

**COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN  
SOCIETY AND HISTORY**

*An International Quarterly*

RAYMOND GREW, <i>Editor</i>	<i>History</i>	University of Michigan
ARAM A. YENGOYAN, <i>Associate Editor</i>	<i>Anthropology</i>	University of California, Davis

#### BOOK REVIEW EDITORS

LEONARD BARKAN	<i>English and History of Art</i>	University of Michigan
NICHOLAS B. DIRKS	<i>Anthropology and History</i>	University of Michigan
DIANE OWEN HUGHES	<i>History</i>	University of Michigan

#### EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

SYLVIA L. THRUPP	<i>History</i>	University of Michigan
GEOFF ELEY	<i>History</i>	University of Michigan
ALBERT FEUERWERKER	<i>East Asian History</i>	University of Michigan
JACK GOODY	<i>Anthropology</i>	University of Cambridge
SHERRY B. ORTNER	<i>Anthropology</i>	University of Michigan
THOMAS R. TRAUTMANN	<i>South Asian History</i>	University of Michigan
JAMES TURNER	<i>History</i>	University of Michigan

#### CONSULTING EDITORS

SVETLANA ALPERS	<i>Art History</i>	University of California, Berkeley
BERNARD S. COHN	<i>Anthropology and History</i>	University of Chicago
NATALIE Z. DAVIS	<i>History</i>	Princeton University
S. N. EISENSTADT	<i>Sociology</i>	Hebrew University, Jerusalem
NANCY FARRISS	<i>History</i>	University of Pennsylvania
CLIFFORD GEERTZ	<i>Anthropology</i>	Institute for Advanced Study
CARLO GINZBURG	<i>History</i>	Università degli Studi di Bologna
MAURICE GODELIER	<i>Anthropology</i>	CNRS
GEOFFREY HAWTHORN	<i>Sociology</i>	University of Cambridge
DAVID A. HOLLINGER	<i>History</i>	University of California, Berkeley
KEITH HOPKINS	<i>Sociology</i>	University of Cambridge
EMMANUEL LE ROY LADURIE	<i>History</i>	Collège de France
DONALD N. MCCLOSKEY	<i>History and Economics</i>	University of Iowa
JACOB M. PRICE	<i>Economic History</i>	University of Michigan
RICHARD RORTY	<i>English and Philosophy</i>	University of Virginia
JAMES SCOTT	<i>Political Science</i>	Yale University
TEODOR SHANIN	<i>Sociology</i>	University of Manchester
SUSAN R. SULEIMAN	<i>Romance Languages</i>	Harvard University
CHARLES TILLY	<i>Sociology and History</i>	New School for Social Research
KATHERINE M. VERDERY	<i>Anthropology</i>	Johns Hopkins University
MICHAEL WALZER	<i>Political Theory</i>	Institute for Advanced Study
ERIC R. WOLF	<i>Anthropology</i>	Lehman College, CUNY
GAVIN WRIGHT	<i>Economics</i>	Stanford University

COMPARATIVE  
STUDIES IN  
SOCIETY AND  
HISTORY

AN INTERNATIONAL QUARTERLY

VOLUME 35, 1993



Published by the Press Syndicate of the University of Cambridge  
The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011, U.S.A.

© Copyright 1993 by  
the Society for the Comparative Study of Society and History

