

Book Reviews

RICHARD HUNTER and IDA MACALPINE, *Three hundred years of psychiatry 1535–1860*, [reprint], Hartsdale, NY, Carlisle Publishing Inc., 1982, 8vo, pp. xxvi, 1107, illus., \$95.00.

Three hundred years of psychiatry is without doubt one of the best books ever produced on the history of psychiatry. Most collections of extracts are at most useful for casual browsing and conveying a flavour of original sources. "Hunter and Macalpine", as it tends to be called, performs those functions, but it does much more. It was so generously conceived and intelligently executed that it is simultaneously a book of readings and a genuine research tool.

The focus is Britain, and the documents were selected from a rich variety of sources: extracts from standard and obscure medical and psychiatric writers like Burton, Willis, Battie, and Conolly lie side by side with selections from diaries, letters, sermons, Acts of Parliament, and newspaper advertisements. Each of the 250 separate entries – arranged chronologically – is prefaced with a biographical or historical exegesis, indicating its significance and placing it in its social context. The extracts were selected with care, and their historical placements were impeccably researched and presented. The result was not simply to provide materials for a history of psychiatry in Britain from 1535 to 1860, but a brilliant version of that history.

The majority of both printed and manuscript material reproduced in this book came from the remarkable library which the late authors (mother and son) had assembled. Ida Macalpine died in 1974; following Richard Hunter's tragic and premature death in 1981, scholars were glad to learn that the library was to be sold intact. It has since been acquired by the Cambridge University Library where it is presently being catalogued and made accessible to scholars.

Originally published in 1963, "Hunter and Macalpine" has been out of print for a number of years and has become increasingly difficult to obtain. Happily, the present reprint again makes it available, though unfortunately not at a bargain price. At least it is well printed and bound. Announced as a "corrected" reprint, the nature and number of the corrections are not specified; they appear to be minor.

W. F. Bynum
Wellcome Institute

VINCENT BROME, *Ernest Jones: Freud's alter ego*, London, Caliban Books, 1982, 8vo, pp. vii, 250, illus., £12.00.

Psychoanalysis had rather varying fortunes in the different countries into which it was introduced. Much of its early history in Britain was closely connected with Ernest Jones, now remembered primarily as the author of the standard three-volume biography of Freud. Jones was an important convert to Freud's teachings, and though master and pupil often differed on points of psychoanalytical theory, their relationship survived for almost forty years, and it was Jones who smoothed the way for Freud and his family to flee Nazi-occupied Vienna.

Despite their relationship, and the service Jones rendered the aged Freud, Freud would never have called Jones his "alter ego". As this biography makes clear, Jones was a man of formidable administrative talent and considerable tact. He did play a key role in both British and international psychoanalytical circles. But he was hardly an intellectual giant: indeed, as Mr Brome shows, Jones's judgements were often based on personal (and sexual) likes and dislikes. Although he became rather rigidly conservative and conventional in later years, his early relationships with patients were not always strictly professional. He had at least a realistic attitude to the therapeutic potentials of psychoanalysis.

Brome's work has in a sense been gestating for thirty years, since it is based, amongst other things, on interviews with Jones in 1953. He has also had the co-operation of Jones's widow and children. (Jones's son Mervyn was analysed by Melanie Klein, but he remembers nothing of it.) There are generous quotations from previously unpublished correspondence, and a useful reconstruction of events concerning Freud, Jung, Ferenczi, Klein, and Anna Freud, largely from Jones's point of view. The result is a workmanlike production, but one marred by a number of careless mistakes and an incredibly sloppy job of proof-reading. Thus, the *Journal of Mental Science* becomes the *Journal of Mental Hygiene*, Karl Pearson becomes an economist, late nineteenth-century psychiatrists are described as still holding to the "wandering womb" theory

Book Reviews

of hysteria, and W. H. Walshe (Brome calls him "Walsh") is described as having studied with Laennec (he was fourteen years old when Laennec died). The publishers seem to have a limited amount of type with umlauts, so "für" usually becomes "fur". I tired of noting misprints at about page 100, but in one notable paragraph of ten lines (p. 225), Cranefield became "Cranfield", Helmholtz became "Hemholtz", Brücke became "Brucke", and du Bois-Reymond became "de Bois-Reymond".

W. F. Bynum
Wellcome Institute

RUDOLF SCHUMACHER, *Die Musik in der Psychiatrie des 19. Jahrhunderts*, (Marburger Schriften zur Medizingeschichte, No. 4), Frankfurt a.M. and Berne, Peter Lang, 1982, 8vo, pp. viii, 191, SFr. 49.00 (paperback).

This Mainz dissertation written under W. F. Kümmel presents a detailed discussion of the role which music came to play in the idea of therapy during the nineteenth century. It is an exhaustive piece of work and adds yet more material to the earlier studies of H. J. Möller (1971) and G. Brandmann (1960). In concentrating on the nineteenth century, Schumacher presents material which gives some insight into the nature and implication of "moral therapy", a regimen in which music therapy came to play a major role. No quotation illuminates the hidden agenda of "music therapy" more than one from François Leurat, a student of Esquirol's, who describes how he threatened a patient with the "baths" until he picked up the violin and played, quite against his will. What did he play? The Marseillaise, of course! The various functions which music therapy has depends on the idea of the patient and the conception of his disease. Schumacher brings sufficient material to illustrate this point several times over. For the German Romantics, such as Peter Joseph Schneider, who wrote a two-volume "system of medical music", it had quite a different function than for Leurat. What is important is that the image of music as therapy had both the sanctity of classical antiquity as well as the cachet of the modern. It was thus used for all manner of treatment of all manner of illnesses. Schumacher's presentation makes one wish for an integrated study of the relationship between music and society in one specific moment of history, let us say the romantics, where the medical component assumes a more central function. E. T. A. Hoffmann's mad musician-heroes are much more understandable once Schumacher's linkage of Romantic concepts of music and of madness are made. And Schneider's book would not be a bad point of departure.

In sum, a good dissertation that leads to further thoughts on a well-worn topic. Not a bad claim for the quality of the Mainz department of the history of medicine and the new Marburg series.

Sander L. Gilman
Cornell University

DIETER JETTER, *Wien von den Anfängen bis um 1900 (Geschichte des Hospitals, vol. 5)*, Wiesbaden, Franz Steiner Verlag, 1982, 8vo, pp. viii, 159, illus., DM 64.00 (paperback).

Most of Jetter's book deals with the ten specific institutions that he judges to be the most important and the best preserved of the many hospitals that have existed in Vienna since Roman times. Each section contains a chronological list of significant events concerning the hospital in question, a dozen or so references to relevant literature, lists of related buildings (for example, hospitals in other cities operated by the same religious order), two or three pages of descriptive texts, and about the same number of pages of photographs and illustrations. The text includes a surprising range of material – among other things, Jetter comments on the aesthetic qualities of buildings, on the political, social, and economic background of the founding and use of the hospitals, on the interpretation of decorative architectural symbols, and on medical practices and beliefs reflected in hospital construction. In his discussion of the Viennese Allgemeines Krankenhaus, Jetter also includes lists of heads of the divisions and clinics to the end of the nineteenth century, as well as of the specific rooms assigned to each unit. The photographs and illustrations are also diverse. Many of the photographs, often taken over the