

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

a
ASHGATE

Volume 2, Issue 2



NINETEENTH-CENTURY
MUSIC REVIEW

VOLUME 2, ISSUE 2
2005

ASHGATE

Published in association with the Centre for
Nineteenth-Century Music, Durham University, UK

Letters to the Editor For any communication concerning published articles or reviews, please send letters by email or hard copy to the General Editor:

Dr Bennett Zon
School of Music
Durham University
Palace Green
Durham DH1 3RL
England

Email: bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk

Subscriptions For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Nicky Staszkievicz
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Gower House
Croft Road
Aldershot
Hants GU11 3HR
England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 351804

Fax: +44 (0)1252 351839

Email: journals@ashgatepublishing.com

Themed Issues

The General Editor of *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* encourages proposals from individuals with ideas for themed issues, involving the commissioning of up to six main articles per issue, as well as one or more review articles for coverage of books, CDs and scores. Those applying to the journal for this purpose should initially provide the General Editor with a statement of no more than 500 words, outlining the thematic nature of the proposed issue, the names of contributing authors along with a working title for their papers, and a timetable for submission of work.

Proposers of themed issues work alongside the General Editor, and are designated Guest Editors. They are responsible for commissioning, organizing and preparing articles for publication, as well as working closely with review editors to locate suitable material and authors for relevant sections of the journal. Review sections of themed issues are not exclusively thematicized, and tend towards a balance of half themed, and half general material.

Articles commissioned for themed issues follow the same process of peer-review as general issues. No guarantee of publication can be given to specially commissioned authors.

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Editor of this Issue
Kerry Murphy

General Editor
Bennett Zon

Book Reviews Editor
Anna Celenza

Music Reviews Editor
Jeremy Dibble

Score Reviews Editor
Stephen Downes

Editorial Board

Dr Bennett Zon, Durham University,
UK (General Editor)

Professor Anna Celenza, Peabody
Conservatory and Johns Hopkins
University, USA (Book Reviews
Editor)

Dr Jeremy Dibble, Durham
University (Music Reviews Editor)

Dr Stephen Downes, University of
Surrey, UK

Professor William Weber, California
State University, Long Beach,
USA

Dr Phyllis Weliver, Wilkes
University, USA

Advisory Board

Dr Rosamund Bartlett, Durham
University, UK

Professor Andrew Bowie, Royal
Holloway, University of London,
UK

Dr Geoffrey Chew, Royal
Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor John Deathridge, King's
College, University of London, UK

Professor Annegret Fauser,
University of North Carolina, Chapel
Hill, USA

Dr Peter Franklin, University of
Oxford, UK

Dr Sophie Fuller

Professor Lydia Goehr, Columbia
University, USA

Professor Thomas Grey, Stanford
University, USA

Professor Hervé Lacombe, Université
Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France

Professor Roberta Marvin, University
of Iowa, USA

Professor Simon McVeigh,
Goldsmiths College, University of
London, UK

Professor Julian Rushton, University
of Leeds, UK

Professor Jim Samson, Royal
Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor Manuela Schwartz,
Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal
(FH), Germany

Professor Nicholas Temperley,
University of Illinois, USA

© Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2005

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Gower House
Croft Road
Aldershot
Hants GU11 3HR
England

Ashgate Publishing Company
Suite 420
101 Cherry Street
Burlington, VT 05401-4405
USA

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A. F. Leighton-Thomas.

Ashgate website: <http://www.ashgate.com>

ISSN: 1479-4098

Typeset by Manton Typesetters, Louth, Lincolnshire

Printed by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

Contents

VOLUME 2, ISSUE 2

Note from the Editor	ix
Kerry Murphy	
Introduction: Choral Concert Life in the Late Nineteenth-Century ‘Metropolis of the Southern Hemisphere’	xi

ARTICLES

Thérèse Radic	
Major Choral Organizations in Late Nineteenth-Century Melbourne	3
Janice B. Stockigt	
A Study of British Influence on Musical Taste and Programming: New Choral Works Introduced to Audiences by the Melbourne Philharmonic Society, 1876–1901	29
Kerry Murphy	
‘Volk von Brüdern’: The German-speaking Liedertafel in Melbourne	55
Jennifer Hill	
‘A Source of Enjoyment’: The Social Dimension of the Melbourne Liedertafels in the Late Nineteenth Century	77
Suzanne Cole	
‘As Much by Force of Circumstances as by Ambition’: The Programming Practices of the Melbourne Liedertafel Societies, 1880–1905	107
Jennifer Royle	
Musical (Ad)venturers: Colonial Composers and Composition in Melbourne, 1870–1901	133

REVIEWS

Book Reviews

T.J. Hochstrasser	
<i>Music and German National Identity</i> edited by Celia Applegate and Pamela Potter	163
Diana Bickley	
<i>The Musical Madhouse (Les Grottesques de la musique)</i> by Hector Berlioz, translated and edited by Alastair Bruce	166
Patrick Warfield	
<i>A Singing Ambivalence: American Immigrants between Old World and New, 1830–1930</i> by Victor R. Greene	170

