Nationalities Papers



ASSOCIATION FOR THE STUDY OF NATIONALITIES



Nationalities Papers

EDITOR-IN-CHIEF Nancy M. Wingfield, Northern Illinois University, USA

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

SOVIET UNION

MANAGING EDITOR

Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

BOOK REVIEW EDITOR FOR FORMER

Steven Sabol, University of North

Carolina, Charlotte, USA

Nicolae Harsanyi, University of North

Mary Dakin, Stanford University, USA

ASSISTANT EDITOR

Pontus Hiort, Northern Illinois University, USA

EAST EUROPEAN EDITOR

Rein Ruutsoo, Academy of Sciences, Estonia

WEST EUROPEAN EDITOR

Frank Golczewski, Universität Hamburg, Germany

CANADIAN EDITOR

Orest Subtelny, York University, Canada

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Leonid Rudnytsky, Las Salle University, USA

Theodore Weeks, Southern Illinois University, USA

Edward Wynot, Florida State University, USA

EMERITUS EDITOR

Henry R. Huttenbach, The City College of the City University of New York, USA

EDITORIAL BOARD

Edward Allworth, Columbia University, USA; Audrey L. Altstadt, University of Massachusetts, USA; Seymour Becker, Rutgers University, USA; Margaret Beissinger, University of Wisconsin, USA; Stefano Bianchini, University of Bologna, Italy; Yaroslaw Bilocerkowycz, University of Dayton, USA; Melissa Bokovy, University of New Mexico, USA; Maria Bucur, Indiana University, USA; Daniele Conversi, Lincoln University, UK; David Crowe, Elon College, USA; Andrew Ezergailis, Ithaca College, USA; William Fierman, Indiana University, USA; Alice Freifeld, University of Florida, USA; Geoffrey Hoskings, University of London, UK; Charles Ingrao, Purdue University, USA; Mark Katz, George Mason University, USA; Mills Kelly, Texas Tech University, USA; Marcia Morris, Georgetown University, USA; Edward Lazzerini, University of New Orleans, USA; Andrew Ludanyi, Ohio Northern University, USA; Reneo Lukic, Laval University, Canada; Allen Lynch, University of Virginia, USA; David Marples, University of Alberta, Canada; Steve Marks, Clemson University, USA; Peter Mentzel, Utah State University, USA; Daniel Miller, University of West Florida, USA; Michael Rywkin, The City College of the City University of New York, USA; Gabriele Simoncini, Pace College, USA; Andris Skreija, University of Nebraska, Omaha, USA: Ralph Tuchtenhagen, Universität Heidelberg, Germany

Editorial correspondence, including submissions to the journal, should be sent to Dr Nancy M. Wingfield, *Nationalities Papers*, Department of History, Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, IL 60115, USA.

The editors accept no responsibility for the statements of fact or opinion made by the contributors.

Nationalities Papers receives support from the Simon H. Rifkind Center for the Humanities of the Division of Humanities of the City College of New York, and from the Shevchenko Scientific Society in America.

The journal is published four times a year in March, June, September and December. These four issues constitute one volume.



SUBSCRIPTION RATES

Nationalities Papers, Volume 28, 2000, 4 issues,

ISSN 0090-5992

Institutional rate: £228.00 North America US\$378.00 Personal rate: £62.00 North America US\$102.00

Subscription rates include postage/air speeded delivery

ORDERING INFORMATION

Please complete in full the details on the Order Form and return to:

Carfax Publishing, Taylor & Francis Ltd, Customer Services Department, Rankine Road, Basingstoke,

OR TO

Hants RG24 8PR, UK

Carfax Publishing, Taylor & Francis Ltd Customer Services Department, 47 Runway Road, Suite "G", Levittown, PA 19057-4700, USA

OR TO

Carfax Publishing, Taylor & Francis Ltd, PO Box 352, Cammeray, NSW 2062, Australia

By Fax:

- +44 (0)1256 330245 (UK)
- +1 215 269 0363 (USA and Canada)
- +61 (0)2 9958 2376 (Australia)

By Telephone:

- +44 (0)1256 813000 (UK)
- +1 215 269 0400 (USA and Canada)
- +61 (0)2 9958 5329 (Australia)

Rv WWW:

http://www.tandf.co.uk

By E-mail:

enquiry@tandf.co.uk

For further details on the journal, including Contents Pages please visit the Carfax Home Page at:

http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals

Nationalities Papers (ISSN 0090-5992, UPS 103138) is published quarterly. Periodicals Postage Paid at Rahway, NJ. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to Carfax Publishing, Taylor & Francis Ltd, Customer Services Department, 47 Runway Road, Suite "G", Levittown, PA 19057-4700, USA

Copyright © 1999 Association for the Study of Nationalities. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored, transmitted, or disseminated, in any form, or by any means, without prior written permission from Taylor & Francis Limited, to whom all requests to reproduce copyright material should be directed, in writing.

