



in his paper 'Haydn's Debt to Cimarosa' that Haydn's opera *La fedeltà premiata* (1780) borrowed not only a libretto set by Cimarosa the previous season, but also a daring succession of keys in the first-act finale. While Haimo's argument for the borrowed key plan in the opera was convincing, the spirited discussion afterward seemed to question whether this encounter with the music of Cimarosa was also the source of certain remote keys in inner movements of Haydn's instrumental music. Matthew McAllister (Florida State University) introduced the music of a little known Scots composer in 'The Model Student: A Study of Thomas Erskine's Modeling of Symphonies by Johann Stamitz'. Not only did Erskine begin two of his overtures with themes copied from Stamitz symphonies, he also adapted other elements of Stamitz's compositional process through a type of modular construction of rhythms, melodies and phrases. The session ended with the outlining of an ambitious theoretical model for understanding style in the keyboard works of C. P. E. Bach and their possible influence on Haydn in 'Methods of Large-Scale Rhythmic and Tonal Organization as Stylistic Features of Haydn's Instrumental Sonatas', presented by Jason Yust (University of Washington). Using a mathematical model known as maximal outerplanar graphs in a reductive type of analysis, Yust found significant differences in the background structures of the two composers.

The joint conference presented a unique experience for those attending from each society: more emphasis on Haydn than in previous meetings of the Society for Eighteenth-Century Music, and a broad range of composers and topics for those members of the Haydn Society of North America. Proceedings from this conference will be published by Steglein, <www.steglein.com>, and more information about the two societies is available at <www.secm.org> and <www.rit.edu/haydnsociety>.

R. TODD ROBER



doi:10.1017/S147857060800167X Printed in the United Kingdom

CUARTO COLOQUIO MUSICAT. HARMONIA MUNDI: LOS INSTRUMENTOS SONOROS EN IBEROAMÉRICA, SIGLOS XVI–XIX (FOURTH MUSICAT CONFERENCE. HARMONIA MUNDI: MUSICAL INSTRUMENTS IN LATIN AMERICA, XVI–XIX CENTURIES)

GUADALAJARA, JALISCO, MEXICO, 10–13 MARCH 2008

In 2002, Lucero Enríquez and colleagues at the Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (UNAM) founded a multidisciplinary seminar to study the music of viceregal New Spain and early independent Mexico. Six years later, MUSICAT, the ongoing Seminario Nacional de Música en la Nueva España y el México Independiente thrives as the premier organization investigating viceregal musics at an international level and counts among its successes the creation of online databases of archival inventories and references to music-making in cathedral documents, the conservation and study of 121 monophonic choirbooks at the cathedral of Mexico and a series of peer-reviewed publications. MUSICAT aims systematically to collect data about music and music-making in New Spain as a tool for researching musical culture from the perspectives of musicology, history, sociology, anthropology, linguistics, art history, and related fields, and, as such, its publications depart significantly from the positivist epistemologies common in Spanish-language music studies.

Following meetings in Mexico City (2004), Oaxaca (2005) and Puebla (2007), MUSICAT hosted its fourth thematic conference in March 2008 at the eighteenth-century Hospicio Cabañas in Guadalajara, Jalisco, on the topic of musical instruments in viceregal Latin America. Scholars from Mexico, the United States, Spain and Argentina presented a total of twenty papers, half of which focused exclusively on eighteenth-century topics. Beyond the confines of the paper sessions, a concert of classical guitar music at a



former Carmelite convent and a demonstration of Guadalajara Cathedral's contemporary organ afforded opportunities to reflect upon the conflicted legacy of viceregal musical traditions in Mexico today.

The keynote speaker, Laurence Libin (Curator Emeritus of Musical Instruments, Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York), discussed the topic of 'Musical Instruments in Cultural Context' with the assistance of live simultaneous translation into Spanish. Citing case studies of both western and non-western instruments, Libin showed how instruments signify culturally constructed ideas such as social hierarchies, gender, politics, propriety and beauty, and how those meanings can be misunderstood or altered over time. In discussing the European origin of musical instruments in Mexico, Libin pointed out how curiously few harpsichords or other keyboard instruments survive there, a point echoed by Lucero Enríquez's 'Entre cuerdas y castañuelas: un vistazo sonoro a la Nueva España galante' ('Between Strings and Castanets: A Sonic View of Galant New Spain'). Enríquez constructed a critical panorama of Enlightenment culture in New Spain and its seemingly ambivalent attitude towards domestic music-making, and drew attention to the absence of musical instruments from aristocratic portraiture as well as their signification of race and lower social stature in 'casta' paintings. Amazingly, though, instruments similar to those expected to be encountered in, but nonetheless absent from, viceregal inventories and visual representations of nobles survive in contemporary Mexico as folk instruments, as noted by anthropologist Victor Hernández Vaca (Colegio de Michoacán). In 'Tradiciones violeras españolas transplantadas a la Nueva España: el caso de Texquitote, San Luis Potosí' ('Spanish Viol-making Traditions Transplanted to New Spain: The Case of Texquitote, San Luis Potosí'), Hernández applied Carlos Herrejón's theory of the 'cycle of tradition' to ethnography in order to explain how string instruments following more or less seventeenth-century forms continue to be manufactured and played in rural Mexico.

