

A MOVEABLE FEAST

Wine Storage Places as Drinkable Calendars in Horace

It is a truth universally acknowledged that Horace wrote his poems in order to provide posterity with quotations for any circumstance. A particularly well-known example of quoting Horace is the story of Patrick Leigh Fermor and the German general who bonded over Horace during the Second World War.¹ In 1944, Fermor abducted the German commander of Crete, General Karl Heinrich Kreipe. As they climb up Mount Ida, General Kreipe looks at the mountain and quotes the beginning of Horace, *Odes* 1.9: *Vides ut alta stet niue candidum Soracte* ('do you see how Mount Soracte stands there glistening with deep snow?'). Fermor overhears the quotation and responds by quoting the rest of the poem. According to Fermor, he and his prisoner looked at each other 'as though, for a long moment, the war had ceased to exist'.² As Kreipe and Fermor quote Horace's *carpe diem* poem and form a strange bond between enemies in the middle of the Second World War, they resemble Diomedes and Glaucus, who meet on the battlefield before Troy and discuss how *leaves that are green turn to brown*.

If we wish to understand the appeal of the *carpe diem* motif, which created an Iliadic encounter in the Second World War, the two most common interpretations of the motif will not do: neither if we regard this motif as a banal call to drinks nor if we regard it as Epicurean will we understand *carpe diem*. In Chapter 1 as well as in the Introduction I showed in detail why the *carpe diem* motif is not Epicurean, and it is unnecessary to repeat the arguments here.³ Rather, it seems profitable to focus on the ways through which

¹ In turn much quoted in Horatian scholarship: Ziolkowski (2005) 183–4, Holzberg (2009) 11–12, Edmunds (2010) 343–4, Mayer (2012) 113.

² Fermor (2002) [1977] 73–4.

³ See pages 20–1 and 63–71. Nonetheless, Epicurean interpretations of Horace's *carpe diem* abound; see, for example, Conte (1994) [1987] 307–8, Lefèvre (1993a) 207–9, Moles (2007) 168.

Horace's *carpe diem* creates effects of presence. Fermor claims that, after the quotation of the poem, 'for a long moment, the war had ceased to exist'. *Carpe diem* thematises precisely such present moments in time. In the Soracte ode, Horace thus tells his addressee to focus on the banquet in the present and to leave everything else to the gods, who will at some point calm the storm that rages outside (*C.* 1.9.9–12). So, too, for Fermor and the German general the intense present moment that the poem evokes makes them forget the storm of war that rages through the world. If, then, the poem is about a moment in time, it is equally important that such a moment is repeatable: Mount Ida can stand in for Mount Soracte. Memory makes moments repeatable. Thus, Fermor notes that he and the general 'had both drunk at the same fountains long before'.⁴ For Horace, however, it is a different drink that triggers the recollection of the past: not water from clear fountains, but wine.

Time and *carpe diem* have been recognised as crucial themes of Horace's poetry.⁵ In this and the next chapter I will analyse the concept of time we find in Horace's *carpe diem* poems. I will argue that we can find the essence of his *carpe diem* in wine and words. This in itself may be hardly surprising, but I hope to show how Horace's treatment of wine and words allows him to write *carpe diem* poems which could have never been created in early Greece. I argue that it is precisely through his choice of wine and words that Horace thematises presence, present time, enjoyment, performance, and reperfor-
 mance in his *carpe diem* poems. Thus, in the Soracte ode, Horace addresses a certain Thaliarchus and asks him to 'serve the four-year-old wine more generously than usual from its Sabine jar' (*C.* 1.9.6–8):

⁴ Compare and contrast the different reaction of Byron's Childe Harold with Edmunds (1992) 71–4; when the Childe reaches Mount Soracte, he regrets that his classical education had only prepared him 'to understand, not love' Horace's lyric.

⁵ I note here only studies solely dedicated to these themes. Time: Gagliardi (1975–6), Deschamps (1983), Ancona (1994), Schwindt (2004b; also 2005b: 15–18), Broccia (2007), Evans (2016), Vogt-Spira (2017), Citti at *EO* ii.645–53 s.v. 'tempo' (also Citti (2000) 54–64). *Carpe diem*: Bardon (1944), D'Anna (1979), Pöschl (1992). Bardon diagnoses Horace with a melancholic soul; D'Anna describes the motif as Epicurean; Pöschl analyses Horace's 'Lebenskunst' biographically. Neither of these approaches convinced me. For a short but learned account on death, time, and *carpe diem* in Horace, Traina (1975–98) [1985] v.134–43 repays reading. Davis (1991) 145–88 offers a rich analysis of the rhetorical scope of Horatian *carpe diem*.

benignius | deprome quadrimum Sabina, | o Thaliarche, merum diota.
 This is the exhortation to *carpe diem* in the poem. Horace evokes the present moment through his usage of wine and words; a wine from four years back points to the ever-changing nature of the year, and its presence at the symposium spreads enjoyment. The Greek word Horace uses to describe the jar, *diota*, is an informal word, which underlines the intimate setting and Horace's concern for the immediate present.⁶

This chapter analyses wine in Horace – hardly, of course, an overlooked topic.⁷ Yet the connection between wine and time has received less attention, though Ernst Schmidt and Courtney Evans made valuable contributions to this aspect of wine.⁸ In this chapter, I will analyse wine as a key element in Horace's *carpe diem* poems. The chapter falls into four sections. In the first section, I will show how Horace's old wines can paradoxically create effects of presence and contribute to enjoyable moments in the present time. In the second section, I turn to reperformance and show how old wines repeat occasions of the past. The third section argues that wine storage places function as a drinkable consular calendar in Horace. The fourth section shows how wine can preserve the taste of old words. I will pay close attention to Roman wine labels, painted inscriptions on amphorae, so that this chapter does not fully leave the epigraphic territory of the preceding one.

2.1 Wine O'Clock: The Present Moment in Horace, *Epodes* 13

Before Horace made *carpe diem* poems one of the leitmotifs of the *Odes*, he already wrote a poem of this kind in the *Epodes* (for *carpe diem* in the *Sermones*, see Section 2 of Chapter 5).⁹ In *Epodes* 13, a raging storm prompts the poet to reflections on

⁶ The argument of Gitner (2012) 112–15. As I serve the four-year-old Sabine wine of *Odes* 1.9 here only as an aperitif in the introduction, I will not point to the enormous bibliography on this poem.

⁷ See Pierson (1860), Kießling (1867) 5–8, Gemoll (1892) 97–104, Apperson (1905), McKinlay (1946; 1947), Commager (1957), A. Richter (1970), Frieman (1972), Griffin (1985) 65–87, Murray (1985), Davis (1991: 145–88; 2007), La Penna (1995), Broccia (2006), Mundt (2018) 99–115, Fedeli at *EO* ii.262–9 s.v. 'vino'. For wine as a poetological image in Greek poetry, see Nünlist (1998) 199–205.

⁸ Schmidt (2002) [1980] 248–65, Evans (2016) 127–245. ⁹ See Davis (1991) 146–50.

mortality and to drinking while it is still possible (I quote the first eight lines).

Horrida tempestas caelum contraxit et imbres
 niuesque deducunt Iouem; nunc mare, nunc siluae
 Threicio Aquilone sonant. rapiamus, amici,¹⁰
 occasionem de die, dumque uirent genua
 et decet, obducta soluatur fronte senectus. (5)
 tu uina Torquato moue consule pressa meo.
 cetera mitte loqui: deus haec fortasse benigna
 reducet in sedem uice.

A chilling storm has given the sky a gloomy appearance, and the god of the sky is overcast by rain and snow. Now the sea, now the forests resound with the Thracian North Wind. Friends, let's snatch the opportunity from the day! And while our legs are vigorous and it's proper, let the old wrinkles relax on the overcast face. You, get wine that was pressed in my birthyear when Torquatus was consul. Don't talk of anything else; perhaps a god will bring a welcome change and let this turbulence settle.

August Meineke said that the whole poem exhales the spirit of a Greek model. The wine with the consular date, however, reeks of pure Romanness:¹¹ the dating of vintages according to consular dates is a decidedly Roman custom, which this chapter will discuss in some detail. In Rome, the names of consuls were visible on amphorae as part of some sort of wine label. These are often referred to as *tituli picti* in scholarship, while ancient sources call them *pittacia* (Petron. 5.34), *notae* (Hor. *C.* 2.3.8), or *tituli* (Juv. 5.34). There is ample evidence for wine labels and the practice of naming vintage wines after consuls in both literary and epigraphic sources.¹² But while the careful blending of Greek symposia with Roman *conuiuia* is characteristic for Horace's

¹⁰ Shackleton Bailey (2001) prints the conjecture *Amici* (vocative singular of the proper name Amicius) of Housman (1972) [1923] iii.1087, which attempts to resolve the supposedly undesirable switch from plural to singular addressees. This conjecture is also recommended by Brink (1982b) 41–2. Other conjectures have been suggested. Yet, commands to one person (even after plural verbs) make good sense in the context of the banquet: Cavarzere (1992) 202 points to Alc. *fr.* 346.

¹¹ L. C. Watson (2003) 423 notes that the wine defies the statement of Meineke (1854) xxii: *totum carmen Graecum exemplar spirat*. Still, for some notably Greek features of the poem, in particular allusions to Alc. *fr.* 338, see Cavarzere (1992) 200 with further sources.