Taylor & Francis Limited grants authorization for individuals to photocopy copyright material for private research use, on the sole basis that requests for such use are referred directly to the requestor's local Reproduction Rights Organization (RRO). In order to contact your local RRO, please contact:

International Federation of Reproduction Rights Organisations' (IFRRO), rue de Prince Royal, 87, B-1050 Brussels, Belgium; email: ifrro@skynet.be

Copyright Clearance Center Inc., 222 Rosewood Drive Danvers, MA 01923, USA; email: info@copyright.com Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London, WIP 0LP, UK; email: cla@cla.co.uk

This authorization does not extend to any other kind of copying, by any means, in any form, and for any purpose other than private research use.

ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING SERVICES

Nationalities Papers is currently noted in Geographical Abstracts: Human Geography, Geobase, Historical Abstracts, International Political Science Abstracts, Sociological Abstracts and America: History and Life.

Nationalities Papers

| ORDER FORM Please enter my subscription to <i>Nationalities Papers</i> , Volume 28, 2000, 4 issues, ISSN 0090-5992. |
|---|
| Institutional rate ☐ £228.00 Note the state of the sta |
| ☐ North America US\$378.00 |
| Personal rate £62.00 |
| ☐ North America US\$102.00 Personal subscriptions are welcomed if prepaid by credit card or personal cheque. |
| METHODS OF PAYMENT |
| Payment has been made to: Girobank plc, Bootle, Merseyside GIR 0AA, UK Sort Code: 72-00-00. Account No: 551 3057. |
| Payment has been made by bank transfer to one of the following accounts (please indicate): |
| UK (Sort Code - 60 02 49) National Westminster Bank plc, Old Market Square Branch, 3 London Street, Basingstoke, Hants RG21 7NS, UK £ Account No: 01 484400 US\$ Account No: 01 328735 |
| |
| ☐ USA Fleet Bank N.A., 3rd Floor, 1185 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10036, USA. Account No: 9417201589 ABA No: 021200339 Swift Ref: NBNAUS33 |
| Payment enclosed. Cheques or bank drafts should be made payable to <i>Taylor & Francis Ltd</i> and be drawn on a UK or US bank. |
| Please charge: American Express Eurocard MasterCard Visa |
| Card Number Expiry Date |
| Signature Date |
| Our Value Added Tax Registration number is |
| ☐ We are not registered for Value Added Tax |
| INSPECTION COPY |
| Please send me an inspection copy of Nationalities Papers. |
| NAME |
| ADDRESS |
| |
| POST/ZIP CODE |
| |
| TELEPHONE FAX |
| TELEPHONE FAX |



Carfax Publishing, Taylor & Francis Ltd Customer Services Department, Rankine Road, Basingstoke, Hants RG24 8PR, UK Customer Services Department, 47 Runway Road, Suite "G", Levittown, PA 19057-4700, USA PO Box 352, Cammeray, NSW 2062, Australia

Online Access



This journal is available online in 2000

Institutional subscribers to the print version of this volume can enjoy online access to the same volume (and in some cases to the electronic archive) free of charge. Journals are currently available in a choice of PDF or *RealPage* formats through a simple-to-use web interface provided by CatchWord.

KEY BENEFITS

- Fully searchable database
- · Active reference linking
- · Easy access to full text
- Multi-format delivery options
- IP access control
- Cross journal searching
- Contents alerting service

Please connect to http://www.tandf.co.uk/online.html for further information and follow the steps set out on the 'Getting Started' page at the CatchWord web site: http://www.catchword.co.uk to enable access.

