

ON SCHUR'S SECOND PARTITION THEOREM

by GEORGE E. ANDREWS†

(Received 20 December, 1966)

1. Introduction. In 1926, I. J. Schur proved the following theorem on partitions [3].

THEOREM 1. *The number of partitions of n into parts congruent to $\pm 1 \pmod{6}$ is equal to the number of partitions of n of the form $b_1 + \dots + b_s = n$, where $b_i - b_{i+1} \geq 3$ and, if $3 \mid b_i$, then $b_i - b_{i+1} > 3$.*

Schur's proof was based on a lemma concerning recurrence relations for certain polynomials. In 1928, W. Gleissberg gave an arithmetic proof of a strengthened form of Schur's theorem [2]; however, the combinatorial reasoning in Gleissberg's paper becomes very intricate.

Although claims of simplicity of proof are highly subjective, we shall in §2 give a proof of Schur's theorem which is shorter than the two previous proofs and seems to exhibit the crucial steps more clearly. This new proof depends on Appell's Comparison Theorem [1, p. 101]. In §3, we generalize our technique and prove a new partition theorem of which the following is a special case.

THEOREM 4. *Let $A(n)$ denote the number of partitions of n into parts congruent to $0, 2, 3, 4, 7 \pmod{8}$. Let $B(n)$ denote the number of partitions of n of the form $n = b_1 + \dots + b_s$, where $b_s \geq 2$, $b_i \geq b_{i+1}$, and, if b_i is odd, $b_i - b_{i+1} \geq 3$. Then $A(n) = B(n)$.*

For example, if $n = 15$, the nineteen partitions enumerated by $A(15)$ are 15, 12+3, 11+4, 11+2+2, 10+3+2, 8+7, 8+4+3, 8+3+2+2, 7+4+4, 7+4+2+2, 7+3+3+2, 7+2+2+2+2, 4+4+4+3, 4+4+3+2+2, 4+3+3+3+2, 4+3+2+2+2+2, 3+3+3+3+3, 3+3+3+2+2+2, 3+2+2+2+2+2+2. The nineteen partitions enumerated by $B(15)$ are 15, 13+2, 12+3, 11+4, 11+2+2, 10+5, 10+3+2, 9+6, 9+4+2, 9+2+2+2, 8+7, 8+5+2, 8+4+3, 7+4+4, 7+4+2+2, 7+2+2+2+2, 6+6+3, 6+5+2+2, 4+4+4+3.

Finally in §4, we show how Schur's lemma concerning recurrence relations for certain polynomials is actually a direct corollary of the q -analogue of Gauss's theorem for hypergeometric series.

2. Proof of Theorem 1. Let $\pi(n)$ denote the number of partitions of n of the form $n = b_1 + \dots + b_s$ with $b_i - b_{i+1} \geq 3$ and $b_i - b_{i+1} > 3$ if $3 \mid b_i$. Let $\pi_m(n)$ denote the number of partitions just described, with the added condition that $b_1 \leq m$. By breaking the set of partitions enumerated by $\pi_m(n)$ into two sets, those with largest part less than m and those with largest part equal to m , we see that

$$\pi_{3m+1}(n) = \pi_{3m}(n) + \pi_{3m-2}(n - 3m - 1), \tag{2.1}$$

$$\pi_{3m+2}(n) = \pi_{3m+1}(n) + \pi_{3m-1}(n - 3m - 2), \tag{2.2}$$

$$\pi_{3m+3}(n) = \pi_{3m+2}(n) + \pi_{3m-1}(n - 3m - 3). \tag{2.3}$$

† Partially supported by National Science Foundation Grant GP-5593.

If

$$d_m(q) = 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \pi_m(n)q^n,$$

and

$$d(q) = 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \pi(n)q^n,$$

then for $|q| < 1$, $d_m(q) \rightarrow d(q)$ as $m \rightarrow \infty$, since

$$|d(q) - d_m(q)| \leq \sum_{n=m}^{\infty} p(n)|q|^n,$$

where $p(n)$ is the ordinary partition function. From (2.1), (2.2) and (2.3) we deduce

