

# American Journal of International Law

### **INSIDE THIS ISSUE**

- Imperfect Alternatives: Institutional Choice and the Reform of Investment Law Sergio Puig and Gregory Shaffer
- Essay
  Incremental, Systemic, and Paradigmatic
  Reform of Investor-State Arbitration
  Anthea Roberts
- Editorial Comment
  Closing the Accountability Gap: Concrete
  Steps Toward Ending Impunity for Atrocity
  Crimes
  Theodor Meron



CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS

## AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

Vol. 11	July 2018	July 2018	
	CONTENTS		PAGE
Imperf Law	Sect Alternatives: Institutional Choice and the Ref	orm of Investment Puig and Gregory Shaffer	361
i i e t	This Article applies the theory of comparative institutional date the trade-offs associated with alternative mechanist investment disputes. We assess the trade-offs in light of accountability under the rule of law, which underpins the efficiency, and peace that are attributed to investment law. To two recommendations: first, reforms should address continuous domestic and international institutions; second choices should respond to the different contexts that states	ms for resolving The principle of goals of fairness, The Article makes complementarity nd, institutional	
	emental, Systemic, and Paradigmatic Reform of vestor-State Arbitration	Anthea Roberts	410
Closi	ial Comment ing the Accountability Gap: Concrete Steps Toward ading Impunity for Atrocity Crimes	Theodor Meron	433
	<b>noriam</b> Iemoriam David D. Caron (1952–2018)	Charles N. Brower	452
International Decisions  Edited by Harlan Cohen Inter-American Court of Human Rights Advisory Opinion OC 23/17 of November 15, 2017 (Angeliki Papantoniou)			460
	lvisory Opinion of the Inter-American Court of Human I tween human rights and the environment	Rights on the relationship	
Slowa	akische Republik (Slovak Republic) v. Achmea B.V. (Bj	örn Arp)	466
inv	ourt of Justice of the European Union judgment on comp vestment treaty arbitration provision with European Unio cutor v. Bemba, et al. (Jonas Nilsson)		473
	ternational Criminal Court Appeals Chamber judgment rentences for offenses against administration of justice	egarding convictions and	

Inter-American Court of Human Rights Advisory Opinion OC-24/17 of November 24, 2017 (Nicolás Carillo-Santarelli)	479	
Advisory Opinion of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights concerning gender identity, same-sex relationships, and the rights of LGBTI persons		
Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law  Edited by Jean Galbraith		
Congress Enacts the Clarifying Lawful Overseas Use of Data (CLOUD) Act, Reshaping U.S. Law Governing Cross-Border Access to Data Trump Administration Expels Russian Diplomats and Imposes Russia-Related	487	
Sanctions	493	
U.S. Supreme Court Holds that a Provision of the Foreign Sovereign Immunities  Act Does Not Lift Immunity from the Attachment of Iranian Artifacts	496	
U.S. Tariffs on Steel and Aluminum Imports Go into Effect, Leading to Trade Disputes	499	
United States Moves Forward with Tariffs and Requests WTO Consultations in Response to Certain Trade Practices by China	505	
Developments Relating to U.S. Trade Negotiations—KORUS, NAFTA, and Trade Promotion Authority	510	
President Trump Withdraws the United States from the Iran Deal and Announces the Reimposition of Sanctions	514	
United States Bombs Syrian Government Facilities in Response to Chemical Weapons Use	522	
Recent Books on International Law		
Book Reviews		
Zidar, Andraž and Jean-Pierre Gauci (eds.). <i>The Role of Legal Advisers in International Law</i> (John R. Crook)	528	
Barron, David J. Waging War: The Clash Between Presidents and Congress 1776 to	)20	
ISIS (Saikrishna Bangalore Prakash) Otto, Dianne (ed.). Queering International Law: Possibilities, Alliances, Complicities,	534	
Risks (Teemu Ruskola)	540	
Gross, Aeyal. <i>The Writing on the Wall: Rethinking the International Law of Occupation</i> (Yutaka Arai-Takahashi)	544	
Books Received	548	
International Legal Materials, Contents, Vol. 57, No. 3		
Erratum		