Printed in the United States of America

# Contents, Volume 35

E. VALENTINE DANIEL	Violent Measures in the Discursive Practices of Sri Lanka's Estate Tamils	568–600
SELIM DERENGIL	The Invention of Tradition as Public Image in the Late Ottoman Empire, 1808 to 1908	3–29
GÖRAN DJURFELDT	Classes as Clients of the State: Landlords and Labourers in Andalusia	159–182
LAURA LEE DOWNS	If “Woman” Is Just an Empty Category, Then Why Am I Afraid to Walk Alone at Night? Identity Politics Meets the Postmodern Subject	414–437
LAURA LEE DOWNS	Reply to Joan Scott	444–451
CISSIE FAIRCHILD	Consumption in Early Modern Europe. <i>A Review Article</i>	850–858
HELEN FEIN	Revolutionary and Antirevolutionary Genocides: A Comparison of State Murders in Democratic Kampuchea, 1975 to 1979, and in Indonesia, 1965 to 1966	796–823
ANTONIA FINNANE	The Origins of Prejudice: The Malintegration of Subei in Late Imperial China	211–238
LILIANA R. GOLDIN and BRENDA ROSENBAUM	Culture and History: Subregional Variation Among the Maya	110–132
PETER GOSE	Segmentary State Formation and the Ritual Control of the Water Under the Incas	480–514
RICHARD GROVE	Conserving Eden: The (European) East India Companies and their Environmental Policies on St. Helena, Mauritius, and in Western India, 1660 to 1854	318–351
ROBERT H. JACKSON and GREGORY MADDOX	The Creation of Identity: Colonial Society in Bolivia and Tanzania	263–284
JENNY JOCHENS	Marching to a Different Drummer: New Trends in Medieval Icelandic Scholarship. <i>A Review Article</i>	197–207
DANIEL H. KAISER and PEYTON ENGEL	Time and Age Awareness in Early Modern Russia	824–839
ANATOLY M. KHAZANOV	Muhammad and Jenghiz Khan Compared: The Religious Factor in World Empire Building	461–479
CORINNE A. KRATZ	“We’ve Always Done It Like This . . . Except for a Few Details”: “Tradition” and “Innovation” in Okiek Ceremonies	30–65

MICHAEL C. LAMBERT	From Citizenship to <i>Négritude</i> : “Making a Difference” in Elite Ideologies of Colonized Francophone West Africa	239–262
DAVID LELYVELD	Colonial Knowledge and the Fate of Hindustani	665–682
DAVID LEMPERT	Changing Russian Political Culture in the 1990s: Parasites, Paradigms, and Perestroikas	628–646
VICTOR LIEBERMAN	Abu-Lughod’s Egalitarian World Order. <i>A Review Article</i>	544–550
ZACHARY LOCKMAN	Railway Workers and Relational History: Arabs and Jews in British-Ruled Palestine	601–627
FRED MATTHEWS	Nature/Nurture, Realism/Nominalism: Our Fundamental Conflict over Human Identity. <i>A Review Article</i>	647–662
BRUCE MAZLISH	A Triptych: Freud’s <i>The Interpretation of Dreams</i> , Rider Haggard’s <i>She</i> , and Bulwer Lytton’s <i>The Coming Race</i>	726–745
B. H. MOSS	Republican Socialism and the Making of the Working Class in Britain, France, and the United States: A Critique of Thompsonian Culturalism	390–413
MICHAEL G. PELETZ	Sacred Texts and Dangerous Words: The Politics of Law and Cultural Rationalization in Malaysia	66–109
SUMATHI RAMASWAMY	En/gendering Language: The Poetics of Tamil Identity	683–725
VINCENT J. ROSIVACH	Agricultural Slavery in the Northern Colonies and in Classical Athens: Some Comparisons	551–567
WILLIAM G. ROSENBERG	Understanding Peasant Russia. <i>A Review Article</i>	840–849
PAUL SANT CASSIA	Banditry, Myth, and Terror in Cyprus and Other Mediterranean Societies	773–795
JOAN W. SCOTT	The Tip of the Volcano	438–443
ANTHONY M. STEVENS-ARROYO	The Inter-Atlantic Paradigm: The Failure of Spanish Medieval Colonization of the Canary and Caribbean Islands	515–543
S. R. S. SZRETER	The Official Representation of Social Classes in Britain, the United States, and France: The Professional Model and “Les Cadres”	285–317
PETER VANDERGEEST	Constructing Thailand: Regulation, Everyday Resistance, and Citizenship	133–158
LUISE WHITE	Vampire Priests of Central Africa: African Debates about Labor and Religion in Colonial Northern Zambia	746–772

