COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN SOCIETY AND HISTORY

AN INTERNATIONAL QUARTERLY

VOLUME 64 NUMBER 4 OCTOBER 2022



COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN SOCIETY AND HISTORY

ISSN 0010-4175 Founded by Sylvia L. Thrupp

EDITORS

Paul Christopher Johnson Anthropology and History, University of Michigan Geneviève Zubrzycki Sociology, University of Michigan

STAFF

David Akin Managing Editor Leigh Stuckey Digital Content Editor Benjamin Hollenbach Submissions Manager

EDITORIAL COMMITTEE

Henry Cowles History

University of Michigan Deirdre de la Cruz

Asian Languages & Cultures University of Michigan

Jatin Dua

Anthropology University of Michigan Matthew Hull Anthropology

University of Michigan

Jaeeun Kim Sociology

University of Michigan

Greta R. Krippner Sociology

University of Michigan

Erik Mueggler Anthropology

University of Michigan

Rebecca Scott History

University of Michigan Andrew Shrycock Anthropology

University of Michigan

Paolo Squatriti

History

University of Michigan

CONSULTING EDITORS

Leonard Barkan

Jean Comaroff

Natalie Z. Davis

Nancy Farriss Felipe Fernández-Armesto

Emmanuel Le Roy Ladurie

Carlo Ginzburg

Maurice Godelier

Engseng Ho David A. Hollinger

Deirdre McCloskey

Sherry B. Ortner

Joel Robbins James Scott Gregory Starrett

Ann Laura Stoler Susan R. Suleiman Katherine M. Verdery Michael Walzer Gavin Wright Comparative Literature African and African

American Studies and

Anthropology History History History History

Anthropology

History and Anthropology

History

History History

Anthropology

Anthropology Political Science Anthropology

Anthropology Comparative Literature Anthropology Political Theory Economics Princeton University Harvard University

University of Toronto University of Pennsylvania University of Notre Dame University of California,

Los Angeles

École des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales Duke University

University of California, Berkeley

College de France University of Illinois at Chicago

University of California, Los Angeles

University of Cambridge Yale University University of North Carolina

at Charlotte New School for Social Research

Harvard University

City University of New York Institute for Advanced Study

Stanford University

COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN SOCIETY AND HISTORY

An International Quarterly

VOLUME 64 NUMBER 4 October 2022



COMPARATIVE STUDIES IN SOCIETY AND HISTORY

Founded by Sylvia L. Thrupp ISSN 0010-4175

Editorial Office: University of Michigan, 6503 Haven Hall, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1045, U.S.A., http://cssh.lsa.umich.edu. David Akin, Managing Editor.

Publishing, Subscription, and Advertising Offices: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A.; or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K.

Subscription Information: Comparative Studies in Society and History (ISSN # 0010-4175) is published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006/Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. Annual subscription rates for Volume 64, 2022: Institutions, print and online: US \$410.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £262.00 elsewhere. Institutions, online only: US \$313.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £203.00 elsewhere. Individuals, print only: US \$81.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £49.00 elsewhere. Individuals, online only: US \$62.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £37.00 elsewhere. Student rate: US \$41.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £30.00 elsewhere. Single part rate: US \$118.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; UK £75.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage. Comparative Studies in Society and History and all other Cambridge Journals can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to: *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Journals Dept., Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006. Send address changes elsewhere to: *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, Journals Dept., Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K.

© Society for the Comparative Study of Society and History 2022. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, http://www.copyright.com, email: info@copyright.com.

Comparative Studies in Society and History would like to acknowledge the support of the College of Literature, Science and the Arts, the Department of Anthropology, and the Department of History at the University of Michigan.