### **BOARD OF EDITORS**

Editors in Chief

CURTIS A. BRADLEY
Duke University School of Law

Anne van Aaken

University of St. Gallen

Dapo Akande

Oxford University

KAREN I. ALTER

Northwestern University

ANTONY ANGHIE

National University of Singapore

Karima Bennoune

Univ. of California, Davis School of Law

Laurence Boisson de Chazournes

University of Geneva School of Law

CHRISTOPHER BRUMMER

Georgetown University Law Center

Gráinne de Búrca

New York University School of Law

BHUPINDER SINGH CHIMNI

Jawaharlal Nehru University

HARLAN COHEN

University of Georgia School of Law

ASHLEY DEEKS

University of Virginia School of Law

JEFFERY DUNOFF

Temple University Beasley School of Law

James Thuo Gathii Loyola University Chicago School of Law

Tom Ginsburg

University of Chicago Law School JACK GOLDSMITH

Harvard Law School

LAURENCE R. HELFER
Duke University School of Law

Monica Hakimi

University of Michigan Law School

Alexandra Huneeus

University of Wisconsin Law School

FLEUR JOHNS

Univ. of New South Wales, Sydney School of

Law

KAREN KNOP

University of Toronto Faculty of Law

KATERINA LINOS

Univ. of California, Berkeley School of Law

DONALD M. MCRAE

University of Ottawa Faculty of Law

CATHERINE POWELL

Fordham Law School

Natalie Reid

Debevoise & Plimpton

HENRY J. RICHARDSON III

Temple University Beasley School of Law

Annelise Riles
Cornell Law School

Cornell Law School

ANTHEA ROBERTS

Australian National University

Gregory Shaffer

Univ. of California, Irvine School of Law

Alan O. Sykes

Stanford Law School

ex officio Lucinda Low Mark David Agrast Honorary Editors

George H. Aldrich

St. Michaels, Maryland

Mahnoush Arsanjani New Haven, Connecticut

RICHARD B. BILDER

University of Wisconsin Law School

CHARLES N. BROWER

The Hague, the Netherlands

EDITH BROWN WEISS

Georgetown University Law Center

THOMAS BUERGENTHAL

George Washington Univ. Law School

CHRISTINE M. CHINKIN

London School of Economics

JAMES R. CRAWFORD

The Hague, the Netherlands

JOHN R. CROOK

Potomac, Maryland

RICHARD FALK

University of California, Santa Barbara

TOM J. FARER

University of Denver

MICHAEL J. GLENNON

Fletcher School, Tufts University

Senior Copyeditor Erin Lovall

Cite-checker Catherina Valenzuela Cynthia Crawford Lichtenstein Boston College Law School

David A. Martin

University of Virginia School of Law

MICHAEL J. MATHESON

George Washington Univ. Law School

THEODOR MERON

The Hague, the Netherlands

JOHN NORTON MOORE

University of Virginia School of Law

BERNARD H. OXMAN

University of Miami School of Law

W. MICHAEL REISMAN

Yale Law School

STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL

South Woodstock, Vermont

DINAH SHELTON

George Washington Univ. Law School

DAVID P. STEWART

Georgetown University Law Center

Peter D. Trooboff

Covington & Burling LLP

RUTH WEDGWOOD

Johns Hopkins University

Assistant to the Editors in Chief
Meaghan Kelly

Submissions Editors 2017–18
SCOTT BOISVERT

Alexandra Buettner Matthew J. Eible Lauren N. Hughes

JAMES D.L. MURRAY KAITLYN M. POSA

### AMERICAN JOURNAL OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Journal of International Law (AJIL) has been published quarterly since 1907. It features articles, essays, and editorial comments by pre-eminent scholars on developments in international law and international relations. AJIL contains summaries and analyses of decisions by national and international courts and arbitral or other tribunals, and of contemporary U.S. practice in international law. Each issue lists recent publications in English and other languages, many of which are reviewed in depth. The AJIL is indispensable for all professionals working in international law, economics, trade, and foreign affairs.

