# ON FINITE COLLINEATION GROUPS OF $F_{5}$ 

REUBEN SANDLER

Our aim in this paper is to fill one gap left in (1) and to prove that if $H$ is a finite collineation group of $F_{5}$, the free plane generated by a finite open configuration of rank 9 , then $|H| \leqq 12$. Alltop has shown that $|H| \leqq 24$ and that there exist finite collineation groups of $F_{5}$ which have order 12 , so that the argument in this paper shows that $|H| \leqq 12$ is the best estimate which can be given. In (1), Alltop has completely settled the question for $F_{n}, n \neq 5$. The notation of this paper will generally be that of (1).

Most of the arguments used here will consist of case analyses of degenerate planes of ranks 7 and 8 and will be sketched rather than given in detail. The one theorem of some interest in this paper, other than the main result, is the following theorem which yields some information about the collineation group of $F_{4}\left(\pi^{2}\right.$ in the notation of (4)).

Theorem 1. Let $F_{4}$ be generated by the four points (or the four lines), $A, B$, $C, D$, and let $H$ be the collineation group of $F_{4}$ generated by extending to collineations of $F_{4}$ the 24 elements of the symmetric group on $A, B, C$, and $D$. Then there are no fixed elements in $F_{4}$ under $H$.

Proof. Observe first that the elements of $H$ are stage-preserving as collineations of $F_{4}$, and that $H$ is transitive on the four elements of stage 0 , the six elements of stage 1 , the three elements of stage 2 , the three elements of stage 3 , and the six elements of stage 4 . If there is a fixed element under $H$, let us assume for definiteness that a line, $L$, is a fixed element of minimal stage, $n \geqq 4$. Then $L$ has two predecessors, say $Q_{1}$ and $Q_{2}$, which must constitue an orbit (under $H$ ) since neither can be fixed, while $L$ is. Thus, we can conclude, since $H$ is stagepreserving, that $Q_{1}$ and $Q_{2}$ are of stage $n-1$. Similarly, $Q_{1}$ has two predecessors, $L_{1}$ and $L_{2}$, while $Q_{2}$ has two predecessors, $L_{3}$ and $L_{4}$. Now, since $Q_{1}$ and $Q_{2}$ are interchanged by $H$, the orbit of $L_{1}$ must include at least one of $L_{3}$ and $L_{4}$, say $L_{3}$. Assume that the orbit of $L_{1}$ does not include $L_{4}$. Then, $L_{1}$ and $L_{3}$ form one orbit, and $L_{2}$ and $L_{4}$ another, and the point $Q=L_{1} \cap L_{3}$ is fixed under $H$ and has stage less than or equal to $n-1$, a contradiction. Thus, we have shown that $L_{1}, L_{2}, L_{3}$, and $L_{4}$ constitute an orbit under $H$; therefore, each $L_{i}$ has stage $n-2$, and we have the situation of Figure 1 . Next, let $H^{\prime}$ be the permutation group on $\left\{L_{1}, L_{2}, L_{3}, L_{4}\right\}$ induced by $H$. Then $H^{\prime}$ must be a homomorphic image of $H$. But $H^{\prime}$ can have no elements of odd order (since

Received September 8, 1967 and in revised form, January 22, 1968. This work was supported by NSF Contract No. GP-5276.


Figure 1
$Q_{1}$ and $Q_{2}$ are fixed or interchanged), so $\left|H^{\prime}\right|=4$ or 8 . However, neither of these cases is possible since $S_{4}$ has no normal subgroups of order 6 or 3 .

It is apparent that the proof of this theorem also suffices to prove the following slightly more general theorem.

Theorem 1'. Let $F_{2 n}$ be the free plane generated by $m=\frac{1}{2}(2 n+4)$ points (lines), and let $H$ be the collineation group induced on $F_{2 n}$ by $S_{m}$, the symmetric group on the $m$ points (lines). Then there are no fixed points in $F_{2 n}$ under $H$.

We proceed now to the proof of the main theorem of this paper.
Theorem 2. Let $H$ be a finite collineation group of $F_{5}$, the free plane generated by an open configuration of rank 9. Then $|H| \leqq 12$.

Proof. We know by (1, Theorems 5.1 and 5.2) that there exists a finite free generator, $D$, of $F_{5}$ such that $D H=D$, and $D$ contains no element of degree 2 (i.e., incident with exactly two elements of $D$ ). Thus, $H$ is a subgroup of the collineation group of $D$. Since $D$ is a finite free generator of $F_{5}$, the results of (2) imply that $r(D)$, the rank of $D$, is 9 . We claim now that $D$ contains at least one element of degree 1 . For if not, since $r(D)$ is odd, not all elements can be of degree 0 , so there would have to be an element, $z$, of odd degree greater than or equal to 3 . If there are no elements of degree 1 or 2 , the "connected component" of $D$ generated by $z$ would be a confined configuration, which is not possible, since $D$ is open. Let $x$ be an element of degree 1 in $D$, and let $D^{\prime}=D-\{x\}$. Then we know that $r\left(D^{\prime}\right)=8$. Now, there are two possibilities: (a) $D^{\prime}$ is a degenerate incidence structure, and (b) $D^{\prime}$ is a non-degenerate incidence structure. We first consider case (a). We know that the free completion of $D^{\prime}, F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$, is a degenerate plane of rank 8 , and these are listed in $(\mathbf{2} ; \mathbf{3})$. The two possible types are shown in Figures 2 and 3.