$$d_{3m+1}(q) = d_{3m}(q) + q^{3m+1}d_{3m-2}(q), \tag{2.4}$$

$$d_{3m+2}(q) = d_{3m+1}(q) + q^{3m+2}d_{3m-1}(q), \tag{2.5}$$

$$d_{3m+3}(q) = d_{3m+2}(q) + q^{3m+3}d_{3m-1}(q). \tag{2.6}$$

Let

$$\alpha_m(q) = d_{3m+2}(q).$$

Then, by (2.6),

$$d_{3m+3}(q) = \alpha_m(q) + q^{3m+3}\alpha_{m-1}(q). \tag{2.7}$$

By (2.5),

$$d_{3m+1}(q) = \alpha_m(q) - q^{3m+2}\alpha_{m-1}(q). \tag{2.8}$$

Hence, by substituting (2.7) and (2.8) into (2.4), we obtain

$$\alpha_m(q) = (1 + q^{3m+1} + q^{3m+2})\alpha_{m-1}(q) + q^{3m}(1 - q^{3m})\alpha_{m-2}(q). \tag{2.9}$$

We note that $\alpha_m(q)$ is uniquely determined by (2.9) and the two initial values $\alpha_{-1}(q) = 1$, $\alpha_0(q) = 1 + q + q^2$.

Now, for $|x| < 1$, $|q| < 1$, define $s_n(q)$ by

$$\prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 + xq^{3n+1})(1 + xq^{3n+2})(1 - xq^{3n})^{-1} = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} s_n(q)x^n, \tag{2.10}$$

and let

$$S_n(q) = \prod_{j=1}^n (1 - q^{3j}) \cdot s_n(q).$$

Calling the expression on the left-hand side of (2.10) $f(x; q)$, we have

$$(1 - x)f(x; q) = (1 + xq)(1 + xq^2)f(xq^3; q). \tag{2.11}$$

Hence $s_0(q) = 1$, $s_1(q) = (1 - q)^{-1}$ and, for $n > 1$,

$$s_n(q) - s_{n-1}(q) = q^{3n}s_n(q) + q^{3n-2}s_{n-1}(q) + q^{3n-1}s_{n-1}(q) + q^{3n-3}s_{n-2}(q).$$

Thus

$$(1 - q^{3n})s_n(q) = (1 + q^{3n-2} + q^{3n-1})s_{n-1}(q) + q^{3n-3}s_{n-2}(q).$$

Therefore

$$S_n(q) = (1 + q^{3n-2} + q^{3n-1})S_{n-1}(q) + q^{3n-3}(1 - q^{3n-3})S_{n-2}(q),$$

and

$$S_0(q) = 1, \quad S_1(q) = 1 + q + q^2.$$

Hence, by the remarks following (2.6), $S_{n+1}(q) = \alpha_n(q)$.

Thus, for $|x| < 1, |q| < 1$,

$$\prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 + xq^{3n+1})(1 + xq^{3n+2})(1 - xq^{3n})^{-1} = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \left(\alpha_{m-1}(q)x^m / \prod_{j=1}^m (1 - q^{3j}) \right). \quad (2.12)$$

Hence, by Appell's comparison theorem [1, p. 101, with $p_n = 1$],

$$\begin{aligned} \prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 + q^{3n-1})(1 + q^{3n+2})(1 - q^{3n+3})^{-1} &= \lim_{x \rightarrow 1} (1 - x) \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \left(\alpha_{m-1}(q)x^m / \prod_{j=1}^m (1 - q^{3j}) \right) \\ &= \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} \alpha_{m-1}(q) \prod_{j=1}^m (1 - q^{3j})^{-1} \\ &= d(q) \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} (1 - q^{3n})^{-1}. \end{aligned}$$

Hence

$$\begin{aligned} d(q) &= \prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 + q^{3n+1})(1 + q^{3n+2}) \\ &= \prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 - q^{6n+1})^{-1}(1 - q^{6n+5})^{-1}. \end{aligned} \quad (2.13)$$

Consequently, comparing coefficients of q^N on both sides of (2.13), we see that $\pi(N)$ is also the number of partitions of N into parts congruent to $\pm 1 \pmod{6}$.

A slight refinement of the above argument will yield Gleissberg's generalization of Schur's theorem [2, p. 374].