It is the policy of the American Society of International Law not to take an official position, by resolution or otherwise, upon controversial questions. The views expressed in the articles, editorial comments, book reviews, and all other contributions to the *AJIL* are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken as representing the views of the Board of Editors or the Society.

### THE AMERICAN SOCIETY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW

The American Society of International Law (ASIL) is a nonprofit, nonpartisan, educational membership organization founded in 1906 by U.S. Secretary of State Elihu Root and chartered by Congress in 1950. Headquartered in Washington, D.C., its mission is "to foster the study of international law and to promote the establishment and maintenance of international relations on the basis of law and justice." ASIL holds Special Consultative Status with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations and is a constituent society of the American Council of Learned Societies.

ASIL's nearly four thousand members hail from more than one hundred nations with nearly 40 percent residing outside the United States. Its members include scholars, jurists, practitioners, government officials, leaders in international and nongovernmental organizations, students, and others interested in international law. Through its many publications, conferences, briefings, and educational events, ASIL seeks to serve the needs of its diverse membership and to advance understanding of international law among policymakers and the public.

ASIL is a volunteer-led organization governed by a sixty-member Executive Council elected by its membership. In partnership with the elected leadership, ASIL is led by an executive director and supported by a professional staff.

## Become a member asil.org/membership

Join one of the Society's Partner Programs and receive complimentary ad space in AJIL asil.org/financial-support/sponsors-and-institutional-supporters

Follow the Society on Twitter twitter.com/asilorg

### Like us on Facebook

facebook.com/American Society of International Law

### OFFICERS AND EXECUTIVE COUNCIL OF THE SOCIETY, 2018–2019

President	Sean D. Murphy
Honorary President	
Vice Presidents	Hannah L. Buxbaum, Tai-Heng Cheng, E. Whitney Debevoise II,
	Oona A. Hathaway
	Mark David Agrast
Secretary	James A. R. Nafziger
Treasurer	
Assistant Treasurer	Ronald J. Bettauer
Audit Committee Chair	

Past Presidents: José E. Alvarez, Charles N. Brower, James H. Carter, Lori Fisler Damrosch, Donald Francis Donovan, Lucinda A. Low, Lucy F. Reed, Arthur W. Rovine, Anne-Marie Slaughter, Peter D. Trooboff, Edith Brown Weiss

Honorary Vice Presidents: Lori Fisler Damrosch, Donald Francis Donovan, Lucinda A. Low

Council Members: Perry S. Bechky, Kristen Boon, Anna Spain Bradley, Todd F. Buchwald, Jacob Katz Cogan, Jeffrey L. Dunoff, Chiara Georgetti, Monica Hakimi, Rebecca Hamilton, Dawn Yamane Hewett, Steven Hill, Christina Hioureas, Mélida Hodgson, Tiyanjana Maluwa, Saira Mohamed, Rahim Moloo, Jaya Ramji-Nogales, Sergio Puig, Victoria Shannon Sahani, Tamara A. Shockley, David L. Sloss, Elizabeth Trujillo, Samuel M. Witten, Jarrod Wong

Counsellors: Dapo Akande, Diane Marie Amann, Laurence Boisson de Chazournes, Nicola Bonucci, Marinn Carlson, Marcella David, James T. Gathii, Harold Hongju Koh, Peter Mason, M. Margaret McKeown, Makau Mutua, Joseph E. Neuhaus, Stephen W. Preston, Balakrishnan Rajagopal, Hélène Ruiz-Fabri, Leila Nadya Sadat, Dan Sarooshi, Steven M. Schneebaum, Richard H. Steinberg, Jane E. Stromseth, Bruce C. Swartz, Peter Tomka, Adrien K. Wing, Nassib G. Ziadé

### PHILANTHROPY AND THE SOCIETY

The American Society of International Law is grateful to its Patrons and the many members who contribute to the Annual Fund and the Endowment. Patron-level donors and Heritage Circle members who have included the Society in their estate plans are acknowledged below. The Society gratefully acknowledges the support of its Law Firm, Publisher and Academic Partners, who are listed on the next page. All institutional partners and individual donors of \$500 and above are acknowledged in the Society's annual Year-in-Review for the year in which the gift was made.

