Volume 7

Issue 2 Spring 1990

Social Philosophy & Policy

CRIME, CULPABILITY, AND REMEDY

Contributors

Jean Hampton	Mens Rea	1
Michael S. Moore	Choice, Character, and Excuse	29
PETER ARENELLA	Character, Choice, and Moral Agency: The Relevance of Character to our Moral Culpability Judgments	59
LARRY ALEXANDER	Reconsidering the Relationship among Voluntary Acts, Strict Liability, and Negligence in Criminal Law	84
STEPHEN J. SCHULHOFER	The Gender Question in Criminal Law	105
Leo Katz	The Assumption of Risk Argument	138
George P. Fletcher	Defensive Force as an Act of Rescue	170
Gerald Dworkin	Equal Respect and the Enforcement of Morality	180
C. L. TEN	Positive Retributivism	194
Jeffrie G. Murphy	Getting Even: The Role of the Victim	209
Jeffrey Reiman and Ernest van den Haag	On the Common Saying that it is Better that Ten Guilty Persons Escape than that One Innocent Suffer: <i>Pro</i> and <i>Con</i>	226

Published by BASIL BLACKWELL, Oxford and Cambridge, MA

Edited at the Social Philosophy and Policy Center Bowling Green State University Bowling Green, Ohio 43403, USA © Social Philosophy & Policy 1990

ISSN 0265-0525

Editor Ellen Frankel Paul Managing Editor Dan Greenberg

Associate Editors Fred D. Miller, Jr. Jeffrey Paul

Editorial Board David Bravbrooke Dalhousie University Baruch Brody Rice University **James Buchanan** Center for Study of Public Choice, George Mason University Jules Coleman Yale University Maurice Cranston London School of Economics Jack Douglas University of California. San Diego **Richard Epstein** University of Chicago Law School **James** Fishkin University of Texas, Austin

Antony Flew Social Philosophy and Policy Center **Charles Fried** Harvard Law School Martin Golding Duke University John Gray Jesus College, Oxford University Gilbert Harman **Princeton** University William Kristol Kennedy School, Harvard University Sevmour Martin Lipset Stanford University Eric Mack Tulane University

Harvey Mansfield Harvard University Wallace Matson University of California, Berkeley Jan Narveson University of Waterloo Robert Nozick Harvard University Nicholas Rescher University of Pittsburgh David Sidorsky Columbia University Hillel Steiner University of Manchester James Q. Wilson University of California, Los Angeles Leland B. Yeager Auburn University

Social Philosophy & Policy is an interdisciplinary journal with an emphasis on the philosophical underpinnings of enduring social policy debates. Each issue is dedicated to a particular theme chosen by the editors, with the advice of the editorial board, designed to appeal to both academic specialists and a broader scholarly audience. While not primarily a journal of policy prescriptions, several contributions to each issue will typically connect theory with practice. The editors encourage and actively pursue diversity of viewpoints among contributors. Diversity is also encouraged by selecting authors from among different disciplines, especially philosophy, economics, political science, and the law. Readers' suggestions for future themes are always welcome, as are inquiries about the topics of issues already planned.

Subscription and back-issue information is on the inside back cover.

CONTRIBUTORS

Jean Hampton is Associate Professor of Philosophy at University of California, Davis, and has taught at UCLA and the University of Pittsburgh. She is the author of *Hobbes and the Social Contract Tradition*, and, with Jeffrie Murphy, *Forgiveness and Mercy* (both published by Cambridge University Press). Her interests range over topics in political philosophy, ethics, and the philosophy of law. The paper in this volume is part of her research on theories of moral culpability, irrationality, and the role of retributive punishment in a liberal state.

Michael S. Moore has recently joined the law faculty of the University of Pennsylvania, where he is Leon Meltzer Professor of Law. He has previously held appointments in the law schools of the University of Southern California, the University of California at Berkeley, Stanford University, and the University of Kansas; he has been both a Fellow and a Senior Fellow in the Law and Humanities Program of Harvard University and a Resident Fellow of the Humanities Research Institute, University of California at Irvine. He is the author of *Law and Psychiatry*: *Rethinking the Relationship* (Cambridge University Press, 1984) and of numerous articles appearing in legal, philosophical, and psychiatric journals. He is currently working on two books, both to be published by Oxford University Press, one on legal reasoning and the other on a general theory of the substantive criminal law (of which the essay in this volume will be a part).

