Canad. Math. Bull. Vol. **58** (2), 2015 pp. 317–319 http://dx.doi.org/10.4153/CMB-2015-008-7 © Canadian Mathematical Society 2015



# Coloring Four-uniform Hypergraphs on Nine Vertices

Marek Kazimierz Lewkowicz

*Abstract.* Every 4-uniform hypergraph on 9 vertices with at most 25 edges has property B. This gives the answer  $m_9(4) = 26$  to a question raised by Erdős in 1968.

## 1 Introduction

In [3, p. 447] Erdős defines  $m_n(k)$  as the smallest integer *m* for which there exists a *k*-uniform hypergraph with *n* vertices and *m* hyperedges without property B, which means that for every 2-coloring of its vertices some hyperedge is monochromatic. In [4, p. 416] Erdős admits "I cannot compute  $m_{2k+1}(k)$  and in fact do not know the value of  $m_9(4)$ " (compare [2, p. 155]). In 1980 Abbott and Liu ([1]) proved that  $24 \le m_9(4) \le 26$ . In particular, they gave an example of a 4-uniform hypergraph with 26 hyperedges without property B.

Our main result is contained in the following theorem.

**Theorem 1.1** Any family of four-element subsets of a given nine-element set without property B must have at least 26 elements.

The proof is partly based on computer calculations, which provide us with many non-isomorphic 4-uniform hypergraphs with 26 edges without property B. In the following sample family, any two elements intersect:

 $\{1234\}\{1235\}\{1237\}\{1456\}\{1467\}\{1489\}\{1567\}\{1589\}\{1789\}\{2369\} \\ \{2459\}\{2468\}\{2479\}\{2568\}\{2578\}\{2579\}\{2678\}\{3457\}\{3458\}\{3478\} \\ \{3569\}\{3578\}\{3679\}\{3689\}\{4567\}\{4579\}.$ 

Thus it is not permutation conjugate to the family given by Abbott and Liu, which has 3 disjoint pairs.

#### 2 Separating triplets in an eight-set

Consider a 3-uniform hypergraph ( $V_8$ , S) on eight nodes. We say that a quadruple  $Q \subset V_8$  separates S if and only if both Q and its complement  $\overline{Q}$  in  $V_8$  contain an edge. Let T(S) denote the family of all quadruples separating S. The maximal size of T(S)

Received by the editors October 17, 2013.

Published electronically March 2, 2015.

AMS subject classification: 05C15.

Keywords: property B, coloring hypergraphs.

for *S* having *n* elements will be denoted by  $\omega(n)$ . These numbers (for  $n \le 11$ ) will be crucial in the proof of Theorem 1.1 in Section 3. They are listed in Proposition 2.1.

Proposition 2.1		The values $\omega(n)$ for $n \leq 11$ are given in the table												
[	n	0	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	]
	n $\omega(n)$	0	0	4	8	12	16	24	26	34	36	38	40	] ·

All the values have been calculated with a computer. Total CPU time on one core of the processor AMD Athlon 64 X2 1.79 GHz is about 9 minutes for  $\omega(10)$  and less than 50 minutes for  $\omega(11)$ .

The algorithm for calculating  $\omega(n)$  is very simple. We consider *n*-element families *S* of triplets in  $V_8$  that contain at least two disjoint triplets. Up to a permutation of  $V_8$  we may assume these two triplets are fixed. The number of the remaining triplets is  $\binom{8}{3} - 2 = 54$ . We consider all n - 2-element subsets of this set, which, together with the two fixed triplets, form *S*. For each *S* we consider  $\binom{n}{2}$  pairs (A, B) in *S*. If the pair is disjoint, then four quadruples separating *S* are created. They are two pairs of complementary sets, represented by  $A \cup \{x\}$  for  $x \in V_8 \setminus (A \cup B)$ . All members in T(S) are obtained in this way. Thus, |T(S)| is twice the number of such pairs. The total number of such operations is

$$\binom{54}{n-2}\binom{n}{2} \cdot 2 \le \binom{54}{9}\binom{11}{2} \cdot 2 \approx 5.8 \cdot 10^{11}.$$

