

I hear that the Croatian translations will be replaced by English and that the entire selection will soon be published abroad. If this should happen, I have certain small suggestions. The bibliographies on the individual writers, particularly those better known in the West, should not be limited to research done in Croatian. When sources are mentioned, it should also be noted where the manuscripts are to be found and which libraries have copies of important rare books. Brlek's valuable guide (*Rukopisi knjižnice Male braće u Dubrovniku*, Zagreb, 1952) is sometimes mentioned, but Jurić's excellent handbook (*Opera scriptorum Latinorum natione Croatarum*, Zagreb, 1968) is not quoted in either the bibliographies or the "sources." These suggestions are only details in an otherwise flawless achievement.

ANTE KADIĆ  
Indiana University

TRANSLATION IN MEDIEVAL BULGARIA. By *Ashit Chakraborty*. Calcutta: Indranath Mojumder, 1969. xiv, 80 pp. \$3.00.

This monograph is the only volume published so far of an ambitious series to be entitled *Theory and Practice of Translation Throughout the Ages*. The author's sole credentials for writing it would appear to be a "number of years" spent in Bulgaria and other East European countries.

One would have to be a great scholar to condense the essence of this large and controversial topic into less than eighty pages. Mr. Chakraborty, making no claim to scholarship, exudes the enthusiasm of the ill-informed. He would have done Indian scholarship and English-language literature more of a service by translating selections from some of his more germane sources than he has done by regurgitating them all, half-digested. Some of these sources, at least, are competent popularizations of philology by specialists in the field. It is difficult, however, to understand the pertinence of D. Blagoev's book *Contribution to the History of Socialism in Bulgaria* (an eyewitness account of events and political developments in late nineteenth-century Bulgaria) to the subject of medieval translations. Yet there are hundreds of basic books and articles that even a beginner should know about. That he lives and works in India is no excuse for Chakraborty's unawareness of bibliography. As a one-time student of the Bulgarian language in Bulgaria, he should have had access to B. Penev's four-volume history of Bulgarian literature, or in any case to the university textbook of Old Bulgarian literature by P. Dinekov and volumes 1 and 2 of the four-volume history of Bulgarian literature published by the Bulgarian Academy of Sciences in 1963 and 1966, respectively.

Chakraborty writes well in English and appears to have good intentions. His future work might be more praiseworthy if he were to limit himself to translation. As for *Translation in Medieval Bulgaria*, it is one of those books that should never have been written.

ILYA V. TALEV  
University of California, Los Angeles

PAMETNA BITKA NA NARODITE. By *Bistra Tsvetkova*. Varna: Dürzhavno izdatelstvo, 1969. 292 pp. 2.10 lv.

One of the most complicated periods in Ottoman and Balkan history is the century between the Ottoman landing at Gallipoli (1354) and the conquest of Constantino-

ple (1453). This well-known Bulgarian Ottoman scholar has given us an excellent synthesis of the social, economic, political, and other developments that occurred during that century of strife. She discusses the protracted resistance of the Bulgarians and other Balkan peoples against the Ottomans, the part played in this struggle by individual Balkan powers and prominent personalities, the devastating consequences of the disunity among the Balkan Christians, and the results of the fall of Tirnovo (1393) and Nicopolis (1396). At the end of the fourteenth century the Christians were so divided that they were unable to take advantage of the civil war in the Ottoman state following Tamerlane's defeat of Sultan Bayezid at Ankara (1402). The author supplies interesting details in connection with the religiosocial movements led by Sheykh Bâdr al-Din and Bürklüje Mustafa at the beginning of the fifteenth century, the fall of Salonika (1430), the Greek revival in Morea, the splintering of the Serbs into a number of feuding political entities, the heroic deeds of Skanderbeg, the ordeals and aspirations of Manuel II (1391–1425), the activities of Ivan Shishman, Ivan Stratsimir, Prince Mircea, János Hunyadi, King Władisław, and a number of others.

The main attention in the book is given to the background, preparations, and execution of the crusade against the Ottomans in 1443–44 that led to the Christian defeat at Varna. The author concludes that the Battle of Varna (1444) marked the decisive point in the struggle of the Balkan peoples against the Ottoman conquerors. The Ottomans established themselves in the Balkans, but they were unable to overcome the resistance of the Balkan peoples. Writing with patriotic fervor, the author compares the historical role of Bulgaria to that of Russia. Just as Russia saved Europe from the Tatars, the Balkan peoples—"especially" the Bulgarians—saved Europe from the Ottomans (p. 265).

The author also explains the establishment of Ottoman rule in the Balkans—the formation of Ottoman institutions and the introduction of Ottoman feudalism. She examines various categories of land (*miri*, *mülk*, *waqf*) and feudal fiefs (*khass*, *ziamet*, *timar*), the Muslim and Christian *sipahis*, and the obligations of fiefholders and peasants to each other and to the state.

The book is well documented and has an extensive bibliography. Besides Western works the author has consulted many Byzantine, Turkish, and Bulgarian chronicles and other documentary materials which shed light on the developments of the day and depict the brutalities that accompanied the Ottoman conquest. The work includes a number of useful maps and an excellent collection of illustrations of battle scenes, prominent men, soldiers and their dress and equipment, fortresses, and art. It is a pity that there is no index and that the printing and binding of the book are not of better quality.

WAYNE S. VUCINICH  
Stanford University

IZSLEDVANIIA V CHEST NA AKADEMIK MIKHAIL ARNAUDOV:  
IUBILEEN SBORNIK. Edited by P. Zarev, G. Dimov, and I. Konev. Sofia:  
Izdatelstvo na Bŭlgarskata akademiia na naukite, 1970. 544 pp. 7.70 lv.

Professor Mikhail Arnaudov is one of Bulgaria's most distinguished and best-known scholars. In his long and varied career he has concerned himself chiefly with the study of the Bulgarian national renaissance and with the history and theory of literature and folklore. This massive Festschrift in recognition of