### LEADERSHIP PATRONS

This category recognizes extraordinary and sustained philanthropic support of the Society.

HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN\*

CHARLES N. BROWER

### PATRONS (2014-2018)

Elihu Root Patron (\$50,000)

ANONYMOUS
DONALD K. ANTON
GARY B. BORN
DAVID D. CARON\* AND SUSAN SPENCER
LORI FISLER DAMROSCH
DONALD FRANCIS DONOVAN AND
JENNIFER LAKE
LUCINDA A. LOW AND
DANIEL B. MAGRAW
LUCY F. REED
W. MICHAEL REISMAN AND
MAHNOUSH H. ARSANJANI
ARTHUR W. ROVINE

Cordell Hull Patron (\$25,000)

CATHERINE M. AMIRFAR R. DOAK BISHOP

JAMES H. CARTER
TAI-HENG CHENG
ELI WHITNEY DEBEVOISE II
SUSAN L. KARAMANIAN
EDWARD G. KEHOE

JAMES G. LEITNER AND TRACY HIGGINS ABBY COHEN SMUTNY

James Brown Scott Patron (\$15,000) Mark D. Agrast and David M. Hollis José E. Alvarez and Susan Damplo Andrea K. Bjorklund Charles H. Camp

DAVID COLSON GLENN P. HENDRIX JUDD KESSLER BENEDICT KINGSBURY CHARLOTTE KU EDWARD KWAKWA
ALOYSIUS LLAMZON
STEPHEN C. MCCAFFREY
GABRIELLE KIRK MCDONALD
SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY
JOSEPH E. NEUHAUS
MARY ELLEN O'CONNELL
DANIEL M. PRICE
STEVEN M. SCHNEEBAUM
MORTIMER N.S. SELLERS
ANDRES RIGO SUREDA
JUDGE BRUNO E. SIMMA
BETH VAN SCHAACK
DON WALLACE, JR.
ADRIEN K. WING
MARCIA A. WISS

### **LEGACY PATRONS (TO 2014)**

DOMINGO E. ACEVEDO GERALD AKSEN ARTHUR R. ALBRECHT Teymour A. Alireza\* GEORGE H. ALDRICH DIANE MARIE AMANN JAMES G. APPLE Frank A. Bauman\* Mrs. Richard Baxter\* DAVID J. BEDERMAN\* AND LORRE B. CUZZE Daniel L. Bethlehem RICHARD B. BILDER JOHN A. BOYD JOHN BRISCOE CHARLES N. BROWER IAN BROWNLIE\* EDITH BROWN WEISS LEE C. BUCHHEIT THOMAS BUERGENTHAL

WILLIAM J. BUTLER
HUGO AND SUSANA CAMINOS
JAMES RICHARD CRAWFORD
JOHN R. CROOK
ANTHONY D'AMATO\*
ARTHUR H. DEAN\*
SARAH WHITCRAFT DEFORD\*
TIMOTHY L. DICKINSON

THOMAS A. DUBBS EDWARD DUMBAULD\* RICHARD W. EDWARDS. JR. Alona E. Evans\* BENJAMIN B. FERENCZ Donald Ferencz THOMAS M. FRANCK\* ALWYN V. FREEMAN\* JOHN KING GAMBLE Ronald E.M. Goodman CHRISTOPHER J. GREENWOOD JOHN LAWRENCE HARGROVE . Victoria M. Hariri\* Oona A. Hathaway RITA E. HAUSER JOHN N. HAZARD\* Alice and Louis\* Henkin ROBERT E. HERZSTEIN\* ROSALYN HIGGINS KEITH HIGHET\* HOWARD M. HOLTZMANN\* CHARLES A. HUNNICUTT JOHN H. JACKSON\*