¹² See Pl. *Poen.* 834–8, Cat. 68.28, Cic. *Brut.* 287–8, Hor. *C.* 3.8.12, 3.21.1, 3.28.8, *Epod.* 13.6, S. 1.10.24, *Epist.* 1.5.4, Tib. 2.1.27, Vell. 2.7.5, Luc. 4.379, Petron. 34.6, Plin. *Nat.*

Greek-style Latin lyric,¹³ the question arises as to why Horace mentions this particular wine, or, in other words: what is the significance of a wine that is as old as he is? Scholars have rightly argued that the age of the wine matters, but while some of their interpretations advance our understanding of the wine, other interpretations are rather elaborate.¹⁴ In contrast, my interpretation is extremely simple: the wine is chosen because it is delicious, that is to say, it is the right moment to drink a wine of this age. This seems the most natural reason for choosing a particular vintage. Thus, we can infer from Cicero that a Falernian wine from the preceding year might be too young, and one from the consulship of Opimius or Anicius might be so old that it has lost its sweetness or is not even drinkable anymore (*Brut.* 287). When Horace specifies the vintage, he asks for a vintage between these extremes of first youth or excessive maturation, a wine that is at its prime for drinking.¹⁵

If we accept that the wine is chosen because it is at the right age for being drunk, this neatly underlines the *carpe diem* motif of the

14.55, Mart. 1.26.7, 1.105, 2.40.5, 3.26.3, 3.82.24, 9.87.1, 10.49.2, 13.113.1, Juv. 5.30–1, and Galen *Ant.* 2.15 = xiv.25–6 Kühn. For epigraphic evidence, Rigato and Mongardi (2016) offer a catalogue of Roman wine labels. Also see the labels at *CIL* iv 2551–880 (and in particular 2551–61 for consular dates), xv 4529–8998, Warmington (1935–40) iv.208–11, Crawford (2012). Cf. Dressel (1878) 167, Marquardt and Mau (1964) [1886] 462–3, Gemoll (1892) 101–2, Blümner (1911) 152, Callender (1965) 5–6, Courtney (1980a) at Juv. 5.28 (and already the scholiasts on that passage: Grazzini (2011–18) 246), Tchernia (1986) 30–1, appendix 2, 321–41, Weeber (1993) 25–6, Nisbet and Rudd (2004) 247–8, Desbat (2004), Stein-Hölkeskamp (2005) 203–11, Thurmond (2017) 206.

¹³ See, for example, C. 1.20 with Commager (1962) 325–6, and C. 1.9, briefly mentioned in the introduction of this chapter. For Horace's transformation of the Greek symposium, see Murray (1985).

¹⁴ Kilpatrick (1970) is particularly laboured; according to him, the poem describes how Horace offers a wine from his own birth year to Cassius at the latter's birthday on the eve of Philippi. None of this has any basis in the poem, as L. C. Watson (2003) 418 notes. Other suggestions are that Horace serves a precious wine for a precious friend who is to be identified with Maecenas, and the wine from the year of his birth also links him with Achilles, who is called an *alumnus* (Lyne (2005) 5, 10, 18–19); the poem may be set on Horace's own birthday (Mankin (1995) *ad loc.*). I profited especially from the following readings: the wine evokes mortality (Lowrie (1992) 416); the wine marks Horace as ordinarily Roman, in contrast to Achilles (Mankin (1995) *ad loc.*); the age of the wine lets Horace reflect on his life (Schmidt (2002) [1980] 249–50). Recently, Evans (2016) 192–4 argued that Chiron's advice to Achilles in the second half of the poem takes place on the day Achilles was born and is thus connected to the wine from Horace's year of birth.

¹⁵ For ideal drinking ages of various grapes, see Ath. 1.26c–27d. For luxurious wine as old as the person drinking it, see Sen. *Dial.* 10.17.2.

poem in several ways. First, the wine is strongly identified with Horace; it is pressed in the year he was born, the year of *his* consul Torquatus: *uina Torquato [. . .] consule pressa meo*. Horace's year of birth and the wine are interwoven in the chiasmic line. Wine and Horace are identified.¹⁶ In the preceding lines, Horace stresses that now is the right time for him and his companions to enjoy themselves, before the advent of gloomy old age. Given the close temporal identification of Horace with his wine, the wine might be on the verge of becoming too old to be still drinkable, and the link between Horace and wine invites readers to transfer the feared prospect of grievous old age to the wine. Indeed, the description of old wine as a metaphorical old man is conventional and arguably would have made the connection between Horace's age and the age of the wine easier.¹⁷ Horace is the wine. The same moment calls them to enjoyment in *Epodes* 13.

There is one more side to the wine. Before Horace mentions the wine, he exhorts his companions to 'snatch the opportunity from the day' (3): *rapiamus, amici, | occasionem de die*. Horace here translates the Greek concept of *καιρός*, the opportune time or right moment. The expression exudes the Greek spirit that August Meineke discerned in the poem. The *καιρός* must be seized before it passes by. The divine allegory of *Καιρός* illustrates the point well: the young god *Καιρός* has a lock of hair in his front, which can be snatched, but he is bald on his back.¹⁸ In Latin, *occasio* is the proper translation for *καιρός*, and the act of snatching also looks back to Greek models where expressions such as *καίρῳ λαμβάνειν* are common, as Alfonso Traina has observed.¹⁹

¹⁶ It is generally noted that Horace mentions a wine from the same vintage at *C.* 3.21.1: *O nata mecum consule Manlio*. Schmidt (2002) [1980] 249–50 stresses the identification of the wine with Horace. He, however, argues that Horace asks for a wine from his birth year as he reviews his life, before he is prepared to die in battle (so already Commager (1962) 282). Lowrie (1992) 417–18 says that the poem 'grounds its own writer in existence' by mentioning the vintage.

¹⁷ See, for example, *Archestr.* *fr.* 59.2–3 Olson and Sens with numerous parallels in their commentary, and Arnott (1970). For the idea of drinking wine before it is too late in Horace, see *C.* 2.14.25–8.

¹⁸ The *locus classicus* for this depiction of *Καιρός* is an epigram of Posidippus, which describes a statue by Lysippus (*APL* 275 = Posidippus 142 Austin and Bastianini). For *καιρός*, see Trédé-Boulmer (2015).

¹⁹ Traina (1973) 7–8, quoting *A. Sept.* 65 (cf. Babcock (1978) 110). Traina notes that *καίρῳ ἀρπάζειν* is not used in Greek before Plu. *Phil.* 15. For *occasio* as a translation of

Horace's exhortation to snatch the right moment is followed by the exhortation to get hold of the particular wine. This suggests that the wine, too, is opportune, and that it is the right moment to drink it. As we have seen, the wine is as much a date, a unit of time, as it is something to drink. As Horace talks about time in *Epodes* 13, he blends a Greek concept of time with a Roman dating system.

The wine in *Epodes* 13 is opportune and should be drunk in this moment. This present quality of the wine needs stressing. It is perhaps natural to focus on the past when it comes to old wines, and this chapter will indeed also consider how vintage wines allow Horace to include the past in his banquets. But equally important is the present nature of wine: it can be drunk once and then it is gone. As we have seen in *Epodes* 13, a vintage wine can present an opportune moment in the present time, a wine that must be drunk now (cf. Hor. *C.* 1.37.1–6). In Horace's exhortation to *carpe diem* in *Epodes* 13, the wine evokes the present time.

2.2 Drinking Again and Thinking of When: Reperformance in *Odes* 3.8

In this section, I wish to look in some more detail at vintage wines as a calendrical mechanism in Horace. *Odes* 3.8 already features a date in its *incipit* and might thus be well suited for an analysis of wine as a dating mechanism:

Martiis caelebs quid agam kalendis,
quid uelint flores et acerra turis
plena miraris positusque carbo in
caespite uiuo,

docte sermones utriusque linguae:
uoueram dulcis epulas et album
Liberio caprum prope funeratus
arboris ictu.

(5)

καίρος, see *Distichs of Cato* 2.26, Phaedr. 5.8, Ausonius *Epigrams* 12 Green. In Latin, the allegory undergoes a gender change from masculine *καίρος* to feminine *occasio*. The peculiar hairstyle of the Opportunity is arguably as strange for female allegories as it is for male ones (*RE* x.2 col.1516 s.v. 'Kairos': 'recht unästhetisch'). Also cf. Plin. *Nat.* 14.142, who tells us that in his time drunkards commonly claimed 'to snatch life' (*rapere se ita uitam praedicant*).

Reperformance in *Odes* 3.8

hic dies anno redeunte festus
corticem adstrictum pice dimouebit (10)
amphorae fumum bibere institutae
consule Tullo.

sume, Maecenas, cyathos amici
sospitis centum et uigiles lucernas
perfer in lucem: procul omnis esto (15)
clamor et ira.

mitte ciuilis super urbe curas:
occidit Daci Cotisonis agmen,
Medus infestus sibi luctuosis (20)
dissidet armis,

seruit Hispanae uetus hostis orae
Cantaber sera domitus catena,
iam Scythae laxo meditantur arcu
cedere campis.

neglegens, ne qua populus laboret, (25)
parce priuatus nimium cauere et
dona praesentis cape laetus horae:
linque seuera.

Although you are well-versed in both Greek and Latin discourses, you are puzzled what a single like me is doing on the first of March? And what the point of the flowers is? And why the boxes are full of incense? And why there are charcoals on the altar of fresh turf? The reason is, I had vowed to Liber a delicious meal and a white goat when a tree almost struck me and sent me six feet under. As the year comes round, this holiday will remove the cork that had been sealed with pitch from an amphora which was taught to drink smoke under the consulship of Tullus.

Raise a hundred toasts, Maecenas, to the rescue of your friend and keep the lights burning till daylight. Here's no place for shouting and anger. Don't worry about the domestic affairs of the city. The army of Cotiso the Dacian has fallen. The hostile Medes tear one another apart with weapons that bring themselves grief. The Cantabrian, our old enemy on the Spanish coast, is finally conquered and in chains. The Scythians have now unstrung their bows and are preparing to withdraw from their plains.

Stop caring if the Roman people is in trouble; don't be too concerned: you're not a politician. Be happy and take the gifts of the present hour. Let go of serious matters.