Peter Arenella is a Professor of Law at the University of California at Los Angeles School of Law. He holds a degree in law from Harvard University and did his undergraduate work at Wesleyan University. He has published widely in the fields of substantive criminal law and constitutional criminal procedure. He is currently working on a book that examines the extent to which we rely on descriptive and normative conceptions of character to help us interpret and defend the moral significance of human action in our blaming theories and practices.

Larry Alexander is a graduate of Williams College and Yale Law School and is currently Professor of Law at the University of San Diego, where he teaches constitutional law and criminal law. He is co-author of *Whom Does the Constitution Command*?, a book on constitutional theory. He has written a number of articles in both legal and philosophical journals on moral theory, legal theory, constitutional law, and criminal law. Stephen J. Schulhofer is the Frank and Bernice J. Greenberg Professor of Law at the University of Chicago and Director of its Center for Studies in Criminal Justice. He graduated from Princeton University and Harvard Law School before serving as law clerk to U.S. Supreme Court Justice Hugo Black. He practiced law for three years and joined the faculty of the University of Pennsylvania Law School in 1972. He has held his present positions at the University of Chicago since 1986. He has published journal articles on (among other topics) attempts, harm sentencing, plea bargaining and police interrogation. He is the author, with Sanford Kadish, of *Criminal Law and Its Processes*.

Leo Katz is Assistant Professor at the University of Michigan Law School. He is the author of *Bad Acts and Guilty Minds*: Conundrums of the Criminal Law.

George P. Fletcher is Beekman Professor of Law at Columbia University School of Law. His writings including *Rethinking Criminal Law* (Little, Brown, 1978) and *A Crime of Self-Defense : Bernard Goetz and the Law on Trial* (The Free Press, 1988), as well as numerous articles on criminal law and legal philosophy. He is currently working on a book on loyalty.

Gerald Dworkin is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Illinois at Chicago. He is the author of *The Theory and Practice of Autonomy* (Cambridge University Press). He has published articles on paternalism, nuclear deterrence, entrapment, responsibility, and other topics in moral and legal philosophy. He is currently working on issues related to the enforcement of morality by the criminal law.

Chin Liew Ten is a Reader in Philosophy at Monash University, Australia. He is the author of *Mill on Liberty* (Clarendon Press, 1980) and *Crime, Guilt, and Punishment* (Clarendon Press, 1987). His main interests are in legal and political philosophy. He is on the editorial committee of *Utilitas: A Journal of Utilitarian Studies*, which commenced publication in May 1989. He has served as an Honorary Consultant to the Law Reform Commission of Victoria.

Jeffrie G. Murphy is Professor of Law and Philosophy at Arizona State University. His most recent book (co-authored with Jean Hampton) is *Foregiveness* and Mercy, published in 1988 by Cambridge University Press. A revised edition of his *The Philosophy of Law: An Introduction to Jurisprudence* (co-authored with Jules L. Coleman) was published in 1989. Jeffrey Reiman is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Master's Program in Philosophy and Social Policy at The American University in Washington, D.C., where he has been on the faculty since 1970. Prior to 1988, he held an appointment in American University's School of Justice. He received his Ph.D. in philosophy from the Pennsylvania State University in 1968. Professor Reiman is the author of In Defense of Political Philosophy: A Reply to R. P. Wolff's In Defense of Anarchism (Harper & Row, 1972), The Rich Get Richer and the Poor Get Prison: Ideology, Class, and Criminal Justice (Wiley, 1979, 1984; Macmillan, 1990), Justice and Modern Moral Philosophy (Yale, 1990), and numerous articles in moral, political, and legal philosophy.

Ernest van den Haag recently retired as John M. Olin Professor of Jurisprudence and Public Policy at Fordham University in New York. He is the author of *Punishing Criminals* and twelve other books. He has published about two hundred essays on diverse subjects.