Andrew J. Jacovides

RICHARD A. JOHNSON

MARK R. JOELSON

KENNETH I. JUSTER

Frederic L. Kirgis

JEFFREY LANG SIR ELIHU LAUTERPACHT\* ROY S. LEE JEREMY I. AND CANDACE C. LEVITT Cynthia Crawford LICHTENSTEIN RICHARD B. LILLICH\* AND GERDA HEIDEL\* A. Vaughan Lowe Andreas F. Lowenfeld\* HOUSTON PUTNAM LOWRY Brunson MacChesney ROBERT MACCRATE\* RONALD ST. JOHN MACDONALD\* D. STEPHEN MATHIAS EDWARD WATSON McWHINNEY\* ROBERT F. MEAGHER\* THEODOR MERON HUSAM MESHAL W. ROBERT MORGAN\* IAMES A.R. NAFZIGER Ved P. Nanda Andre Newburg Shigeru Oda BERNARD H. OXMAN Jan Paulsson Nancy L. Perkins HERMAN PHLEGER\*

Natalie L. Reid SANG-MYON RHEE DAVIS R. ROBINSON WILLIAM D. ROGERS\* SEYMOUR J. RUBIN\* PHILIPPE J. SANDS OSCAR SCHACHTER\* STEPHEN M. SCHWEBEL Anne-Marie Slaughter EARL A. SNYDER\* BARBARA STARK ERIC STEIN\* CHARLES W.T. STEPHENSON JOHN R. STEVENSON\* DAVID P. STEWART LAURENCE STORCH ENRIQUE P. SYQUIA\* GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR\* Peter D. Trooboff DETLEV F. VAGTS\* CHARLES O. VERRILL, JR. JILL McClanahan Watson RUTH WEDGWOOD BURNS H. WESTON\* EDWIN D. WILLIAMSON BASIL S. YANAKAKIS Nassib G. Ziadé

B. DONOVAN PICARD

### THE ASIL HERITAGE CIRCLE

Members who have advised the Society that they made provisions to include the Society in their estate plans.

Anonymous (2) Elizabeth Andersen James G. Apple Frank A. Bauman\* Charles N. Brower James H. Carter \* deceased Sarah Whitcraft DeFord\* Michael and Mary Ann Farley Thomas M. Franck\* Christian A. Herter, Jr.\* Chimène Keitner CHARLOTTE KU
CYNTHIA CRAWFORD LICHTENSTEIN
H.C.L. MERILLAT\*
SEAN D. AND JULIE MURPHY
MARY ELIEN O'CONNELL
LUCY F. REED

OSCAR SCHACHTER\*
STEPHEN SCHER
ERIC STEIN\*
JOHN R. STEVENSON\*
GENEVIEVE EAGON TILLAR\*
RICHARD YOUNG

### LAW FIRM PARTNERS

Leadership Circle

ARNOLD & PORTER LLP
DEBEVOISE & PLIMPTON LLP
FOLEY HOAG LLP
FRESHIELDS BRUCKHAUS DERINGER LLP
WHITE & CASE LLP
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