‘This ode begins with a parody of an aetiology’, Nisbet and Rudd state.²⁰ As they point out, this manner of aetiology is closely linked to the Roman calendar, and Ovid’s *Fasti* provides the best example for this type of literature. Indeed, the *Fasti* also includes an aetiology for the Calends of March (1 March), that is, the *Matronalia*, a holiday for Juno Lucina. Ovid asks Mars why mothers celebrate the first day of March (Ov. *F.* 3.170: *dic mihi matronae cur tua festa colant*). Questions about a celebration also prompt the aetiology in Horace, and his sequence of two indirect questions might point to the (mock-) didactic nature of the passage. Pointedly, the questions in the ode arise because Horace celebrates the first day of March as a bachelor, and is thus quite the opposite of Ovid’s celebrants.²¹ The riddle – impossible to solve for Maecenas despite his Greek and Latin learning – is resolved when Horace reveals that he celebrates his delivery from a fallen tree with an annual holiday (*C.* 3.8.6–12. Cf. *C.* 2.13, 2.17).²² Horace’s new aetiology leads to a re-attribution of the holiday; suddenly, Juno Lucina is not the honoured goddess anymore, but Bacchus (6–7): *uoueram dulcis epulas et album | Libero caprum* (‘I had vowed to Liber a delicious meal and a white goat’).²³ Bacchus takes over this holiday and, as the following stanza reveals, Bacchus also provides a system for measuring time in this ode.

This day is a yearly recurring feast (9–11): *hic dies anno redeunte festus | corticem adstrictum pice dimouebit | amphorae* (‘as the year comes round, this holiday will remove the cork that had been sealed with pitch from an amphora’).²⁴ Such recurring

²⁰ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) 123.

²¹ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.* note the witty enclosure of *caelebs* within *Martiis kalendis*, and point out that Juv. 9.53 speaks of 1 March as *femineis* [...] *Kalendis*. Fulkerson (2017) 77–8 cites numerous references for the *Matronalia*.

²² Oftentimes there exist both Greek and Latin aetiologies for Roman festivals, as Ov. *F.* 2.359, for instance, testifies for the Lupercalia. Though Greek and Latin learning is essential for identifying calendrical traditions, it is of little use for solving the riddle of Horace’s celebration (cf. Fraenkel (1957) 222).

²³ New holidays commemorating events of the recent past became common under Caesar, as Kießling and Heinze (1966) note at *C.* 3.8.9. See Rüpke (2011) [1995b] 124–34 on new holidays instated by or associated with Augustus, and recently again Rüpke (2017) 59–63. Beard (1987) 10–11 argues that one of the fundamental qualities of the Roman calendar is its openness to reinterpretations of festivals. Cf. Feeney (1998) 127–31.

²⁴ Nisbet and Hubbard (1970) 244 clarified that *anno redeunte* ‘in no way implies a first anniversary’, which is ‘a view that depends on a mistranslation’. For feasts in Horace, see Lieberg (1965).

feasts often offer a ritualistic reperformance of an original event on which they are supposedly based. Thus, Ovid's *Fasti* explains in some detail that Romans run naked through the town and slap women on the Lupercalia (Ides of February = 15 February) because Romulus and Remus were naked when they once pursued cattle thieves (Ov. *F.* 2.267–380). Similarly, Horace also re-performs his delivery from the falling tree. In the second stanza, Horace mentions that Liber saved him from a tree falling on his head, and Nisbet and Rudd are right to point out that the literal meaning of Lyaeus, 'the loosener', suits the god very well in this context.²⁵ The following stanza deals with reperformance. This time, not a tree (*arbor*) but one of its constituents, namely rind (*cortex*), is the object that must be removed.²⁶ *Cortex*, the metonymic, ritualistic signifier, makes way for Bacchus, just as the tree made way for him. When Horace put an amphora into storage and destined it to be drunk on the anniversary of the tree incident, this marked the preparations for the ritualistic reperformance. In other words, 'teaching' the amphora to drink smoke in the storage place, Horace was already 'inaugurating' his celebrations, and this is exactly the double-meaning that is entailed in Horace's use of *institutus*, as Nisbet and Rudd observe (11–12):²⁷ *amphorae fumum bibere institutae | consule Tullo* ('an amphora which was taught [or inaugurated] to drink smoke under the consulship of Tullus').

Odes 3.8 shows the significance of reperformance for Horace's poetics of the present. The party Horace describes in the poem is a unique moment in present time. At the end of the poem, Horace makes this explicit, as he exhorts Maecenas to 'gladly take the gifts of the present hour' (27: *dona praesentis cape laetus horae*). This is the exhortation to *carpe diem*.²⁸ As we have already seen in *Epodes* 13, here, too, an exhortation to seize time is semantically

²⁵ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.*

²⁶ A comparison between the parallel sentences in Hor. *C.* 3.8.9–11 and *C.* 3.14.13–14 shows that *corticem* is in the place of *atras curas*; the happy holiday removes cork and sorrows to make time for wine. For similarities between the two poems, see Santirocco (1986) 128–31. For wine removing sorrows, see Broccia (2006). For forgetting (and remembering) at banquets, see Hutchinson (2016) 253–4, 267–8.

²⁷ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.*

²⁸ As Commager (1962) 244 n.9 notes, the insight into human mortality, a requirement for a *carpe diem* poem, is implied in the cause for the party: Horace's escape from death.

linked with an exhortation to enjoy wine; Horace tells Maecenas earlier in the poem to ‘take a hundred cups’ (13–14) (sume, *Maecenas, cyathos amici | sospitis centum*).²⁹ Yet, the wine is not just the ‘gift of the present hour’. It also recreates the enjoyment of the present hour every single year, and in doing so looks back at the fall of the tree, an event from several years ago. Horace is *drinking again and thinking of when* the tree almost killed him. Removing the cork from the bottle creates a reperformance, a ritual, and Horace’s own religious calendar.³⁰ As Horace expresses time through wine, *carpe diem* materialises: enjoying time and enjoying wine becomes the same thing, though this notably entails a strange blend of past and present time.

Every time Horace uses the phrase *dies festus* in the *Odes* and the *Epistles*, he also mentions an old wine (*C.* 2.3.6–7, 3.8.9, 3.14.13, 3.28.1; *Epist.* 1.5.9–10). In Horace, a holiday or festival is more than a time of intense celebration of the present. In the perfectly cyclical Roman calendar in which any *dies festus* is identical to last year’s *dies festus* or that of any previous year, celebration of the present is naturally evocative of the past.³¹ Vintage wine brings the time of the past to the symposium, and a clear distinction between past and present becomes impossible, as Horace’s book poetry conflates occasions of past and present.³²

The inauguration of Horace’s yearly ritual happened under the consulship of Tullus. At this point we encounter a second form of the Roman calendar. As Denis Feeney has reminded us, there existed two types of *fasti*: the calendrical *fasti*, an annual calendar of celebrations (which has concerned us so far in *Odes* 3.8), and

²⁹ The parallel between the present poem and *Epod.* 13 would be even stronger if the *uaria lectio* of *rape* in place of *cape* was accepted at *C.* 3.8.27. Traina (1973) 8–9, following Bentley (1713) *ad loc.*, gives a detailed account on the semantic qualities of the words and why *cape* should be preferred. Cf. Citti (2000) 58–9 and Graziosi (2009) 151–2. Putnam (1996b) brings out the urgency of the exhortations. Lieberg (1965) 414 and Delignon (2017) 85 wish to see an Epicurean sentiment in the exhortation.

³⁰ Cf. Griffin (1997), Schwindt (2004b) 83–4. *Hor. C.* 3.22 similarly creates a personal religious calendar, as has been analysed by Cairns (1982), J. Henderson (1995), Feeney (1998) 134–5. For the importance of reperformance in Horace, see Barchiesi (2000) 175–6.

³¹ See Feeney (2007) 158–63 on the identity of dates in different years of Caesar’s calendar.

³² See, in particular, Schmidt (2002) [1980] 264–5 on occasion, wine, and celebrations. Cf. Lieberg (1965), A. Richter (1970) 5–6, Griffin (1997), O’Gorman (2002) 90–3, Evans (2016) 245.

the consular *fasti*, a list of Roman magistrates that denotes years.³³ The date ‘under the consulship of Tullus’ can refer to the year 66 BC as well as to the year 33 BC. While older commentaries generally favour the earlier date, with the somewhat artificial reasoning that Horace often mentions older wines, Nisbet and Hubbard as well as Ernst Schmidt have made the compelling point that *consule Tullo* gives us a date for the tree incident, so that 33 BC is almost certainly the right date.³⁴ Indeed, since the storage of the wine marks the inauguration of Horace’s annual festival, this seems sensible: the *cortex* that Horace removes from the amphora dates back to the tree incident. Wood from that year is again removed, and wine from that year signifies freedom.³⁵

As Schmidt says, dating events by wine is typical for Horace.³⁶ Yet, this is a peculiar system of dating and deserves further scrutiny. For it is one thing to say that ‘1945 is the year that marked the end of the Second World War’, but it is an altogether different thing to say this: ‘Château Mouton Rothschild of 1945 is a stellar example [*sc.* of a truly great vintage] and to celebrate the Allied victory and mark the return of Baron Philippe to his estates, he [i.e., Baron Philippe de Rothschild] commissioned the artist Philippe Jullian to illustrate the wine’s label with the ‘V’ for Victory.’³⁷ In the latter case the Allied victory is contextualised through an outstanding wine vintage, and more specifically through a peculiar wine label: a unique moment in history becomes recallable through a wine, which some people still buy and drink today. In Rome, most wines were probably drunk after a minimal time of maturation.³⁸ Yet, vintage wines also existed and they took their names from the consuls of the year of the vintage, or of the year when the wine was transferred from the *dolium* to the

³³ Feeney (2007) 166–9. Cf. Wolkenhauer (2011) 190–1.

³⁴ Schmidt (2002) [1980] 258–60. The later date was first suggested by Ensor (1902) 210. Nisbet and Hubbard (1970) 244 first suggested a connection between the date of the wine and the tree incident. The earlier date is favoured by Kießling and Heinze (1966) *ad loc.*, Syndikus (1972–3) ii.106.

³⁵ Did the rind come from the very tree that almost killed Horace?

³⁶ Schmidt (2002) [1980] 248–65, Evans (2016) 127–245.

