

VOL 101 NO 1096 NOVEMBER 2020

New Blackfriars



A REVIEW

Edited by the
Dominicans of the
English Province

ISSN 0028-4289

WILEY
Blackwell

Founded in 1920 *New Blackfriars* is edited by the English Dominicans

Editor - Brian Davies

Assistant Editor - John O'Connor

Reviews Editor - Robert Ombres

Associate Editor - Christopher Arroyo

Editorial Board - Helen Alford, Gary Anderson, Margaret Atkins, Michael Baur, Vivian Boland, Richard Conrad, Michael Dodds, John Drummond, Eamon Duffy, Nathan Eubank, Richard Finn, Simon Gaine, Martin Ganeri, David Goodill, Peter Groves, Simon Hewitt, Oliver Keenan, Fergus Kerr, Anthony Lisska, Denis Minns, Paul Murray, Richard Ounsworth, Aristotle Papanikolaou, Roger Pouivet, Timothy Radcliffe, Howard Robinson, Dominic Ryan, Michael Sherwin, Eleanor Stump, Simon Tugwell, Denys Turner, Gregory Murphy, Rik Van Nieuwenhove, Robert Verrill, Allan White

New Blackfriars is published by John Wiley & Sons Ltd, 9600 Garsington Road, Oxford OX4 2DQ, UK; Tel: +44 (0) 1865 776868; Fax: +44 (0) 1865 714591.

Production Editor: Anil Kumar (NBFR@wiley.com)

JOURNAL CUSTOMER SERVICES: For ordering information, claims and any enquiry concerning your journal subscription please go to www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask or contact your nearest office.

Americas: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +1 781 388 8598 or +1 800 835 6770 (Toll free in the USA & Canada).

Europe, Middle East and Africa: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +44 (0) 1865 778315.

Asia Pacific: Email: cs-journals@wiley.com; Tel: +65 6511 8000.

Japan: For Japanese speaking support, Email: cs-japan@wiley.com; Tel: +65 6511 8010 or Tel (Toll-free): 005 316 50 480.

Visit our Online Customer Help available in 7 languages at www.wileycustomerhelp.com/ask

Correspondence about editorial matters and books for review should be addressed to the Editor or the Reviews Editor, *New Blackfriars*, Blackfriars, Oxford OX1 3LY, UK; e-mail: nb.editor@english.op.org and nb.reviews@english.op.org

INFORMATION FOR SUBSCRIBERS: *New Blackfriars* Journal is published bi-monthly. Subscription prices for 2020 are:

	Europe	The Americas	Rest of World
Institutional print and online:	€438	US\$499	\$677
Personal print and online:	€ 60 (Europe, Euro zone) £ 60 (Europe, non-Euro zone)	US\$ 65	£ 38

Prices are exclusive of tax. Asia-Pacific GST, Canadian GST/HST and European VAT will be applied at the appropriate rates. For more information on current tax rates, please go to www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/tax-vat. The price includes online access to the current and all online back files to January 1st 2015, where available. For other pricing options, including access information and terms and conditions, please visit www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/access.

DELIVERY TERMS AND LEGAL TITLE: Where the subscription price includes print issues and delivery is to the recipient's address, delivery terms are **Delivered at Place (DAP)**; the recipient is responsible for paying any import duty or taxes. Title to all issues transfers FOB our shipping point, freight prepaid. We will endeavour to fulfil claims for missing or damaged copies within six months of publication, within our reasonable discretion and subject to availability.

BACK ISSUES: Single issues from current and recent volumes are available at the current single issue price from cs-journals@wiley.com. Earlier issues may be obtained from Periodicals Service Company, 351 Fairview Avenue – Ste 300, Hudson, NY 12534, USA. Tel: +1 518 822-9300, Fax: +1 518 822-9305, Email: psc@periodicals.com.

