**International Journal of** 

# TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT IN HEALTH CARE



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

### International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care

Official Journal of the International Society for Technology Assessment in Health Care

#### **Editors**

Egon Jonsson, Ph.D.:
Professor
The Karolinska Institute and the
Swedish Council on Technology
Assessment in Health Care
P.O. Box 16158
103 24 Stockholm, Sweden
(tel.) 46 8 611-1913
(fax) 46 8 611-7973

Stanley J. Reiser, M.D., Ph.D.
Professor, Program on Humanities
and Technology in Health Care
The University of Texas—Houston
Health Science Center
P.O. Box 20708
Houston, Texas 77225, U.S.A.
(tel.) 713 792-5140
(fax) 713 792-5141

Aims and Scope: The International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care has as its specific scope of interest the generation, evaluation, diffusion, and use of health care technology. It addresses the diverse audience of health care providers within medicine, nursing, and the allied health professions; decision makers in government, industry, and health care organizations; and the scholarly disciplines such as ethics, economics, law, history, sociology, psychology, and engineering. The journal aims to fill the needs of those interested in the complexities of interaction between people and technology; technology as a force in social and organizational change; and technology as it is created, produced, applied, and paid for. It examines descriptively and analytically the effects of technology as perceived from the vantage point of different academic disciplines and policy-making organizations and examines methods necessary to conduct studies and evaluations of technology.

The focus of the journal will be the international health care community. The experience of different countries in their encounter with health care technology, viewed comparatively, is invaluable to understanding its effects. Further, it is important to establish ties with the scholars, governments, and private institutions concerned with health care technology so that the experiences and learning of the international community in its parts can benefit the whole. The use of technology in health care has created some of the major dilemmas in society today. The journal will serve as a forum for the wide range of professionals interested in the assessment of medical technology, its consequences for patients, and its impact on society.

Membership in the International Society for Technology Assessment in Health Care: Members receive the journal at individual rates and can participate in the Society's activities, including the annual meeting. Individual dues for 1994, including the journal, are US \$90 for regular membership and US \$50 for student membership, payable to Cambridge.

Publishing, Production, and Advertising Offices: Cambridge University Press, 40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011, U.S.A.

Subscription Offices: Cambridge University Press, 110 Midland Avenue, Port Chester, NY 10573, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England (for U.K. and elsewhere).

1994 Subscription Information: International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care (ISSN 0266-4623) is published quarterly. Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 10 (1994): US \$126.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £77.00 elsewhere. Individual rates: US \$90.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £50.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage and insurance; air mail or registered mail is extra. Back volume prices are available upon request.

#### Copyright © 1994 Cambridge University Press

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press.

Photocopying Information (for users in the U.S.A.): The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0266-4623/94 \$5.00 + .00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transactional Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying; contact the nearest Cambridge University Press office.

Second-class postage paid at New York, NY, and additional mailing offices.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to: International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care, Journals Department, Cambridge University Press, 110 Midland Avenue, Port Chester, NY 10573, U.S.A.

## International Journal of Technology Assessment in Health Care

Volume 10 1994 Number 1

#### **CONTENTS**

SPECIAL SECTION: VACCINES AND PUBLIC HEALTH:

ASSESSING TECHNOLOGIES AND Guest Editors: Phyllis Freeman Regina Rabinovich Anthony Robbins		
Introduction: Vaccine Technologies a Review Now?  Phyllis Freeman	and Public Health: Why a Critical  Anthony Robbins	1
The Promise of New Technologies  John R. La Montagne	N. Regina Rabinovich	7
The Effectiveness of Means of Contr Kenneth S. Warren	folling Communicable Diseases	14
The Contribution of Immunization to David Parker	o Economic Development  Terrel Hill	21
The Role of Vaccine Research and D Development of Middle-Income Coun Adolfo Martínez-Palomo Malaquías López-Cervantes		30
The Global Capacity for Manufactur Competition and Collaboration Amo Anthony Robbins		39
The Transfer of Vaccine Technology American Experience Akira Homma	to Developing Countries: The Latin  Robert F. Knouss	47
New Challenges in Quality Control as Kenneth R. Brown	nd Licensure: Regulation  R. Gordon Douglas, Jr.	55
The Desired Field-Performance Chara for the Developing World Ciro A. de Quadros Peter Carrasco	acteristics of New Improved Vaccines  Jean-Marc Olivé	65
Desirable Immunologic Characteristic Ideal Vaccine Gordon Ada	es for the Development of an	71
Modern Concepts in Immune Recogn Relevance for the Development of Us Ronald N. Germain		81
Effective Mucosal Immunity: Current Immune Response Analysis  Jerry R. McGhee	Concepts for Vaccine Delivery and  Hiroshi Kiyono	- 93

