

# CHURCH HISTORY

AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY, DECEMBER, 1991

# THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

## *PRESIDENT*

RICHARD L. GREAVES, Florida State University

## *PRESIDENT-ELECT*

GEORGE M. MARSDEN, The Divinity School, Duke University

## *SECRETARY-TREASURER*

WILLIAM B. MILLER, Indialantic, FL

## *ASSISTANT SECRETARY*

STUART C. HENRY, The Divinity School, Duke University

## *EDITORS*

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

## *MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL*

### Class of 1991

MARK A. NOLL  
HARRY S. STOUT  
ANN TAVES  
FREDRICA THOMPSETT  
PETER W. WILLIAMS

### Class of 1992

HESTER G. GELBER  
MICHAEL W. HARRIS  
RONALD L. NUMBERS  
ANNE J. SCHUTTE  
GROVER A. ZINN, JR.

### Class of 1993

PETER KAUFMAN  
EUGENE Y. LOWE, JR.  
J. REBECCA LYMAN  
STEPHEN A. MARINI  
JAN SHIPPS

The Society was founded in 1888 by Philip Schaff, was reorganized in 1906, and was incorporated by act of the Legislature of the State of New York in 1916.

Vol. 60      December 1991      No. 4

# CHURCH HISTORY

Published quarterly by  
THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF CHURCH HISTORY

© 1991, The American Society of Church History

## CHURCH HISTORY EDITORS

JERALD C. BRAUER  
MARTIN E. MARTY

The Divinity School, University of Chicago

*with the cooperation of*

JANE D. DOUGLASS, Princeton Theological Seminary  
MARK U. EDWARDS, JR., The Divinity School, Harvard University  
ROBERT T. HANDY, Union Theological Seminary  
BERNARD MCGINN, The Divinity School, University of Chicago  
RICHARD A. NORRIS, Union Theological Seminary  
ALBERT J. RABOTEAU, Princeton University  
JOHN F. WILSON, Princeton University

*assistants to the editors*

JULIA A. CRUTCHFIELD  
K. SIGNE HANSEN

*Church History* is published quarterly in March, June, September, and December by the American Society of Church History. Subscription prices are \$30.00 a year (persons having been society members for five years and now retired from professional life—\$15.00; dues free for graduate students with the approval of a professor who is a member of the Society); \$8.00 for single issues; \$7.00 per year extra should be added for foreign countries. Please make all remittances payable to the American Society of Church History. Subscription applications, renewals, changes of address, claims for missing numbers, and orders for single copies of current or back issues should be sent to William B. Miller, 328 Deland Avenue, Indialantic, FL 32903. Claims for missing numbers will be honored without charge if made within two months following the regular month of publication.

Microfilm reproductions of *The American Society of Church History Papers*, series I and II, and of *Church History*, vols. 1–17 (1932–48), are available from the ATLA Preservation Board. Orders for these reproductions as well as inquiries about microfilm portions and xerox copies should be sent to 1118 East 54th Place, Chicago, Illinois 60615.

Microfilm reproductions of *Church History* starting with vol. 18 (1949) are available to subscribers and members of the society from University Microfilms, 300 N. Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106. *Church History* is indexed in *Religion Index One: Periodicals*, published by the American Theological Library Association, Chicago, available online in the ATLA Religion Database through BRS Information Technologies (Latham, New York) and DIALOG Information Services (Palo Alto, California).

The following indexes are available from the treasurer, William B. Miller, at the address given above: *Papers* and vols. 1–30 (1932–1961), \$10.00; vols. 31–39 (1962–1970), \$10.00; vols. 40–49 (1971–1980), \$10.00 (\$8.00 for active, individual members of the Society). Add \$2.00 postage charges. Book reviews are indexed or abstracted in *Book Review Index*, *Historical Abstracts*, and *America: History and Life*.

Manuscripts and books for review should be sent to *Church History*, Swift Hall, 1025 E. 58th St., Chicago, Illinois 60637. Manuscripts submitted for consideration must be typed double-spaced on sturdy paper; footnotes must be typed double-spaced on separate pages following the text. Manuscripts exceeding twenty-five pages in length (including footnotes) cannot be considered. Please submit two copies of the manuscript and include correct return postage.

