

## ON THE RANK OF A $p$ -GROUP OF CLASS 2

BY  
U. H. M. WEBB

ABSTRACT. Let  $d(G)$  denote the minimal number of generators of the finite  $p$ -group  $G$ ,  $r(G)$  the maximum over all subgroups  $H$  of  $G$  of  $d(H)$  and  $r_a(G)$  the maximum over all abelian subgroups  $H$  of  $G$  of  $d(H)$ . If  $G$  is of class two it is clear that

$$d([G, G]) \leq r_a(G) \leq r(G) \leq d(G/[G, G]) + d([G, G]).$$

By considering properties of the stability number of graphs we construct examples which show that any value of  $r(G)$  within these bounds can occur.

§1. If  $G$  is a group let  $d(G)$  denote the minimal number of generators of  $G$ , and  $r(G) = \max\{d(H) \mid H \leq G\}$ , the rank of  $G$ . Let  $r_a(G) = \max\{d(H) \mid H \leq G \text{ and } H \text{ abelian}\}$ . Patterson [3] has shown that if  $p$  is an odd prime then any finite  $p$ -group  $G$  has a subgroup  $N$  of nilpotency class at most two with  $d(N) = r(G)$ .

It is clear that in any group  $r_a(G) \leq r(G)$ ; we shall look at groups in which

$$(I) \quad r_a(G) = r(G)$$

that is groups with an abelian subgroup  $N$  with  $d(N) = r(G)$ . It was shown by Wehrfritz [4] that if  $G$  is the iterated wreath product of cyclic groups of order  $p > 3$ , then  $G$  has the stronger property that

$$(II) \quad \text{any subgroup } H \text{ of } G \text{ with } d(H) = r(G) \text{ must be abelian,}$$

and one might ask whether this characterises such groups. We shall construct a family of  $p$ -groups of class two and exponent  $p$  which show among other things, that the answer is no.

If  $G$  is any nilpotent group of class two then it is clear that  $d(G') \leq r_a(G) \leq r(G) \leq d(G/G') + d(G')$ . We shall show that even among  $p$ -groups satisfying (I) it is possible for every value of  $r(G)$  within these bounds to occur.

Our results follow from a construction which associates to any graph on  $n$  vertices and any odd prime  $p$  an  $n$ -generator group of class at most two and exponent  $p$ . We denote by  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$  the set of all such groups arising from graphs on  $n$  vertices.

---

Received by the editors August 25, 1981, and in revised form, November 20, 1981.

AMS (1980) subject classification: 20D15.

© Canadian Mathematical Society, 1983.

**THEOREM.** *Let  $p$  be an odd prime, and  $n$  an integer greater than two. There is a family  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$  of  $n$  generator groups of exponent  $p$  and nilpotency class at most two with the following properties.*

- (i) *Every group in  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$  has property I.*
- (ii) *If  $n - 1 \geq a \geq 2$  then  $X_a = \{G \in \mathcal{G}(n, p) \mid r(G) = a + r(G')\}$  has unique elements  $G_1$  and  $G_2$  of largest and smallest order respectively, and  $G_1$  has II and  $G_2$  does not.*
- (iii) *As*

$$n \rightarrow \infty, \quad \frac{|X_{a_1}| + |X_{a_2}|}{|\mathcal{G}(n, p)|} \rightarrow 1$$

where  $a_1 = \lfloor d \rfloor, a_2 = \lceil d \rceil$  and  $d$  is the real solution of

$$\binom{n}{d} = 2 \binom{d}{2} \quad \text{i.e.} \quad d = \frac{2 \log n}{\log 2} + 0(\log \log n),$$

- (iv)  *$X_n$  consists of the elementary abelian  $p$ -group  $P$  on  $n$  generators  $P; r_a(P) = r(P) = n = n + r(P')$ .  $X_1$  consists of the free group  $Q$  of nilpotency class 2 and exponent  $p$  on  $r$  generators;  $r_a(Q) = r(Q) = 1 + r(Q')$ . Both  $P$  and  $Q$  have II.*

Part (iii) leads one to wonder whether a similar result is true if  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$  is replaced by the set of all  $n$  generator  $p$ -groups of exponent  $p$ , in other words whether almost all such groups would have ranks drawn from some finite set  $d_1(n), \dots, d_k(n)$ .

It is perhaps worth noticing that Patterson's result does not hold for arbitrary nilpotent groups. For if  $C = A \uparrow B$  where  $A$  is free abelian on three generators  $\{a, b, c\}$  and  $B$  is cyclic generated by  $t$ , where  $a^t = ab^3, b^t = bc^3, c^t = c$  then  $G$  has class 3 and  $d(G) = 4$ . If  $H$  is a subgroup of  $G$  with  $d(H) = 4$  then  $d(H) = 4 \leq d(H/H \cap A) + d(H \cap A) \leq 1 + 3$  so  $d(H/H \cap A) = 1$  and  $d(H \cap A) = 3$ . But then  $H$  has the same class as  $G$ .

