

SUMMER 1994

Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

ARTICLES

Zoltan D. Barany : *The East European Roma*

Charles King : *Moldovan Identity*

Andrew Rossos : *Macedonian National Identity*

Carol S. Lilly : *Agitprop in Post-war Yugoslavia*

Yuri Slezkine : *The USSR and Ethnic Particularism*

Maria Todorova : *The Balkans: From Discovery to Invention*

Mary E. McIntosh, Martha Abele Mac Iver, Daniel G. Abele,

Dina Smeltz : *Market Democracy in Central and
East Europe*

COMMENT

David R. Marples : *Investigation of a Stalinist Historical Controversy*

RESPONSE

Richard Pipes and George G. Weickhardt: *Was There Private
Property in Muscovite Russia?*

EDITOR

ELLIOTT MOSSMAN

ASSOCIATE EDITOR, JEAN GURLEY

BOOKS EDITORS

BEN EKLOF, INDIANA UNIVERSITY

CATHERINE ALBRECHT, UNIVERSITY OF BALTIMORE

FILM EDITOR, SVETLANA BOYM, HARVARD UNIVERSITY

ASSISTANT EDITORS, BRONWYN GURLEY and RICHARD FROST

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS

VITALY CHERNETSKY

BARBARA KENDA

GORDANA KOSTIĆ

LESLEY RIMMEL

IVANA VULETIC

EDITORIAL BOARD

History

Laura Engelstein, *Princeton University* • Boris Mironov, *Institute of Russian History, St. Petersburg* • Norman Naimark, *Stanford University* • Nancy Shields Kollmann, *Stanford University* • Ronald G. Suny, *University of Michigan* • Roman Szporluk, *Harvard University* • Gale Stokes, *Rice University* • Richard S. Wortman, *Columbia University*

Literature & Linguistics

Caryl Emerson, *Princeton University* • Vyacheslav Ivanov, *Moscow University & UCLA* • Gary Saul Morson, *Northwestern University* • Stephanie Sandler, *Amherst College*

Social Sciences

Mark R. Beissinger, *University of Wisconsin* • Ellen T. Comisso, *University of California, San Diego* • Mary McAuley, *Oxford University* • Blair A. Ruble, *Kennan Institute for Advanced Russian Studies* • Brian D. Silver, *Michigan State University* • Katherine M. Verdery, *Johns Hopkins University*

The editors assume no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion made by contributors.

Slavic Review (formerly *The American Slavic and East European Review*) is published quarterly by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc., and is sent to all Association members. Members also receive the *AAASS Newsletter*. Membership is open to individuals interested in Slavic studies and study of the non-Slavic peoples of eastern Europe and Eurasia. Applications for membership are accepted by the AAASS, Jordan Quad/Acacia, 125 Panama Street, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4130; (415) 723-9668.

Membership dues: salary \$10,000–19,999—\$25.00; \$20,000–29,999—\$35.00; \$30,000—39,999—\$45.00; \$40,000–49,999—\$55.00; \$50,000—59,999—\$65.00; more than \$60,000—\$75.00. Joint members with one subscription to *Slavic Review*, add \$15.00 to dues of higher paid member. Dues for students or those with salaries under \$10,000 are \$20.00. Subscriptions without membership are \$50.00. Single current issues and back issues to subscribers are \$15.00; for members, \$10.00 each. For overseas postage, please add \$6.00; for Canada, add \$5.00. Correspondence regarding membership, subscriptions, changes of address or items for the *Newsletter* should be sent to the AAASS headquarters at Stanford.

Articles, books for review, and correspondence concerning editorial matters or advertising should be sent to *Slavic Review*, 636 Williams Hall, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA 19104-6305. Building address is 36th & Spruce Streets. Telephone: 215-898-8096; FAX: 215-898-2998; E-mail: slavrev@sas.upenn.edu. Technical requirements for manuscript submissions may be found at the end of the advertising section.

Published by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc. Text set in Baskerville by Automated Composition Service, Inc., Lancaster, PA. Printed by Science Press, Ephrata, PA. Second-class postage paid at Palo Alto, CA and additional mailing office. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *Slavic Review*, c/o AAASS, Jordan Quad/Acacia, 125 Panama Street, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305-4130.

Copyright © 1994 *Slavic Review*: ISSN 0037-6779 by the American Association for the Advancement of Slavic Studies, Inc.