JAMES A. WINN	An Old Historian Looks at the New Historicism. <i>A Review Article</i>	859–870
DENNIS WRONG	The Present Condition of American Sociology. <i>A Review Article</i>	183–196
JONATHAN WYLIE	Too Much of a Good Thing: Crises of Glut in the Faroe Islands and Dominica	352–389

# Annales

Économies Sociétés Civilisations

Fondateurs : Lucien FEBVRE et Marc BLOCH. Directeur : Fernand BRAUDEL  
Revue bimestrielle publiée depuis 1929 avec le concours  
de l'École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales

48<sup>e</sup> ANNÉE — N<sup>o</sup> 3

MAI-JUIN 1993

## PRÉSENCE DU PASSÉ, LENTEUR DE L'HISTOIRE VICHY, L'OCCUPATION, LES JUIFS

Lucette VALENSI, Présence du passé, lenteur de l'histoire

### LA POLITIQUE ANTIJUIVE

Pierre VIDAL-NAQUET, Présentation d'un document : le journal de Me Lucien Vidal-Naquet

Lucien VIDAL-NAQUET, Journal, 15 septembre 1942-29 février 1944

Serge KLARSFELD, Juillet-septembre 1942. Les divergences dans l'appareil policier nazi et la réalisation de la Solution finale en France

Anne GRYNBERG, Les camps du sud de la France : de l'internement à la déportation

Henriette ASSEO, Contrepoint : la question tzigane dans les camps allemands

Maxime STEINBERG, Le paradoxe français dans la Solution finale à l'Ouest

Rita THALMANN, La traque des Juifs dans le contexte de la « mise au pas » de la France

Robert O. PAXTON, La spécificité de la persécution des Juifs en France en 1942

### L'OPINION ET LES VICTIMES

Daniel CORDIER, La Résistance française et les Juifs

Henri SZWARC, Souvenirs : l'étoile jaune

Bernard COMTE, Conscience catholique et persécution antisémite : l'engagement de théologiens lyonnais en 1941-1942

Pierre LABORIE, 1942 et le sort des Juifs : quel tournant dans l'opinion ?

Suzanne ACHACHE-WIZNITZER, Souvenirs : les fragments d'un puzzle

Lilianne KLEIN-LIEBER, Témoignage sur les opérations de sauvetage

Idith ZERTAL, Connaissance et culpabilité : les Juifs de Palestine face à l'extermination des Juifs en Europe

### CONSTRUCTION DE LA MÉMOIRE

Simone VEIL, Réflexions d'un témoin

Annette WIEVIORKA, 1992. Réflexions sur une commémoration

Mariana SAUBER, Traces fragiles. Les plaques commémoratives dans les rues de Paris

James E. YOUNG, Écrire le monument : site, mémoire, critique

Henry ROUSSO, Une justice impossible. L'épuration et la politique antijuive de Vichy

Marc FERRO, Ordre juridique et connaissance historique : dialogue avec Henry Rouso

Michaël R. MARRUS, Regard sur l'historiographie de l'Holocauste

Henry ROUSSO, Le souvenir de la seconde guerre mondiale et des persécutions antisémites. Contexte historique et repères chronologiques

RÉDACTION : 54, boulevard Raspail, 75006 PARIS

ABONNEMENTS 1993

- France : 377 F - Étudiants France : 283 F
- Étranger : 100 \$ - Pays de la CEE : 80 écus
- Le numéro : 94 F

Les abonnements doivent être souscrits auprès d'Armand COLIN Éditeur,



# NEW FROM CALIFORNIA

## Hysteria Beyond Freud

SANDER GILMAN,  
HELEN KING, ROY  
PORTER, GEORGE  
ROUSSEAU, and  
ELAINE SHOWALTER

"Encyclopedically  
learned, up-to-date,  
authoritative, and  
altogether the best  
introduction to the  
subject that exists."

—Thomas Laqueur,  
author of *Making Sex*

The authors draw on the  
new social and cultural  
history in this absorbing  
reevaluation of hysteria.

