

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

מרכז מינרבה לזכויות האדם

The Minerva Center for Human Rights

مركز مينيربا لحقوق الانسان

Faculty of Law, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem



---

Volume 43

Number 1

2010

---

Introduction

*Yuval Shany and Sir Nigel Rodley*

Immigration and the Human Rights Discourse:

The Universality of Human Rights and the Relevance of States and of Numbers

*Ruth Gavison*

Minority Rights for Immigrants?

Multiculturalism versus Antidiscrimination

*Christian Joppke*

Citizens' Rights and Human Rights

*Stephen H. Legomsky*

Managing Female Foreign Domestic Workers in Singapore:

Economic Pragmatism, Coercive Legal Regulation, or Human Rights?

*Eugene KB Tan*

Sovereign States Control of Immigration:

A Global Justice Perspective

*Yaffa Zilbershats*

The Rights Discourse and the Obligation of States

to Admit Immigrants

*Chaim Gans*

Rights in Immigration: The Veil as a Test Case

*Gila Stopler*

Joining the Jewish People: Non-Jewish Immigrants from the Former USSR,

Israeli Identity and Jewish Peoplehood

*Alexander Yakobson*

Lionel Cohen Lecture

*Patricia Janet Scotland*

A Response to the Review of *The Palestine Question in International Law*

by Robbie Sabel

*Orna Ben-Naftali, Aeyal Gross, & Keren Michaeli*

Rejoinder to Joint Letter of

*Orna Ben-Naftali, Aeyal Gross, and Keren Michaeli*

*Robbie Sabel*

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

---

Volume 43

Number 1

2010

---

---

Introduction

*Yuval Shany and Sir Nigel Rodley* ..... 4

Immigration and the Human Rights Discourse:  
The Universality of Human Rights and the  
Relevance of States and of Numbers

*Ruth Gavison* ..... 7

Minority Rights for Immigrants?  
Multiculturalism versus Antidiscrimination

*Christian Joppke* ..... 49

Citizens' Rights and Human Rights

*Stephen H. Legomsky* ..... 67

Managing Female Foreign Domestic Workers  
in Singapore: Economic Pragmatism,  
Coercive Legal Regulation, or Human Rights?

*Eugene KB Tan* ..... 99

Sovereign States Control of Immigration:  
A Global Justice Perspective

*Yaffa Zilbershats* ..... 126

The Rights Discourse and the Obligation  
of States to Admit Immigrants

*Chaim Gans* ..... 164

Rights in Immigration: The Veil as a Test Case

*Gila Stopler* ..... 183

Joining the Jewish People:  
Non-Jewish Immigrants from the Former USSR,  
Israeli Identity and Jewish Peoplehood

*Alexander Yakobson* ..... 218

Lionel Cohen Lecture

*Patricia Janet Scotland* ..... 240

A Response to the Review of  
*The Palestine Question in International Law*  
by Robbie Sabel

*Orna Ben-Naftali, Aeyal Gross, & Keren Michaeli* ..... 252

Rejoinder to Joint Letter of  
Orna Ben-Naftali, Aeyal Gross, and Keren Michaeli

*Robbie Sabel* ..... 256

# ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

---

---

Volume 43

Number 1

2010

---

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

SIR NIGEL RODLEY      YUVAL SHANY  
*Editors-in-Chief*

CHAIM GANS  
*Guest Editor*

YAËL RONEN  
*Academic Editor*

DANNY EVRON  
*Executive Editor*

MICHELE MANSPEIZER  
*Production Editor*

## STUDENT EDITORS

AVISHAI AZRIEL  
YFAT BARAK  
MENACHEM DANISHEFSKY

RAMON FELDBRIN  
BAT SHEVA KATZ

ADAM SHAMES  
DANA YAFFE  
NOA ZAKIN

## INTERNATIONAL ADVISORY BOARD

- PROF. AHARON BARAK (*President Emeritus Israeli Supreme Court*)  
PROF. DAPHNE BARAK-EREZ (*Tel Aviv University*)  
PROF. ANTONIO CASSESE (*Florence University*)  
PROF. MALCOLM FEELEY (*University of California, Berkeley*)  
PROF. JOCHEN FROWEIN (*Max Planck Institute for Comparative Public Law  
and International Law, Heidelberg*)  
PROF. FRANCOISE HAMPSON (*University of Essex*)  
PROF. VICKI JACKSON (*Georgetown University*)  
PROF. MICHAEL KARAYANNI (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. ECKART KLEIN (*Potsdam University*)  
PROF. MORDECHAI KREMNITZER (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. DAVID KRETZMER (*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*)  
PROF. FIONNUALA NÍ-AOLÁIN (*University of Minnesota and University of Ulster*)  
PROF. FRANCES RADAY (*College of Management Academic Studies, Rishon Le Zion*)  
PROF. WILLIAM SCHABAS (*National University, Ireland*)  
PROF. MALCOLM SHAW (*Leicester University*)  
PROF. HENRY STEINER (*Harvard University*)

## ISRAEL LAW REVIEW

The *Israel Law Review* is the oldest and most acclaimed Israeli law journal published in English. Since its establishment in 1966 by the Law Faculty at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, the *Israel Law Review* has served as a leading source of legal scholarship on Israeli law and on issues relevant to Israeli society.

As of 2009, the *Israel Law Review* is published under the auspices and management of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem's Minerva Center for Human Rights. Under this new stewardship, it focuses on scholarship in the fields of human rights, public law and international law and examines the application of legal norms under conditions of conflict and political uncertainty, highlighting the relevance of the Israeli experience in these fields to other parts of the world and that of other societies to Israel. The *Israel Law Review* is peer-reviewed and presently indexed in major databases and abstracting services including Lexis, Hein, and EBSCO.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the very generous financial assistance provided by the P.E.F. Israel Endowment Funds, in memory of the funds' founder and first president, Judge Julian W. Mack and by the permanent endowment fund established by Abraham D. Slavitt of Norwalk, Connecticut, U.S.A., in memory of his beloved wife, Jennie A. Slavitt. The *Israel Law Review* gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance of the Faculty of Law, the Hebrew University of Jerusalem. The Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem gratefully acknowledges the financial assistance provided by the Minerva Foundation for the publication of the *Israel Law Review*.

## SUBMISSIONS

The *Israel Law Review* accepts unsolicited articles for submission. Please follow the submission guidelines available at <http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=741&in=735>.

## SUBSCRIPTION

The *Israel Law Review* is issued three times annually. The annual subscription price is \$65 USD (inclusive of shipment by airmail).

## DISCLAIMER

The opinions expressed in articles are those of the signed authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Hebrew University of Jerusalem or of the *Israel Law Review*.

## COPYRIGHT

All rights reserved. Permission to reproduce articles should be obtained through the *Israel Law Review*.

## CONTACT

*Israel Law Review*  
The Minerva Center for Human Rights  
Faculty of Law, Hebrew University of Jerusalem  
Mount Scopus, Jerusalem 91905  
Israel  
Tel: +972-2-5881156  
Fax: +972-2-5819371  
[ilr@savion.huji.ac.il](mailto:ilr@savion.huji.ac.il)  
<http://law.huji.ac.il/eng/pirsumim.asp?cat=735>  
ISSN 0021-2237