

BBS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory
with open peer commentary
Volume 34 | Issue 3 | June 2011 | ISSN: 0140-525X

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Behavioral and Brain Sciences

Editors

Paul Bloom

Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

E-mail: bbsjournal@cambridge.org

Behavioral and Brain Sciences
Journals Department
Cambridge University Press
32 Avenue of The Americas
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

Editorial Administrator

Ralph DeMarco

Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin

Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

Editorial Board

Affective Neuroscience

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

Atypical Neurodevelopment

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

Behavioral Neurogenetics

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

Cognition and Artificial Intelligence

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

Cognitive and Decision Sciences

Nick Chater/University College London

Cognitive Development

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

Cognitive Neuroscience

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

Computational Neuroscience

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

Evolution of Brain and Cognition

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

Evolution of Cognition

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

Experimental Analysis of Behavior

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

Language and Language Disorders

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

Linguistics

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

Perception

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

Philosophy of Science

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

Primate Cognition

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

Social Cognition

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

Social Cognitive Neuroscience

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

Vision, Language and Computation

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

Editorial Policy *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email bbsjournal@cambridge.org.

© Cambridge University Press 2011. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com.

Subscriptions *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 34 (2011) for *institutions* is US \$1136.00 for print and online, US \$957.00 for online only, and US \$1024.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £645.00 for print and online, UK £546.00 for online only, and UK £590.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$323.00 for print and online and US \$295.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £190.00 for print and online and UK £173.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$121.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £76.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$99.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £60.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$218.00 (UK £108.00) plus postage. *Institutional* orders may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk. *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

Online availability *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Institutional subscribers: Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

Advertising Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

Contents Volume 34:3 June 2011

Précis

Carey, S. Précis of *The Origin of Concepts* 113

Open Peer Commentary

Allen, J. W. P. & Bickhard, M. H.

You can't get there from here: Foundationalism and development 124

Burge, T. Border crossings: Perceptual and post-perceptual object representation 125

Butterfill, S. A. Infants' representations of causation 126

Gauker, C. Concepts are not icons 127

Gelman, R. The case for continuity 127

Gentner, D. & Simms, N. Language and analogy in conceptual change 128

Gopnik, A. A unified account of abstract structure and conceptual change: Probabilistic models and early learning mechanisms 129

Haman, M. & Hernik, M. Can multiple bootstrapping provide means of very early conceptual development? 130

Heintz, C. Presuming placeholders are relevant enables conceptual change 131

Hill, C. S. Can Carey answer Quine? 132

Keil, F. Graceful degradation and conceptual development 133

Kiss, S. The notion of incommensurability can be extended to the child's developing theories of mind as well 134

Korman, J. Concept revision is sensitive to changes in category structure, causal history 135

Landy, D., Allen, C. & Anderson, M. L. Conceptual discontinuity involves recycling old processes in new domains 136

Machery, E. What is the significance of *The Origin of Concepts* for philosophers' and psychologists' theories of concepts? 137

Mandelbaum, E. What is the narrow content of *fence* (and other definitionally and interpretationally primitive concepts)? 138

Mandler, J. M. A leaner nativist solution to the origin of concepts 138

Margolis, E. & Laurence, S. Beyond the building blocks model 139

Markman, A. B. Can developmental psychology provide a blueprint for the study of adult cognition? 140

McLaren, I. P. L., Wills, A. J. & Graham, S. Representation development, perceptual learning, and concept formation 141

Overmann, K. A., Wynn, T. & Coolidge, F. L. The prehistory of number concept 142

Poulin-Dubois, D. How to build a baby: A new toolkit? 144

Rips, L. J. & Hespos, S. J. Rebooting the bootstrap argument: Two puzzles for bootstrap theories of concept development 145

Ristau, C. A. Cognitive ethology, over-attribution of agency and focusing abilities as they relate to the origin of concepts 146

Schlesinger, M. & Amso, D. Oculomotor skill supports the development of object representations 147

Shea, N. Acquiring a new concept is not explicable-by-content 148

Spelke, E. S. Quinian bootstrapping or Fodorian combination? Core and constructed knowledge of number 149

Weiskopf, D. A. Language and mechanisms of concept learning 150

Xu, F. Rational constructivism, statistical inference, and core cognition 151

Author's Response

Carey, S. Concept innateness, concept continuity, and bootstrapping 152