

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review



Volume 5, Issue 2

NINETEENTH-CENTURY  
MUSIC REVIEW

VOLUME 5, ISSUE 2  
2008

**ASHGATE**

Published in association with the Centre for  
Nineteenth-Century Music, Durham University, UK

*Letters to the Editor* For any communication concerning published articles or reviews, please send letters by email or hard copy to the General Editor:

Professor Bennett Zon  
School of Music  
Durham University  
Palace Green  
Durham DH1 3RL  
England

Email: [bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk](mailto:bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk)

*Subscriptions* For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Nicky Staszkiwicz  
Ashgate Publishing Limited  
Wey Court East  
Union Road  
Farnham  
Surrey GU9 7PT  
England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 351804  
Fax: +44 (0)01252 351839  
Email: [journals@ashgatepublishing.com](mailto:journals@ashgatepublishing.com)

### *Themed Issues*

The General Editor of *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* encourages proposals from individuals with ideas for themed issues, involving the commissioning of up to six main articles per issue, as well as one or more review articles for coverage of books, CDs and scores. Those applying to the journal for this purpose should initially provide the General Editor with a statement of no more than 500 words, outlining the thematic nature of the proposed issue, the names of contributing authors along with a working title for their papers, and a timetable for submission of work.

Proposers of themed issues work alongside the General Editor, and are designated Guest Editors. They are responsible for commissioning, organizing and preparing articles for publication, as well as working closely with review editors to locate suitable material and authors for relevant sections of the journal. Review sections of themed issues are not exclusively thematized, and tend towards a balance of half themed, and half general material.

Articles commissioned for themed issues follow the same process of peer review as general issues. No guarantee of publication can be given to specially commissioned authors.

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review

*Editors of this Issue*

James Sobaskie and Susan Youens

*General Editor*

Bennett Zon

*Book Reviews Editor*

Anna Celenza

*CD Reviews Editor*

Jeremy Dibble

*Score Reviews Editor*

Stephen Downes

## Editorial Board

**Professor Bennett Zon**, Durham University UK (General Editor)

**Dr Stephen Downes**, University of Surrey, UK (Scores Reviews Editor)

**Professor Anna Celenza**, Georgetown University, USA (Book Reviews Editor)

**Professor William Weber**, California State University, Long Beach, USA

**Professor Jeremy Dibble**, Durham University (CD Reviews Editor)

**Dr Phyllis Weliver**, Wilkes University, USA

## Advisory Board

**Dr Rosamund Bartlett**

**Professor Andrew Bowie**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Dr Geoffrey Chew**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor John Deathridge**, King's College, University of London, UK

**Professor Annegret Fauser**, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

**Professor Peter Franklin**, University of Oxford, UK

**Dr Sophie Fuller**

**Professor Lydia Goehr**, Columbia University, USA

**Professor Thomas Grey**, Stanford University, USA

**Professor Hervé Lacombe**, Université Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France

**Professor Roberta Marvin**, University of Iowa, USA

**Professor Simon McVeigh**, Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

**Professor Julian Rushton**, University of Leeds, UK

**Professor Jim Samson**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor Manuela Schwartz**, Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

**Professor Nicholas Temperley**, University of Illinois, USA

© Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2008

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by  
Ashgate Publishing Limited  
Wey Court East  
Union Road  
Farnham  
Surrey GU9 7PT  
England

Ashgate Publishing Company  
Suite 420  
101 Cherry Street  
Burlington, VT 05401-4405  
USA

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A.F. Leighton-Thomas.

[www.ashgate.com](http://www.ashgate.com)

ISSN: 1479-4098

Bach musicological font developed by © Yo Tomita



Printed and bound in Great Britain by  
MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall.

# Contents

VOLUME 5, ISSUE 2

Notes on Article Contributors vii

## ARTICLES

### **Schubert Familiar and Unfamiliar: New Perspectives**

- James William Sobaskie  
Introduction 3
- Robert S. Hatten  
A Surfeit of Musics: What Goethe's Lyrics Concede When Set to  
Schubert's Music 7
- Susan Youens  
Swan Songs: Schubert's 'Auf dem Wasser zu singen' 19
- Xavier Hascher  
'In dunklen Träumen': Schubert's Heine-Lieder through the  
Psychoanalytical Prism 43
- James William Sobaskie  
Schubert's Self-Elegies 71

## REVIEWS

### *Book Reviews*

- James Garratt  
*Mendelssohn, Goethe, and the Walpurgis Night: The Heathen Muse in  
European Culture, 1700–1850*, by John Michael Cooper 109
- Dan Shore  
*Grieg: Music, Landscape and Norwegian Identity*, by Daniel M. Grimley 112
- Patricia Puckett Sasser  
*The Prima Donna: 1815–1930*, by Susan Rutherford 115
- David Larkin  
*Richard Strauss's Orchestral Music and German Intellectual Tradition:  
The Philosophical Roots of Musical Modernism*, by Charles Youmans 118

Books Received	122
<i>CD Reviews</i>	
<i>Franz Schubert (1797–1828): The Complete Songs; soloists, Graham Johnson pf; Hyperion Records Limited</i>	123
James Parsons Discs 1–6	123
Susan Wollenberg Discs 7–12	129
Suzannah Clark Discs 13–19	133
David Gramit Discs 20–26	138
Susan Youens Discs 27–31	143
Lorraine Byrne Bodley Discs 32–34	148
Richard Kramer Discs 35–38	153
Susan Youens Discs 38–40: Schubert's Friends and Contemporaries	159
CDs Received	165
<i>Score Reviews</i>	
Jeremy Barham Gustav Mahler, <i>Symphonie Nr. 5. Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Gesamtausgabe, Band V</i> , edited by Reinhold Kubik	166
Scores Received	170
LETTER TO THE EDITOR	
Marian Wilson Kimber Of 'Bumps' and Biography: A Response to Marcia Citron	171
Guidelines for Contributors	177