³⁷ www.idealwine.info/2015/05/08/1945-the-victory-year/. In the following years, well-known artists, among them Picasso, Chagall, and Warhol, would design the wine label for each new vintage of Mouton Rothschild – perhaps the most artistic take on wine labels since Horace.

³⁸ Tchernia (1986) 29–30, Thurmond (2017) 189.

amphora, or both. This is natural enough; after all, the names of consuls *were* the year, as Feeney says,³⁹ and a date *ab urbe condita* for wine would have been absurd.⁴⁰

In the case of *Odes* 3.8, the year 33 BC would have been known to Romans as ‘Imp. Caesar Diui f. and L. Volcatius Tullus’. Wines sometimes took the name of only one of the two consuls.⁴¹ For 33 BC, the year in question, Tullus was the only sensible choice out of the two, as Augustus accumulated a total of thirteen consulships (eleven of them by the publication of the tribiblos), so that it seems impossible to put his name elegantly into poetry.⁴² These practical considerations do not mean that Augustus is altogether absent: the date ‘under the consulship of Tullus’ refers to a year in which Augustus was consul, a year that was named after him. Thus, Augustus is present, however elusively. Horace’s worries and the danger to his life are gone, and when he marks this day Augustus is somewhere there.⁴³ But probably Horace would warn us not to ask where exactly Augustus is, just as he in fact warns Maecenas not to ask about the political state of the empire (*C.* 3.8.15–28): everything is taken care of and must not be mentioned at the banquet.

2.3 Horace’s *Fasti*: Wine Storage Places at *C.* 3.8 (again), *C.* 2.3, *C.* 3.28

Consular wines are a synonym for vintage wines. This is exactly the punchline in the following epigram of Martial (13.111):

De Sinuessanis uenerunt Massica prelis:
condita quo quaeris consule? nullus erat.

³⁹ Feeney (2007) 171.

⁴⁰ Though, for contextualisation, Pliny *Nat.* 14.55 gives an additional *ab urbe condita* date for the famous Opimian wine.

⁴¹ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) at *C.* 3.21.1, citing Plin. *Nat.* 14.94. For epigraphic evidence, see, for example, *CIL* iv 9313 (= Rigato and Mongardi (2016) 113, no. 51).

⁴² Horace manages to describe the wine label ‘second consulship of Taurus’ at *Epist.* 1.5.4: *uina bibes iterum Tauro diffusa*. Mentioning the number of a consulship is common on actual wine labels, for example, *CIL* iv 2554–9.

⁴³ Cf. Hor. *Epod.* 9.37–8, *C.* 3.14 (discussed below). In *C.* 4.5, Horace explicitly mentions that Augustus drives out any cares. Syndikus (1972–3) ii.108 says that in *C.* 3.8 the carefree life points to Augustus, though he is not named (cf. Griffin (1997) 58). Yet the wine label does and does not include Schrödinger’s Caesar. See page 89 for an actual wine label from 33 BC, which does not include Augustus.

Wine Storage Places at C. 3.8, C. 2.3, C. 3.28

Massic wine has come from Sinuessan presses. You are asking under which consul it was put to storage? There wasn't any.

The hyperbole is telling. A wine that predates the existence of consuls is an absurd impossibility in more than one sense; it is not only unrealistic but also subverts the whole system. A wine that predates the Republic also predates Roman time and, in particular, Roman oenological time.⁴⁴

As we have seen, wine labels, which were painted on amphorae, are commonly mentioned in literary sources, and just over 160 such labels are known to have survived.⁴⁵ Among the existing wine labels, we also have a label for the wine Horace mentions in *Odes* 3.8, the vintage dating back to 33 BC (*CIL* xv 4566):⁴⁶

FVN. P.
L. TULL. L. AUT
COS

The abbreviations stand for *Fun(danum). P(asianum) | L. Tull(o). L. Aut(ronio) | co(n)s(ulibus)*, so that the label refers to a wine from Fundi from the year when L. Volcacius Tullus and L. Autronius Paetus were consuls, the latter a suffect consul.⁴⁷ As wine labels were most commonly written in ink, they faded over time. At *Odes* 3.8.11–12, Horace says that his wine bottle was taught to drink smoke: *amphorae fumum bibere institutae | consule Tullo* ('an amphora which was taught to drink smoke under the consulship of Tullus'). 'Drinking smoke' refers to a Roman way of storing wine; Nisbet and Rudd note that Romans sometimes stored wine in an *apotheca* under the roof, where smoke supposedly improved

⁴⁴ This is also the point in 13.117, where Martial says that he has an amphora from the time of Nestor, which 'can bear any name you please'. Cf. Mart. 1.105, where an amphora is so old that it has lost its label.

⁴⁵ Helpfully collected by Rigato and Mongardi (2016). See page 79 n.12 for wine labels in literary and epigraphical sources as well as in scholarship.

⁴⁶ Rigato and Mongardi (2016) 111, no. 29. The second inscription of the amphora reads: *Fund(ani) uel fundi). Pasiani. A[e]mil(-). | (amphora) III | Tull(o). et A[ut]ron(io). co(n)s(ulibus)*. Another wine label from this year is *CIL* viii 22640, 3 (= Rigato and Mongardi (2016) 121, no. 115). Some fragmentary labels which mention Augustus could date to 33 BC as well as any other year in which he held the consulate (Rigato and Mongardi (2016) 125, no. 159–61).

⁴⁷ Autronius Paetus became suffect consul when Augustus stepped down as consul on 1 January. For consuls and suffects of this year, see Bodel (1995) 287–9. For wines from Fundi, see Plin. *Nat.* 14.65, Mart. 13.113.

its taste.⁴⁸ Whether or not this was the case, at any rate the smoking process changed both the taste of the wine and the appearance of the amphora. The older an amphora is, the darker its label, so that the past becomes gradually more illegible.⁴⁹ The taste of the wine becomes smokier as well as stronger, while the liquid diminishes.⁵⁰ When Horace serves a wine which has ‘drunk smoke’ in *Odes* 3.8 he and Maecenas will be able to taste the past gone by.

Some wealthy Romans owned thousands of amphorae (Varro *De uita populi Romani* fr. 125a Riposati *apud* Plin. *Nat.* 14.96 and fr. 125b *apud* Nonius 544 Mercier, Hor. *S.* 2.3.115–17, Galen *Ant.* 2.15 = xiv.25–6 Kühn).⁵¹ Seneca therefore speaks of ‘storehouses filled with the vintages of many ages’ (*Epist.* 114.26): *aspice ueteraria nostra et plena multorum saeculorum uindemiis horrea: unum putas uideri uentrem cui tot consulum regionumque uina cluduntur?* (‘Look at our grand crus and the storehouses that are filled with the vintages of many ages. Do you think that the wines of so many consular years and so many regions were put into storage for the enjoyment of a single belly?’). Elsewhere he notes that old wines were stored according to taste and age (*Nat.* 4B.13.3: *ueteraria per saporos aetatesque disponere*; ‘to store vintage wines by type and age’). The sight of such storage places, then, resembled a huge, drinkable consular calendar, possibly no less spectacular than Augustus’ famous *Fasti Capitolini*. Consular calendars were essentially lists of past consuls: an orderly sequence of yearly dates denoted by the names of the consuls for each year. We can also discern in other contexts the underlying grid of the consular calendar; the best-known example is arguably

⁴⁸ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.*, Tchernia and Brun (1999) 136–8 with numerous further references.

⁴⁹ Cf. Mart. 1.105, Juv. 5.33–5: *cras bibet Albanis aliquid de montibus aut de | Setinis, cuius patriam titulumque senectus | deleuit multa ueteris fuligine testae.*

⁵⁰ The most famous old wine is the so-called Opimian from 121 BC. Plin. *Nat.* 14.55–6 says that by his time this wine had diminished to strong dregs, which were highly valued and used to spice other wines.

⁵¹ For these and the following references, see Tchernia (1986) 33–4, who also notes that Cicero could attack Piso for not having a wine cellar but buying his wines from the tavern (*Pis.* 67). Cf. Tchernia (1995) 300, Tchernia and Brun (1999) 34, 133–4. Also see now Van Oyen (2020) 50–3, who makes important points on the transformative quality of wine storage.

Roman annalistic historiography, which charted the past on a calendrical grid.⁵² Wine storage places are another such calendrical structure, as the wines were arranged according to consular years. The sequence of consular names that a wine storage place displays is the sequence of such names in the *fasti*. Entering the storage space, one could slowly make (or drink) one's way further into the past, while reading the names of consuls in ink on the amphorae, which gradually recalled an ever more distant past. Wine storage places thus offered a spatial visualisation of time.⁵³ Indeed, the physician Galen made his way through the emperor's wine storage place, reading the consular years, and drinking his way from old bitter wines at the back of the storage place to younger wines that lack this bitterness at the front (Galen *Ant.* 2.15 = xiv.25–6 Kühn):⁵⁴

κομιζομένων γὰρ τοῖς βασιλεῦσι τῶν ἀρίστων ἀπανταχόθεν, ἐξ αὐτῶν πάλιν τούτων τὸ κάλλιστον αἰρήσεται, ἕγωγέ τοι τῶν οἴνων τῶν Φαλερινῶν ἐκάστου τὴν ἡλικίαν ἀναγινώσκων ἐπιγεγραμμένην τοῖς κεραμίοις, εἰχόμενη τῆς γεύσεως, ὅσοι πλείονων ἐτῶν ἦσαν εἴκοσι, προερχόμενος ἀπ' αὐτῶν ἄχρι τῶν οὐδὲν ὑπόπικρον ἐχόντων.

For the best things are brought to the emperors from everywhere, and from these again the best will be chosen. Thus, I read the age written on the jars of each of the Falernian wines, and had a taste of all those which were more than twenty years old and from these I went further until the wines had no bitterness in their taste.