£25.00 cloth, illustrated

## War of Shadows

*The Struggle for Utopia  
in the Peruvian Amazon*

MICHAEL F. BROWN  
and EDUARDO  
FERNÁNDEZ

**New in paper**—"An  
excellent example of how  
historical scholarship and  
an awareness of contem-  
porary politics may be  
combined in a mutually  
reinforcing way."

—*Times Literary  
Supplement*

£10.95 paper, illustrated



## Private Lives and Public Affairs

*The Causes Célèbres of  
Prerevolutionary France*

SARAH MAZA

From 1770 to 1789 a  
succession of highly  
publicized cases riveted  
the attention of the  
French public. Maza  
convincingly argues that  
the reporting to the  
public of these private  
scandals had a decisive  
effect on the way in  
which ordinary French  
men and women came  
to understand public  
issues in the years before  
the Revolution. *Studies on  
the History of Society & Culture*,

£30.00 cloth, illustrated

Phone orders (+243) 829121



## Hooliganism

*Crime, Culture,  
and Power in St.  
Petersburg, 1900-1914*

JOAN NEUBERGER

Drawing on the work of  
Foucault, Certeau, and  
others, Neuberger  
establishes hooliganism  
as a crucial category for  
understanding the  
development of cultural  
identities and values in

Russia. *Studies on the History  
of Society & Culture*,  
£33.50 cloth, illustrated

## The Widening Gate

*Bristol and the Atlantic  
Economy, 1450-1700*

DAVID HARRIS  
SACKS

**New in paper**—" [A]  
handsomely produced  
masterwork. . . . [It is]  
nothing less than an  
account of the local  
history of capitalism  
across three centuries,  
poised in the complex  
cultural setting of  
English provincial life."

—*William and Mary  
Quarterly*

1992 John Ben Snow  
Foundation Prize,  
£14.95 paper, illustrated

UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA PRESS

# New from Cambridge

## **A Concise History of Portugal**

*David Birmingham*

As a new member of the EEC as well as an emerging tourist attraction, Portugal has in recent years experienced great social and economic change. This concise, illustrated history offers an introduction to its people, culture and evolving role as an imperial power in contemporary Europe.

43308-8 Hardcover \$44.95  
43880-2 Paper \$12.95

## **Epidemics and Ideas**

Essays on the Historical Perception of Pestilence

*Terence Ranger and Paul Slack, Editors*

The chapters in this book, by acknowledged experts in the history of their periods, look at the ways in which the great epidemic diseases of the past—from classical Athens to the present day—have shaped not only our views of medicine and disease, but the ways in which people have defined the “health” of society in general terms.

Contributors: *Paul Slack, James Longrigg, Peregrine Horden, Lawrence I. Conrad, Brian Pullan, John V. Pickstone, Richard J. Evans, A. W. Crosby, Rajnarayan Chandavarkar, Terence Ranger, Megan Vaughan, Virginia Berridge*

40276-X Hardcover \$54.95

## **Common Labour**

Workers and the Digging of North American Canals, 1780–1860

*Peter Way*

This study of canal construction workers between 1780–1860 challenges labor history’s focus on skilled craftsmen. As unskilled workers, canalers’ harsh lifestyles inevitably bred conflict that undercut worker unity but promoted battles with employers over workplace issues, and the state was increasingly drawn in to enforce industrial production.

44033-5 Hardcover \$54.95

*New paperbacks...*

## **The First America**

The Spanish Monarchy, Creole Patriots and the Liberal State, 1492–1866

*D. A. Brading*

*“... Brading presents a sweeping review of the ideas and ideologies motivating human conduct in Spanish America, mainly Mexico. Foremost among its many qualities, this brilliantly written book is that rarest of all products of serious scholarship, a good read...”*

—*Timothy E. Anna, Mexican Studies*

44796-8 Paper \$24.95

*Chosen as One of The New York Times Nine Best Books of the Year for 1992*

## **The Ant and the Peacock**

Altruism and Sexual Selection from Darwin to Today

*Helena Cronin*

*Foreword by John Maynard Smith*

*“This is a book about the evolution of beauty, goodness and intelligence, three things that especially puzzled Charles Darwin. It is part history, part science-reporting, part philosophy, and though it is footnoted like an academic book it reads much too well to be left to the professionals...”*