SEND AN E-MAIL TO:

CatchWord Helpdesk - support@catchword.co.uk
Online Customer Services Department - online@tandf.co.uk

Please contact Customer Services at either:

Taylor & Francis Ltd, Rankine Road, Basingstoke, Hants RG24 8PR, UK

Tel: +44 (0)1256 813000 Fax: +44 (0)1256 330245 E-mail: enquiry@tandf.co.uk www: http://www.tandf.co.uk

Taylor & Francis Inc, 47 Runway Road, Suite "G", Levittown, PA 19057-4700, USA

Tel: 1-800 821 8312 Fax: +1 215 269 0363 E-mail: info@taylorandfrancis.com www: http://www.taylorandfrancis.com

Nationalities Papers

VOLUME 27 NUMBER 4 DECEMBER 1999

CONTENTS

ARTICLES

| Monuments and Memory: Immortalizing Count M. N. Muraviev in Vilna, 1898 Theodore R. Weeks | 551 |
|---|-----|
| National Awakening and National Consciousness in Belarus David R. Marples | 565 |
| How the "Iron Minister" Kaganovich Failed to Discipline Ukrainian Historians: A Stalinist Ideological Campaign Reconsidered Serhy Yekelchyk | 579 |
| Islam and Nation Building in Tatarstan and Dagestan of the Russian Federation Galina M. Yemelianova | 605 |
| FORUM: NEW DIRECTIONS IN BELARUSIAN STUDIES | |
| Besieged Past: National and Court Historians in Lukashenka's Belarus Rainer Lindner | 631 |
| Political Culture and National Symbols: Their Impact on the Belarusian Nation-Building Process Astrid Sahm | 649 |
| Language, Nationalism, and Populism in Belarus Alexandra Goujon | 661 |
| Comments David R. Marples | 679 |
| REVIEW ARTICLE | |
| Magyarism: A Bland Cult of Nationality? Johanna Granville Glatz, Ferenc, ed., The Hungarians and Their Neighbours in Modern Times Csepeli, Gyorgy, National Identity in Contemporary Hungary | 683 |

FEATURED REVIEW

| Gitelman, Zvi, ed., Bitter Legacy. Confronting the Holocaust in the USSR (Antony Polonsky) | 689 |
|---|-----|
| BOOK REVIEWS | |
| Cockburn, Cynthia, The Space between Us: Negotiating Gender and National Identities in Conflict (Carol S. Lilly) | 695 |
| MacIver, Don, ed., The Politics of Multinational States (Michael Thurman) | 698 |
| Escape through the Balkans: The Autobiography of Irene Grünbaum (Sarah A. Kent) | 702 |
| "Ukraine in the World: Studies in the International Relations and Security Structure of a Newly Independent State." Special Issue, <i>Harvard Ukrainian Studies</i> | |
| (Nancy Popson) | 703 |
| Marples, David R., Belarus: A Denationalized Nation (Mary I. Dakin) | 706 |
| Allensworth, Wayne, The Russian Question: Nationalism, Modernization, and Post-Communist Russia (David J. Nordlander) | 707 |
| Glants, Musya and Toomre, Joyce, eds, Food in Russian History and Culture (Steven Marks) | 707 |
| Humphrey, Caroline and Sneath, David, The End of Nomadism? Society, State and the Environment in Inner Asia | |
| (Cynthia Werner) Gleason, Gregory, The Central Asian States: Discovering Independence | 710 |
| (Mary I. Dakin) Anderson, John, Kyrgyzstan: Central Asia's Island of Democracy? | 712 |
| (William Fierman) Hewitt, George, ed., <i>The Abkhazians: A Handbook</i> | 713 |
| (Kay Shelton) | 714 |

CONTENTS, VOLUME 27

Contributors

Alexandra Goujon is a PhD candidate at Institut d'Etudes Politiques de Paris, France.

Joanna Granville is Assistant Professor of History at Clemson University, U.S.A.

Rainer Lindner is a Lecturer in East European History at the University of Konstanz, Germany.

David R. Marples is Professor of History at the University of Alberta, Canada.

Antony Polonsky is the Albert Abramson Chair of Holocaust Studies at Brandeis University, U.S.A.

Astrid Sahm is a Researcher at the Mannheim Centre of European Social Research at University of Mannheim, Germany.

Theodore R. Weeks is Associate Professor of History at Southern Illinois University, U.S.A.

Serhy Yekelchyk is a PhD candidate in the Department of History and Classics at the University of Alberta, Canada.

Galina M. Yemelianova is a Research Fellow at the Centre for East European and Russian Studies at the University of Birmingham, U.K.