Slavic Review

AMERICAN QUARTERLY OF RUSSIAN, EURASIAN AND
EAST EUROPEAN STUDIES

VOLUME 53 NUMBER 2 • SUMMER 1994

CONTRIBUTORS	viii
FROM THE EDITOR	x
ARTICLES	
Living on the Edge: The East European Roma in Postcommunist Politics and Societies ZOLTAN D. BARANY	321
Moldovan Identity and the Politics of Pan-Romanianism CHARLES KING	345
The British Foreign Office and Macedonian National Identity, 1918–1941 ANDREW ROSSOS	369
Problems of Persuasion: Communist Agitation and Propaganda in Post-war Yugoslavia, 1944–1948 CAROL S. LILLY	395
The USSR as a Communal Apartment, or How a Socialist State Promoted Ethnic Particularism YURI SLEZKINE	414
The Balkans: From Discovery to Invention MARIA TODOROVA	453
Publics Meet Market Democracy in Central and East Europe, 1991–1993 MARY E. McINTOSH, MARTHA ABELE MAC IVER, DANIEL G. ABELE, DINA SMELTZ	483

COMMENT

- Kuropaty: The Investigation of a Stalinist Historical Controversy 513
DAVID R. MARPLES

RESPONSE

- Was There Private Property in Muscovite Russia? 524
RICHARD PIPES responds
GEORGE G. WEICKHARDT replies 531

REVIEW ARTICLE

- The End of Communism? 539
ALFRED G. MEYER

FILM REVIEWS

- Save Us and Keep Us (Spasi i sokhrani)* (Inna Broude) 547
Close to Eden (Urga) (Anna A. Tavis) 549

FEATURED REVIEWS

- Odnodnevnye gazety SSSR 1917–1983* (Jeffrey Brooks) 551
Vahan D. Barooshian, *V.V. Vereshchagin: Artist at War*
(Elizabeth Kridl Valkenier) 552
Michael Glenny and Richard Taylor, eds., Michael Glenny,
trans., *S.M. Eisenstein: Selected Writings*, vol. 2 *Towards a
Theory of Montage*; David Bordwell, *The Cinema of Eisenstein*
(Mikhail Yampolsky) 553
David Shepherd, *Beyond Metafiction: Self-Consciousness in Soviet
Literature* (Irina Gutkin) 556
Thomas Lahusen and Gene Kuperman, eds., *Late Soviet
Culture: From Perestroika to Novostroika* (Edith W. Clowes) 557
Loren R. Graham, *The Ghost of the Executed Engineer: Technology
and the Fall of the Soviet Union* (Timothy E. O'Connor) 559
Holland Hunter and Janusz M. Szyrmer, *Faulty Foundations:
Soviet Economic Policies, 1928–1940* (Joseph S. Berliner) 560
Anthony B. Atkinson, ed., *Alternatives to Capitalism: The
Economics of Partnership* (Alec Nove) 561

BOOK REVIEWS

- Robert Louis Jackson, ed., *Reading Chekhov's Text* (George Pahomov) 563
- Ronald E. Peterson, *A History of Russian Symbolism* (Joachim T. Baer) 565
- David M. Bethea, ed., *Puškin Today* (Barbara Heldt) 566
- Gavriel Shapiro, *Nikolai Gogol and the Baroque Cultural Heritage* (Stephen C. Hutchings) 567
- Susanne Fusso, *Dead Souls: An Anatomy of Disorder in Gogol* (Sven Spieker) 569
- Donna T. Orwin, *Tolstoy's Art and Thought, 1847–1880* (Rimvydas Silbajoris) 570
- David Rampton, *Vladimir Nabokov* (Priscilla Meyer) 571
- Linda H. Scatton, *Mikhail Zoshchenko: Evolution of a Writer* (Rachel May) 573
- Peter Henry, Jim MacDonald and Halina Moss, eds., *Scotland and the Slavs: Selected Papers from the Glasgow-90 East-West Forum* (Dale E. Peterson) 574
- Denise J. Youngblood, *Movies for the Masses: Popular Cinema and Soviet Society in the 1920s* (Jeffrey Brooks) 575
- Oleg Prokofiev, trans. and ed., *Sergei Prokofiev: Soviet Diary 1927 and Other Writings* (David Montgomery) 576
- Susan Compton, *Russian Avant-Garde Books, 1917–34* (John E. Bowlt) 577
- William C. Brumfield, *A History of Russian Architecture* (Janet Kennedy) 578
- Lázló Honti, Sirkka-Liisa Hahmo, Tette Hofstra, Jolanta Jastrzębska and Osmo Nikkilä, eds., *Finnisch-Ugrische Sprachen zwischen dem germanischen und dem slavishchen Sprachraum* (Daniel Abondolo) 579
- Arnold McMillin, ed., *Under Eastern Eyes: The West as Reflected in Recent Russian Émigré Writing*; John Glad, ed., *Conversations in Exile: Russian Writers Abroad*, Richard and Joanna Robin, trans.; Sergei Chakovsky and M. Thomas Inge, eds., *Russian Eyes on American Literature* (Olga Peters Hasty) 581
- Paul Mojzes, *Religious Liberty in Eastern Europe and the USSR: Before and after the Great Transformation* (Jane Ellis) 584
- Carlo Ginzburg, *Ecstasies: Deciphering the Witches' Sabbath*, trans. Raymond Rosenthal (Dianne E. Farrell) 585

