# European Constitutional Law Review

2009 VOLUME 5 ISSUE I

Contributions by

Ramses A. Wessel, Alicia Hinarejos, Paul de Hert & Karen Weis, Maria Fletcher, Marta Cartabia, Petr Bříza, Gavin Barrett

# Subjects

JUDICIAL DIALOGUE AND RIGHTS; IRISH SUPREME COURT ON Referendums; THE UK'S OPT-INS AND OPT-OUTS FROM EUROPE; THE THIRD PILLAR UNDER THE LISBON TREATY; CONVERGENCE IN THE EUROPEAN UNION LEGAL ORDER; CZECH CONSTITUTIONAL COURT ON the Lisbon Treaty; BOOK REVIEW

*EuConst* 2009/1



T.M.C.ASSER PRESS

Managhan warden



# T·M·C·ASSER PRESS

# The Legitimacy of Highest Courts' Rulings Judicial Deliberations and Beyond

Edited by

Nick Huls, Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff

In his Judicial Deliberations: A Comparative Analysis of Judicial Transparency and Legitimacy (Oxford 2004), the American-French scholar Mitchel Lasser has, among other things, tried to re-establish the strengths of the French cassation system. Using Lasser's approach and ideas as a starting point, in this book judges from the French, Belgian and Dutch Cassation Courts reflect on the challenges that their Courts are facing. The book also contains a series of contributions from scholars analyzing the wide range of factors that determine the legitimacy of these courts' decisions. Specific attention is given to the Strasbourg Court of Human Rights that has been so important for the moral legitimacy of the European legal order, and to courts in post-communist systems, which face many similar challenges and are even under greater pressure to modernize.

The book is a multidisciplinary contribution to the international debate about the legitimacy of the highest courts' rulings as well as the concept of judicial leadership and offers a new perspective in the USA versus Europe debate. It is recommended reading for academics, judges, policymakers, political scientists and students.

Nick Huls is a Professor of socio-legal studies at the Faculty of Law of the Erasmus University Rotterdam and Leiden University's Faculty of Law, The Netherlands. Maurice Adams is a Professor of law at Tilburg University, The Netherlands, and part-time Professor of comparative law at Antwerp University in Belgium. Jacco Bomhoff is a Lecturer in law at the Law Department of the London School of Economics.

www.asserpress.nl/cata/hulsadams/fra.htm 2009, ISBN 9789067042895 478 pages, hardcover GBP 75.00

Distributed for T.M.C. Asser PRESS by Cambridge University Press www.cambridge.org



#### EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

www.asserpress.nl/cata/euconst/fra.htm journals.cambridge.org/ECL Recommended citation: EuConst

The journal is edited in the HOGENDORPCENTER for European Constitutional Studies, a Jean Monnet Centre of excellence. This Centre is affiliated with the Europa Instituut and the Amsterdam Center of International Law (ACIL), University of Amsterdam and with the Faculties of Humanities and Political Sciences. Published three times a year.

The Journal acknowledges financial support from the Dutch Ministry of the Interior for editorial office and for language editing.

Indexed in the following Thomson Reuters products and services: Social Sciences Citation Index; Social Sciences; Current Contents/Social and Behavioral Sciences; Journal Citation Reports/Sciences Edition.

#### Editorial Office

European Constitutional Law Review c/o Hogendorpcentre, P.O. Box 1030; NL – 1000 BA Amsterdam. Tel. +31 20 5252957/2951. Fax +31 20 5252900. E-mail: EuConst@uva. nl.

#### Distribution

The European Constitutional Law Review is distributed for T.M.C.ASSER PRESS by Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK. The journal is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service. This service can be found at <a href="http://journals.cambridge.org/ECL">http://journals.cambridge.org/ECL</a>.

#### Subscription rates and specimen copies

Subscription to the European Constitutional Law Review, Volume 5 (2009): Print + online: GBP 99.00 / USD 178.00 / EUR 142.00. Print only: GBP 90.00 / USD 162.00 / EUR 128.00; Online only: GBP 82.00 / USD 148.00 / EUR 118.00; Subscription orders and requests for specimen copies should be sent to Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, UK.

#### Advertising

To advertise in the journal please contact the relevant Advertising Promoter for your area: in the USA, Canada or Mexico: journals\_advertising@cup.org or telephone +1 (212) 337 5053; in the UK, Europe or rest of the world: ad\_sales@cambridge.org or telephone +44 (1223) 325757.