DISCLAIMER: The Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors cannot be held responsible for errors or any consequences arising from the use of information contained in this journal; the views and opinions expressed do not necessarily reflect those of the Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors, neither does the publication of advertisements constitute any endorsement by the Publisher, The Dominican Council and Editors of the products advertised.

PERIODICAL ID STATMENT: NEW BLACKFRIARS (ISSN 0028-4289) is published bi-monthly. US mailing agent: Mercury Media Processing, LLC 1850 Elizabeth Avenue, Suite #C, Rahway, NJ 07065 USA. Periodical postage paid at Rahway, NJ. Postmaster: Send all address changes to NEW BLACKFRIARS, John Wiley & Sons Inc., C/O The Sheridan Press, PO Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331.

COPYRIGHT AND COPYING (in any format): Copyright © 2020 The Dominican Council. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior permission in writing from the copyright holder. Authorization to copy items for internal and personal use is granted by the copyright holder for libraries and other users registered with their local Reproduction Rights Organisation (RRO), e.g. Copyright Clearance Centre (CCC), 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA (www.copyright.com), provided the appropriate fee is paid directly to the RRO. This consent does not extend to other kinds of copying such as copying for general distribution, for republication, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works or for resale. Permissions for such reuse can be obtained using the RightsLink "Request Permissions" link on Wiley Online Library. Special requests should be addressed to: permissions@wiley.com

ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING SERVICES: The journal is indexed by Dietrich's Index Philosophicus; New Testament Abstracts; Old Testament Abstracts; Periodicals Index Online; Philosopher's Index; Religion Index One: Periodicals; Russian Academy of Sciences Bibliographies; The Catholic Periodical and Literature Index.

New Blackfriars accepts articles for Open Access publication. Please visit <http://olabout.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-828081.html> for further information about OnlineOpen.

For submission instructions, subscription and all other information visit: www.wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/NBFR

Printed in Singapore by C.O.S. Printers Pte Ltd.

Notes for Contributors

1. Articles should be submitted online at <http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/nbfr>. Full instructions and support are available on the site and a user ID and password can be obtained on the first visit. Support can be contacted by phone (+1 434 817 2040 ext. 167), e-mail (support@scholarone.com) or at <http://mcv3support.custhelp.com>. Books for review should be sent to Robert Ombres, Blackfriars, Oxford OX1 3LY, UK.
2. Articles will not be considered for publication if they have been previously published in English or are currently being considered for publication elsewhere.
3. Articles should normally be 5–7500 words in length, including notes, though longer articles may sometimes be considered.
4. All contributions should have an abstract (150–200 words) and 5 keywords describing the contents of the article, for web searching purposes.
5. Contributions should be submitted, typed double-spaced on one side of the paper, or preferably as e-mail attachment to nb.editor@english.op.org.
6. Greek and Hebrew etc., should be transliterated.
7. Notes (preferably footnotes) should be numbered sequentially throughout the article.
8. Submissions may follow either UK or US spelling conventions, provided that they are consistent.
9. References should follow these formats:
 - (i) Gerald O'Collins, *Christology: A Biblical, Historical, and Systematic Study of Jesus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995), p. 29.
 - (ii) John P. Galvin, 'Before the Holy Mystery: Karl Rahner's Thought on God', *Toronto Journal of Theology* 9 (1993), pp. 229–37.
 - (iii) Werner G. Jeanrond, 'Hans Küng', in David F. Ford, ed., *The Modern Theologians: An Introduction to Christian Theology in the Twentieth Century* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1997), pp. 162–78.