Horace is the poet who mentions wine storage most frequently. Thus, Horace mentions at one point a Sabine wine that he had 'stored away' at a special occasion (C. 1.20: *conditum*), and at another point a 'stored away Caecuban wine' (C. 3.28.2–3: *reconditum* [...] *Caecubum*). The verb Horace uses, *condo*, appropriately describes the process of storing away wine for future use. Yet, Horace's usage of this verb goes further. At one point Horace

⁵² Feeney (2007) 190 calls annalistic historiography 'the narratological correlative to the monumental *fasti* with their paired consuls'. Cichorius at *RE* i.2 col.2250 s.v. 'Annales' argued that such historiography derived from consular *fasti*. Conversely, Rüpke (1995a) argued that consular *fasti* took their information from historiography.

⁵³ For spatial prepositions and their application to time in Latin, see Bettini (1991) [1988] 113–93. Evans (2016) 5–29 applies Bettini's findings to verbs of movement in Horace.

⁵⁴ Text: Kühn (1821–33).

speaks of ‘times that are stored in the public records of the *fasti*’ (C. 4.13.13–16).⁵⁵

nec Coae referunt iam tibi purpurae
nec cari lapides tempora, quae semel
notis condita *fastis*
includit uolucris dies.

Neither purple dresses from Cos nor precious gems can any longer bring back the years once winged time has stored them away and locked them up in the public *fasti*.

To be sure, the comparison in this passage is made with tongue in cheek; the aging Lyce is made aware of the flight of time, and the evocation of the public consular *fasti*, which record time, strongly contrasts in register with her licentious love life.⁵⁶ And yet, the mention of the Roman calendar system of the *fasti* in Greek-style lyric is striking. Denis Feeney thus says about this passage that ‘no Greek lyric poet could have thought or written in such manner’.⁵⁷ Jörg Rüpke notes that the *fasti* appear in Horace as an ‘authorised form of collective memory’.⁵⁸ Significantly, Horace strongly links calendars with wine storage places; thus, time is ‘stored away’ in the *fasti* as if they were a wine cellar.⁵⁹ This is an apt choice of words, since wine cellars in turn also act as *fasti*, which preserve the names of consuls. Another significant usage of *condo* is noted by Michael Putnam; Horace uses the word also for writing poetry, and at one point says that he composes and stores up what he might soon again remove from storage, in words that are wholly evocative of wine storage (*Epist.* 1.1.12): *condo et conpono quae mox depromere possim* (‘I’m storing and putting away what I may soon bring forth again’).⁶⁰ What I wish to stress is that storing wine,

⁵⁵ For this poem as ‘anti-*carpe diem*’, see Davis (1991) 223–4.

⁵⁶ Thus Feeney (1993) 58, and already Orelli and Baier (1850) *ad loc.* Cf. T. S. Johnson (2004) 177–8. Conversely, Fedeli and Ciccarelli (2008) *ad loc.* argue that the *fasti* in the ode refer to the aediles’ registers of prostitutes.

⁵⁷ Feeney (1993) 58, and see 58–60.

⁵⁸ Rüpke (1997) 76 and 76 n.61 quoting besides the present passage also Hor. *S.* 1.3.112, *C.* 3.17.2–4, 4.14.1–6, *Epist.* 2.1.48. Cf. Mugellesi at *EO* ii.134–5 s.v. ‘calendario’, Lowrie (1997) 54 on the calendar in *C.* 1.4, Barchiesi (2007) 153–5, Evans (2016) 47–8.

⁵⁹ See *OLD* s.v. ‘condo’ 2c, where *C.* 4.13.15 is listed as a transferred meaning of storing something (thus also Bo (1965–6) s.v.).

⁶⁰ Putnam (1969) 153–4. Mayer (1994) *ad loc.* is on point: ‘metaphors for poetic composition [...] elegantly revert to more basic senses’. For the storage imagery, see also

storing dates, and storing poetry are semantically interwoven realms in Horace's book poetry: all this can be stored and accessed later. As Horace says farewell to lyric and begins to write literary letters, he proclaims to 'put away' his lyric, but we might wonder if he does not merely put it into storage (*Epist.* 1.1.10): *nunc itaque et uersus et cetera ludicra pono* ('so now I put away poetry and other trifles').⁶¹ At any rate, ten years after the publication of the tribiblos Horace returns to lyric again in *Odes* 4 and he accesses his self-storage facility: at the beginning of *Odes* 4.11, he mentions that he has kept a jar of Alban wine for over nine years.⁶²

Horace's wine storage place is closely linked to Augustan forms of memorialising. Thus, Augustus' deeds in war and peace are perhaps virtually preserved in wine bottles for future ages (*Epist.* 1.3.8): *bella quis et paces longum diffundit in aeuum?* ('who disseminates his [i.e., Augustus'] deeds in war and peace for long time to come?'). Nisbet has suggested that *diffundo* may be a wine metaphor here: 'the poet bottles up the great deeds of the present for the delectation of future generations'.⁶³ Just as wine storage places preserve the *tituli* ('wine labels') of numerous vintages, so library catalogues or indeed Horace's poetry preserve the *tituli* ('titles') of numerous poems.⁶⁴ Appropriately, Horace

D. West (1967) 24, 27. The passage is appropriately listed under the lemma of storing, preserving, and bottling at *OLD* s.v. 'condo' 2b (thus also Bo (1965–6) s.v.), not under the lemma for composing literature (14a). For *conpono*, meaning 'to put away/store', see Bo (1965–6) s.v. See Nisbet and Rudd (2004) at *C.* 2.3.2–3 on *promo*. Sullivan (2014) interprets Horace's lyric monument (*C.* 3.30) as a basket of papyrus scrolls, commonly arranged in pyramid form. If right, Horace's scrolls will outlast anything, and readers will always access them.

⁶¹ Cf. *Hor. S.* 2.3.115–16: *positis intus Chii ueterisque Falerni mille cadis*.

⁶² Thus Murray (1985) 50, Bernays (1996) 41–2, T. S. Johnson (2004) 152, Thomas (2011) *ad loc.*, Evans (2016) 237–8. Fedeli and Ciccarelli (2008) *ad loc.* rightly stress the similarity to *Ars* 388, where Horace recommends a nine-year wait between the draft and publication of a poem. Did Horace mark the tribiblos with a stamp of its publication year, akin to a wine label? His address to Sestius in *C.* 1.4 might indicate the publication year of 23 BC, in which Sestius was suffect consul. Sestius' name also appears as a stamp on numerous amphorae, since he was a rich amphora producer (for this and the relevance of the addressee for the ode, see Will (1982)). Hutchinson (2008) 131–61, however, argues against publication of the three books together (see 138–9 on Sestius).

⁶³ Nisbet (1966) 327, pointing to *Hor. Epist.* 1.5.4: *uina [. . .] iterum Tauro diffusa*. One could add *Ov. F.* 5.517–18: *quaeque puer quondam primis diffuderat annis | promit fumoso condita uina cado*.

⁶⁴ For these two meanings of *titulus*, see *OLD* s.v. 1 and 3 (and 2 for the oddity of an attached label at *Petr.* 34.6). The dictionary entry points to *Ov. Tr.* 1.1.7 (among other

envisages in *Odes* 4.14 that Augustus may be kept in eternal memory through *tituli* (here: ‘commemorative inscriptions’) and *fasti* (‘public records’, but also ‘calendars’);⁶⁵ but it is of course also his own poetry that inscribes Augustus and numerous other people and events upon *tituli* and *fasti*.

While the act of storing wines and dates in calendrical order is important in Horace’s poetry, the act of accessing this calendar is equally important. This is the message of *carpe diem*: if the wine is not taken from storage for enjoyment, only an heir will profit after death (*C.* 2.14.25–8). Time and time again, Horace asks for wines to be brought forth from storage places. One such instance can be found in *Odes* 2.3, a *carpe diem* poem. Horace begins the poem by telling Dellius to keep an even-minded disposition in all circumstances (*C.* 2.3.1–8):

Aequam memento rebus in arduis
seruare mentem, non secus in bonis
ab insolenti temperatam
laetitia, moriture Delli,

seu maestus omni tempore uixeris, (5)
seu te in remoto gramine per dies
festos reclinatum bearis
interiore nota Falerni.

Keep this in mind: be level-headed when things are arduous; likewise in good times tone down your excessive joy, Dellius. For you are sure to die, whether you spend every moment of your life in misery or at each holiday you lie down in a secluded meadow and enjoy yourself with a Falernian vintage wine from the back of your cellar [literally: ‘treat yourself to an interior label of Falernian wine’].

These lines show some awareness of the spatial dimension of wine storage places. Horace speaks of the ‘interior label of a Falernian wine’ (*interiore nota Falerni*). As Porphyrio informs us, this expression refers to the custom that the youngest wines were stored at the front of the storage place and the oldest at the back,

passages) for the meaning ‘title’, so that *L&S* s.v. seem wrong in stating that ‘title of a book’ is a post-Augustan meaning of *titulus*.

⁶⁵ *Hor. C.* 4.14.1–4, where Feeney (2007) 185 and A. Russell (2019) 178 n.69 are arguably right to insist that the meaning ‘calendar’ for *fasti* need not be excluded here, though Ps-Acro and all the modern commentators think so.

that is, its most ‘interior’ place.⁶⁶ We can observe the same spatial structure that we saw when Galen drank his way through the emperor’s wine cellar: the past is a place far away at the back of the cellar. Yet, Horace strongly links the past with the present: he says that Dellius may drink old wines ‘at each holiday’ (*per dies festos*).⁶⁷ The old wine with ‘the interior label’ becomes part of the present feast. This is indeed what we have seen in *Odes* 3.8, in which Horace serves a vintage wine for a peculiar holiday. *Odes* 2.3 thus explicitly comments on Horace’s method of blending old wine with present festivities. But the ode also puts this theory into practice, when Horace asks for some wine (*C.* 2.3.9–16):

quo pinus ingens albaque populus
 umbram hospitem consociare amant (10)
 ramis? quid obliquo laborat
 lympa fugax trepidare riuo?

huc uina et unguenta et nimium breuis
 flores amoenae ferre iube rosae,
 dum res et aetas et sororum (15)
 fila trium patiuntur atra.