Figure 2


Figure 3

Since $r\left(F\left(D^{\prime}\right)\right)=8$, if $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is of the first kind (Figure 2), then $i=4$, and if $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is of the second kind, then $i+j=5$. Now, $D^{\prime}$ is a free contraction of $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$, and $D=D^{\prime}+\{x\}$ is a non-degenerate incidence structure of rank 9 with no element of degree 2 , where $x$ is an element of degree 1 . By using the principle of duality, we may assume that $x$ is a point. But this situation can arise only in a limited number of ways, and these can be enumerated and the collineation group of $D$ determined for each case. If $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is of the first kind, then $x \notin L$ (since $D$ must be non-degenerate). Thus, one of the other lines, say $P \cdot P_{1}$, is in $D^{\prime}$ and $x \in P \cdot P_{1}$. However, if $L \in D$, we could not have $P_{1} \in D$, for $P_{1}$ would be of degree 2 . Since $P \cdot P_{1}$ cannot be of degree 2 in $D, P_{1} \in D \Leftrightarrow P \in D$. If $P \in D$, then $L \notin D$, and two points, say, $P_{3}, P_{4} \notin D$, $L \notin D$, and $D$ is as in Figure 4.


Figure 4
Clearly, the collineation group of $D, G(D)$, is of order 4. If $P_{1} \notin D$, then $P \notin D$ and $D$ can only be as in Figure 5.


Figure 5
In this case, $|G(D)|=2$. We next examine the situation where $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is of the second kind (Figure 3). We know that $i+j=5$, and it is easy to see that if $i \leqq 1$, or $j \leqq 1$, it is impossible to add an element of degree 1 and obtain a non-degenerate configuration. Thus, $i=2$ or 3 , and the point $x$ cannot be adjoined to $L$. It is easy to see that this situation cannot occur, however, since if $x$ is added to $L_{1}$, then $L_{1}$ will be of degree 2 and cannot be in $D$; therefore, $x$ cannot have been removed from $L_{1}$. Thus, if $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is of the first kind, $|G(D)| \leqq 4$, and $F\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ cannot be of the second kind, and we have disposed of case (a). We now assume that $D^{\prime}$ is non-degenerate, and again have two possibilities: $\left(\mathrm{b}_{1}\right) D^{\prime}$ has an element $y$ of degree 1 , and $\left(\mathrm{b}_{2}\right) D^{\prime}$ has no element of degree 1 . In case $\left(\mathrm{b}_{1}\right)$, let $D^{\prime \prime}=D^{\prime}-\{y\}$, and we know that $r\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right)=7$ and $D^{\prime \prime}$ must be degenerate. In this case, we must examine all possible structures obtained by adjoining two elements of degree 1 to a free contraction of a
structure of rank 7, and determine the collineation groups of those resultant configurations which are non-degenerate and which have no element of degree 2. Again, we refer to Figures 2 and 3, where now in Figure 2, $i=3$, and in Figure $3, i+j=4$, since $r\left(D^{\prime \prime}\right)=7$. A case analysis is required, as above, but again it is true that every structure $D$ obtained is degenerate or has $|G(D)| \leqq 12$. The final case is $\left(\mathrm{b}_{2}\right)$, where $D^{\prime}$ has no element of degree 1 , and $D^{\prime}$ is non-degenerate, $r\left(D^{\prime}\right)=8$. If $x$ were a point, then the (unique) line $L$, of $D^{\prime}$ incident with $x$, must be of degree 0 or 2 in $D^{\prime}$. If the degree of $L$ is 0 , then the stage of every element in $D^{\prime}$ is 0 , and $D^{\prime}$ must be as in Figure 6 . Otherwise, it is possible to take a free contraction of $D^{\prime}$ for at least one step. In fact, we can take a sequence of free contractions of $D^{\prime}$ until we have arrived at an open non-degenerate configuration of rank $8, E$, with no elements of degree 2 . Now, if there are no elements of degree 1 in $E$, then all elements are of degree 0 (otherwise, we could obtain a confined configuration) and $E$ must be one of the types pictured in Figure 6.


Figure 6
On the other hand, if $E$ contains an element $y$ of degree 1, then $E^{\prime}=E-\{y\}$ has rank 7 , and a simple case analysis shows that $E$ must be one of the following two types:

(1)

(2)

Figure 7
Now, by (1, Theorem 5.2), we know that $|G(E)| \geqq\left|G\left(D^{\prime}\right)\right|$. Also, since $x$ is the unique element in $D$ of degree 1 , then $x$ must be fixed by $G(D)$, and therefore $G(D) \cong H\left(D^{\prime}\right)$, where $H\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ is the subgroup of $G\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ fixing $L$, the unique element of $D^{\prime}$ incident with $x \in D$. Finally, if $E$ is as in Figure 7, or Figure 6 , numbers (3) and (4), then $|G(E)| \leqq 6$. Otherwise, $G(E)=S_{4}$, and $|G(E)|=24$. Now, in this last case, Theorem 1 shows that $H(E)$ (the restriction of $H\left(D^{\prime}\right)$ to $E$ ) must be a proper subgroup of $G(E)$; therefore,

$$
|H(E)|=|G(D)| \leqq 12
$$

as asserted in the theorem.

## References

1. W. O. Alltop, Free planes and collineations, Can. J. Math. 20 (1968), 1397-1411.
2. Marshall Hall, Jr., Projective planes, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 54 (1943), 229-277.
3. Günter Pickert, Projective Ebenen, Die Grundlehren der mathematischen Wissenschaften in Einzeldarstellungen mit besonderer Berücksichtigung der Anwendungsgebiete, Bd. LXXX (Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1955).
4. Reuben Sandler, The collineation groups of free planes, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 107 (1963), 129-139.

University of Illinois at Chicago Circle, Chicago, Illinois