—*The Economist*

45765-3 Paper \$19.95

## **Health, Race and German Politics between National Unification and Nazism, 1870–1945**

*Paul Weindling*

*“... Weindling’s book is a major contribution to an important subject. It brings a mass of fascinating and illuminating detail to bear on the medical origins of Nazi exterminism.”*

—*The Times Higher Education Supplement*

*“an impressively researched contribution to an important subject.”* —*Social History*

42397-X Paper \$29.95

Available in bookstores or from

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

40 West 20th St., N.Y., NY 10011-4211

Call toll-free 800-872-7423

MasterCard/VISA accepted.

Prices subject to change.

*Comparative Studies in Society and History* is a forum for presentation and discussion of new research into problems of change and stability that recur in human societies through time or in the contemporary world. It sets up a working alliance between specialists in all branches of the social sciences and humanities. Debate and review articles bring the general reader in touch with current findings and issues.

## NOTES FOR CONTRIBUTORS

Contributions may be descriptive, analytical, or theoretical. Any article not in itself comparative may be accepted if it lends itself to comment that will place it in comparative perspective. Correspondence with the editors prior to the submission of articles will help to enable them to obtain such comment or a companion study. Emphasis in comparative studies may be either on similarities or, if these are significant enough and call for some recasting of generalizations, on differences. All contributions and editorial correspondence should be sent to the Editors, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 102 Rackham Building, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1070.

Two copies of each contribution, preferably accompanied by a stamped, addressed envelope, should be submitted. Both text and footnotes should be clearly typed with double spacing and wide margins; footnotes should appear on separate pages at the end of the article. Illustrations may be included by arrangement with the editors.

---

**Copyright © 1993 Society for the Comparative Study of Society and History.** All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. *Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.:* The Item-Fee Code for this publication (0010-4175/93 \$5.00 + .00) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) Transaction Reporting Service, provided that the appropriate remittance of \$5.00 per article is paid directly to: CCC, 27 Congress Street, Salem, MA 01970. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying. Contact the *ISI Tearsheet Service*, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, for single copies of separate articles.

---

**COMPARATIVE STUDIES  
IN SOCIETY AND HISTORY**

<i>Editorial Foreword</i>	663–664
<i>The Identity of Language</i>	
DAVID LELYVELD Colonial Knowledge and the Fate of Hindustani	665–682
SUMATHI RAMASWAMY En/gendering Language: The Poetics of Tamil Identity	683–725
<i>Modern Uses of Myth</i>	
BRUCE MAZLISH A Triptych: Freud's <i>The Interpretation of Dreams</i> , Rider Haggard's <i>She</i> , and Bulwer-Lytton's <i>The Coming Race</i>	726–745
LUISE WHITE Vampire Priests of Central Africa: African Debates about Labor and Religion in Colonial Northern Zambia	746–772
<i>Violence and the State</i>	
PAUL SANT CASSIA Banditry, Myth, and Terror in Cyprus and Other Mediterranean Societies	773–795
HELEN FEIN Revolutionary and Antirevolutionary Genocides: A Comparison of State Murders in Democratic Kampuchea, 1975 to 1979, and in Indonesia, 1965 to 1966	796–823
<i>CSSH Discussion</i>	
DANIEL H. KAISER and PEYTON ENGEL Time- and Age- Awareness in Early Modern Russia	824–839
WILLIAM G. ROSENBERG Understanding Peasant Russia. <i>A Review Article</i>	840–849
CISSIE FAIRCHILDS Consumption in Early Modern Europe. <i>A Review Article</i>	850–858
JAMES A. WINN An Old Historian Looks at the New Historicism. <i>A Review Article</i>	859–870
CSSH Notes	871–878
<i>Index, Volumes 31–35</i>	879–932

---

Cambridge University Press  
The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU  
40 West 20th Street, New York, NY 10011  
10 Stamford Road, Oakleigh, Melbourne 3166, Australia

© 1993 Society for the Comparative Study of Society and History