Why do the huge pine and the white poplar love to join their branches and create inviting shade? Why does the quick-flowing water bother to rush along the river’s twisted course? Tell them to bring wine here and perfumes and the all-too-short-lasting blossoms of the lovely rose, while matters and your age and the black threads of the three sisters of fate allow it.

The transition between these two stanzas and the two preceding ones is difficult. In the first two stanzas Horace made a general statement on the good life: keep your nonchalance, Dellius, whether times are difficult or you are enjoying a banquet with old wine on a remote meadow. But there is no suggestion yet that the poem’s setting is this very banquet on the meadow.⁶⁸ Horace characteristically embellishes one part of the doublet and gives us

⁶⁶ Porphyrio *ad loc.*: *hoc est: uetustiore, quoniam interiores lagynae solent esse, quae prius stipatae sunt*. Also note that there is a semantic overlap between a wine label (*nota*) and a mark in the calendar for an auspicious day (*nota* at *C.* 1.36.10).

⁶⁷ Not ‘throughout the holidays’. For the distributive usage of *per*, see Kießling and Heinze (1966) *ad loc.*

⁶⁸ For banquets *en plein air* in literature, see Cazzato (2016).

an attractive vignette of the banquet, while the description of the sad life remains colourless.⁶⁹ Nonetheless, his words are gnomic and do not seem to refer to a particular situation in the present:⁷⁰ the tenses in the second stanza are future-perfects, and they describe the balance of a life when it is over, not the present situation. In the third stanza, however, Horace seems to move from a general statement to a particular place. Attempts have been made to ease the boldness of the transition by adopting different readings in the third stanza.⁷¹ This will not do. For the beginning of the fourth stanza is even bolder. Rather than adopting different readings, we should appreciate with Nisbet and Hubbard the ‘immediacy’ and ‘urgency’ of Horace’s lyric here.⁷² The strongest sign of this immediacy is the first word of the fourth stanza: *huc*. This opening of the stanza is striking, and meant to be so. For the deictic *huc*, ‘here’, points to the *hic et nunc* of the banquet.⁷³ With this word we have left behind the generalising statements of the poem’s beginning. The timeless banquet from the beginning is transformed into a banquet of the present moment. This inner movement of the poem mirrors the movement of wine: as Horace asks for wines to be brought to the banquet and be made present (*huc*), so the poem becomes present.⁷⁴

⁶⁹ Thus Woodman (1970) 169–70, Harrison (2017) *ad loc.* For this technique, see Davis (1991) 163–4, who notes that often one member of the doublet is ‘marked’, the other one ‘unmarked’ (the terms of Palmer (1981) 95–6).

⁷⁰ Nisbet and Hubbard (1978) 52–3: ‘In the third stanza the poem moves from generalizations to the description of a particular parkland [...] In the fourth stanza, with another abrupt development Horace uses the poet’s prerogative to issue directions for a symposium.’ The issue is that lyric poems show movement, and ‘setting’ is anything but a stable category, as Hutchinson (2018) discusses in detail.

⁷¹ Brink (1971b) 19–21 strongly argues in favour of *qua* instead of *quo* in line 9 (Lambinus saw this in manuscripts) and Haupt’s *ramisque et* instead of *ramis quid* in line 11. Shackleton Bailey (2001) prints *qua*, as well as Fea’s *et* in place of *quid* in line 11.

⁷² Nisbet and Hubbard (1978) at C. 2.3.9.

⁷³ Cf. Heinze (1923) 155 on the demonstrative *harum* [...] *arborum*, which perhaps introduces a sympotic setting at the *carpe diem* poem Hor. C. 2.14.22. Barchiesi (2005) 155–7 adduces C. 2.11.13–14 additionally to these two passages, in a short discussion of lyric deixis of trees in Horace’s sympotic poems. Rösler (1983) discusses *demonstratio ad oculos* and ‘deixis am Phantasma’ in relation to Greek lyric, and treats Horace’s deictics in this tradition on pages 23–5. Mindt (2007) applies Rösler’s concepts to several Horatian banquet poems. Lefèvre (1993b) 149–50 takes the deictics as evidence that C. 2.3 and C. 2.11 were actually performed in a park.

⁷⁴ Pöschl (1994) 126 argues that the poem moves between dark and light notes as well as between generalising and personal aspects.

Wines have to be ‘moved’ to the symposium (*Epod.* 13.6: *tu uina Torquato moue consule pressa meo*; ‘you, get wine that was pressed in my birthyear when Torquatus was consul’), or ‘brought forth’, as they had been ‘put away’ (C. 3.2.2–3: *prome reconditum*, | *Lyde, strenua Caecubum*; ‘Lyde, quickly bring forth the Caecuban wine, which has been stored away’);⁷⁵ or in a mock-hymn the wine jar has to ‘descend’ from its storage place (C. 3.21.7: *descende*).⁷⁶ Vintage wines in Horace leave the *apotheca*, something of a storehouse of memory, and enter the intense presence of the symposium. The incarnate date, an amphora with a consular year, thus enters the present time of the symposium. This concept of dates and past time, which can be carried around, is possibly comparable to the concept of language among Jonathan Swift’s Lilliputians. In *Gulliver’s Travels* the Lilliputians do not use spoken language but carry objects around with which they communicate. In Horace, we can observe a moveable feast: in the form of wine bottles, past feasts and occasions are literally moved to the present moment. The manifest date is brought from its place in the calendar to the banquet. This also allows Horace to move his celebrations to unusual dates: as Horace gets the appropriate wine, he moves the feast for Bacchus to the first day of March in *Odes* 3.8.

Using consular dates is a dating system that comes with some peculiarities. When Pliny mentions the age of the well-known Opimian wine from 121 BC, the date ‘Opimius’ immediately evokes political events that are associated with the consul (Plin. *Nat.* 14.55): *anno [sc. claritas] fuit omnium generum bonitate L. Opimio cos., cum C. Gracchus tribunus plebem seditionibus agitans interemptus est* (‘one year was distinguished as it was excellent for all types of wine; this was the year when Lucius Opimius was consul and when Gaius Gracchus, the tribune of the people, was first causing civil discord and was then killed’). Pliny’s passive verb *interemptus est* (‘he was killed’) may be

⁷⁵ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.* note that *promē* is ‘a natural word for bringing out wine’, also appearing in Hor. C. 1.36.11, 3.21.8. Cf. *Epod.* 9.1: *Quando repostum Caecubum ad festas dapes [sc. bibam?]*. At *Ov. F.* 5.517–18 an old man serves a wine he had stored as a child (quoted on page 93 n.63).

⁷⁶ On hymnic features of Hor. C. 3.21, see Norden (1956) [1913] 143–63.

slightly obscuring: it was Opimius who promised to give anyone bringing him Gracchus' head the equivalent weight of gold. Pliny's way of recalling history through a wine vintage in this passage is very similar to the case of the Allied victory and the Mouton Rothschild quoted above.⁷⁷ In Horace we have already seen a possible allusion to politics in his mention of Tullus in *Odes* 3.8: the co-consul Augustus is latently lurking behind that date. In other odes the mention of consular dates seems to serve different purposes.⁷⁸ In *Odes* 3.28, Horace tells a certain Lyde to celebrate the feast day of Neptune together with him and bring some wine from the consulship of Bibulus (*C.* 3.28.5–8):

inclinare meridiem (5)
 sentis et, ueluti stet uolucris dies,
 parcis deripere horreo
 cessantem Bibuli consulis amphoram?

You can feel that the midday sun is about to enter its downward course, and yet – as if the winged day were standing still – are you hesitating to snatch from storage the sluggish amphora from the year that Bibulus was consul?

The consulship of Bibulus marks the year 59 BC, when Julius Caesar and M. Calpurnius Bibulus were consuls. Suetonius, however, asserts that Romans jokingly referred to the year as 'Julius and Caesar' instead of 'Caesar and Bibulus', as Bibulus was notoriously inactive (*Suet. Jul.* 20.2).⁷⁹ Bibulus attempted to prevent his co-consul Caesar's legislation by procrastinating. Some people even used this date jokingly in testamentary documents,

⁷⁷ See page 87. The reverse is also possible: at Velleius 2.7.5 the account of Gracchus' story triggers the mention of the Opimian wine.

⁷⁸ Note that in *Hor. C.* 1.20 Maecenas becomes part of a quasi-consular date for wine, as Cairns (1992) 92 recognises: an acclamation for Maecenas provides the date for the wine in place of the usual consular date.

⁷⁹ Evans (2016) 223–34 also points to this section of Suetonius as well as to the one I quote in the following paragraph, and he stresses that Bibulus' political (in)activity mirrors the hesitating amphora. This interpretation goes back to D. West (1973) 43–4. Evans notes that *Cic. Att.* 2.19.2 describes Bibulus in the famous words that Ennius coined for Fabius Cunctator: *unus homo nobis cunctando restituit rem* (*Enn. fr.* 363 Skutsch). Cassius Dio 38.6 reports that people broke the *fasces* of Bibulus in 59, which takes his consular power away from him. For consuls that were so bad that they should have been deleted from the *fasti*, see *Cic. Sest.* 33 and *Pis.* 30 with A. Russell (2019) 174. Russell further notes on page 171 that Mark Antony's name was first deleted then reinscribed upon the *fasti*. Tiberius rejected the suggestion to delete the names of bad consuls in the *fasti* (*Tac. Ann.* 3.17–18).

according to Suetonius. Moreover, the following verses were supposedly common knowledge at that time (Suet. *Jul.* 20.2):

non Bibulo quiddam nuper sed Caesare factum est:
nam Bibulo fieri consule nil memini.

An event recently happened not in the year of Bibulus but in the year of Caesar. For I do not remember anything to have happened in the year of Bibulus.

