

Nineteenth- Century Music Review

a
ASHGATE

Volume 1, Issue 1



NINETEENTH-CENTURY
MUSIC REVIEW

VOLUME 1, ISSUE 1
2004

ASHGATE

Published in association with the Centre for
Nineteenth-Century Music, University of Durham, UK

Letters to the Editor We hope to include letters to the editor in future issues of the journal. Please send letters to the general editor:

Dr Bennett Zon
School of Music
University of Durham
Palace Green
Durham DH1 3RL
England

Email: bennett.zon@durham.ac.uk

Subscriptions For the latest information about the price of the journal and details of how to subscribe, please contact:

Customer Services
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Gower House
Croft Road
Aldershot
Hants GU11 3HR
England

Tel: +44 (0)1252 331551
Fax: +44 (0)1252 351839
www.ashgate.com

Nineteenth-Century Music Review

General Editor
Bennett Zon

Book Reviews Editor
Anna Celenza

Music Reviews Editor
Jeremy Dibble

Editorial Board

Dr Bennett Zon, University of Durham, UK (General Editor)

Professor Anna Celenza, Michigan State University, USA (Book Reviews Editor)

Dr Jeremy Dibble, University of Durham (Music Reviews Editor)

Dr Stephen Downes, University of Surrey, UK

Professor William Weber, California State University, Long Beach, USA

Dr Phyllis Weliver, Wilkes University, USA

Advisory Board

Professor Andrew Bowie, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Dr Rosamund Bartlett, University of Durham, UK

Dr Geoffrey Chew, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor John Deathridge, King's College, University of London, UK

Professor Annegret Fauser, University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, USA

Dr Peter Franklin, University of Oxford, UK

Dr Sophie Fuller, University of Reading, UK

Professor Lydia Goehr, Columbia University, USA

Professor Thomas Grey, Stanford University, USA

Professor Hervé Lacombe, Université Rennes 2 – Haute Bretagne, France

Professor Roberta Marvin, University of Iowa, USA

Professor Simon McVeigh, Goldsmiths College, University of London, UK

Professor Julian Rushton, University of Leeds, UK

Professor Jim Samson, Royal Holloway, University of London, UK

Professor Manuela Schwartz, Hochschule Magdeburg/Stendal (FH), Germany

Professor Nicholas Temperley, University of Illinois, USA

© Ashgate Publishing Ltd 2004

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Published by
Ashgate Publishing Limited
Gower House
Croft Road
Aldershot
Hants GU11 3HR
England

Ashgate Publishing Company
Suite 420
101 Cherry Street
Burlington, VT 05401-4405
USA

This journal is the successor of the *Music Review*, founded by the late Geoffrey Sharp, which then continued for many years under the ownership of the late A. F. Leighton-Thomas.

Ashgate website: <http://www.ashgate.com>

ISBN: 0 7546 3124 9

Typeset by SetSystems Ltd, Saffron Walden, Essex

Printed by MPG Books Ltd, Bodmin, Cornwall

Editorial

It gives me great pleasure to introduce the peer-reviewed international music journal *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*, published by Ashgate in association with the Centre for Nineteenth-Century Music, University of Durham, UK. It is the successor of *Music Review*, edited by A. F. Leighton-Thomas for over 50 years, and it is the inheritor of a rich tradition of musicological diversity which his journal had encouraged. Like its predecessor, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* is founded as an open forum of ideas, and does not prosecute a singular philosophical, methodological or theoretical template. It is intended as 'a conference in writing', where a wide range of ideas can be expressed and discussed, and where intellectual dialogue and debate is advanced. It is interdisciplinary in its approach, and it accepts the idea of the 'long century' (roughly the 1780s to the 1920s). True to its name, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* will contain numerous reviews of books, CDs and scores, and in addition each issue will include several articles, correspondence to and from the editor and relevant conference reports. Articles with fine visual content will be one of its hallmarks.

When a new journal is established on the foundation of an old one, broad comparisons between the two are inevitable. But I would like to circumvent this, if I may, by drawing attention to one point in particular, namely the last word in the title of both journals – 'review'. The word 'review' comes from the Latin 're' and 'videre'. It means literally to see again, and as a noun and a verb it has had various closely related meanings over the years. In the sixteenth century it meant a formal inspection, and a century later, a general survey or account. The *Oxford Dictionary of English Etymology* gives recent definitions variously as 'inspect again', 'revise' and 'survey'. Modern dictionaries tend to lump these characteristics together. The *Oxford Reference Dictionary*, for example, gives as its primary definition 'a general survey or assessment of a subject or thing, a survey of past events', and in subsequent definitions 're-examination, reconsideration'; 'a display and formal inspection of troops'; and lastly 'a published report assessing the merits of a book or play etc., a periodical publication with critical articles on current events, the arts, etc.'. Workable as these definitions are, they do not really define the word adequately. They focus on review as an exclusively reflective activity, and in doing so fail to consider the ways in which the act of review actually points to the future. In fact, review is as much about the formulation of the future as it is about the interpretation of the past.

Nineteenth-Century Music Review is a journal dedicated to uncovering the past in ways which point to the future, and it is the intention of its editors to publish work which conforms to this basic approach. We are seeking to expand the horizons of musicological discourse, and to create a vehicle for the distribution of new and dynamic perceptions of nineteenth-century music. We wish to encourage scholars to come forward with individual contributions, as well as ideas for thematically unified groupings of articles, and we will ensure that all contributions are assessed with the utmost fairness and impartiality. *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* is intended as a journal for the musicological community

– in service to it – and it is our hope that musicologists and all scholars interested in music will treat it as an opportunity to create a new intellectual future through its pages.

