

the late Middle Ages, writings peppered throughout Grave's essay vignettes. Grave's analysis of Bellini's *Sacred Allegory* at the book's beginning, and the *Feast of the Gods* and *Woman at Her Toilette* at the end, effectively illustrate and bracket Grave's broader thesis that medieval allegorical thinking conditioned the "hermeneutics and aesthetics of the image in the modern period" (263), a shift typified by the arc of Bellini's oeuvre. A closer consideration of humanistic writings—above all, the *Hypnerotomachia Poliphili* (1499), a tour de force of word and image that gives voice to the playful process and performance of image making in Bellini's time—would have deepened Grave's study of the contemplative allure of Bellini's art. Specialists who seek a more thorough analysis of the literary, social, and intellectual climate of Bellini's age, along with a comprehensive bibliography, would be better served by the recent publications of Susannah Rutherglen and Charlotte Hale, Daniel Wallace Maze, and Davide Gasparotto, among others.

Nonetheless, Grave's book provides a succinct *vade mecum* to Bellini's paintings, which is sure to appeal to museum audiences who have fallen under Bellini's spell as much as undergraduates, who will find Grave's efficient commentaries on the theological and philosophical complexities of Bellini's painting an accessible introduction to Bellini's oeuvre and, more generally, to the practice—and power—of thoughtful, close, and consistent looking.

April Oettinger, *Goucher College*  
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.505

*Drawing in Tintoretto's Venice.* John Marciari.

Exh. Cat. New York: Morgan Library and Museum; London: Paul Holberton, 2018. 224 pp. \$40.

---

John Marciari's *Drawing in Tintoretto's Venice* was published in conjunction with an exhibition at the Morgan Library and Museum, New York, and at the National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC. Organized into seven chapters, the book is mostly dedicated to the drawings of Jacopo Tintoretto but also to those of his predecessors: Domenico Tintoretto, Palma Giovane, and a group of drawings possibly by El Greco. The introduction and epilogue serve to frame questions about the criticism of Jacopo's role as a draftsman, and more broadly about *disegno* in Venetian Renaissance artists' workshops. In his introduction, Marciari states his interest in correcting misperceptions of Tintoretto as an artist who did not draw, noting that several hundred drawings remaining by Tintoretto and members of his circle remain largely unknown to the public. The author further posits that it is necessary move away from the Florentine-Venetian stylistic dichotomies established by Vasari toward a closer analysis of Jacopo's drawings themselves.

Chapter 1 examines Jacopo's antecedents and contemporaries in order to challenge assumptions about Venetian drawings. Marciari points out that close comparisons can be made between the drawings of Tintoretto and Andrea Schiavone, including their use of thick outlines and similar figural types. In chapter 2's discussion of the evolution of Tintoretto's drawing style, it becomes increasingly clear that while Tintoretto drew from the imagination, he returned to his early methods of drawing from life throughout his career. Tintoretto's studio drawing exercises include *The Kneeling Man with a Staff* (ca. 1548–50, National Gallery, Washington, DC), which anticipated the drawings of Annibale, Agostino, and Ludovico Carracci. The discussion of Tintoretto's use of squaring for establishing figural proportions rather than for direct transfer to a painting is interesting; one example is the *Study of a Man with Raised Arms* (ca. 1562–66, British Museum, London), related to *The Finding of the Body of Saint Mark* (ca. 1562–66, Pinacoteca di Brera, Milan).

Tintoretto's sculpture drawings are discussed in chapter 3, and special attention is paid to his studies after Michelangelo's *Samson and the Philistines* (ca. 1540, Bargello, Florence). Marciari views this practice as a reflection of Tintoretto's need to train his workshop and his interest in studying bodies in space rather than as part of a *colore-disegno* debate. Discussion of Tintoretto's large-scale workshop continues in chapter 4, which considers studies *dal vivo* inserted into compositional studies—for example, *Reclining Nude Seen from Behind* (ca. 1580, British Museum, London) for the painting of the *Resurrection of Lazarus* (ca. 1580, Minneapolis Institute of Art)—as well as figures traced from the recto to the verso of a drawing. In chapter 5, Domenico emerges as a much less interesting draftsman than his father. However, the immediacy of his studies from life, as visible in his *Reclining Female Nude* (ca. 1590, Metropolitan Museum of Art), is striking. Chapter 6 presents a group of mystery drawings previously assigned to Venetian artists but recently reattributed to El Greco by Nicholas Turner. One example is the *Last Supper* (ca. 1575, Morgan Library and Museum, New York), which Stefania Mason instead attributes to Alessandro Maganza. Marciari's contentment with allowing the mystery to remain unsolved is refreshing. In chapter 7, the author presents Palma Giovane's multiple modes of drawing as a conclusion of the Venetian Renaissance tradition rather than a change to it.

The idea of Tintoretto's legacy is carried forward in the epilogue with a discussion of his interest in sculpture drawings as a specific means of teaching through drawing. Interpreting Palma's contributions to drawing manuals as an extension of Tintoretto's achievements for Venetian *disegno*, Marciari closes with an idea that is as much about the importance of drawing in Venice as it is about Tintoretto's legacy as a draftsman. Throughout his text, Marciari directly engages with much of the previous scholarship on Venetian drawings, including by Hans Tietze, Erika Tietze-Conrat, Anna Forlani, and David Rosand. The author raises questions about attribution and the function of drawings in Tintoretto's studio. Relationships with the Carracci's methods of drawing repeated throughout the chapters might be worth expanding into a

further discussion. The book is a fascinating reevaluation of Tintoretto's oeuvre of drawings and an excellent resource that functions independently from its related exhibition.

Veronica White, *Princeton University Art Museum*  
doi:10.1017/rqx.2019.506

*Flagellant Confraternities and Italian Art, 1260–1610: Ritual and Experience.*

Andrew H. Chen.

Visual and Material Culture, 1300–1700 5. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2018. 234 pp. + 12 color pls. €95.

---

Over the previous several decades, art historians have cast new light on works of art that were commissioned by lay confraternities, drawing inspiration from a burst of research activity that first appeared in social and cultural history. In so doing, they have attempted to better understand these works by analyzing them within their original physical, ritual, social, and ideological contexts. By their nature, confraternities offer several advantages to the historian who studies their works. The rituals and the spaces within which they were acted out are of a particular type, and the groups have left substantial documentation of the entire range of their activities.

This book, by Andrew H. Chen, follows that tradition and takes a wide view of the relationship between works of art and the ritual practices of flagellant confraternities in Italy, beginning in 1260 (the year of the flagellant processions) and ending in 1610. It also ranges widely across the Italian landscape, visiting lay brotherhoods in smaller towns outside of Florence, Rome, and Venice. Chen divides the book into two parts. The first part contains five chapters that present a series of case studies of works of art. In these, Chen shows how the decorative elements were integrated into specific confraternal objectives and practices, even when those objectives and practices seem to be at odds with the works of art. In chapter 1, for example, Chen analyzes the paradox of having an image of Christ's flagellation act as a focal point for a ritual that the *confratelli* often acted out in a darkened room while wearing hoods that obscured their vision. The rest of part 1 explores works of art that marked the separation between the confraternal oratory and the outside world; analyzes images specifically linked to commemorative practices for deceased brothers; examines objects used in confraternal masses, comforting rituals, and processions; and presents new evidence for female participation in flagellation rituals.

The second part of the book charts changes in confraternal rituals and visual style over the course of the sixteenth century, both before and after the Council of Trent. In chapter 7, Chen argues that sixteenth-century art was "disruptive to the absorptive