

(e.g., the numeral МЕОДРЪ 'million,' p. 59) ? One regrets that the funds of the Conseil des Arts du Canada were spent on this flimsy work by the Conseil Canadien de Recherches sur les Humanités.

HORACE G. LUNT  
Harvard University

THE GREEK PROTHETIC VOWEL. By *William F. Wyatt, Jr.* Philological Monographs of the American Philological Association, no. 31. Cleveland: Press of Case Western Reserve University, 1972. xvii, 124 pp. \$10.00.

If, like Wyatt, one rejects the notion that PIE possessed laryngeal consonants, he must offer alternative analyses for those phenomena which laryngeals are invoked to explain. This work is an attempt to account for the Greek prothetic vowels as a purely internal Greek matter—in opposition to the now dominant view which holds them to be reflexes of PIE initial laryngeals before consonants.

Any account of the prothetic vowels must account for two facts: (1) not all words with initial resonants in other IE languages show a prothetic vowel in Greek; and (2) the prothetic vowel may be /e/, /o/, or /a/. Wyatt assumes that some initial resonants were devoiced under certain conditions and that, at a later date, the voiced resonants developed a prothetic schwa. Subsequently the voiced and voiceless resonants fell together and the prothetic schwa became /e/, /o/, or /a/ depending on what followed the resonant.

The rules (of which there are sixteen) that describe these developments are ad hoc and artificial. Even Wyatt admits to having difficulty in suggesting a plausible phonetic basis for them. That he can fashion environments at all for his rules is the result, it seems to me, of certain accidental gaps in the Greek lexicon. A telling point against Wyatt's whole position would be a comparison of his ingenious but arbitrary rules with the straightforward ones assumed by the laryngealists to explain the same data. There is no question that the latter is the more elegant solution, and it would seem the more insightful one as well. Also, Wyatt's explanation will only explain the Greek data, whereas the laryngealist position provides insights into such phenomena as compound-lengthening in Sanskrit as well.

The book is interesting and stimulating as a tour de force but, in the end, not very convincing.

DOUGLAS Q. ADAMS  
University of Idaho

## SYMPOSIA

FORSCHUNGEN ZUR OSTEUEOPÄISCHEN GESCHICHTE: WERNER PHILIPP ZUM 65. GEBURTSTAG VON SEINEN SCHÜLERN. Edited by *Klaus Meyer* and *Hans-Joachim Torke*. Osteuropa-Institut an der Freien Universität Berlin, Historische Veröffentlichungen, Herausgegeben von *Mathias Bernath* und *Werner Philipp*, vol. 20. Berlin: In Kommission bei Otto Harrassowitz, Wiesbaden, 1973. 151 pp. Paper.

CONTENTS: Frank Kämpfer, "Nationalheilige in der Geschichte der Serben." Johannes Gertler, "Zur Bedeutung der Kategorien Volk und Nation in den frühen Schriften von