Wiley's Corporate Citizenship initiative seeks to address the environmental, social, economic, and ethical challenges faced in our business and which are important to our diverse stakeholder groups. Since launching the initiative, we have focused on sharing our content with those in need, enhancing community philanthropy, reducing our carbon impact, creating global guidelines and best practices for paper use, establishing a vendor code of ethics, and engaging our colleagues and other stakeholders in our efforts. Follow our progress at www.wiley.com/go/citizenship

Wiley is a founding member of the UN-backed HINARI, AGORA, and OARE initiatives. They are now collectively known as Research4Life, making online scientific content available free or at nominal cost to researchers in developing countries. Please visit Wiley's Content Access – Corporate Citizenship site: <http://www.wiley.com/WileyCDA/Section/id-390082.html>

View this journal online at wileyonlinelibrary.com/journal/NBFR

CONTENTS

Aquinas in His Place, 637

BRIAN DAVIES, OP

Reading *Contra Julianum* in Light of the *City of God*, 640

KEVIN E. JONES

Let's Work This Out: Is Work A Basic Human Good?, 658

RICHARD PLAYFORD

Is There Pain in hell?, 669

FRANCO MANNI

Job's Unfinalizable Voice: An Addendum to David Burrell's

Deconstructing Theodicy, 681

TREVOR B WILLIAMS

Pusey and Scripture: Dead End or Fertile Ground?, 698

BRIAN DOUGLAS

"H Newman" and Ludwig Wittgenstein: Re-evaluating the History of
John Henry Newman's Philosophical Reception, 716

DANIEL PRATT MORRIS-CHAPMAN

Aquinas' Fifth Way, 726

JOHN OWENS

Laudato Si's View on Integral Ecology in Light of the Planetary
Boundaries Concept, 740

JOHAN DE TAVERNIER AND KINGSLEY NDUBUEZE

Reviews

BY David Albert Jones, Marco Salvioli OP, G. R. Evans, Robert Ombres
OP, Dominic White OP, Joost Baneke, Mikolaj Slawkowski-Rode

Contents

Aquinas in His Place <i>Brian Davies, OP</i>	637
Reading <i>Contra Julianum</i> in Light of the <i>City of God</i> <i>Kevin E. Jones</i>	640
Let's Work This Out: Is Work A Basic Human Good? <i>Richard Playford</i>	658
Is There Pain in hell? <i>Franco Manni</i>	669
Job's Unfinalizable Voice: An Addendum to David Burrell's Deconstructing Theodicy <i>Trevor B Williams</i>	681
Pusey and Scripture: Dead End or Fertile Ground? <i>Brian Douglas</i>	698
"H Newman" and Ludwig Wittgenstein: Re-evaluating the History of John Henry Newman's Philosophical Reception <i>Daniel Pratt Morris-Chapman</i>	716
Aquinas' Fifth Way <i>John Owens</i>	726
<i>Laudato Si's</i> View on Integral Ecology in Light of the Planetary Boundaries Concept <i>Johan De Tavernier and Kingsley Ndubueze</i>	740

Reviews

John Haldane, THE LIFE AND PHILOSOPHY OF ELIZABETH ANSCOMBE Reviewed by David Albert Jones	760
Mary L. Hirschfeld, AQUINAS AND THE MARKET: TOWARD A HUMANE ECONOMY Reviewed by Marco Salvio OP	762
Rachel Davies, BONAVENTURE, THE BODY, AND THE AESTHETICS OF SALVATION	
Lydia Schumacher, EARLY FRANCISCAN THEOLOGY: BETWEEN AUTHORITY AND INNOVATION Reviewed by G. R. Evans	764

George Corbett, DANTE'S CHRISTIAN ETHICS.
PURGATORY AND ITS MORAL CONTEXTS 766
Reviewed by Robert Ombres OP

Christopher R. Brewer, CHRISTIAN THEOLOGY AND THE
TRANSFORMATION OF NATURAL RELIGION: FROM
INCARNATION TO SACRAMENTALITY. ESSAYS IN
HONOUR OF DAVID BROWN 768
Reviewed by Dominic White OP

Steven J. Jensen, THE HUMAN PERSON: A BEGINNER'S
THOMISTIC PSYCHOLOGY 770
Reviewed by Joost Baneke

Guy Nicholls Cong. Orat., UNEARTHLY BEAUTY: THE
AESTHETICS OF ST JOHN HENRY NEWMAN 772
Reviewed by Mikolaj Slawkowski-Rode