

35 Landon, *Haydn in England*, 34; 32–35 for the full poem.

36 Matthew Head discusses the Haydn monument and its cultural implications in 'Music With "No Past"? Archaeologies of Joseph Haydn and *The Creation*', *Nineteenth-Century Music* 23/3 (2000), 191–217. See also Tolley, *Painting the Cannon's Roar*, 182–183.

37 *Berliner Musikzeitung* 1 (1805), 252; partly reproduced and translated in *The Critical Reception of Beethoven's Compositions by His German Contemporaries*, volume 1, ed. and trans. Wayne Senner (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1999), 35.

38 *Autobiography of Miss Knight*, 73.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

and a symbol of Haydn's genius.[39] The composer's pen was, of course, an established iconographical trope: John Hoppner was only one of the English painters who depicted Haydn with pen in hand in his 1791 portrait of the composer, a decade before the artist's famous portrayal of the heroic Nelson standing before a raging naval battle.

A relatively new social dynamic thus displaced the language of princes and Napoleonic leaders into the sphere of the arts.[40] Further, one can observe a parallel displacement in contemporary aesthetic philosophy – in particular, in the changing idea of the sublime. The sublime was practically synonymous with Haydn's music in the 1790s, and it is no accident that the period of music history that Webster defines as 'the age of Haydn's sublime' is more or less congruent with the decade of Haydn's most explicitly political music.[41] Haydn learnt first hand about the power of 'God Save the King' to promote social cohesion in England, of course. Equally important in the development of his 'heroic' aesthetic, however, was his encounter with the vastly expanded late eighteenth-century take on Handel, which Buch dubs 'the official sublime': the choral 'grand manner' suited to solemn state occasions and the treatment of biblical or heroic subjects.[42] By the 1790s, however, the prevailing idea of the sublime had undergone a transformation: no longer primarily a rhetorical register appropriate to powerful themes – an understanding of the sublime that is often associated with the treatise attributed to Longinus – the sublime was now a theory of power itself.[43] As Tom Furniss explains:

> As the [eighteenth] century progresses, discussions of the sublime tend to abandon the questions of rhetorical style which were central in Longinus in order to stress psychological responses to nature in its irregular or vast aspects.[44]

Besides natural and divine powers, this idea of the sublime aestheticized institutional and political powers, often of the most oppressive kind. Explaining sublime 'obscurity', for example, Burke remarked:

> Those despotic governments, which are founded on the passions of men, and principally upon the passion of fear, keep their chief as much as may be from the public eye. The policy has been the same in many cases of religion. Almost all heathen temples were dark.[45]

More importantly, Burke's treatise on the sublime and the beautiful is witness to a subtle conceptual slippage that implicitly attributed such powers to art itself.[46] One example of this occurs in Burke's discussion of sublime 'magnificence'. Having cited a passage describing the King's army from Shakespeare's

---

39 See Griesinger, 'Biographical Notes', 57. See also Tolley's reading of this exchange in *Painting the Cannon's Roar*, 187.

40 'Relatively' new because a public discourse of heroism in the arts, and its associated monumental imagery, had been present to some degree in connection with Handel earlier in the century. See Suzanne Aspden, '"Fam'd Handel Breathing, tho' Transformed to Stone": The Composer as Monument', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 55/1 (2002), 39–90.

41 See James Webster, 'Between Enlightenment and Romanticism in Music History: "First Viennese Modernism" and the Delayed Nineteenth Century', *Nineteenth-Century Music* 25/2 (2001), 108–126; see particularly the diagram on 116. See also his 'The *Creation*, Haydn's Late Vocal Music, and the Musical Sublime', in *Haydn and His World*, ed. Elaine Sisman (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), 57–102.

42 See Buch, *Beethoven's Ninth*, 11–25.

43 See Longinus, *On the Sublime*, trans. and ed. James A. Arieti and John M. Crossett (New York: Edwin Mellen, 1985).

44 Tom Furniss, *Edmund Burke's Aesthetic Ideology: Language, Gender and Political Economy in Revolution* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 21. For a comparable view in a musicological context see Elaine Sisman, *Mozart: The 'Jupiter' Symphony, K. 551* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), chapter 2, particularly 13–15.

45 Edmund Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and the Beautiful*, ed. James T. Boulton (London: University of Notre Dame Press, 1968), 59.