- Charles Youmans
Nietzsche and Music by Georges Liébert, translated by David Pellauer and Graham Parkes 173
- Richard Giarusso
Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style edited by Michael Musgrave and Bernard Sherman 176
- Leslie David Blasius
Hugo Riemann and the Birth of Modern Musical Thought by Alexander Rehding 179
- Roe-Min Kok
Schumann's Piano Cycles and the Novels of Jean Paul by Erika Reiman 182
- John E. Druesedow
Bound for America: Three British Composers by Nicholas Temperley 186
- Monika Hennemann
Mendelssohn: A Life in Music by R. Larry Todd 190
- Books Received 194
- CD Review Article*
- Nigel Simeone
Debussy: Piano Works. Vol. One: Tall Poppies TP094 (79:00): Images, Series One; Etudes, Book One; 'Étude retrouvée'; Etudes, Book Two; Images, Series Two. Vol. Two: Tall Poppies TP123 (71:38): Images (1894) ('Images oubliées'); Préludes, Book Two; Berceuse héroïque; Page d'album; Elégie; 'Second Suite bergamasque' (Masques, D'un cahier d'esquisses, L'Isle joyeuse); Vol. Three: Tall Poppies TP164 (74:44): Morceau de concours; Estampes; Préludes, Book One; Les Soirs illuminés par l'ardeur du charbon; The little Nigar; Hommage à Haydn; Pour le piano; La plus que lente. Vol. Four: Tall Poppies TP165 (73:04): Danse bohémienne; Intermède; Rêverie; Mazurka; Danse; Ballade; Valse romantique; Deux arabesques; Suite bergamasque; Nocturne; Children's Corner. Roy Howat *pf* 196
- CD Reviews*
- Kenneth Hamilton
Alkan: 48 Esquisses op. 63. Steven Osborne *pf* 202
- Julian Rushton
Berlioz: Les Troyens/The Trojans. Susan Graham (Dido), Anna Caterina Antonacci (Cassandre), Renata Pokupić (Anna), Gregory Kunde (Enée), Ludovic Tézier (Chorèbe), Nicolas Testé (Panthée), Laurent Naouri (Narbal/Le Grand Prêtre), Mark Padmore (Iopas), René Schirrer (Priam/Mercure), Monteverdi Choir, Choeur du Théâtre du Châtelet, Orchestre Révolutionnaire et Romantique, Sir John Eliot Gardiner *cond* 204

Elaine Kelly	
Brahms: Clarinet Sonata in F minor op. 120 no. 1; Clarinet Sonata in E \flat major op. 120 no. 2. Thea King <i>cl</i> , Clifford Benson <i>pf</i>	207
Michael Struck	
Brahms: Four-hand Piano Music Vol. 10: String Quartet in C minor op. 51 no. 1; String Quartet in A minor op. 51 no. 2. Silke-Thora Matthies and Christian Köhn <i>pf</i>	210
Antonio Cascelli	
Chopin: Four Ballades and Four Scherzos: Ballade No. 1 in G minor op. 23; Scherzo No. 1 in B minor op. 20; Ballade No. 2 in A minor op. 38; Scherzo No. 2 in B \flat minor op. 31; Ballade No. 3 in A \flat major op. 47; Scherzo No. 3 in C \sharp minor op. 39; Ballade No. 4 in F minor op. 52; Scherzo No. 4 in E major op. 54. Stephen Hough <i>pf</i>	214
Michael Murphy	
Romantic Violin Concerto Vol. 4: Moszkowski: Violin Concerto in C op. 30; Ballade in G minor op. 16 no. 1; Karłowicz: Violin Concerto in A op. 8. Tasmin Little <i>vn</i> , BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra, Martyn Brabbins <i>cond</i>	217
Nicole Grimes	
Schoenberg: String Quartets: Presto in C major; Scherzo in F major; String Quartet in D major; String Quartet No. 1 op. 7; String Quartet No. 2 op. 10 (with String Quartet No. 3 op. 30 and String Quartet No. 4 op. 37). Aron Quartet with Anna Maria Pammer <i>sop</i>	220
Douglass Seaton	
Schumann: Symphony No. 2 in C major op. 61; Symphony No. 4 in D minor op. 120. Orchestre des Champs Elysées, Philippe Herreweghe <i>cond</i>	222
David Brown	
Tchaikovsky: Piano Concerto No. 1 in B \flat minor op. 23; Piano Concerto No. 3 in E \flat major op. 75; Andante and Finale op. 79 (orch. Sergey Taneyev). Konstantin Scherbakov <i>pf</i> , Russian Philharmonic Orchestra, Dmitry Yablonsky <i>cond</i>	225
Martin Clarke	
The English Hymn 5: 'Lead, Kindly Light' – Hymns of Faith and Assurance. The Choir of Wells Cathedral, Malcolm Archer <i>director</i> , Rupert Gough <i>org</i>	226
CDs Received	229
<i>Score Reviews</i>	
Kenneth Hamilton	
Liszt: <i>Free Arrangements and Transcriptions for Piano Solo</i> edited by Istvan Kassai and Imre Sulyok	231
John Michael Cooper	
Mendelssohn: <i>Sinfonie Nr. 1 (Fassung 1829) für Klavier zu vier Händen mit Violine und Violoncello (ad lib.) c-moll</i> edited by Ralf Wehner	233

Marina Frolova-Walker	
Rachmaninoff: <i>Fugue in D minor</i> (1891); <i>Suite in D minor</i> (1891)	240
Daniel M. Grimley	
Sibelius: <i>Solo Songs with Orchestra</i> edited by Kari Kilpeläinen and Timo Virtanen; <i>Solo Songs with Piano</i> edited by Jukka Tiilikainen	242
Sophie Fuller	
Smyth: <i>Trio in D minor for violin, cello and piano</i> (1880) edited and with foreword by Margaret Lucia and Terry King	245
Scores Received	248
Guidelines for Contributors	251