- Yaroslav N. Shchapov, *State and Church in Early Russia, 10th–13th Centuries*, trans. Vic Schneierson (David M. Goldfrank) 586
- Walter Leitsch, *Berichte über den Moskauer Staat in italienischer Sprache aus dem 16. Jahrhundert* (Marshall Poe) 587
- Evgenii V. Anisimov, *The Reforms of Peter the Great: Progress through Coercion in Russia*, trans. John T. Alexander (Nicholas V. Riasanovsky) 588
- Joseph de Maistre, *St. Petersburg Dialogues: Or Conversations on the Temporal Government of Providence*, trans. and ed. Richard A. Le Brun (Raymond McNally) 589
- A.K. Afanas'ev, N.B. Bystrova, N.L. Zubova, F.A. Petrov, M.V. Falaleeva and A.D. Ianovskii, eds., *1812–1814: Sekretnaia perepiska generala P.I. Bagrationa, Lichnye pis'ma generala N.N. Raevskogo, Zapiski generala M.S. Vorontsova, Dnevnik ofitserov russkoi armii* (E. Willis Brooks) 590
- G.M. Hamburg, *Boris Chicherin and Early Russian Liberalism, 1828–1866* (Priscilla Roosevelt) 591
- Bruce W. Menning, *Bayonets before Bullets: The Imperial Russian Army, 1861–1914* (W. Bruce Lincoln) 592
- John C.K. Daly, *Russian Seapower and "The Eastern Question," 1827–41* (Christopher C. Lovett) 594
- Olga S. Tian-Shanskaia, *Village Life in Late Tsarist Russia*, ed. David L. Ransel, trans. David L. Ransel and Michael Levine (Stephen P. Frank) 595
- M.G. Vandalkovskaia, *P.N. Miliukov, A.A. Kizevetter: Istoriia i politika* (G.M. Hamburg) 596
- Michael Kettle, *Churchill and the Archangel Fiasco, November 1918–July 1919* (Christine A. White) 598
- Charles J. Weeks, Jr., *An American Naval Diplomat in Revolutionary Russia: Vice Admiral Newton A. McCully* (George Nekrasov) 599
- Svend Aage Christensen, Carsten Pape, Lars Poulsen-Hansen and Niels E. Rosenfeldt, *Imperiets sammenbrud, 1982–1992* (Helene C. Isotalo and Birgitta Ingemanson) 600
- Robert Weinberg, *The Revolution of 1905 in Odessa: Blood on the Steps* (Henry Reichman) 601
- George Nekrasov, *North of Gallipoli: The Black Sea Fleet at War, 1914–1917* (Charles J. Weeks) 603
- Vadim Rogovin, *Byla li al'ternativa? "Trotskizm": Vzgliad cherez gody* (Philip Pomper) 604

- William G. Rosenberg and Lewis H. Siegelbaum, eds., *Social Dimensions of Soviet Industrialization* (William B. Husband) 605
- Arkadii A. German, *Nemetskaia avtonomiia na Volge, 1918–1941, Pt. 1, Avtonomnaia oblast' 1918–1924* (Donald J. Raleigh) 606
- V.E. Tarrant, *Stalingrad: Anatomy of an Agony* (Louis C. Rotundo) 607
- Klaus Reinhardt, *Moscow—The Turning Point: The Failure of Hitler's Strategy in the Winter of 1941–42*, trans. Karl B. Keenan (Earl F. Ziemke) 608
- John Löwenhardt, James R. Ozinga and Erik van Ree, *The Rise and Fall of the Soviet Politburo* (Myron Rush) 609
- R. Craig Nation, *Black Earth, Red Star: A History of Soviet Security Policy, 1917–1991* (Mark N. Katz) 610
- Ben Eklof and Edward Dneprov, eds., *Democracy in the Russian School: The Reform Movement in Education since 1984* (David L. Williams) 611
- W.H. Zawadzki, *A Man of Honour: Adam Czartoryski as a Statesman of Russia and Poland, 1795–1831* (Anna M. Cienciala) 612
- A. James McAdams, *Germany Divided: From the Wall to Reunification*; Elizabeth Pond, *Beyond the Wall: Germany's Road to Unification* (Melvin Croan) 613
- Mikael Sandberg, ed., *Baltic Sea Region Environmental Protection: "Eastern" Perspectives and International Cooperation* (David R. Marples) 614
- Richard F. Staar, ed., *Transition to Democracy in Poland* (Janine P. Holc) 616
- Walter D. Connor and Piotr Płoszajski, eds., *The Polish Road from Socialism: The Economics, Sociology, and Politics of Transition* (Raymond Taras) 617
- Alois Jirásek, *Old Czech Legends*, trans. Marie K. Holeček (Marvin Kantor) 618
- Kurt W. Treptow, *From Zalmoxis to Jan Palach: Studies in East European History* (Sarah A. Kent) 620
- Ewald Osers, ed. and trans., *Contemporary Macedonian Poetry* (Vasa D. Mihailovich) 621
- Erich Rathfelder, ed., *Krieg auf dem Balkan: Die europäische Verantwortung* (Nicholas I. Novosel) 622
- Dennis P. Hupchick, *The Bulgarians in the Seventeenth Century: Slavic Orthodox Society and Culture under Ottoman Rule* (John D. Bell) 624