46 Incidentally, Haydn acquired a copy of Burke's treatise in an English edition while in London; see Maria Hörwarthner, 'Joseph Haydn's Library: An Attempt at a Literary-Historical Construction', trans. Kathrine Talbot, in *Haydn and His World*, 421.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Henry IV, Part I – 'all furnished, all in arms' – Burke suggests that the sublimity of the poetry has less to do with its majestic and warlike subject than 'a richness and profusion of images, in which the mind is so dazzled as to make it impossible to attend to that exact coherence and agreement of the allusions'.[47] In other words, the overwhelming experience of the sublime can be created by art alone. It was with analogous reasoning that theorists came to regard the richly imagistic Pindaric ode – a genre that had traditionally served to praise heroic achievements – as the very quintessence of the poetic sublime and, like J. A. P. Schultz in Sulzer's encyclopaedia, often compared the sublime obscurity of the Pindaric ode to the power of music.[48] Even Burke himself illustrated the sublimity of obscurity by pointing out 'the acknowledged and powerful effects of instrumental music'.[49]

Kant was to discern in Burke's obscure profusion of images two distinct modes of sublime experience: the 'dynamic sublime' of overwhelming power and the 'mathematical sublime' of inconceivable boundlessness.[50] Kant's account of the sublime nonetheless retains the Burkean preoccupation with more direct forms of power: 'Even in the most highly civilized state [a] peculiar veneration for the soldier remains', he remarks, before concluding that 'war itself . . . has something sublime in it'.[51] And Kantian theories evidently allow that art can itself produce the 'momentary checking of the vital powers and a consequent stronger outflow of them' that was the basis of sublime experience.[52] By 1805 Christian Friedrich Michaelis could claim in his Kantian reflections on the musical sublime in the *Berlinische musikalische Zeitung* that music could 'arouse the feeling of sublimity through an inner structure that is independent of any emotional expression': music had acquired a power of its own.[53]

But it bought this autonomy at a price. To the extent that the aesthetic of the sublime developed its conception of the power of art by analogy with more direct or worldly forms of power, it continued to rely on the very powers from which it made art notionally independent. Just as Burney conceived of Haydn as a musical prince, so music itself was now conceivable as the medium through which Haydn exercised his princely power. It seems fitting that a common topos of Haydn's sublime is a kind of slippage, analogous to that in Burke's treatise, between divine or worldly powers and the power of music itself. Haydn's first attempt at setting an English text – a poem by John Wolcot, who chose the revealing pseudonym 'Peter Pindar' – was the grand 1792 chorus *The Storm*: Haydn 'bid the huge tormented tempest howl', rhapsodized the dramatist Thomas Holcroft.[54] Like Holcroft, Haydn's contemporaries often described such music as the very embodiment of sublime power, rather than an appropriately elevated medium through which sublime powers could be depicted. According to one sensitive critic, Symphony No. 100 gave musical form to the horrors of war: 'the clash of arms, the groans of the wounded, and what may be called the hellish roar of war increase to a climax of horrid sublimity', ran the oft-cited report in London's *Morning Chronicle*.[55] And one could hardly omit Haydn's most dazzling passage of brass and timpani: the appearance of light in *The Creation*. Haydn's music not only gave this paradigmatic moment of the Longinian 'biblical sublime' a direct musical analogue, but encouraged an equivalent parallel between composer and divine creator: 'And in that moment when light broke forth for the first time, one would have said that light rays darted from the composer's eyes', wrote the excitable Fredrik Samuel Silverstolpe of its first rehearsal in the Schwarzenberg

47 Burke, *Philosophical Enquiry*, 78.

48 See 'Symphonie' in Johann Georg Sulzer, *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste*, volume 3 (Leipzig, 1792); also Mark Evan Bonds, 'The Symphony as Pindaric Ode', in *Haydn and His World*, 131–153.

49 Burke, *Philosophical Enquiry*, 60.

50 Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Judgement*, trans. J. H. Bernard (London: Macmillan, 1914), 102ff.

51 Kant, *Critique of Judgement*, 127.

52 Kant, *Critique of Judgement*, 102.

53 Christian Friedrich Michaelis, *Berlinische musikalische Zeitung* (1805); trans. and ed. in Peter le Huray and James Day, *Music and Aesthetics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), 289.