**§2. Some combinatorics.** In this section we describe the graphs needed for our construction in Section 3. Let  $\Gamma$  be a finite non-directed graph with  $e(\Gamma)$  edges. We denote by  $K_r$  the complete graph on  $r$  vertices; then  $e(K_r) = r(r - 1)/2$ . A subset  $T$  of the vertices of  $\Gamma$  involves a particular edge if both ends of it lie in  $T$ ; in other words the edge lies in the subgraph spanned by  $T$ . The stability number of  $\Gamma$  (also called the vertex independence number in the literature) is  $a(\Gamma) = \max\{m \mid \exists m \text{ vertices in } \Gamma \text{ which involve no edge}\}$ . It is clear that there is a unique graph  $\Gamma_1$  on  $n$  vertices with stability number  $a$  and maximal number of edges:  $\Gamma_1$  is the complement of the graph on  $n$  vertices consisting of a  $K_a$  and  $(n - a)$  isolated vertices, and  $e(\Gamma_1) = \binom{n}{2} - \binom{a}{2}$ .

It is a famous result of Turan (in for example [1] Chapter 4, Section 2) that there is a unique graph  $\Gamma_2$  on  $n$  vertices with stability number  $a$  and minimal number of edges. In fact if  $n = ra + s$  with  $0 \leq s < a$  then  $\Gamma_2$  consists of  $s$  copies of  $K_{r+1}$  and  $(a - s)$  copies of  $K_r$ , so

$$e(\Gamma_2) = s \binom{r+1}{2} + (a - s) \binom{r}{2} = \frac{1}{2} \left\lfloor \frac{n}{a} \right\rfloor \left\{ 2n - a \left( \left\lfloor \frac{n}{a} \right\rfloor + 1 \right) \right\}.$$

Thus if  $\Gamma$  has  $n$  vertices and stability number  $a$  then

$$e(\Gamma_2) \leq e(\Gamma) \leq \binom{n}{2} - \binom{a}{2},$$

and  $e(\Gamma)$  can taken any value in this range.

It has been shown by Bollobas (see [1] Chapter 7, Section 4) that if  $A_n$  is the set of all graphs on  $n$  vertices, then the stability number of almost all graphs in  $A_n$  takes one of two possible values,  $d_1$  and  $d_2$ . That is to say if  $B_n = \{\Gamma \in A_n \mid a(\Gamma) = d_1 \text{ or } a(\Gamma) = d_2\}$ , then  $|B_n|/|A_n| \rightarrow 1$  as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ . Explicitly  $d_1 = \lfloor d \rfloor$ ,  $d_2 = \lceil d \rceil$ , where  $d$  is the real solution to

$$\binom{n}{d} = 2^{\binom{d}{2}},$$

and  $d = 2 \log n / \log 2 + 0(\log \log n)$ .

If  $\Gamma$  has stability number  $a$  then any  $(a + 1)$  vertices must involve at least one edge. This generalises as follows.

LEMMA 1. *Let  $\Gamma$  be a graph on  $n$  vertices with stability number  $1 \leq a \leq n$ , and suppose any  $(a + 1)$  vertices involve at least  $k \geq 1$  edges. Then any  $(a + r)$  vertices involve at least  $k + r - 1$  edges, for  $1 \leq r \leq n - a$ .*

**Proof.** We use induction on  $r$ ; the case  $r = 1$  is given. Suppose any  $a + d$  vertices involve at least  $k + d - 1$  edges,  $d \geq 1$ . Let  $T$  be a set of  $a + d - 1$  vertices. Then for  $d \geq 2$ ,  $T$  involves at least one edge. Removing one end of this from  $T$  leaves a set of  $a + d - 2$  vertices, which by induction involve at least  $k + d - 2$  edges, so  $T$  involves at least  $k + d - 1$  edges.  $\square$

§3. **The construction.** In this section we construct the elements of  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$ . Let  $p$  be an odd prime, and  $n$  an integer greater than two.