In New Spain, prominent religious institutions constituted the primary patrons of music and signalling the distinctions among them helps understand the larger musical culture. Focusing on the most powerful church, Javier Marín López (Universidad de Jaén, Spain) synthesized the sonic evolution of the musical chapel at the cathedral of Mexico from the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries in 'Tradición e innovación en los instrumentos musicales de la Catedral de México' ('Tradition and Innovation in Musical Instruments at the Cathedral of Mexico') and signalled both conservative and progressive periods in comparison with peninsular Spanish institutions. Meanwhile, scholars also considered other entities, such as communities of nuns and lay confraternities. For example, Citlali Campos Olivares (UNAM) examined traditions of teaching girls to sing and play the vihuela, harp, guitar and organ at a convent in the city of Mexico during the 1770s in 'Mujeres instrumentistas: aprendizaje en el colegio de Belem' ('Women Instrumentalists: Learning at the School of Belem'). In 'Música en la *Relación* escrita por Madre Josefa de la Providencia: las tradiciones de un beaterio limeño 1683–1738' ('Music in the *Relación* Written by Mother Josefa de la Providencia: Traditions of the Devout in Lima, 1683–1738'), Cristina Cruz Uribe (Yale University) assessed the role of music in a biographical account written by a Nazarene nun, noting the presence of monophonic devotional singing as well as improvisation on the vihuela. Also discussing the viceroyalty of Peru, Clarissa Pedrotti (Universidad Nacional de Córdoba, Argentina) evaluated how confraternities contributed to the musical life of a smaller cathedral city such as Tucumán, which formed the seat of the Jesuit province of Paraguay, in her presentation 'La periferia colonial: música en una cofradía de Córdoba del Tucumán' ('The Colonial Periphery: Music in a Confraternity in Córdoba del Tucumán').

The multidisciplinary spirit of MUSICAT rang through a topical panel about the social functions of church bells (*campanas*), not a traditional musical instrument per se, but nonetheless an inescapable sonic element of viceregal society. In '¿Hasta dónde resuenan las campanas?' ('How far do the bells resound?'), sociologist Lourdes Turrent (Centro de Arte Mexicano) reflected on how the regulations on the use of bells issued by the Archbishop of Mexico in 1772 articulated the regal aim to suppress the regular clergy's authority by attempting to limit the peeling of bells at churches other than the cathedral. Erika Salas Cassy (UNAM) discussed how the tolling of cathedral bells for funerals asserted viceregal social hierarchies in 'Las campanas, sus funciones y simbolismo en el ritual fúnebre catedralicio' ('The Functions and Symbolism of Bells in Cathedral Funereal Ritual'), which touched on the semiology inherent to a resounding urban



soundscape. Indeed, the idea that peeling bells might constitute a unique language also informed ‘Las campanas en una ciudad episcopal’ (‘Bells in a Cathedral City’) by Montserrat Galí Boadella (Benemérita Universidad Autónoma de Puebla), which differentiated between the meanings of late viceregal and early independent regulations in Puebla de los Ángeles. Finally, Arturo Camacho (Colegio de Jalisco), Patricia Díaz Cayeros (UNAM) and Daniela Gutiérrez (Universidad de Guadalajara) considered early nineteenth-century regulations on bells in their joint presentation ‘Llamado a sermón: sobre el reglamento de campanas para la Catedral de Guadalajara’ (‘Called to Order: On the Regulation of Bells in Guadalajara Cathedral’).

Mexico conserves one of the densest concentrations of pre-nineteenth-century pipe organs in the world and despite their appeal to the tourism industry in places like Oaxaca, little serious scholarship has been devoted to them. In a groundbreaking paper, ‘Innovaciones en la construcción de órganos en la Ciudad de México y de Puebla alrededor de 1700 y sus antecedentes en España’ (‘Innovations in Organ Construction in the City of Mexico and Puebla around 1700 and their Antecedents in Spain’), Edward Charles Pepe (independent scholar, Oaxaca) compared the monumental organs by Jorge de Sesma at the cathedral of Mexico and by Félix Yzaguirre at Puebla with peninsular instruments and proved that these organs were innovative not only for New Spain, but in the context of Spain itself. This led into a special debate about the techniques, ethics, politics and status of organ restoration featuring Pepe, Daniel Guzmán Vargas (organ builder, Mexico), Eduardo Bribiesca (organ builder, Spain), Ricardo Rodys filling in for Cecilia Winter (Instituto de Órganos Históricos de Oaxaca), and Miguel Arcángel Sandoval del Toro (organist, Guadalajara) with questions from the public fielded by Lucero Enríquez, Patricia Díaz Cayeros and myself. The issues raised included whether organs should be restored at all; whether the political goals of organ restoration rely more on the visual than the sonic aspect of the instrument; to what stage of its history an historic organ should be restored and whether a concept of ‘original’ applies; who should be involved in the decision-making process; and how restoration differs from preservation or repair. Frustratingly, the debate achieved little consensus, aside from a shared concern for caution in the process and the need for informed scholarly involvement, as several panellists lamented the consequences of disastrous interventions to organs in Europe. The debate occurred at a timely moment, as the gospel organ in the cathedral of Mexico has recently entered a restoration process.