Advertising orders and requests for permission to quote should be addressed to the editorial office in Chicago.

*Church History* is printed by Science Press, Ephrata, Pennsylvania. Second-class postage paid at Indialantic, Florida and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send Address Changes to: Church History, American Society of Church History, 328 Deland Avenue, Indialantic, FL 32903.

CHURCH HISTORY (ISSN 0009-6407)

# CONTENTS

- 445 Gender and the Authority of Friars: The Significance of Holy Women for Thirteenth-Century Franciscans and Dominicans  
JOHN COAKLEY
- 461 The Ohio Valley: Testing Ground for America's Experiment in Religious Pluralism  
TIMOTHY L. SMITH
- 480 Defending Roman Loyalties and Republican Values: The 1848 Italian Revolution in American Catholic Apologetics  
SANDRA YOCUM MIZE
- 493 'Who is Sufficient For These Things?': Sara G. Stanley and the American Missionary Association, 1864–1868  
JUDITH WEISENFELD
- 508 'The Church of Humanity': New York's Worshipping Positivists  
GILLIS J. HARP
- 524 **Book Reviews**
- Cabaniss, Allen, *Patterns in Early Christian Worship* ..... Carl Andrew Volz  
Thurston, Bonnie Bowman, *The Widows: A Women's Ministry in the Early Church* ..... Roy Bowen Ward  
Kaestli, Jean-Daniel, Poffet, Jean-Michel, and Zumstein, Jean, eds., *La communauté johannique et son histoire: La trajectoire de l'évangile de Jean aux deux premiers siècles* ..... Anthony Joseph Springer  
Perelmuter, Hayim Goren, *Siblings: Rabbinic Judaism and Early Christianity at Their Beginnings* ..... Anthony Joseph Springer  
Gerchow, Jan, *Die Gedenküberlieferung der Angelsachsen. Mit einem Katalog der Libri Vitae Necrologien* ..... Richard W. Pfaff  
Briscoe, Marianne G., and Coldewey, John C., eds., *Contexts for Early English Drama* ..... Martha H. Fleming  
Goodich, Michael E., *From Birth to Old Age: The Human Life Cycle in Medieval Thought, 1250–1350* ..... Clarissa W. Atkinson  
Lesnick, Daniel R., *Preaching in Medieval Florence: The Social World of Franciscan and Dominican Spirituality* ..... Paul Lachance  
Caberlin, Luigi, ed., *Il Catastico di S. Giustina di Monselice detto di Ezzelino*  
Mantovani, Gilda, ed., *Il Formulario Vicentino-Padovano di lettere Vescovili (sec. XIV)* ..... Daniel Bornstein  
Wood, Diana, *Clement VI: The Pontificate and Ideas of An Avignon Pope* ..... John E. Weakland  
Kieckhefer, Richard, *Magic in the Middle Ages* ..... R. C. Finucane  
Gritsch, Eric W., *Thomas Müntzer: A Tragedy of Errors*  
Friesen, Abraham, *Thomas Muentzer, a Destroyer of the Godless: The Making of a Sixteenth-Century Religious Revolutionary* ..... Joyce L. Irwin