President's Circle

SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP

Counselors

COVINGTON & BURLING LLP CURTIS MALLET-PREVOST, COLT & MOSLE LLP KING & SPALDING LLP STEPTOE & JOHNSON LLP

### PUBLISHER PARTNERS

Platinum

Brill Nijhoff Publishers Cambridge University Press Gold

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

Bronze

EDWARD ELGAR PUBLISHING HART PUBLISHING ROUTLEDGE – TAYLOR AND FRANCIS PUBLISHING SPRINGER PUBLISHING

### ACADEMIC PARTNERS

AMERICAN UNIVERSITY WASHINGTON COLLEGE OF LAW ARIZONA STATE UNIVERSITY SANDRA DAY O'CONNOR COLLEGE OF LAW BOSTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW BROOKLYN LAW SCHOOL CASE WESTERN UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW COLUMBIA LAW SCHOOL CORNELL LAW SCHOOL DUKE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW EMORY UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW GEORGETOWN UNIVERSITY LAW CENTER GEORGE WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL HARVARD LAW SCHOOL Indiana University Maurer School of Law INDIANA UNIVERSITY McKINNEY SCHOOL OF LAW LOYOLA UNIVERSITY CHICAGO SCHOOL OF LAW NEW YORK UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY PRITZKER SCHOOL OF LAW NOTRE DAME LAW SCHOOL McGeorge School of Law University of the Pacific PENNSYLVANIA STATE UNIVERSITY DICKINSON SCHOOL OF LAW PEPPERDINE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW STANFORD UNIVERSITY LAW SCHOOL Syracuse University College of Law University at Buffalo School of Law University of California, Berkeley School of Law University of California, Irvine School of Law University of California, Los Angeles School of Law University of Cincinnati College of Law University of Colorado, Boulder School of Law University of Denver Sturm College of Law University of Geneva Faculty of Law University of Georgia School of Law University of Iowa School of Law University of Miami School of Law University of Michigan School of Law University of Pennsylvania Law School University of Pittsburgh School of Law University of Richmond School of Law University of San Francisco School of Law University of Southern California Gould School of Law VANDERBILT UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW VERMONT LAW SCHOOL WASHINGTON AND LEE UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW WASHINGTON UNIVERSITY SCHOOL OF LAW

VALE LAW SCHOOL

### JOURNAL INFORMATION

AJIL is published in print and digitally by Cambridge University Press on behalf of the American Society of International Law. The journal publishes quarterly, in January, April, July, and October, and to reduce time between acceptance and publication, contributions may appear online as FirstView publications in advance of their scheduled publication in an issue. Discover the entire AJIL back archive at www.cambridge.org/ajil/issues.

### Subscriptions

The electronic version of *AJIL* is available to all members of the American Society of International Law by login to the ASIL website www.asil.org. Print copies are also supplied to all members.

To subscribe as a non-member or recommend a subscription to your librarian go to www.cambridge.org/ajil.

### Submission of Manuscripts

AJIL invites submission of manuscripts on international law subjects. AJIL's coverage extends beyond public international law to closely related issues of global governance, transnational law, and national or sub-state law. It generally does not publish manuscripts focused on purely private or commercial law or on comparative or foreign law, including the internal law of the European Union. AJIL will not consider submissions whose content has been, or will be, published before it appears in this journal.

AJIL welcomes submissions for **Articles**, **Essays**, and **Current Developments** via AJIL's electronic submission website mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ajil or through Scholastica at ajil.scholasticahq.com/.

Editorial Comments are written by members of the Board of Editors. Content for the Contemporary Practice of the United States Relating to International Law section of AJIL is generated by the editor of that section, Jean Galbraith, and outside submissions are not accepted. The Recent Books on International Law section contains book reviews that are solicited by invitation of the editor, Richard Bilder. AJIL strongly encourages authors and publishers to submit books for review in hard copy to: AJIL Book Review Office, 2223 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Washington, DC 20008-2864, USA.

The **International Decisions** section, edited by Harlan Cohen, focuses on final decisions (not subject to further appeal) of international courts or national courts on international law issues. It consists of contributions that are mostly proposed to the editor by readers of the *AJIL*. Proposals for International Decisions should be sent to hcohen@uga.edu.

**AJIL Unbound**, an online initiative to supplement *AJIL* by publishing short, original essays, periodically issues open calls for short contributions on specified topics.

AJIL is committed to publishing a diversity of authors, whether based in the United States or abroad, and to covering a wide range of subjects and approaches. Suggestions for topics for AJIL symposia or Agora should be sent to admin\_ajil@law.duke.edu.

All submissions must follow the AJIL Style Guide. Full instructions on how to prepare and submit your paper may be found here:

www.cambridge.org/core/journals/american-journal-of-international-law/information/instructionscontributors

### Claims and Address Updates

subscriptions\_newyork@cambridge.org (in the USA, Canada and Mexico) journals@cambridge.org (elsewhere)

### Copyright and Permissions

www.cambridge.org/about-us/rights-permissions.

To Advertise in the Journal ad\_sales@cambridge.org

### **Abstracting and Indexing Services**

www.cambridge.org/ajil/abstracting

### For other ASIL Publications

www.asil.org

### **Proper Citation**

AJIL shall be cited according to the following example: 112 AJIL 219 (2018)

ISSN: 0002-9300 E-ISSN: 2161-7953

© American Society of International Law