3. Generalizations. We may extend our previous argument to prove the following theorem.

THEOREM 2. *Let q be real with $0 < q < 1$, and $a_i \geq 0$ for $1 \leq i \leq r$. If $t_0 = 1, t_n = 0$ for $n < 0$, and for $n > 0$*

$$t_n = (1 + a_1q^n)t_{n-1} + \sum_{j=2}^r a_jq^n t_{n-j} \prod_{s=1}^{j-1} (1 - q^{n-s}), \quad (3.1)$$

then

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} t_n = \prod_{m=1}^{\infty} (1 + a_1q^m + a_2q^{2m} + \dots + a_rq^{rm}).$$

Proof. If here we let

$$f_r(x; q) = \prod_{m=1}^{\infty} (1 + a_1 x q^m + a_2 x q^{2m} + \dots + a_r x q^{rm}) (1 - x q^{m-1})^{-1}, \tag{3.2}$$

and write

$$f_r(x; q) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \beta_n(q) x^n, \tag{3.3}$$

then from

$$(1-x)f_r(x; q) = (1 + a_1 x q + a_2 x q^2 + \dots + a_r x q^r) f_r(x q; q) \tag{3.4}$$

we deduce that

$$t_n = \beta_n(q) \prod_{j=1}^n (1 - q^j). \tag{3.5}$$

Now $t_0 = 1 > 0$. Suppose that, for $0 \leq n < m$, $t_n > 0$; then

$$\begin{aligned} t_m - t_{m-1} &= a_1 q^m t_{m-1} + \sum_{j=2}^r a_j q^m t_{m-j} \prod_{s=1}^{j-1} (1 - q^{m-s}) \\ &\geq 0. \end{aligned} \tag{3.6}$$

Thus, by mathematical induction, t_m ($m > 0$) is a non-decreasing sequence of positive numbers. Consequently,

$$\begin{aligned} t_m &\leq (1 + a_1 q^m) t_{m-1} + \sum_{j=2}^r a_j q^m t_{m-1} \\ &= (1 + (a_1 + \dots + a_r) q^m) t_{m-1}. \end{aligned} \tag{3.7}$$

Hence, for all $m \geq 0$,

$$t_m \leq \prod_{n=0}^{\infty} (1 + (a_1 + \dots + a_r) q^n). \tag{3.8}$$

Thus t_m is a non-decreasing bounded sequence of positive terms, and therefore t_m converges to a limit L .

Hence, by Appell's comparison theorem [1, p. 101 with $p_n = 1$], we deduce as in Theorem 1 that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow 0} t_n = L = \prod_{m=1}^{\infty} (1 + a_1 q^m + a_2 q^{2m} + \dots + a_r q^{rm}). \tag{3.9}$$

Thus Theorem 2 is proved.

As an example of Theorem 2, we prove the following partition theorem.

THEOREM 3. *Let $r \geq 2$ be an integer. Let $P_1(n)$ denote the number of partitions of n into parts which are either even and not congruent to $4r - 2 \pmod{4r}$ or odd and congruent to $2r - 1, 4r - 1 \pmod{4r}$. Let $P_2(n)$ denote the number of partitions of n of the form $n = b_1 + \dots + b_s$, where $b_i \geq b_{i+1}$, and for b_i odd, $b_i - b_{i+1} \geq 2r - 1$ ($1 \leq i \leq s$, where $b_{s+1} = 0$). Then $P_1(n) = P_2(n)$.*

Proof. Let $p(n, m)$ denote the number of partitions of n of the type enumerated by $P_2(n)$, with the added restriction that $b_1 \leq 2m$. Let

$$B_m(q) = 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} p(n, m)q^n.$$

First we shall prove that

$$p(n, m) - p(n, m - 1) = p(n - 2m, m) + p(n - 2m + 1, m - r). \tag{3.10}$$

Now $p(n, m) - p(n, m - 1)$ denotes the number of partitions of the type enumerated by $p(n, m)$ with the added restriction that either $2m$ or $2m - 1$ is the largest part. If $2m$ is the largest part, remove it. This yields a partition of the type enumerated by $p(n - 2m, m)$. If $2m - 1$ is the largest part, then the next largest part does not exceed $2m - 2r$. Hence, if $2m - 1$ is removed from the partition under consideration, we obtain a partition of the type enumerated by $p(n - 2m + 1, m - r)$. Thus the above procedure establishes a one-to-one correspondence between those partitions enumerated by $p(n, m) - p(n, m - 1)$ and the totality of partitions which are enumerated either by $p(n - 2m, m)$ or by $p(n - 2m + 1, m - r)$. Thus (3.10) is established.