Adjuvants and Immune Enhancement  Anthony C. Allison	107
Novel Approaches to Controlled-Release Antigen Delivery  Smadar Cohen Robert Langer  Maria J. Alonso	121
Live Attenuated Vaccine Vectors  John J. Mekalanos	131
Maternal Immunization to Prevent Infectious Diseases in the Neonate or Infant  Richard A. Insel  Marvin Amstey  Kathleen Woodin  Michael Pichichero	143
Immunization of the Neonate  Alexander R. Lawton	154
Synthetic Peptides and Purified Antigens as Vaccines Fred Brown	161
Glycoconjugate Vaccines: What Next?  Kathryn E. Stein	167
The Thermostability of Vaccines: Technologies for Improving the Thermostability of the Oral Poliovirus Vaccine  Stanley M. Lemon Julie B. Milstien	177
Combination Vaccines  Ronald W. Ellis  R. Gordon Douglas, Jr.	185
Conclusion: A New Technologic Synthesis: The Children's Vaccine Initiative Suryanarayan Ramachandran Philip K. Russell	193
TECHNOLOGY ASSESSMENT REPORTS	
Report from the Center for Technology Assessment and Quality Improvement in Health Care of the Veneto Region (Italy)  Establishment of a Regional Center for Technology Assessment and Quality Improvement in Health Care	197
Reports from the Conseil d'évaluation des technologies de la santé du Québec	198
Routine Preoperative Chest X-rays Screening for Breast Cancer in Women Aged 40-49 Years	
Report from the French Agence nationale pour le developpement de l'evaluation medicale (ANDEM)  Evaluation of the Application of Nocturnal Nasal Continuous Positive Airway  Pressure in the Treatment of Obstructive Sleep Apnea	200
Report from the U.K. King's Fund Centre  Criteria for Change: The History and Impact of Consensus Development  Conferences in the United Kingdom	202
Consensus Statement from the U.S. National Institutes of Health  Gallstones and Laparoscopic Cholecystectomy	203
MEETINGS AND ANNOUNCEMENTS	205
CONTRIBUTORS	206

### International Journal of **Technology Assessment in Health Care**

#### **Editors**

Egon Jonsson, Ph.D.

**Professor** 

The Karolinska Institute and the Swedish Council on Technology Assessment in Health Care P.O. Box 16158 103 24 Stockholm, Sweden

Stanley J. Reiser, M.D., Ph.D. Professor, Program on Humanities and Technology in Health Care The University of Texas—Houston Health Science Center P.O. Box 20708 Houston, Texas, 77225, U.S.A.

Bernard S. Bloom, Ph.D. Research Associate Professor University of Pennsylvania Medical School

Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

#### Richard Chrzanowski, M.D.

Institut Suisse de la Santé Publique Aarau, Switzerland

#### Paul F. Gross

Director Institute of Health Economics and Technology Assessment North Sydney, Australia

#### Ruth S. Hanft, Ph.D., Sc.D. (Hon.)

Professor

Department of Health Services Management and Policy The George Washington University Washington, DC, U.S.A.

#### Akinori Hisashige

**Professor** Suzuka University of Medical Science and Technology Suzuka, Japan

#### **Associate Editors**

Samuel Korper, Ph.D., M.P.H. Associate Director for Planning, Analysis, and International

National Institute on Aging, N.I.H. Bethesda, Maryland, U.S.A.

#### Frederick Mosteller, Ph.D.

**Director** 

Activities

**Technology Assessment Group** Department of Health Policy and Management Harvard School of Public Policy Boston, Massachusetts, U.S.A.

#### Jorge Peña-Mohr, Ph.D.

Pan American Health Organization Pan American Sanitary Bureau World Health Organization Washington, DC, U.S.A.

#### Seymour Perry, M.D.

Professor

Department of Community and Family Medicine Georgetown University School of Medicine Washington, DC, U.S.A.