As a journal is dependent upon the help of so many individuals, I would like to thank firstly my five editorial colleagues: Professor Anna Celenza (Michigan State University, USA), book reviews, and Professor Jeremy Dibble (University of Durham, UK), CD and score reviews; and Dr Stephen Downes (University of Surrey, UK), Professor William Weber (California State University, Long Beach, USA) and Dr Phyllis Weliver. Their dedication to the journal has been truly inspiring, and I offer them my warmest thanks and my deepest gratitude. I would like to also offer many thanks to our advisory board, too great in number to name individually, but invaluable in consultation and advice. And finally, I would like to thank the team at Ashgate for their consistent support of this venture. Their excellence in production and administration has ensured a journal of the highest quality.

Bennett Zon
School of Music, University of Durham

Contents

VOLUME 1, ISSUE 1

Editorial v

ARTICLES

- Ralph P. Locke
Nineteenth-Century Music: Quantity, Quality, Qualities 3
- Ingrid J. Sykes
Sonorous Mechanics: The Culture of Sonority in Nineteenth-Century France 43
- Maiko Kawabata
The Concerto that Wasn't: Paganini, Urhan and *Harold in Italy* 67
- Christina Fuhrmann
Continental Opera Englished, English Opera Continentalized: *Der Freischütz* in London, 1824 115

REVIEWS

Review Article

- Julian Johnson
Writing the History of Nineteenth-Century Music 145

Book Reviews

- Kathryn Lowerre
Gilbert and Sullivan: A Dual Biography by Michael Ainger 154
- Paul Rodmell
Music and British Culture, 1785–1914: Essays in Honour of Cyril Ehrlich,
edited by Christina Bashford and Leanne Langley 156
- Conrad L. Donakowski
Decadent Enchantments: The Revival of Gregorian Chant at Solesmes
by Katherine Bergeron 159
- Nicholas Temperley
Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms by John Daverio 162
- Benjamin Walton
Gioachino Rossini: A Guide to Research by Denise P. Gallo 165
- Helen M. Greenwald
Verdi in Performance, edited by Alison Latham and Roger Parker 169

Alexander Rehding	
<i>The Arts Entwined: Music and Painting in the Nineteenth Century</i> , edited by Marsha L. Morton and Peter L. Schmunk	173
Diana Hallman	
<i>Reading Critics Reading: Opera and Ballet Criticism in France from the Revolution to 1848</i> , edited by Roger Parker and Mary Ann Smart	176
Books Received	181
<i>CD Reviews</i>	
Michael Spitzer	
Beethoven: Violin Concerto in D major op. 61; Romanze for Violin and Orchestra no. 1 in G major op. 40; Romanze for Violin and Orchestra no. 2 in F major op. 50. Anne-Sophie Mutter <i>vn</i> New York Philharmonic: Kurt Masur	183
Peter Horton	
Harwood: Complete Organ Works vol. 1 etc. Adrian Partington <i>org</i> Victorian Organ Sonatas: John E. West, Hugh Blair, W. Battison Haynes. John Kitchen <i>org</i>	185
Stephen Downes	
Scharwenka: Piano Music vols 1 and 2. Seta Tanyel <i>pf</i> Scharwenka: The Complete Chamber Music. Seta Tanyel <i>pf</i> Lydia Mordkovich <i>vn</i> Colin Carr <i>vc</i> Levon Chilingirian <i>vn</i> Ivo-Jan van der Werff <i>va</i> Garbis Atmacayan <i>vc</i>	187
Richard Bruce	
Schubert: Piano Sonata in A minor D537; Piano Sonata in A major D664; <i>German Dances</i> D820 and D790. Mitsuko Uchida <i>pf</i>	190
Beate Perrey	
Schumann: Songs vol. 7 etc. Dorothea Röschmann <i>sop</i> Ian Bostridge <i>ten</i> Graham Johnson <i>pf</i> Polyphony: Stephen Layton	192
Stuart Campbell	
Tchaikovsky: Tchaikovsky for four hands – Symphony no. 4 in F minor op. 36; <i>Romeo and Juliet</i> ; Sixteen from Fifty Russian Folk-Songs. Anthony Goldstone and Caroline Clemmow <i>pf</i>	193
Alain Frogley	
Vaughan Williams: The Early Chamber Music. The Nash Ensemble	195
Amanda Glauert	
Wolf: <i>Lieder nach Heine und Lenau</i> . Stephan Genz <i>bar</i> Roger Vignoles <i>pf</i>	199
<i>Score Reviews</i>	
Nicholas Marston	
Beethoven: <i>Streichquintette</i> , edited by Sabine Kurth	201

Clive Brown	
Brahms: <i>Klavierquintett f-moll</i> op. 34, edited by Carmen Debryn and Michael Struck	203
R. Larry Todd	
Mendelssohn: <i>Die schöne Melusine</i> Ouverture op. 32, edited by Christopher Hogwood	206
Graham Barber	
Widor: <i>Symphonie pour orgue et orchestre</i> op. 42, edited by John R. Near	209
Suzana Ograjenšek	
Wratny: <i>Missa in B flat; Missa in A; Missa in G</i> , edited by Aleš Nagode	212
Guidelines for Contributors	217