Now given a graph  $\Gamma$  on  $n$  vertices  $\{V_1, \dots, V_n\}$  we construct a  $p$ -group  $G$  as follows. Let  $F$  be the free group of nilpotency class two and exponent  $p$  on  $n$  generators  $\{X_1, \dots, X_n\}$ , so  $F/F'$  and  $F' = Z(F)$  are elementary abelian on  $n$  and  $\binom{n}{2}$  generators respectively, and  $F' \mathbf{O}$  is generated by  $\{[X_i, X_j] \mid i \neq j, 1 \leq i, j \leq n\}$ . See for example [2]. Let  $X$  be the subgroup of  $F'$  generated by  $\{[X_i, X_j] \mid V_i \text{ is not adjacent to } V_j \text{ in } \Gamma\}$ , so  $X$  is elementary abelian on  $\binom{n}{2} - e(\Gamma)$  generators. As  $X$  is a subgroup of  $Z(F)$ ,  $X$  is normal in  $F$ . We use bars to denote images modulo  $X$ ; let  $G = \bar{F}$ . Then  $d(G) = d(F) = n$ , and  $G' = \bar{F}'$  so  $d(G') = d(\bar{F}') = d(F') - d(X) = e(\Gamma)$ .

LEMMA 2. *Let  $\Gamma$  be a graph on  $n$  vertices with  $e$  edges and stability number  $a$ , and suppose any  $(a + 1)$  vertices of  $\Gamma$  involve at least  $k \geq 1$  edges. Then if  $p$  is an odd prime, and  $L$  is any subgroup of the  $p$ -group  $G$  constructed as above,  $d(L) \leq a + e$ . If further  $k \geq 2$  then  $d(L) = a + e$  only if  $L$  is abelian.*

**Proof.** As  $G'$  is central in  $G$ ,  $d(L) \leq d(L, G')$ , so we may assume  $L \geq G'$ . Let  $L = \bar{H}$ , and let  $h = d(H/F') = d(L/G')$ . If  $h = 1$  then  $L/G'$  is cyclic so  $L$  is abelian, and  $d(L) = 1 + d(G') = 1 + e = h + e$ . If  $h > 1$  pick a basis  $\{u_1F', \dots, u_hF'\}$  for  $H/F'$ . Let  $D = \langle u_1, \dots, u_h \rangle$ . Then  $D' = H'$ , and  $D$  is free of exponent  $p$  on  $h$  generators, so  $d(D') = d(H') = \binom{h}{2}$ . Suppose that  $u_1F' = X_1^{\alpha_1} \cdots X_n^{\alpha_n}F', \dots, u_hF' = X_1^{\alpha_{h1}} \cdots X_n^{\alpha_{hn}}F'$ . Then by performing row operations and relabelling the  $X_i$  if necessary we may assume  $u_i = X_i n_i, 1 \leq i \leq h$ , where  $n_i \in \langle X_{h+1}, \dots, X_n \rangle$ . If  $i < j$ , let  $t_{ij} = [u_i, u_j] = [X_i n_i, X_j n_j] = [X_i, X_j] m_{ij}$ , where  $m_{ij}$  involves no  $[X_r, X_s]$  with  $1 \leq r, s \leq h$ . Then  $\{t_{ij} \mid 1 \leq i < j \leq h\}$  form a basis of  $H'$ , and  $[X_i, X_j]$  occurs in  $t_{ij}$  but in no other  $t_{rs}$  with  $r \neq i, s \neq j$ . Let  $T$  be the subgroup of  $\Gamma$  on vertices  $\{V_1, \dots, V_h\}$ .

Suppose  $d(H' \cap X) = x$ ; then  $H' \cap X$  lies in the span of at least  $x$  of the  $t_{ij}$ . If some linear combination of the  $t_{ij}$  lies in  $H' \cap X$  then each of the corresponding  $[X_i, X_j]$  lies in  $X$ , so there is no edge joining  $V_i$  and  $V_j$  in  $\Gamma$ , and hence in  $T$ . Thus  $x \leq (\# \text{ of non edges of } T) = \binom{h}{2} - e(T)$ .

It follows that

$$\begin{aligned} d(L) &= d(L/L') \\ &= d(L/G') + d(G'/L') \\ &= h + d(G') - d(L') \\ &= h + e - d(L') \tag{*} \\ &= h + e - (d(H') - d(H' \cap X)) \tag{**} \\ &\leq h + e - \binom{h}{2} + \left( \binom{h}{2} - e(T) \right) \\ &= h + e - e(T). \end{aligned}$$

Now since any  $(a + 1)$  element subset of the vertices of  $\Gamma$  involves at least  $k$  edges, then by Lemma 1 any  $(a + r)$  element subset involves at least  $(k + r - 1)$  edges. Thus if  $h > a$ , say  $h = a + r$  with  $r \geq 1$ , then  $e(T) \geq r + k - 1$  and  $d(L) \leq a + r + e - (r + k - 1) = a + e + 1 - k \leq a + e$ , and if  $k \geq 2, d(L) < a + e$ . If  $h = a$  then  $d(L) \leq a + e - e(T)$ , and if  $d(L) = a + e$  then by (\*)  $d(L') = 0$ , so  $L$  is abelian. If  $h < a$  then  $d(L) \leq h + e + e(T) < a + e$ . So in any case  $d(L) \leq a + e$ , and if  $k \geq 2$  then  $d(L) = a + e$  only if  $L$  is abelian.  $\square$