Organs and cathedral music chapels inspired a series of informative chronicles including ‘Tendencias históricas de la capilla musical de Oaxaca’ (‘Historical Tendencies in the Musical Chapel of Oaxaca’) by Sergio Navarrete and Berenice Ibarra (Centro de Investigaciones y Estudios Superiores en Antropología Social); ‘Órganos y organeros de la Catedral de Oaxaca, 1544–2007’ (‘Organs and Organ Builders in Oaxaca Cathedral, 1544–2007’) by Ricardo Rodys; ‘El órgano de Santo Domingo, Zacatecas’ (‘The Organ of Santo Domingo, Zacatecas’) by Liliana Olvera Flores (Escuela Nacional de Conservación); ‘El órgano de la Catedral de Guadalajara, 1727–1730’ (‘The Organ of Guadalajara Cathedral, 1727–1730’) by Cristóbal Durán (Universidad de Guadalajara); ‘Instrumentos musicales en la Catedral de Guadalajara, 1740–1820’ (‘Musical Instruments in Guadalajara Cathedral, 1740–1820’) by Celina Becerra and Rafael González (Universidad de Guadalajara); and ‘Un acercamiento a la vida musical de la catedral de Mérida Yucatán en los siglos XVII y XVIII’ (‘A Glance at the Musical Life of the Cathedral of Mérida, Yucatán in the XVII and XVIII Centuries’) by Ángel Gutiérrez Romero (Universidad Autónoma de Yucatán), all of which gleaned data from cathedral chapter acts and documents. Discussions called for the need to merge documentary information with that on the physical remains of instruments themselves, as considerable discrepancies remain, especially in the case of Oaxaca. Unfortunately, the Guadalajara organ discussed by Durán, Becerra and González no longer exists, and rumours that the instrument had been transferred elsewhere in the late nineteenth century appear to be untrue.

Several papers on sixteenth-century topics enriched current understanding of the early viceregal period. Antonio Ruiz Caballero (Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de Hidalgo) used striking pictorial documents from the 1540s in his paper ‘Campanas y órganos: los artefactos de la discordia en el traslado de la catedral de Tzintzuntzan a Pátzcuaro, siglo XVI’ (‘Bells and Organs: Artifacts of Discord in the Sixteenth-Century Move of the Cathedral from Tzintzuntzan to Pátzcuaro’) to relate the ordeal of dragging



instruments overland when the cathedral seat of Michoacán was transferred. Taking a critical historical approach to early documentation from the cathedral of Mexico, Israel Álvarez Moctezuma (UNAM) problematized the cathedral chapter's relative silence about music-making and sketched the contributions of minstrels during the sixteenth century in 'Rumores de papel: indicios y re-construcciones de los instrumentos (y sus ministriles) en la Catedral Metropolitana de México' ('Rumors on Paper: Signs and Reconstructions of the Instruments of the Metropolitan Cathedral of Mexico'). Álvarez proposed differentiating between the two principal types of discourse about music in cathedral documents, top-down regulatory statutes and decisions in chapter acts instigated by more bottom-up practices. Finally, my 'La armonía de la conversión: ángeles músicos y el pensamiento agustino-neoplatónico' ('The Harmony of Conversion: Musical Angels and Augustinian Neoplatonic Thought') identified and interpreted the stone figures of angels playing the vihuela de mano and shawm that adorn the plateresque façades of the former Augustinian convents of Acolman, Metztitlán and Yuririapúndaro, central Mexican constructions from the 1550s through 1580s, in the contexts of contemporaneous transatlantic ideas of neoplatonism, mythology, harmony and iconography.

The papers presented in Guadalajara showed that musical culture in viceregal Latin America extended far beyond the traditions preserved in music manuscripts. The instruments approached through documents, visual art, and physical remains point to the complex and sometimes ambivalent roles of music-making in colonialist ancien regime societies and the even more delicate relationships between those societies and the present.

DREW EDWARD DAVIES