54 See Landon, *Haydn in England*, 355.

55 See Landon, *Haydn in England*, 247.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Palace.[56] The parallel between Haydn and the creator Himself became a standard trope in writing about *The Creation*: 'It is its own creation, of its own kind', wrote Carl Friedrich Zelter, 'and its own free play of Art, which serves the master's hand in the modelling of a new garden, a new Eden'.[57] A comparable interpretive slippage would perhaps have been encouraged by Haydn's setting of Knight's Pindaric ode about Nelson – a conflation of the hero who is celebrated and the heroic composer who celebrates him that mirrored Haydn's new status. Maybe the 'Nelson' Mass conflates composer and war hero even further. After all, one could hardly say that this work is a celebration of the heroic Nelson; rather, Haydn had created a – and perhaps the – heroic style.[58]

Haydn's changing cultural status and the changing character of his music thus together produced a 'heroic' aesthetic. 'We have moved from Beethoven's hero to Beethoven Hero', writes Scott Burnham of the reception of the 'Eroica', and one might say the same thing here: we have moved from Haydn's hero to Haydn Hero.[59]

THE 'OCCASIONAL WORK CONCEPT'

By acquiring its nickname, the 'Nelson' Mass eventually came to celebrate a particular hero, of course – and the mass perhaps even became an 'occasional work' to laud Nelson during his stay in Eisenstadt. But this kind of political appropriation – the attribution of an inevitably partial and temporary meaning to the music – goes hand in hand with the autonomy aesthetic. If one conceives of music as essentially oblivious to worldly concerns, then one must conceive of the process by which music acquires worldly meanings as a kind of co-option; if one considers music to be autonomous, then any specific meanings that music can be said to convey are themselves evidence of co-option. To put it another way, musical autonomy can be measured only in the notional disparity between what music is said to mean on a particular occasion and all that music can mean.

One might call this the foundational paradox of aesthetic autonomy – and, once again, one can trace its social preconditions to London. The Salomon concerts made Haydn's music available in principle to anyone with the requisite half a guinea, in other words, to a 'general public'. As Terry Eagleton puts it:

> When art becomes a commodity, it is released from its traditional social functions within church, court and state into the anonymous freedom of the marketplace. Now it exists, not for any specific audience, but just for anybody with the taste to appreciate it and the money to buy it. And in so far as it exists for nothing in particular, it can be said to exist for itself.[60]

Haydn's music was thus emancipated by entering the marketplace. It gained its autonomy to the extent that it became a commodity: Haydn's music was 'free', but free to be consumed. Indeed, embroiled in what Haydn jokingly called 'a bloodily harmonic war' (*ein blutig harmonischer Krieg*) with the rival Professional Concerts, his music cried out to be consumed.[61] Haydn's music had long been characterized by surprising

56 See Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 318. Translation modified in Webster, *New Grove Haydn*, 40.

57 C. F. Zelter, 'Briefe an einen Freund über die Musik in Berlin', *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung* 17 (21 January 1801), column 291.

58 There is perhaps also an analogy here with Michael Steinberg's notion, centring on the narrative of Orpheus and the Furies associated with the Andante con moto of the Fourth Piano Concerto, that Beethoven in some sense gained a 'voice' for music at the start of the nineteenth century, when his compositions came to perform or embody narratives rather than represent or recount them; see *Listening to Reason: Culture, Subjectivity, and Nineteenth-Century Music* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004), 66–67.

59 Burnham, *Beethoven Hero*, xvi.

60 Terry Eagleton, *The Ideology of the Aesthetic* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1990), 368.

61 Letter of 17 January 1792; *Gesammelte Briefe*, no. 170, 274; *Collected Correspondence*, 128.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

formal ruptures and characteristic effects that encourage particularly close listener engagement, but London's concert life perhaps exaggerated his interest in these musical 'gimmicks' – eccentricities, surprises and jolts so susceptible to poetic or narrative interpretation.[62] Tolley even suggests that the sudden fanfares and evocative passages of imitation in the *Missa in tempore belli* and *Missa in angustiis* owe much to the musical adventures of the London Symphonies.[63] Susanne Langer's romantic–modernist notion that music is an 'unconsummated symbol' seems appropriate to music thus invested in the process of its own consumption. While it invites us to interpret its expressive intent, it nonetheless eludes any definitive explanation of its meaning; one can only imperfectly 'consummate' its symbolism with whatever programme or occasion is at hand.[64]