Horace's choice of dating the wine seems strange at first sight: while Romans have wittily asserted that such a thing as a consulship of Bibulus does not exist, Horace nonetheless asks for a wine from that time. In *Odes* 3.8 above we have already seen how Horace's mention of one consul, Tullus, provokes his readers to think of the absence of the other consul, Augustus. In the case of Bibulus and *Odes* 3.28, incompleteness and absence is very much the essence of the date. This serves different purposes; for once, the hesitant amphora is evocative of the consul Bibulus, who famously procrastinated Caesar's legislation, as David West notes.⁸⁰ Indeed, Horace's interlocking word order keeps the 'consul Bibulus' neatly embedded between (or inscribed on?) the 'hesitating amphora'.

The date on the wine label in *Odes* 3.28 also serves another purpose. Victor Pöschl stresses, in a wonderful interpretation of the poem, that Lyde is only characterised through her hesitation, and he notes that her hesitation finds a parallel in the hesitating amphora.⁸¹ Horace attempts to overcome Lyde's hesitation, and Pöschl is arguably right to see a lover's pleas in Horace's urging.⁸² This is a common situation in *carpe diem* poems; thus, Horace urges Leuconoe to seize the day in *Odes* 1.11, and several Greek epigrams urge women to submit to their lovers' pleas before time runs out. Indeed, the word *parco* ('to spare, be sparing'), which expresses Lyde's hesitation, may point to Greek models where $\phi\epsilon\iota\delta\omicron\mu\alpha\iota$ ('to spare, be sparing') is used in exactly

⁸⁰ D. West (1973) 43–4, T. S. Johnson (2004) 152 n.46, Evans (2016) 223–34. Bibulus also hesitated to leave his house as a governor of a province while there was still a single enemy outside (and he still wanted a triumph), as Cicero jokes at *Att.* 6.8.5.

⁸¹ Pöschl (1970) 186, Schmidt (2002) [1980] 255–6, Evans (2016) 231.

⁸² Pöschl (1970) 188–91.

this context.⁸³ As Horace mentions the midday sun, he introduces a sense of urgency; this is the reminder of time passing by, possibly pointing to the approaching evening of life in the typical fashion of a *carpe diem* poem.⁸⁴

When Horace urges Lyde to submit to his pleas, he tells her not to hesitate to ‘snatch’ (*deripere*) an amphora from the year of Bibulus. The word for getting hold of the amphora, *deripio*, is a comparatively violent term. Elsewhere Horace uses more neutral (*moueo, fero, peto*) or technical vocabulary (*promo, depromo*). The exhortation to snatch the wine rapidly and violently is an attempt to overcome Lyde’s hesitation.⁸⁵ But this also points again to the peculiar calendar Horace uses. We have seen how Horace exhorts his companions in *Epodes* 13 to ‘snatch’ (*rapio*) the occasion and to ‘move’ (*moueo*) some wine to the banquet. As Horace addresses Lyde, he conflates time and wine: Lyde is asked to snatch an amphora as well as an elusive moment in time. Just as Bibulus’ consulate is a fleeting date, so the amphora is hesitant to be brought from storage. The moment in past time, 59 BC, which is difficult to locate but promises ‘bibulous’ enjoyment,⁸⁶ finds some parallel in the moment in present time: here, Horace’s date with Lyde promises enjoyment if only he can convince her to seize the day (and the wine).

Feeney has stressed that the consular *fasti* served a symbolical purpose, while ‘the utilitarian dimension [...] is less clear’.⁸⁷ At first sight wine labels may offer such a utilitarian dimension; identifying the right wine is, after all, quite useful. Closer inspection, however, has revealed that Feeney’s statement also holds true for amphorae: it is the symbolic value of consuls on wine labels that Horace exploits with his drinkable calendar.

⁸³ See *AP* 5.85.1 = Asclepiades 2.1 *HE*, *AP* 9.439.6 = Crinagoras 47.6 *GP*, *AP* 11.25.3 = Apollonides 27.3 *GP*, *P.Oxy.* 1795.3 (at *CA* 199–200, if restored correctly) and already *PMG* 913.2 at Amipsias *fr.* 21.5. Asclepiades’ epigram is close in spirit. I discuss the other epigrams in detail in Chapter 4.

⁸⁴ Thus Pöschl (1970) 182–6. This is the reference to death of the *carpe diem* poem. Cf. Evans (2016) 231–2.

⁸⁵ Thus Pöschl (1970) 186.

⁸⁶ For the pun on Bibulus and *bibulus*, see Kießling and Heinze (1966) *ad loc.*, who point to Hor. *Epist.* 1.14.34 [*sc. scis*] *quem bibulum liquidi media de luce Falerni*.

⁸⁷ Feeney (2007) 170 referring to Wallace-Hadrill (1987) 223–4, Rüpke (1995a).

2.4 Memories of Linguistic Wars: Tasting Language in *Odes* 3.14

The oldest wine Horace mentions in his poetry appears in *Odes* 3.14. In this poem, Horace celebrates Augustus' happy return from Spain (*C.* 3.14.13–28):

hic dies uere mihi festus atras
exiget curas: ego nec tumultum
nec mori per uim metuam tenente
Caesare terras. (15)

i pete unguentum, puer, et coronas
et cadum Marsi memorem duelli,
Spartacum siqua potuit uagantem
fallere testa. (20)

dic et argutae properet Neerae
murreum nodo cohibere crinem:
si per inuisum mora ianitorem
fiet – abito.

lenit albescens animos capillus
litium et rixae cupidus proteruae:
non ego hoc ferrem calidus iuuenta
consule Planco. (25)

19 uagantem *codd.* : uagacem *Charis.* *GL* i.66

This is a real holiday for me as it will banish my dark worries: I will not fear civil strife or violent death, because Caesar controls the world. Slave, come and get perfume and garlands and a cask that remembers the Marsian feud, if anywhere a jar was able to elude marauding Spartacus.

And tell Neaera with her clear voice to hurry and to tie her myrrh-scented hair with a band. If the detested doorman makes you wait, just give up and come back. My hair is turning white and that's softening my temper; I used to welcome altercations and violent quarrels. I would not have put up with this in my youth when I was hot-blooded and when Plancus was consul.

Augustus returns victorious from Spain, and Horace celebrates. The ode thus seems a good example for a celebration of the present moment in typical lyric fashion. On closer inspection, however, much of the ode deals with the past as a foil for present celebrations; as Horace praises Augustan peace, he recalls the civil wars

of the past (14–15: *tumultus* and *uis*). Parts of this recollection of political unrest in Rome are also the Social War (18), Spartacus' revolt (19–20), and Plancus' consulship that marks the year of Philippi (27–8).

When Horace asks a slave to bring a wine jar to the symposium, the wine also provides a historical date (17–20): *i pete unguentum, puer, et coronas | et cadum Marsi memorem duelli, | Spartacum siqua potuit uagantem | fallere testa* ('slave, come and get perfume and garlands and a cask that remembers the Marsian feud, if anywhere a jar was able to elude marauding Spartacus'). The wine dates back to the Social War of 91–87 BC (or even precedes it), a revolt of Rome's Italian allies.⁸⁸ This date makes it of course an old and therefore choice wine, thus befitting the occasion.⁸⁹ Yet, apart from these concerns for the symposiasts' enjoyment, the vintage also makes the wine a historical fact.⁹⁰ Horace's instructions to his slave are generic for a symposium, and they are common in early Greek lyric. The wine jar, however, which is firmly placed in Roman history, is distinct from the usual commands at a Greek symposium. As we have seen in *Odes* 2.3, again an old wine enters the present moment of the banquet and marks a holiday. This time the wine had to escape from the dangers of wars of the past in order to make it to the banquet. Wines were indeed easy victims in war; Polybius tells us that Hannibal washed his horses in old wine in order to cure them of scabies as he marauded through Italy.⁹¹ Horace's wine escaped the notice of Spartacus' marauding hordes. The wine thus evokes Roman history; in fact, it is even said to remember it (18): *cadum Marsi memorem duelli* ('a cask that remembers the Marsian feud').⁹²

⁸⁸ Putnam (1996a) 453 understands the line as referring to a wine that was processed during the Social War. Schmidt (2002) [1980] 252 considers it likely that the wine dates back to a time of peace preceding the Social Wars. L. Morgan (2005) 194 takes it for granted that the wine predates the war.

⁸⁹ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.* point to Juv. 5.31: *calcatamque tenet bellis socialibus uuam*.

⁹⁰ Cf. Schmidt (2002) [1980] 251–2, Davis (2007) 212 n.6, Evans (2016) 212–22.

⁹¹ Plb. 3.88 with Thurmond (2017) 226. Cic. *Phil.* 13.11 mentions that Mark Antony emptied Pompey's wine cellar (Tchernia (1986) 117).

⁹² Schmidt (2002) [1980] 251 speaks of an 'Erinnerungsfähigkeit' (an ability to remember) of the wine. For the significance of time in other elements of the ode, see Putnam (1996a) 447.

As Ellen Oliensis notes, remembering is an odd activity for wine, the proverbial agent of oblivion.⁹³ In *Odes* 3.14, however, the wine jar remembers the past not just as a fact but even recalls a past style of speech. My first piece of evidence for this must be tentative, as it is based on a doubtful reading in the text. Nisbet raised a number of textual issues in the ode and one of his suggestions was that *uagacem* may be a reasonable alternative for *uagantem* in line 19.⁹⁴ While the manuscript evidence supports *uagantem*, the reading *uagacem* is preserved in a quotation of the Horatian line by the grammarian Charisius (*GL* i.66). Although the word is not elsewhere attested in Latin, Nisbet thought that the word, supposedly meaning ‘rampageous’, might be ‘an archaism with a period flavour, or perhaps a whimsical coinage of Horace’s own’.⁹⁵ This suggestion is attractive. The wine jar then not only remembers historic events, but recalls them in the language of their time, speaking in archaisms. While the fact that *uagacem* has no parallel in Latin may seem to diminish its likelihood, the question *utrum in alterum* offers some support for the reading: it is not unlikely that *uagantem* appeared in the manuscripts as a normalisation of the unusual *uagacem*.⁹⁶

Admittedly it would be shaky scholarship if my argument rested on one doubtful reading, but the passage contains at least one more archaism that is certain (18):⁹⁷ *cadum Marsi memorem duelli* (‘a cask that remembers the Marsian feud’). The term *duelli* is of course an archaism for *belli*.⁹⁸ Ovid, for instance, uses the term

⁹³ Oliensis (1998) 148, pointing to Hor. *C.* 2.7.21: *obliuioso* [. . .] *Massico*.