#### Tore Scherstén, M.D.

**Professor** Dean, Faculty of Medicine University of Göteborg Department of Surgery Göteborg, Sweden

Jane E. Sisk, Ph.D. Columbia University School of Public Health New York, New York, U.S.A.

Stephan Tanneberger, M.D., Ph.D.

**Professor Division of Oncology** Saint Orsola Malpighi Policlinic Hospital Bologna, Italy

#### Norman Weissman, Ph.D.

Director

Center for General Health Services and **Experimental Research** Agency for Health Care Policy and Research Rockville, Maryland, U.S.A.

#### Elizabeth Heitman, Ph.D.

Assistant Editor Program on Humanities and Technology in Health Care The University of Texas—Houston Health Science Center Houston, Texas, U.S.A.

#### **Editorial Board**

Jeremiah A. Barondess, M.D. Per Buch Andreasen, M.D., **President** Ph.D. Department of

New York Academy of Medicine New York, New York, U.S.A.

#### Clyde Behney

Health Program Manager Office of Technology Assessment Congress of the United States Washington, DC, U.S.A.

Robert Brook, M.D., Sc.D. The Rand Corporation

**UCLA Schools of Medicine** and Public Health Santa Monica, California, U.S.A.

Roger Bulger, M.D.

President Association of Academic **Health Centers** Washington, DC, U.S.A.

#### **Professor** University of Limburg Maastricht, Netherlands

H. David Banta, M.D., M.P.H.

Gastroenterology and Clinical Pharmacology

Hellerup, Denmark

**Gentofte University Hospital** 

#### **Editorial Board (continued)**

John P. Bunker, M.D., MRCP
CRC Clinical Trials Centre
King's College School of Medicine
and Dentistry
Rayne Institute
London, England

E. N. Chigan, M.D.

Director
Division of Noncommunicable
Diseases and Health Technology

World Health Organization Geneva, Switzerland

John L. Cova

Director
Medical Technology Assessment
Health Insurance Association
of America
Washington, DC, U.S.A.

Luigi Donato, M.D.

Professor Instituto de Fisiología Clinica CNR Pisa, *Italy* 

Robert Evans, Ph.D.

Professor
Department of Economics
University of British Columbia
Vancouver, British Columbia,
Canada

David Feeny, Ph.D.

Professor McMaster University Hamilton, Ontario, Canada

Glovanni N. Fracchia
Commission of the European
Communities

Brussels, Belgium

**Alicia Granados** 

Director
Department of Health
and Social Security
Barcelona, Spain

Peter F. Hjort, M.D.

Professor National Institute of Public Health Oslo, *Norway* 

Naoki Ikegami, M.D.

Professor Keio University School of Medicine Tokyo, *Japan* 

Ted R. Mannen

Executive Vice President
Health Industry Manufacturers
Association
Washington, DC, U.S.A.

Jean-Paul Moatti

Bureau des Etudes Economiques et Sociales INSERM Paris, *France* 

Duncan Neuhauser, Ph.D.

Professor
Department of Community
Health
School of Medicine
Case Western Reserve
University
Cleveland, Ohio, U.S.A.

Miriam Orleans, Ph.D.

Professor
Department of Preventive
Medicine and Biometrics
University of Colorado
Health Services Center
Denver, Colorado, U.S.A.

Frederick C. Robbins, M.D.

University Professor
Case Western Reserve
University
Cleveland, Ohio, U.S.A.

Steven Schroeder, M.D.

President

Robert Wood Johnson Foundation Princeton, New Jersey, *U.S.A.* 

Mordechai Shani, M.D.

Director

The Chaim Sheba Medical Center Tel-Hashomer, *Israel* 

Jacobo A. Tieffenberg, M.D.

President ACINDES Buenos Aires, Argentina

**Ted Tyson** 

President
Tyson Consulting Group
Buffalo Grove, Illinois, *U.S.A.* 

Johannes Vang, M.D., Ph.D.

**Professor** 

Manager, European Program for Hospitals and Health Institutions World Health Organization Copenhagen, Denmark

Judith L. Wagner, Ph.D.
Office of Technology Assessment
Congress of the United States
Washington, DC, U.S.A.

Kara K. McArthur Production Editor

The University of Texas—Houston Health Science Center Houston, Texas, *U.S.A.*