The idea of the work and the idea of the occasional work are thus codependent: the very concept of appropriation requires that something potentially autonomous has been appropriated. In this connection, it is worth noting that the term *Gelegenheitsstück* and its cognates – *Gelegenheitswerk* and *Gelegenheitsmusik* – are ubiquitous in German critical writing on music and theatre in the 1790s. The reliance on the concept of the occasional work to describe the explosion of patriotic music that accompanied the outbreak of hostilities in Europe is a kind of negative trace of the rising intellectual currency of the work concept. To be sure, the terms *Gelegenheitsstück*, *Gelegenheitswerk* and *Gelegenheitsmusik* do not appear in any contemporary music dictionaries or encyclopaedias, but most likely because the concept originated in the literary sphere, where the term *Gelegenheitsgedicht* described established genres of celebratory verse – the Pindaric ode not least among them.[65] Perhaps prompted by the wartime surge in the number of occasional pieces, Johann Christian Adolf Grohmann, a staunch Kantian based at the time in Wittenberg, published his *Briefe über Gelegenheitsgedichte* (Letters on Occasional Poetry) in 1794, a treatise that betrays considerable anxiety about aesthetic autonomy: 'The artist should place himself not too near his object, but also not too far' (*der Künstler stelle sich dem Gegenstande nicht zu nahe, aber auch nicht zu ferne*), he equivocates, recognizing by implication that art was a power in its own right.[66]

If Haydn's 'heroic' music instantiated art's new power, one should not be surprised that the state was so eager to harness it for its own ends. 'I had a text fashioned by the worthy poet Haschka', wrote Count Joseph Franz Saurau of 'Gott erhalte', 'and to have it set to music, I turned to our immortal compatriot Haydn, who, I felt, was the only man capable of creating something that could be placed at the side of . . . "God Save the King" '.[67] Music that is thus 'drafted in' to speak on behalf of institutions or ideologies rather than to echo

62 Griesinger claims that Haydn told him that he 'was interested in surprising the public with something new' when he composed the famous Andante of Symphony No. 94; see Griesinger, 'Biographical Notes', 33. The central argument of Thomas Tolley's *Painting the Cannon's Roar* is that Haydn's music created and responded to an 'attentive listening public' by adapting a primarily English culture of attentive looking to the medium of music, through pictorial and atmospheric effects. Annette Richards discusses Haydn's London Symphonies in the context of the aesthetic of the 'picturesque'; see *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 104–109 and 118–119. David Schroeder has theorized the specifically 'public' style of the London Symphonies in *Haydn and the Enlightenment: The Late Symphonies and Their Audience* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1990). Meanwhile, Gretchen Wheelock has argued that a newly 'public' style of composition, calling for greater, and more self-conscious, listener engagement as a result of playful or subversive compositional strategies, is evident earlier than the London Symphonies: in the Op. 33 string quartets onwards, which is to say, from Haydn's Artaria publications of the 1780s. See *Haydn's 'Ingenious Jesting With Art': Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer, 1992), particularly 195–206.

63 *Painting the Cannon's Roar*, 259.

64 Susanne Langer, *Philosophy in a New Key: A Study in the Symbolism of Reason, Rite, and Art* (New York: Mentor, 1951), 204.

65 Only the word *Gelegenheitsgedicht* is included in Adelung's dictionary. See Johann Christoph Adelung, *Grammatisch-kritischen Wörterbuch der hochdeutschen Mundart*, volume 2 (Vienna, 1811), column 529.

66 J. C. A. Grohmann, 'Briefe über Gelegenheitsgedichte', *Der Neue Teutsche Merkur* (June 1794), 140.

67 Landon, *Haydn: The Years of 'The Creation'*, 241.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

them cannot merely be the ventriloquism of the occasion, but must have its own voice.[68] And this, perhaps, is what makes much of Haydn's music from the 1790s both 'modern' and 'political'. Its new brand of cultural influence, notionally independent from official forms of state power, amounted to a form of the consensual and informal control that Gramsci would call hegemony – the kind of control commensurate with the development of civil societies that were themselves notionally independent from the state.[69] Indeed, Haydn's music appears to take up the role that Friedrich Schiller had envisioned for art in his 1794 treatise *On the Aesthetic Education of Man*, mediating between the state and its citizens, reconciling duty with inclination: 'the State remains forever a stranger to its citizens', he complained, 'since at no point does it ever make contact with their feeling'.[70] It would not be long before Metternich was practising this most modern form of social control, encouraging the components of a renewed but closely policed Viennese public sphere: 'the newspapers are worth to Napoleon an army of three hundred thousand men', he wrote in 1808, 'for such a force would not overlook the interior better, or frighten foreign powers more, than half a dozen of his paid pamphleteers'.[71]