#### Photocopying

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organizations in the USA who are also registered with the C.C.C. may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US Copyright law) subject to payment to the C.C.C. of the per copy fee of \$15.00. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 1574-0196/09. ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Organizations authorized by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions. For all other use, permission should be sought from the copyright owner. Please apply to the Editorial Office of the *European Constitutional Law Review* (see above).

#### ISSN 1574-0196

#### © 2009 T·M·C·Asser PRESS, The Hague, and contributors.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the copyright owners.

#### BOARD OF EDITORS

W.T. Eijsbouts, editor-in-chief

Professor of European Union law, University of Amsterdam, Jean Monnet Chair in European constitutional law and history

Jan-Herman Reestman, associate editor-in-chief Lecturer in public law at the University of Amsterdam

Leonard F.M. Besselink

Professor of European constitutional law, University of Utrecht

Monica Claes

Professor of European and comparative constitutional law, University of Tilburg

Joost de Reede, special advisor

Former associate professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

John W. Sap

Associate professor of European Union law, VU University Amsterdam

Gustaaf van Nifterik, associate editor

Lecturer in legal history, University of Amsterdam

Elies van Sliedregt, associate editor

Professor of criminal law, VU University Amsterdam

Jeremy B. Bierbach, assistant editor

Ph.D. candidate at the University of Amsterdam

Russell E.M. Lawson, special language advisor

Lasse Burmeister, magister temporis

### Board of Advisors

Andreas Auer

Professor of constitutional law, University of Geneva

Paul Craig

Professor of English law, St. John's College, Oxford

Gráinne de Búrca

Professor of European law, NYU, Columbia

Bruno de Witte

Professor of European Union law, European University Institute, Florence

Olivier Duhamel

University Professor at IEP (Sciences Po), Paris

Spyridon Flogaitis

Professor of administrative law, University of Athens

Jörg Gerkrath

Professor of European law, University of Luxembourg

P.J.G. Kapteyn

Former judge in the ECJ

Tim Koopmans

Former judge in the ECJ and Advocate General at the Hoge Raad (Supreme Court of the Netherlands), The Hague.

Rick Lawson

Kirchheiner Chair, Department of Public Law, Leiden University

Koen Lenaerts

Judge in the ECJ and professor of European law, University of Leuven

Ingolf Pernice

Professor of public law and of international and European law, Humboldt University, Berlin

Iit Peters

Professor of public law, University of Amsterdam

Lucas Prakke

Professor emeritus of comparative constitutional law, University of Amsterdam

Sacha Prechal

Professor of international and European institutional law, University of Utrecht

Hjalte Rasmussen

Professor of European Union law, University of Copenhagen

W.H. Roobol

Professor emeritus of European history, University of Amsterdam

Dominique Rousseau

Professor of public law, University of Montpellier 1

András Sajó

Judge of the European Court of Human Rights

Mirosław Wyrzykowski

Professor of constitutional law at Warsaw University, Poland and judge in the Trybunał Konstytucyjny (Polish Constitutional Court)

Peter G. Xuereb

Professor of European and comparative law, University of Malta

Jiří Zemánek

Jean Monnet Professor of European Union Law, Charles University, Prague

#### EUROPEAN CONSTITUTIONAL LAW REVIEW

## 2009 VOLUME 5 ISSUE I

#### **CONTENTS**

Editorial

A Glimpse of EU Government 1

Articles

Marta Cartabia – Europe and Rights: Taking Dialogue Seriously 5

Gavin Barrett – Building a Swiss Chalet in an Irish Legal Landscape? Referendums on European Union Treaties in Ireland & the Impact of Supreme Court Jurisprudence 32

Maria Fletcher – Schengen, the European Court of Justice and Flexibility Under the Lisbon Treaty: Balancing the United Kingdom's 'Ins' and 'Outs' 71

Alicia Hinarejos – The Lisbon Treaty Versus Standing Still: A View from the Third Pillar 99

Ramses A. Wessel – The Dynamics of the European Union Legal Order: An Increasingly Coherent Framework of Action and Interpretation 117

Case Note

Petr Bříza – The Czech Republic: The Constitutional Court on the Lisbon Treaty Decision of 26 November 2008 143

Book Review

Constantin Stefanou & Helen Xanthaki (eds.), Towards a European Criminal Record (Paul de Hert & Karen Weis) 165