Equation (3.10) implies that

$$(1 - q^{2m})B_m(q) = B_{m-1}(q) + q^{2m-1}B_{m-r}(q). \tag{3.11}$$

Now in Theorem 2 replace q by q^2 , then set $a_1 = a_2 = \dots = a_{r-1} = 0, a_r = q^{-1}$. This yields

$$\begin{aligned} 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P_2(n)q^n &= \lim_{m \rightarrow \infty} B_m(q) \\ &= \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 + q^{2rj-1})(1 - q^{2j})^{-1} \\ &= \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 - q^{4rj-2})(1 - q^{2j})^{-1}(1 - q^{2rq-1})^{-1} \\ &= 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P_1(n)q^n. \end{aligned} \tag{3.12}$$

Comparing coefficients on both sides of (3.12), we obtain Theorem 3.

Theorem 4 (stated in the introduction) is obtained from Theorem 3 directly; set $r = 2$ in Theorem 3.

4. Schur's recurrence lemma. The following theorem is a strengthened form of the result Schur originally used to prove Theorem 1. We shall show that the result is a consequence of the q -analogue of Gauss's theorem for hypergeometric series [4, p. 97, (3.3.2.5)].

THEOREM 5. *If $P_0 = 1$,*

$$P_n = \prod_{j=1}^n (1 + \alpha q^j + zq^{2j}),$$

and D_n is defined by $D_0 = 1, D_1 = 1 + \alpha q,$

$$D_n = (1 + \alpha q^n)D_{n-1} + zq^n(1 - q^{n-1})D_{n-2} \quad (n > 1),$$

then

$$D_n = \sum_{m=0}^n (-z)^m q^{m(n+1) - \frac{1}{2}m(m-1)} \begin{bmatrix} n \\ m \end{bmatrix} P_{n-m}, \tag{4.1}$$

where

$$\begin{bmatrix} n \\ m \end{bmatrix} = \prod_{j=1}^m (1 - q^{n-j+1})(1 - q^j)^{-1}.$$

Proof. Let β_1 and β_2 be the roots of the equation $x^2 + \alpha x + z = 0$. Then, by (3.3) and (3.4),

$$\prod_{n=1}^{\infty} (1 - \beta_1 x q^n)(1 - \beta_2 x q^n)(1 - x q^{n-1})^{-1} = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} D_n x^n \prod_{j=1}^n (1 - q^j)^{-1}. \tag{4.2}$$

But, by the q -analogue of Gauss's theorem [4, p. 97, (3.3.2.5)],

$$\begin{aligned} & \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} (1 - \beta_1 x q^n)(1 - \beta_2 x q^n)(1 - x q^{n-1})^{-1} \\ &= \sum_{N=0}^{\infty} x^N \prod_{j=1}^N (1 - \beta_1 q^j)(1 - \beta_2 q^j)(1 - q^j)^{-1} \prod_{h=0}^{\infty} (1 - x z q^{h+N+2}) \\ &= \sum_{N=0}^{\infty} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} P_N x^N (-1)^k z^k q^{(N+2)k + \frac{1}{2}k(k-1)} x^k \prod_{m=1}^N (1 - q^m)^{-1} \prod_{j=1}^k (1 - q^j)^{-1} \\ &= \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} \left(\sum_{N+k=n} P_N (-z)^k q^{(N+2)k + \frac{1}{2}k(k-1)} \prod_{m=1}^N (1 - q^m)^{-1} \prod_{j=1}^k (1 - q^j)^{-1} \right) x^n, \end{aligned} \tag{4.3}$$

where the penultimate expression is obtained by expanding the infinite product in the sum and by applying Euler's theorem [4, p. 92, (3.2.2.15)].

Comparing coefficients of x^n in the series expansion of (4.2) and (4.3), we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} D_n &= \sum_{N+k=n} (-z)^k P_N q^{(N+2)k + \frac{1}{2}k(k-1)} \begin{bmatrix} n \\ k \end{bmatrix} \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^n (-z)^k q^{(n-k+2)k + \frac{1}{2}k(k-1)} \begin{bmatrix} n \\ k \end{bmatrix} P_{n-k} \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^n (-z)^k q^{k(n+1) - \frac{1}{2}k(k-1)} \begin{bmatrix} n \\ k \end{bmatrix} P_{n-k}. \end{aligned}$$

REFERENCES

1. P. Dienes, *The Taylor series*, Dover (New York, 1957).
2. W. Gleissberg, Über einen Satz von Herrn I. Schur, *Math. Z.* **28** (1928), 372–382.
3. I. J. Schur, Zur additiven Zahlentheorie, *S.-B. Akad. Wiss. Berlin* (1926), 488–495.
4. L. J. Slater, *Generalized hypergeometric functions*, Cambridge University Press (Cambridge, 1966).

THE PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY
UNIVERSITY PARK, PENNSYLVANIA