By this time 'Gott erhalte' was widely portrayed not as a method of enforcing loyalty to the sovereign, but rather as a means of internalizing civic obedience – which Haydn himself supposedly reinforced through the daily ritual of playing his hymn. In 1808 Sigismund Neukomm reported that Haydn, in spite of his age and frailty, played 'three or four times daily his ever-beautiful song'.[72] Three years later August Wilhelm Iffland, recalling an earlier encounter with the composer, had Haydn describe the spiritual nourishment that 'Gott erhalte' afforded:

> He played the melody all the way through with indescribable expression, with deep feeling – which his glistening eyes reflected. After the song was ended, he remained in front of the instrument for a while, placed both hands on it and said in the tone of a worthy patriarch: 'I play this song every morning, and often I have gained comfort and strength from it, in days of unrest. I can't do differently; I must play it every day. I feel very well indeed when I'm playing it, and for a while afterwards too.'[73]

Dies likewise claimed that Haydn soothed his ageing nerves with 'Gott erhalte' whenever he became confused and agitated, as if the composer's loyalty to the state had been literally internalized by his body.[74]

The apotheosis of this trope about 'Gott erhalte' is the story, reported by both Dies and Griesinger, that Haydn played his hymn even in the hours of his death, during the French assaults of 1809. Griesinger writes:

> Haydn loved his fatherland and his royal family with deepest loyalty. As often as warm weather and his strength permitted, he was taken, in the last two years of his life, to his innermost room for the

68 In a music-theoretical rather than historiographical context, Burnham proposes the analogous idea that 'if we wish to grant music the power to speak of other things, we inherently need to understand music as music, as an autonomous voice: we couldn't reasonably expect something without its own voice to comment on anything – something without its own voice would at best be a mouthpiece for something else'. Scott Burnham, 'Theorists and "The Music Itself"', *Journal of Musicology* 15/3 (1997), 326.

69 Habermas's influential account of the development of the public sphere defines civil society by its notional independence from the coercion of the state; see Jürgen Habermas, *The Structural Transformation of the Public Sphere: An Inquiry into a Category of Bourgeois Society*, trans. Thomas Bürger (Cambridge: Polity, 1989), 57–89, particularly 73–79.

70 Friedrich Schiller, *On the Aesthetic Education of Man*, ed. and trans. Elizabeth M. Wilkinson and L. A. Willoughby (Oxford: Clarendon, 1967), 37. For a reading of Schiller's aesthetics as a theory of hegemony see Eagleton, *Ideology of the Aesthetic*, chapter 4.

71 Cited and translated in Langsam, *German Nationalism in Austria*, 58.

72 H. C. Robbins Landon, *Haydn Chronicle and Works*, volume 5: *The Late Years 1801-1809* (Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1977), 372.

73 Landon, *Haydn: The Late Years*, 372.

74 Albert Christoph Dies, 'Biographical Accounts of Joseph Haydn According to His Spoken Narration', in *Haydn: Two Contemporary Portraits*, ed. and trans. Vernon Gotwals (London: University of Wisconsin Press, 1968), 141.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press

> sole purpose of playing his song *Gott erhalte Franz den Kaiser!* on the pianoforte. . . . On May 10 in the morning a French army corps pushed on to the Mariahülf line, which is not far from Haydn's dwelling. . . . From this hour on, physical weakness grew. Still Haydn played his Emperor's Hymn daily, and on May 26 even three times in succession, with an expressiveness at which he himself was amazed.[75]

Dies's version of the story reports that Haydn 'had his servants gather around him and played to them in exaltation the Emperor Hymn'.[76]

Dies and Griesinger thus make Haydn's noble death into an allegory of his music's new social power: the heroic Haydn exercises a potent form of aesthetic control, his music a sublimation of more direct forms of coercion, exerting a subtle power deep within its hearers. And, as the Austrian state soon realized, the power of music was at once a more attractive and perhaps a more effective form of influence than any direct imposition of authority – a musical means of wielding power appropriate to the emerging civil societies of post-revolutionary Europe.

75 Griesinger, 'Biographical Notes', 49–50.

76 Dies, 'Biographical Accounts', 194.

https://doi.org/10.1017/S1478570607000681 Published online by Cambridge University Press