

## LETTERS

TO THE EDITOR:

The reviewer of my book, *Poland and Her National Minorities* (June, 1962, pp. 357-58), did not produce an objective review. At the outset, in order to minimize the value of my study, he misinformed the reader by saying that I am not a historian. May I take this opportunity in assuring Mr. W. J. Rose that I have a Ph.D. in history and have spent many years doing research in this field.

This review continued under the misinformation of the second sentence; it presented in rather desperate form a defense of Polish interests—for Mr. Rose, as the reader will remember, did not take issue with the facts presented in my study. Mr. Rose's general phrases and praising of his own works, which in my opinion are not the best example of objectivity, do not make up a review. Therefore it is hard for me to discuss my book with him in the traditionally scholarly manner.

Mr. Rose is mistaken in the assumption that the Germans from Lodz did consider themselves only as "Hiesige." May I suggest to Mr. Rose that he write to the "Lodzermenschen" (Landsmannschaft der Litzmannstatter in Stuttgart, Germany) and ask them how they felt while living in Poland. To my knowledge they by no means considered themselves "Hiesige," as Polish propaganda (and Mr. Rose) would like to have it.

Whose publications are more objective, that of the "notorious" Lengyed or Mr. Rose's self-evaluated study? I will, in this case, remain subject to my own judgment and not Mr. Rose's. Obviously, I have aroused Mr. Rose's anger for not including his "exhaustive study . . . either in the text or in the bibliography!" This, doubtless, was my gravest mistake.

The reviewer simply refuses to accept a different view of inter-war Poland than that presented by some Polish historians in a rather colorful though distorted picture. Mr. Rose's refusal to apply the term "nation" to Polish Jews is an unusual case and not generally supported by others. And again, the reviewer makes empty phrases regarding the case of the Ukrainians and Belorussians. What is the relationship between the Polish treatment of these minorities and "achieving independence" by the Ukrainians? Mr. Rose does not elaborate. Did the nonachievement of independence by these nationalities grant to the Poles certain rights to pacify them? It is hard to find a basic logic in Mr. Rose's philosophy.

And so, if somebody "oversimplified" it is Mr. Rose, since I did not say "that the disasters of 1939-1945 were due to these errors." I merely wrote that the situation created by the Poles had its influence on the events of later years.

STEPHAN HORAK  
*Indiana University*

EDITOR'S NOTE: Professor Rose does not desire to reply except to express regret if any of his remarks were such that they may have been construed as being of a personal nature.