⁹⁴ Nisbet (1983) 116. Previously suggested by Brink (1971a) 34–5. Klingner (1959) and Shackleton Bailey (2001) mention the reading *uagacem* in the apparatus.

⁹⁵ Nisbet (1983) 116.

⁹⁶ Cf. Verg. *A.* 11.230, where the archaism *pacem petendum* (gerund with direct object) should be preferred to the alternative manuscript reading *petendam* (Horsfall (2003) *ad loc.*). While the manuscripts are divided between the two readings, the indirect grammatical tradition prefers the archaism.

⁹⁷ Is *cadus* another archaism? Brink (1982a) at *Hor. Epist.* 2.2.163 and Muecke at *EO* ii.773 s.v. ‘lingua e stile’ think so. *Aliter* Nisbet and Rudd (2004) at *C.* 3.29.1–2: ‘everyday word’.

⁹⁸ L. Morgan (2005) 195 n.20 notes the striking combination of *memorem* with the archaism *duelli*. Cf. Isidorus, *Etymologiae siue Origines* 18.1.9: *bellum antea duellum uocatum* with Maltby (1991) s.v. ‘bellum’ and *L&S* s.v. ‘bellum’ I. Horace uses *bellum* forty-eight times and the archaism *duellum* six times (Waltz (1881) 45, Ruckdeschel (1911) 92–3, Bo (1965–6) s.v., Bartalucci at *EO* ii.797 s.v. ‘arcaismi’, Kießling and Heinze (1961a) at *Epist.* 1.2.7). Axelson (1945) 112 finds fault with Horace’s ‘Gebrauch der selbst den Epikern zu rostigen Form *duellum*’.

duellum as he talks about a war in Rome's far history (*F.* 6.201). In Horace, the wine 'remembers the Marsian feud', and thus remembers a bygone war as well as a bygone word. The certain presence of the archaism *duelli* offers further support for the reading *uagacem*. Nisbet and Rudd say that *duelli*, 'with its suggestion of "old unhappy far-off things"' makes a contrast with the delights of the symposium.⁹⁹ Possibly so, but at least as important is the point that the archaism makes wine a device that brings the past to the symposium. As the wine jar recalls inter-Roman wars, so poet and poem also recall them: as has long been noted, the consulship of Plancus, which Horace mentions at the end of the poem, marks the year of Philippi. Oswyn Murray says that 'the date is carefully placed in the sympotic context, as if it were a mark of vintage'.¹⁰⁰ In this year Horace was fighting under Brutus and Cassius against Octavian, the later Augustus. Horace, much like the curious wine he serves, is a survivor of inter-Roman wars.¹⁰¹ Before this background of near-death, Horace exhorts to the enjoyment of the present in his *carpe diem* poem.

Odes 3.14 is not alone in recalling wars through old wine and words. In the so-called Cleopatra ode, Horace celebrates Augustus' victory over Mark Antony and the end of the civil wars. After the well-known call to drink, *nunc est bibendum*, Horace says that 'previously it was a sacrilege to bring Caecuban wine from ancestral cellars' (*C.* 1.37.5–6): *antehac nefas depromere Caecubum | cellis auitis*. Horace might be thinking of a wine predating the civil war here, a wine worthy of being opened now. As Horace approaches the 'ancestral cellars', he again brings back not only an old wine but also an old word. The word *antehac* is an archaism, as Roland Mayer notes.¹⁰² Again, in *Epodes* 9, in which Horace also celebrates Augustus' victory at Actium with a banquet, he begins his poem by asking when the time would come to drink 'a Caecuban wine that had been put into storage (*repostum*) for a banquet of celebration' (*Epod.* 9.1).

⁹⁹ Nisbet and Rudd (2004) *ad loc.* ¹⁰⁰ Murray (1985) 47.

¹⁰¹ In his own account of Philippi, Horace also stresses that he was able to escape the notice of the enemy (*C.* 2.7.13–16). The words *consule Planco* are well discussed by Klingner (1961) [1938] 402–5, Fraenkel (1957) 290, Schmidt (2002) [1994–5] 282–3.

¹⁰² Mayer (2012) *ad loc.*

The word *repostum*, which describes the storage of wine, is another archaism.¹⁰³ In *Odes* 2.3, which I discussed above, Horace tells Dellius that he may have made himself happy (*bearis*) with an old Falernian wine with its interior label. The verb *bearis* has been described as an archaism.¹⁰⁴ Finally, as Horace speaks of a ‘jar of wine’ in the *Epistles* he uses the expression *cadum temeti*, in which *temetum* is an archaism and *cadum* perhaps another one (*Epist.* 2.2.163).¹⁰⁵ The identification of Latin words as archaisms is notoriously difficult, and not every one of my examples might be as clear cut as the example of the wine that remembers the Marsian feud. Nonetheless, the cumulative force of these examples is clear enough – old wine preserves the taste of old words in Horace. Horace’s storehouse is not just a thesaurus of wine but also a thesaurus of words. This need perhaps not surprise us; in the *Epistles*, Horace tells us that ‘the jar will long keep the fragrance of what it was once steeped in when new’.¹⁰⁶ The link between old wine and old words, styles, and texts is not unique to Horace. Cicero compares the old style of Thucydides’ rhetoric to wines of old consular dates, and new oratory to a wine from the preceding year (*Brut.* 287). It is suggestive that Horace finds obsolete words in a storage place: in an influential study, Aleida Assmann identified a cultural phenomenon which she calls ‘storage memory’ (‘Speichergedächtnis’).¹⁰⁷ This describes a type of cultural memory that preserves obsolete information, as archives do, for instance. Horace’s storage places seem to work in comparable ways.

Wine as a mechanism of remembering past moments is particularly well suited for lyric poetry. One obvious reason is the presence of wine at the symposium, one of the essential spaces for lyric poetry.¹⁰⁸ The other reason, which strikes me as more interesting,

¹⁰³ Thus L. C. Watson (2003) *ad loc.*

¹⁰⁴ Waltz (1881) 42–3, Nisbet and Hubbard (1978) *ad loc.*

¹⁰⁵ Brink (1982a) *ad loc.* regards both words as archaisms. Fedeli at *EO* ii.262 s.v. ‘vino’ argues that *temetum* carries the flavour of the rural world. Cf. *OLD* s.v.

¹⁰⁶ *Epist.* 1.2.69–70: *quo semel est inbuta recens seruibit odorem | testa diu*. Horace’s jar here preserves the fragrance of Ennius *fr.* 476 Skutsch (Mayer (1994) *ad loc.*): *quom illud quo iam semel est inbuta ueneno*. Also note that Horace frequently employs Grecisms for drinking vessels (Gitner (2012) 114–15).

¹⁰⁷ A. Assmann (2011) [1999] 119–32. ¹⁰⁸ See e.g., Murray (1985) for Horace.

is the uniquely timely quality of vintage wines. Wine is a product of the season, since grapes are harvested every autumn and wine is produced. Similarly to flowers or grain, this makes wine an innate part of the natural cycle of the year. Yet, wine is distinct from most other seasonal products in that it can be preserved. Horace's own poetry, too, was always destined to be preserved, as he makes clear in the last poem of the tribiblos, *Exegi monumentum*. As Horace projects a future life of his momentary poems, wine bottles become the ideal vessel for his poetry. While wine is a product of the season and is enjoyed in a particular moment, this seasonal point in time can be preserved for a considerable period.¹⁰⁹ When wine drinkers open a bottle of old wine in our time, they often will have informed themselves previously about how the weather of that year influenced the vintage. Similarly in Martial, even the legendary Opimian, around 200 years old by Martial's time, bears the signs of a fortunate autumn (13.113): *Haec Fundana tulit felix autumnus Opimi. | expressit mustum consul et ipse bibit* ('The fruitful autumn of Opimius has brought forth this wine from Fundi. The consul himself pressed out the must and drank it').¹¹⁰ Drinking wine can then provide a direct sensory experience of a past season. This flavour of the past leads us back to *Odes* 3.14.

The wine in *Odes* 3.14 is some truly strong stuff from the Marsian war, and the alien, stronger taste is reflected in the archaisms that the wine 'memorises'. In this ode and elsewhere, wine preserves archaisms that have been out of season for decades. The metaphor 'out of season' is indeed appropriate for words in Horace, as he regards the lexical development of words as cyclical, comparable to the seasonal change of leaves (*Ars* 45–72). Horace repeatedly compares words to vines that the poet has to cultivate. Thus, he says in the epistle to Florus (*Epist.* 2.2.122–3): [*sc. poeta*] *luxuriantia conpescet, nimis aspera sano | leuabit cultu, uirtute carentia tollet* ('The aspiring poet will cut back excessive (otiose!)

¹⁰⁹ Compare and contrast Pindar *O.* 9.48–9, who famously urged to praise 'old wine but the flowers of newer poems'. Horace picks up the saying at *Epist.* 2.1.34–5 (Brink (1982a) *ad loc.*, Spelman (2018) 203–13 and 207 n.68).

¹¹⁰ The outstanding weather in this year is also noted by Plin. *Nat.* 14.55: *ea caeli temperies fulsit (cocturam uocant), solis opere, natali urbis DCXXXIII: durantque adhuc uina ea cc fere annis.*

foliage verbiage, he will smoothen what is too rough with beneficial attention, and he will uproot those words that lack dignity'). The archaisms in *Odes* 3.14 are words that have not been pruned, and it is fitting that they are preserved by a wine jar. Yet, these thoughts on the seasonal quality of words in Horace are already branching into the next chapter, where I will look in more detail at the eternal cycle of leaves and words in Horace's poetry.