Osamu Ieda, ed., <i>New Order in Post-Communist Eurasia</i> (Neil B. Weissman)	625
Darra Goldstein, <i>The Georgian Feast: The Vibrant Culture and Savory Food of the Republic of Georgia</i> (Cathy A. Frierson)	626
Michael J. Oleska, <i>Orthodox Alaska: A Theology of Mission</i> (George Makowski)	627
Eugene Huskey, ed., <i>Executive Power and Soviet Politics: The Rise and Decline of the Soviet State</i> (Gregory Gleason)	628
Coit D. Blacker, <i>Hostage to Revolution: Gorbachev and Soviet Security Policy, 1985–1991</i> (William E. Odom)	629
Arthur H. Miller, William M. Reisinger and Vicki L. Hesli, eds., <i>Public Opinion and Regime Change: The New Politics of Post-Soviet Societies</i> (Vera Tolz)	630
Ian Bremmer and Ray Taras, eds., <i>Nations and Politics in the Soviet Successor States</i> (Yitzhak M. Brudny)	632
Michael McFaul, <i>Post-Communist Politics: Democratic Prospects in Russia and Eastern Europe</i> (Ronald J. Hill)	633
Michael McFaul and Sergei Markov, <i>The Troubled Birth of Russian Democracy: Parties, Personalities, and Programs</i> (Vera Tolz)	634
Marilyn Vogt-Downey, ed., <i>The USSR 1987–1991: Marxist Perspectives</i> (Mary Buckley)	635
Brad Roberts and Nina Belyaeva, eds., <i>After Perestroika: Democracy in the Soviet Union</i> (Donald D. Barry)	636
Donald D. Barry, ed., <i>Toward the “Rule of Law” in Russia? Political and Legal Reform in the Transition Period</i> (Zigurds L. Zile)	636
F.J.M. Feldbrugge, <i>Russian Law: The End of the Soviet System and the Role of Law</i> (Ethan S. Burger)	637
Walter Adams and James W. Brock, <i>Adam Smith Goes to Moscow: A Dialogue on Radical Reform</i> (Judith R. McKinney)	638
Henryk J. Flakierski, <i>Income Inequalities in the Former Soviet Union and Its Republics</i> (Alastair McAuley)	639
Georges Nivat, <i>Impressions de Russie, l’an un: Crimée, Oural, Haute-Volga</i> (Mark Kramer)	640
L.V. Keldysh et al., eds., <i>Andrei Sakharov: Facets of a Life</i> (Paul R. Josephson)	642
Semen S. Vilenskii, ed., <i>Soprotivlenie v Gulage: Vospominaniia, Pis'ma, Dokumenty</i> (David Nordlander)	644

Lois Fisher, <i>Survival in Russia: Chaos and Hope in Everyday Life</i> (Walter L. Hixson)	645
Andreas Fürst, Volker Heise and Steven E. Miller, eds., <i>Europe and Naval Arms Control in the Gorbachev Era</i> (James J. Tritten)	645
Milan Vego, <i>Soviet Naval Tactics</i> (Norman Polmar)	646
Bradley R. Gitz, <i>Armed Forces and Political Power in Eastern Europe: The Soviet/Communist Control System</i> (Christopher Jones)	647
William C. Green and W. Robert Reeves, eds. and trans., <i>The Soviet Military Encyclopedia, Abridged English Language Edition</i> (Michael Parrish)	649
Kenneth M. Currie, <i>Soviet Military Politics: Contemporary Issues</i> (Jacob W. Kipp)	650
LETTERS	652