# Review of International Studies

## **Editors**

Martin Coward Richard Devetak Carolina Moulin Matthew Paterson Nisha Shah Maja Zehfuss Andreja Zevnik



VOLUME 48
ISSUE 5
DECEMBER 2022
ISSN 0260-2105



# Review of International Studies

### Editors

Martin Coward (Lead Editor), University of Manchester Richard Devetak, The University of Queensland Carolina Moulin, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais Matthew Paterson, The University of Manchester

Editorial Board

Rita Abrahamsen, University of Ottawa Soumita Basu, South Asian University Jaco Bernard-Naude, University of Cape Town Michele Betsill, Colorado State University Ruth Blakeley, University of Sheffield Nadia Bou Ali, American University of Beirut Dan Bulley, Oxford Brookes University Amanda Coffie, University of Ghana Scarlett Cornelissen, University of Stellenbosch Julia Costa-Lopez, University of Groningen Robyn Eckersley, University of Melbourne Tom Gregory, University of Auckland Siba Grovugui, Cornell University Enze Han, University of Hong Kong Sophie Harman, Queen Mary University of London Alison Howell, Rutgers University Naeem Inayatullah, Ithaca College

Nisha Shah, The University of Ottawa Maja Zehfuss, The University of Copenhagen Andreja Zevnik, The University of Manchester

Piki Ish-Shalom, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem Ken MacLeish, Vanderbilt University Amrita Narlikar, German Institute for Global and Area Studies

Chukwumerije Okereke, University of Reading Philipp Pattberg, Vrije Univeristeit Amsterdam Shirin Rai, University of Warwick Or Rosenboim, City, University of London Olivia Rutazibwa, University of Portsmouth Giorgio Shani, International Christian University, Japan Hayley Stevenson, Universidad Torcuato di Tella, Argentina Johannes Stripple, Lund University Arlene B. Tickner, Universidad del Rosario in Bogotá Jacqui True, Monash University Annick Wibben, Swedish Defence University Peter Vale, University of Pretoria Ayse Zarakol, University of Cambridge

### © British International Studies Association 2022

### Subscriptions

Review of International Studies (ISSN 0260-2105) is published five times per annum for the British International Studies Association by Cambridge University Press.

Review of International Studies is only available as part of the British International Studies Association package with European Journal of International Security. The 2022 subscription price for institutions (excluding VAT) of this package, which includes print and electronic access, is £742.00 (US \$1293.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico). The electronic-only price available to institutional subscribers is £603.00 (US \$963.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico). The print-only price available to institutional subscribers is £713.00 (US \$1209.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico).

Review of International Studies is available to individuals ordering directly from the publishers and certifying that the journal is for their personal use. The prices of a 2022 individual subscription, which includes print and electronic access, is £83.00 (US \$123.00 in USA, Canada and Mexico). EU subscribers (outside the UK) who are not registered for VAT should add VAT at their country's rate. VAT registered subscribers should provide their VAT registration number. Orders, which must be accompanied by payment, may be sent to any bookseller or subscription agent or to the publisher: Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, University Printing House, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, UK. Orders from the USA, Canada and Mexico should be sent to Cambridge University Press, 1 Liberty Plaza, Floor 20, New York, NY 10006, USA. Prices include delivery by air. Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY, and at additional mailing offices.

### Copying

This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923, USA. Organisations in the USA who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of US copyright law) subject to payment to CCC of the per-copy fee of \$15.00. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes. Code 0260-2105/2021 \$15.00. Organisations authorised by the Copyright Licensing Agency may also copy material subject to the usual conditions.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19104, USA, is authorised to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from Cambridge or the American Branch of Cambridge University Press.

This journal is included in the Cambridge Core service which can be found at cambridge.org/core.

# Review of International Studies

VOLUME 48 · NUMBER 5 · DECEMBER 2022

Lead Editor: Martin Coward, University of Manchester Editors: Richard Devetak, The University of Queensland Carolina Moulin, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais Matthew Paterson, The University of Manchester Nisha Shah, The University of Ottawa Maja Zehfuss, The University of Copenhagen Andreja Zevnik, The University of Manchester

Special Issue: Pluriversal Relationality

Special Issue Editors: Tamara Trownsell, Navnita Chadha Behera and Giorgio Shani

### **CONTENTS**

### Special Issue Articles

Introduction to the Special Issue: Pluriversal relationality	
TAMARA TROWNSELL, NAVNITA CHADHA BEHERA AND GIORGIO SHANI	787
Recrafting ontology TAMARA TROWNSELL	801
Relational revolution and relationality in IR: New conversations MILJA KURKI	821
Provincialising International Relations through a reading of <i>dharma</i> GIORGIO SHANI AND NAVNITA CHADHA BEHERA	837
Against ontological capture: Drawing lessons from Amazonian Kichwa relationality	857
Cosmopraxis: Relational methods for a pluriversal IR	875
Relational Indigenous systems: Aboriginal Australian political ordering and reconfiguring IR	001
MORGAN BRIGG, MARY GRAHAM AND MARTIN WEBER	891
Role and relation in Confucian IR: Relating to strangers in the states of nature CHIH-YU SHIH	910