

# Nineteenth-Century Music Review

Volume 6, Issue 2



## NINETEENTH-CENTURY Music Review

VOLUME 6, ISSUE 2 2009

### **ASHGATE**

Published in association with the Centre for Nineteenth-Century Music, Durham University, UK

Letters to the Editor For any communication concerning published articles or reviews, please send letters by email or hard copy to the General Editor:

Professor Bennett Zon School of Music Durham University Palace Green Durham DH1 3RL England

Email: bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk

*Subscriptions* For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Nicky Staszkiewicz Ashgate Publishing Limited Wey Court East Union Road Farnham Surrey GU9 7PT England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 736693 Fax: +44 (0)01252 736736

Email: journals@ashgatepublishing.com

#### Themed Issues

The General Editor of *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* encourages proposals from individuals with ideas for themed issues, involving the commissioning of up to six main articles per issue, as well as one or more review articles for coverage of books, CDs and scores. Those applying to the journal for this purpose should initially provide the General Editor with a statement of no more than 500 words, outlining the thematic nature of the proposed issue, the names of contributing authors along with a working title for their papers, and a timetable for submission of work.

Proposers of themed issues work alongside the General Editor, and are designated Guest Editors. They are responsible for commissioning, organizing and preparing articles for publication, as well as working closely with review editors to locate suitable material and authors for relevant sections of the journal. Review sections of themed issues are not exclusively thematicized, and tend towards a balance of half themed, and half general material.

Articles commissioned for themed issues follow the same process of peer review as general issues. No guarantee of publication can be given to specially commissioned authors.

## Nineteenth-Century Music Review

General Editor
Bennett Zon

Book Reviews Editor James William Sobaskie

> CD Reviews Editor Jeremy Dibble

Score Reviews Editor R. Larry Todd

#### **Editorial Board**

**Professor Bennett Zon**, Durham University, UK (General Editor)

**Professor Jeremy Dibble**, Durham University, UK (CD Reviews Editor)

**Professor R. Larry Todd**, Duke University, USA (Score Reviews Editor) **Dr James William Sobaskie**, Mississippi State University, USA (Book Reviews Editor)

**Professor William Weber**, California State University, Long Beach, USA

**Dr Phyllis Weliver**, Saint Louis University, USA

#### **Advisory Board**

#### Dr Rosamund Bartlett

**Professor Andrew Bowie**, Royal Holloway, University of London,UK

**Professor Anna Celenza,** Georgetown University, USA

**Dr Geoffrey Chew**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

**Professor John Deathridge**, King's College, University of London, UK

Dr Steven Downes

**Professor Peter Franklin**, University of Oxford, UK

Dr Sophie Fuller

**Professor Lydia Goehr**, Colombia University, USA

**Professor Thomas Grey**, Stanford University, USA

**Professor Hervé Lacombe**, Université Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France

**Professor Roberta Marvin**, University of Iowa, USA

Professor Simon McVeigh, Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

**Professor Julian Rushton**, University of Leeds, UK

**Professor Jim Samson**, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor Manuela Schwartz, Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

**Professor Nicholas Temperley**, University of Illinois, USA

#### © Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2009

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrival system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by

Ashgate Publishing Limited Ashgate Publishing Company

Wey Court East Suite 420

Union Road 101 Cherry Street

Farnham Burlington, VT 05401–4405

Surrey GU9 7PT USA

England

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A.F. Leighton-Thomas.

www.ashgate.com

ISSN: 1479-4098

Bach musicological font developed by © Yo Tomita



Printed and bound in Great Britain by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall.

