There is an extensive bibliography, which provides a quarry for readers themselves wishing to pursue wider aspects of church history, particularly in the parishes of Wales. The text deserves a print run which would enable it to be enjoyed widely.

David Harte, Lecturer in Law, University of Newcastle-upon-Tyne

WALES AND THE REFORMATION by GLANMORE WILLIAMS, University of Wales Press, Cardiff, 1997, xii + 440 pp (reissued in paperback 1999 £14.99) ISBN 0-7083-1415-5.

The history of the Reformation in Wales as recounted here turns out to be singularly uneventful. So far as the evidence shows, the Welsh acquiesced with more or less equanimity at each stage of the process by which the religion of the English Crown's dominions was transformed from the sacrament-centred Catholicism of the late medieval period with its quasi-magical accretions to the austere, word-centred Protestantism of the late sixteenth century. Thus, Henry VIII's theologically orthodox ecclesiastical revolution of 1533 to 1546, the lurch into Protestantism under Edward VI, 1546 to 1553, the Catholic restoration under Queen Mary, 1553 to 1558 and finally the reversion to a somewhat modified form of Edward VI's (ie Cranmer's) Second Prayer Book under Elizabeth, 1559 to 1603, all secured at least outward conformity. Indeed from the 1580s onwards Williams discerns a gradual shift in attitude from simple outward compliance to a more internalised, albeit ideological, commitment to Prayer Book Protestantism, perceived as representing a revival of the pure evangelical Christianity of the ancient British (ie Welsh) Church, and as such owed allegiance in loyalty to the Welsh nation and to its ruling dynasty, the Welsh-British Tudors. By the end of the century Protestantism had come to be regarded as an integral part of the Welsh identity.

Glanmore Williams's account of the Reformation in Wales garners the fruits of a research career devoted to the study of early modern Welsh history, and in particular the study of the Reformation. Clearly presented in unpretentious but elegant English, meticulously documented and coherently organised on a firm chronological framework, this survey is likely, to hold the field as the authoritative account for some time to come. Yet one serious criticism must be registered. The narrative fails to convey, any sense of the remarkable character of the story being unfolded or to address the explanatory problem it presents to the historian. These have to do with the fact that, as noted at the outset, the response of the Welsh to the various forms of religious settlement imposed upon them in the course of the sixteenth century was generally one of at least outward compliance. There were no rebellions, no iconoclastic riots, no lethal power struggles between religious conservatives and radicals, exceedingly few martyrs—no more than three executions took place in Wales in the period of the Marian repression, and just one in the course of Elizabeth's crackdown on Catholic activists. By the same token there were few heroes either, unless that category be extended to include a couple of mild-mannered Protestant literati William Salesbury, a layman, and Bishop William Morgan of St David's, who stand out for their contribution towards providing translations of the scriptures and the liturgical texts in Welsh and in this way helping to root the English Reformation in Welsh culture. The point is that civil agitation, violence and political upheaval were the norm wherever the Reformation was introduced throughout Europe, as they were indeed in the Tudors' other two dominions, England and Ireland. The question arises therefore as to why Wales was different. An ancillary question is why the response to the English Reformation in Ireland, like Wales a remote Celtic borderland dominion, should have been so entirely different. There, despite similar conditions in many,

BOOK REVIEWS 71

ways, the Reformation was overwhelmingly rejected after seventy years of tacit civil resistance interspersed with rebellions of increasingly massive proportions culminating in a Nine Years War in which Ireland became a theatre in the international struggle between the forces of the Reformation and the Counter-Reformation.

The criticism is that William's rather bland narrative fails to engage with either of these questions. This is not the place to do so either. Suffice it to say, as I have argued at length elsewhere (Bradshaw and Peter Roberts (eds) *British consciousness and identity*, CUP, 1998) that the key to the solution is found in two considerations. One is that the Tudors, lacking a local bureaucracy, were utterly dependent, at such a remote distance from the centre, on the local élites in Wales and Ireland to implement their religious policy. The second is that the revolution in the Church throughout the Tudor dominions was introduced in association with a revolution in the state, the so-called 'Tudor Revolution' in government, which hugely benefited the Welsh socio-political élite while seriously disadvantaging the socio-political élite in Ireland. Accordingly the Welsh élite were predisposed to act as instruments of the Crown's religious reform programme as well as its political one, while their counterparts in Ireland became increasingly averse as the uncongenial aspects of the reform package came to the fore.

'Study problems not periods' Lord Acton advised the historian. It is advice that Glanmore Williams would have done well to follow in this instance. As it is, nevertheless, he leaves us greatly in his debt once more for what is undoubtedly the best survey of the Reformation in Wales to date.

Brendan Bradshaw, Queens' College, Cambridge.

RENDER UNTO CAESAR: CHURCH PROPERTY IN ROMAN CATHOLIC AND ANGLICAN CANON LAW by JOSEPH FOX (ed), Pontifical University of St Thomas Aquinas, Rome, 2000, xi + 152 pp (£15 including postage, obtainable from the Centre for Law and Religion, Cardiff University, Law Building, Museum Avenue, PO Box 427, Cardiff CFI 1XD).

Whilst we may debate whether Jesus owned any property other than the clothes that he wore, the Church in carrying out her message requires recourse to property. As a device by which Christian communities can organise themselves, and as a device by which unity amongst Christians can be fostered, it is surprising that the canon law systems dealing with the property régimes of the Anglican and Roman Catholic Churches have been so scantily treated.

These may have been the thoughts in the minds of a number of Roman Catholic and Anglican canonists who met in Rome at a *colloquium* organised by the Pontifical University of St Thomas Aquinas and Cardiff University's Centre for Law and Religion in April 1999 to discuss issues relating to Church property. The fruits of their labour form this book, which aims to provide a critical examination into Church property in canon law and, perhaps more crucially, an ecumenical dialogue on the same. To that end, the essays in this book elucidate the different systems of property holding, trusteeship, responsibility, liability, and authority in Anglican and Roman Catholic traditions. The essays provide contemporary and historical perspectives, and look at theoretical as well as more practical issues, such as the property régimes which pertain to the contents of churches, sources of funding, and parish quotas. The collection concludes, fittingly, with an examination of the ecumenical use of Church buildings.