Janz, Denis R., <i>Luther on Thomas Aquinas: The Angelic Doctor in the Thought of the Reformer</i> .....	Eric W. Gritsch
Brooks, Peter Newman, <i>Cranmer in Context: Documents from the English Reformation</i> .....	Paul F. Vieson
Wright, Craig, <i>Music and Ceremony at Notre Dame of Paris, 500–1550</i> .....	John Ogasapian
Dufour, Alain, and Nicollier, Béatrice, eds., <i>Correspondance de Théodore de Bèze. Volume 14, 1573</i> .....	Jill Raitt
Unghvary, Alexander Sandor, <i>The Hungarian Protestant Reformation in the Sixteenth Century under the Ottoman Impact: Essays and Profiles</i> .....	Andrew Harsanyi
Marshall, Sherrin, ed., <i>Women in Reformation and Counter-Reformation Europe: Private and Public Worlds</i> .....	Charmarie J. Blaisdell
Whiting, Robert, <i>The Blind Devotion of the People: Popular Religion and the English Reformation</i> .....	Baird Tipson
McGoldrick, James Edward, <i>Luther's Scottish Connection</i> .....	W. Fred Graham
Sasek, Lawrence A., ed., <i>Images of English Puritanism: A Collection of Contemporary Sources, 1580–1646</i> .....	William M. Abbott
Gres-Gayer, Jacques, ed., <i>Paris-Cantorbéry, 1717–1720: Le Dossier d'un première Oeuménisme</i> .....	Ted A. Campbell
Sattler, Gary R., <i>Nobler than the Angels, Lower than a Worm: The Pietist View of the Individual in the Writings of Heinrich Müller and August Hermann Francke</i> .....	Eric Lund
Davis, Bertram H., <i>Thomas Percy: A Scholar-Cleric in the Age of Johnson</i> .....	Grayson Carter
Szasz, Margaret Connell, <i>Indian Education in the American Colonies, 1607–1783</i> .....	Robert S. Michaelsen
Kervingant, M. T., <i>Des Moniales Face à la Révolution Française: Aux origines des Cisterciennes-Trappistines</i> .....	John B. Guarino
Chadwick, Owen, <i>The Spirit of the Oxford Movement: Tractarian Essays</i> .....	Lawrence Barmann
Wright, Conrad Edick, ed., <i>American Unitarianism, 1805–1865</i> .....	Arie J. Griffioen
Johnson, Curtis D., <i>Islands of Holiness: Rural Religion in Upstate New York, 1790–1860</i> .....	James E. Johnson
Wallace, Dewey D., ed., <i>Sherlock Bristol: The Pioneer Preacher: Incidents of Interest and Experiences in the Author's Life</i> .....	Ronald E. Osborn
Van Die, Marguerite, <i>An Evangelical Mind: Nathaniel Burwash and the Methodist Tradition in Canada</i> .....	Phyllis D. Airhart
Brown, Richard D., <i>Knowledge is Power: The Diffusion of Information in Early America, 1700–1865</i> .....	Charles H. Lippy
Altholz, Josef L., <i>The Religious Press in Britain, 1760–1900</i> .....	James E. Bradley
Gibson, Ralph, <i>A Social History of French Catholicism, 1789–1914</i> .....	Richard F. Costigan
Perry, Nicholas and Echeverría, Loreto, <i>Under the Heel of Mary</i> .....	David G. Schultenover
McIntire, C. T., and Perry, Marvin, eds., <i>Toynbee: Reappraisals</i> .....	Robert Bruce Mullin
Smaby, Beverly Prior, <i>The Transformation of Moravian Bethlehem: From Communal Mission to Family Economy</i> .....	Jerry L. Surratt
Fuechtmann, Thomas G., <i>Steeple and Stacks: Religion and Steel Crisis in Youngstown</i> .....	Jacob H. Dorn
Peacock, James L. and Tyson, Ruel W., Jr., <i>Pilgrims of Paradox: Calvinism and Experience Among the Primitive Baptists of the Blue Ridge</i> .....	Bill J. Leonard
Titon, Jeff Todd, ed., <i>Reverend C. L. Franklin: Give Me This Mountain: Life History and Selected Sermons</i> .....	Milton C. Sernett

Bull, Malcolm and Lockhart, Keith, <i>Seeking a Sanctuary: Seventh-day Adventism and the American Dream</i> .....	A. Gregory Schneider
Lotz, David W., ed., <i>Altered Landscapes: Christianity in America, 1935–1985</i> .....	R. Scott Appleby
Avis, Paul, <i>Anglicanism and the Christian Church</i> .....	William L. Sachs
Pelikan, Jaroslav, <i>Confessor between East and West: A Portrait of Ukrainian Cardinal Josyf Slipyj</i> .....	Charles A. Frazee
James, Wendy and Johnson, Douglas H., eds., <i>Vernacular Christianity: Essays in the Social Anthropology of Religion Presented to Godfrey Lienhardt</i> .....	Noel Q. King
Langmuir, Gavin I., <i>History, Religion, and Antisemitism</i> .....	Charles H. Lippy
Kitagawa, Joseph Mitsuo, <i>The Quest for Human Unity: A Religious History</i> .....	Rollin S. Armour

589 **Reprints and Books Received**

592 **Members of the American Society of Church History, 1991**

621 **Index to *Church History*, Volume 60**