Now let  $A_n$  be the set of graphs on  $n$  vertices. If  $p$  is an odd prime and  $\Gamma \in A_n$  let  $G(\Gamma, p)$  be the group constructed above. Let  $\mathcal{G}(n, p) = \{G(\Gamma, p) \mid \Gamma \in A_n\}$ . Then each element of  $\mathcal{G}(n, p)$  is nilpotent of class at most two and exponent  $p$ , and  $|G(\Gamma, p)| = p^{n+e(\Gamma)}$ .

LEMMA 3. If  $G = G(\Gamma, p) \in \mathcal{G}(n, p)$  and  $\Gamma$  has stability number  $a$  then

- (i)  $r_a(G) = r(G) = a + r(G')$  and  $G$  satisfies (I).

(ii)  $G$  satisfies (II) if and only if any  $a + 1$  vertices of  $\Gamma$  involve at least two edges.

**Proof.** (i) As  $\Gamma$  has stability number  $a$  we can find a vertices  $\{V_1, \dots, V_a\}$  of  $\Gamma$  involving no edges: then let  $A = \langle X_1, \dots, X_a, F' \rangle \leq F$ . It follows that  $A' \leq X$  so  $\bar{A}$  is abelian and  $d(\bar{A}) = a + e$ , so  $r_a(G) \geq a + e$ . But by Lemma 2  $r(G) \leq a + e$ , so  $r(G) = r_a(G) = a + e$ .

(ii) If any  $(a + 1)$  vertices involve at least two edges then by Lemma 2 any subgroup  $L$  with  $d(L) = a + e$  is abelian, so  $G$  satisfies (II). If there is a set of  $(a + 1)$  vertices  $\{V_1, \dots, V_{a+1}\}$  which involve only one edge let  $N = \langle X_1, \dots, X_{a+1}, F' \rangle \leq F$ . Then by (\*\*)

$$d(\bar{N}) = (a + 1) + e - \binom{a + 1}{2} + d(N' \cap X),$$

and here

$$d(N' \cap X) = \binom{a + 1}{2} - e(T)$$

where  $T$  is the subgraph generated by  $\{V_1, \dots, V_{a+1}\}$ , so  $d(\bar{N}) = (a + 1) + e - e(T) = a + e$ . However as  $T$  has one edge,  $V_i V_j$  say, then  $[\bar{X}_i, \bar{X}_j] \neq 1$  so  $\bar{N}$  is not abelian.  $\square$

This enables us to prove the Theorem.

**Proof.** Part (i) follows from Lemma 3. Part (ii) follows from our remarks in Section 3; set  $G_1 = G(\Gamma_1, p)$  and  $G_2 = G(\Gamma_2, p)$ . Clearly any  $(a + 1)$  vertices of  $G_1$  involve at least  $a \geq 2$  edges so by Lemma 2  $G_1$  has property II. On the other hand we can find  $(a + 1)$  vertices in  $G_2$  which involve only one edge (for since  $a < n$ ,  $\Gamma_2$  consists of  $a$  complete graphs at least one of which contains more than one vertex: select two vertices from this complete graph and one from each of the other complete graphs). Thus by Lemma 3,  $G_2$  does not have property II. Part (iii) follows from the result of Bollobas quoted in Section 2. Part (iv) is clear from Lemma 2.

REFERENCES

1. B. Bollobas, *Graph Theory*, Springer GTM 63.
2. G. Higman, *Enumerating  $p$ -groups. I: Inequalities*. Proc. Lond. Math. Soc., Ser 3, **10**, (1960), 24–30.
3. A. R. (MacWilliams) Patterson, *The minimal number of generators for  $p'$  subgroups of  $GL(n, p)$* , J. Algebra **32**, (1974) 132–140.
4. B. A. F. Wehrfritz, *The rank of a linear  $p$ -group; An apology*, J. Lond. Math. Soc. (2), **21** (1980), 237–243.

DEPARTMENT OF PURE MATHEMATICS  
 QUEEN MARY COLLEGE (UNIVERSITY OF LONDON)  
 MILE END ROAD  
 LONDON E1 4NS  
 Current address:  
 UNIVERSITY OF ILLINOIS AT URBANA-CHAMPAIGN  
 URBANA, IL 61801, U.S.A.