### 3 Proof of Theorem 1.1

Suppose  $(V_9, E)$  is a hypergraph on 9 nodes with  $|E| \le 25$ . We have to find a coloring of  $V_9$  for which no edge is monochromatic. As  $\sum \{|A| : A \in E\} \le 25 \cdot 4 = 100 < 108 = 12 \cdot |V_9|$ , we can find  $P \in V_9$  such that the family  $E_1 = \{A \in E : P \in A\}$  has at most 11 elements. Let

$$V_8 = V_9 \setminus \{P\},$$
  $E_0 = \{A \in E : P \notin A\},$   
 $S = \{A \setminus \{P\} : A \in E_1\},$   $n = |S| = |E_1| \le 11.$ 

Let T(S) be the family of all quadruples in  $V_8$  separating S. Proposition 2.1 applied to the 3-uniform hypergraph  $(V_8, S)$  gives the maximal possible values of |T(S)|. In particular  $|T(S)| \le 18 + 2n$ . Let

$$R = \left\{ B \subset V_8 : (|B| = 4) \land ((B \in E_0) \lor (V_8 \setminus B \in E_0) \right\}.$$

We have

 $|R| \le 2 \cdot |E_0| \le 2 \cdot (25 - |E_1|) = 50 - 2n.$ 

The number of quadruples in  $V_8$  is  $\binom{8}{4} = 70$ . As (18 + 2n) + (50 - 2n) = 68 < 70 we can find a quadruple *K* in  $V_8$  not belonging to  $T(S) \cup R$ . Clearly  $\overline{K} = V_8 \setminus K$  cannot belong to  $T(S) \cup R$  either. Let

$$S_0 = \{ C \in S : (C \subset K) \lor (C \subset \overline{K}) \}, \quad S_1 = S \setminus S_0.$$

As  $K \notin T(S)$ , K does not separate S. Therefore, all  $C \in S_0$  are contained either in K or in  $\overline{K}$ . Replacing K with  $\overline{K}$  if necessary, we may assume that no  $C \in S$  is

318

contained in  $\overline{K}$ . We shall easily verify now that *K* is a coloring for  $V_9$  that has no monochromatic set belonging to *E*. Indeed, if  $A \in E$  is monochromatic, then either  $A \subset K$  or  $A \subset \overline{K} \cup \{P\}$ . If  $A \subset K$ , then  $K = A \in E_0 \subset R$ , which is impossible, since  $K \notin T(S) \cup R$ . If  $A \subset \overline{K} \cup \{P\}$  and  $P \notin A$ , then  $\overline{K} = A \in E_0$  and again  $K \in R$ . If  $A \subset \overline{K} \cup \{P\}$  and  $P \in A$  then  $C = A \setminus \{P\} \in S, C \subset \overline{K}$ , which contradicts our choice of *K*. This completes the proof of Theorem 1.1.

**Acknowledgments** I would like to sincerely thank Dr. Tomasz Furmanowski from the University of Wrocław, Poland, for many inspiring conversations.

#### References

- H. L. Abbott and A. C. Liu, On property B of families of sets. Canad. Math. Bull. 23(1980), no. 4, 429–435. http://dx.doi.org/10.4153/CMB-1980-063-6
- [2] H. L. de Vries, On property B and on Steiner systems. Math. Z. 153(1977), no. 2, 155–159. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01179788
- [3] P. Erdős, On a combinatorial problem. II. Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar 15(1964), 445–447. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF01897152
- [4] \_\_\_\_\_, On a combinatorial problem. III. Canad. Math. Bull. **12**(1969), 413–416. http://dx.doi.org/10.4153/CMB-1969-051-5

Faculty of Mechanical and Power Engineering, Wrocław University of Technology, 50-370 Wrocław, Poland e-mail: marek.lewkowicz@pwr.edu.pl