

VOLUME 19

NUMBER 1

JANUARY 2010

CQ

*Cambridge*

*Quarterly of*

*Healthcare*

*Ethics*

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to  
Engaging a World Community  
of Bioethicists*

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



**Cambridge**  
**Quarterly of**  
**Healthcare**  
**Ethics**

**A Quarterly**  
**Journal Devoted**  
**to Engaging a**  
**World Community**  
**of Bioethicists**

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*  
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*  
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,  
<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantou/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*  
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*  
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*  
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*  
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*  
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*  
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*  
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*  
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*  
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*  
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*  
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*  
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*  
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*  
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*  
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*  
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*  
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*  
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*  
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*  
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*  
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*  
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*  
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*  
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to [TKushner@aol.com](mailto:TKushner@aol.com). Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, *Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308*.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 19 (2010) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$312/£182; online only: \$260/£155; print only: \$298/£173. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$82/£48. Students and retirees: \$82/£41. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$70/£35. Student and retiree: \$82/£60. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Copyright © 2010 Cambridge University Press. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Permission inquiries from the USA, Mexico, and Canada should be addressed to the New York office of Cambridge University Press <http://www.cambridge.org/us/information/rights/contacts/newyork.htm>; permission inquiries from elsewhere should be addressed to the Cambridge office <http://www.cambridge.org/uk/information/rights/contacts/cambridge.htm>; permission inquiries from Australia and New Zealand should be addressed to the Melbourne office [http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts\\_melbourne.htm](http://www.cambridge.org/aus/information/contacts_melbourne.htm).

*Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com). Specific written permission must be obtained for republication; contact the nearest Cambridge University Press office.

ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

# Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 19, Number 1, January 2010

## CONTENTS

Contributors	1
<i>Special Section: Open Forum</i>	
From the Editors: Dos and Don'ts	4
Death Is Just Not What It Used to Be JAMES N. KIRKPATRICK, KARA D. BEASLEY, AND ARTHUR CAPLAN	7
Not Dead Yet: Controlled Non-Heart-Beating Organ Donation, Consent, and the Dead Donor Rule DALE GARDINER AND ROBERT SPARROW	17
Just Caring: In Defense of Limited Age-Based Healthcare Rationing LEONARD M. FLECK	27
Conscience-Based Exemptions for Medical Students MARK R. WICCLAIR	38
Actualizable Potential, Reproduction, and Embryo Research: Bringing Embryos into Existence for Different Purposes or Not at All INGMAR PERSSON AND JULIAN SAVULESCU	51
Consequentialism without Consequences: Ethics and Embryo Research SARAH CHAN AND JOHN HARRIS	61
The Ethics of Aggressive Discharge Planning ALISTER BROWNE	75
Choosing Deafness with Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis: An Ethical Way to Carry on a Cultural Bloodline? SILVIA CAMPORESI	86
The Legal Development of the Informed Consent Doctrine: Past and Present JANET L. DOLGIN	97
When Is My Genetic Information Your Business? Biological, Emotional, and Financial Claims to Knowledge RUTH WILKINSON	110

Contents continued

*Contents continued*

***Departments and Columns***

*Dissecting Bioethics*

TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY

Dignity: One, Two, Three, Four, Five, Still Counting  
DORIS SCHROEDER 118

*The Great Debates*

Human Rights and Genetic Technologies  
D. MICAH HESTER AND ALISSA SWOTA 126

Bioethics and Human Rights: Curb Your Enthusiasm  
ELIZABETH FENTON AND JOHN D. ARRAS 127

Human Rights and American Bioethics: Resistance Is Futile  
GEORGE J. ANNAS 133

Wrong Again—Rejoinder to Annas  
ELIZABETH FENTON AND JOHN D. ARRAS 141

*CQ Review*

GREG LOEBEN

*Global Bioethics*, edited by H. Tristram Engelhardt Jr.  
REVIEWED BY GRIFFIN TROTTER 151

*Abstracts of Note: The Bioethics Literature*

BARRY MORENZ 154