## Contents

#### Volume 6, Issue 2

Notes on Article Contributors	ix
Articles	
Emma Sutton Too Close for Comfort: Henry James, Richard Wagner and <i>The Sacred Fount</i>	3
Rosemary Golding Musical Chairs: The Construction of 'Music' in Nineteenth-Century British Universities	19
Andrew H. Weaver Poetry, Music, and <i>Fremdartigkeit</i> in Robert Schumann's Hans Christian Andersen Songs, op. 40	41
E. Douglas Bomberger Putting Words in the Master's Mouth: Anton Strelezki's <i>Personal</i> Recollections of Chats with Liszt	71
Peter Dayan Truth in Art, and Erik Satie's Judgement	91
Reviews	
Review Article	
Heather Platt New Paths to Understanding Brahms's Music: Recent Analytic Studies	111
Book Reviews	
Benjamin McKay Ayotte  The Schenker Project: Culture, Race, and Music Theory in  Fin-de-siècle Vienna by Nicholas Cook	124
Laura Hedden The Cambridge Companion to Mahler edited by Jeremy Barham	129

Jonathan Kregor Rossini in Paris: The Sound of Modern Life by Benjamin Walton	132
Christa Pehl  Beethoven's Century: Essays on Composers and Themes by Hugh Macdonald	136
Kenneth Stilwell  Heinrich Heine and the Lied by Susan Youens	139
Leanne Wood  Making Music in Los Angeles: Transforming the Popular  by Catherine Parsons Smith	143
Books Received	147
CD Reviews	
Douglass Seaton Brahms: Piano Quintet in F minor op. 34; String Quartet in A minor op. 51, no. 2; Takács Quartet. Stephen Hough <i>pf</i>	148
Julian Horton Bruckner: Symphony No. 8 in C minor op. 108 (version Robert Haas). Royal Concertgebouw Orchestra, Bernard Haitink <i>cond</i>	151
Jan Smaczny Czech Organ Music: Novák: <i>Svatováclavský Triptych</i> op. 70 ( <i>St Wenceslas Triptych</i> ); Martinů: <i>Vigilia</i> ; Dvořák: Fugue in G minor; Smetana: Šest Preludii pro varhany (Six Preludes for Organ); Janáček: Postludium; Ropek: Variations on 'Victimae Paschali Laudes'. Iain Quinn <i>org</i> . Dvořák: Stabat Mater (original version of 1876); <i>Accentus</i> . Alexandra Coku <i>sop</i> , Renata Pokupic <i>alto</i> , Pavol Breslik <i>ten</i> , Markus Butter <i>bass</i> , Brigitte Engerer <i>pf</i> , Laurence Equilbey <i>cond</i>	156
Christopher Mark Janáček: The Eternal Gospel; The Ballad of Blaník; The Fiddler's Child; The Excursions of Mr Brouček. Gweneth-Ann Jeffers sop, Adrian Thompson ten, Edinburgh Festival Chorus, Elizabeth Layton vn, BBC Scottish Symphony Orchestra, Ilan Volkov cond	159
James William Sobaskie  L'invitation au voyage: Mélodies from La belle époque (Cressonois,  Delibes, Lecocq, Pessard, Godard, Puget, Hillemacher x 2,  Paladilhe, Duparc). John Mark Ainsley ten, Graham Johnson pf	162

Contents vii

Laura Bassini Mascagni: Cavalleria Rusticana. Violetta Urmana sop (Santuzza), Vincenzo La Scola ten (Turiddu), Dragana Jugovic mezzo (Lola), Viorica Cortez contr (Lucia), Marco di Felice bar (Alfio). Leoncavallo: Pagliacci. Vladimir Galouzine ten (Canio), Maria Bayo sop (Nedda), Carlo Guelfi bar (Tonio), Antonio Gandia ten (Beppe), Ángel Ódena bar (Silvio). Chorus and Orchestra of the Teatro Real (Madrid), Jesús López Cobos cond	166
Patrick Zuk  Medtner: The Complete <i>Skazki</i> opp. 8, 9, 14, 20, 26, 31, no. 3, 34, 35, 42, 48, 51, 54, and <i>Skaza</i> '195'. Hamish Milne <i>pf</i>	169
CDs Received	173
Letter to the editor	
Marcia J. Citron Coda: A Reply to Marian Wilson Kimber	175
Guidelines for Contributors	177