

COLOMBIA: A CHANGING CONTINUITY

AN ANDEAN CITY AT MID-CENTURY: A TRADITIONAL URBAN SOCIETY. By ANDREW HUNTER WHITEFORD. (East Lansing, Mich.: Michigan State University Press, 1977. Pp. 352.)

THE FORGOTTEN ONES: COLOMBIAN COUNTRYMEN IN AN URBAN SETTING. By MICHAEL WHITEFORD. (Gainesville, Fl.: University of Florida Press, 1976. Pp. 139. \$8.50.)

PENTECOSTALISM IN COLOMBIA: BAPTISM BY FIRE AND SPIRIT. By CORNELIA BUTLER FLORA. (Cranbury, N.J.: Associated University Presses, 1976. Pp. 288. \$13.50.)

CAHIERS DU MONDE HISPANIQUE ET LUSO-BRESILIEU (CARAVELLE). Université de Toulouse-Le Mirail, No. 26 (1976). Special issue on Colombia.

The three monographs on a "traditional" city, an unremarkable migrant barrio, and more "Catholic" than Protestant Pentecostals remind us that the most provocative changes may be those that do not occur. Focusing on Colombia, Andrew Whiteford's exploration of social classes and mobility in post-World War II Popayan, son Michael's 1970s followup study of Popayan barrio, Tulcan, and Cornelia Flora's research on Palmira Pentecostals reaffirm the inadequacy of existing models, or, conversely, the obstinate insistence of Latin Americans that their urban, migratory, or even their "born again" experiences be particularly their own. An edition of *Caravelle* presents more of a potpourri with little in common with the above selection except a focus on Colombia.

Containing observations amassed during field researches from 1949 to 1952, Andrew Whiteford's work first appears in print in this 1977 edition. The original monograph has not been updated, but rather included in a Michigan State Latin American Series aimed at resurrecting deserving manuscripts from academic backfiles and presenting them as "benchmark" pieces. A quarter-century perspective places this one not only within that first torrent of postwar manuscripts on Colombia (Parsons, Crist, West, Bushnell, Fals-Borda, Ospina Vasquez), but also within tributaries that pivoted researches from rural to urban themes (Nelson 1950a, Whetten, Davis, Lewis), focused attention on local social structures (Beals, Hawthorn, Hayner), and prompted a particular quest for an elusive "middle class" (Nelson 1950b, Germani, Lopez de Mesa, Smith). *An Andean City* shares, if not blood, at least ritual kinship ties with such North American classics as *Yankee City* and *Middletown*, which influenced its organization and themes (division into upper, middle, lower classes with tripartite divisions within each; focus on inter- and intra-class relationships and on mobility); and it also reflects Robert Redfield's influence in its promised use of comparative urban research to measure change. Although Whiteford abandoned an original plan to follow this Popayan study with fieldwork in nearby industrializing Cali, he did employ such a comparative focus (Popayan, Colombia; Querétaro, Mexico) in his later *Two Cities of Latin America* (Whiteford 1960).

Whiteford takes a certain atavistic delight in proposing that Popayan, a nonindustrial, isolated municipio (population 44,388, 1951), rather than burgeoning Cali, Medellín, or Bogotá, represents the “quintessence of Latin American urbanism” (p. 8). His suggestion is still provocative, if not in the way originally intended by the author. He saw in the Popayan of colonial architecture, unhurried streets, measured lifestyle, distanced yet intimate class relationships, the essence of a particularly Latin American experience, a real “culture” deep-rooted in the past, and yet possibly fragile in withstanding the Coca-Colazation to come. With premature nostalgia, and a Freyre-like pen, Whiteford captures the posturing of the Coca-Colas (Yankee imitators), the parading of the sport queen, the etiquette of the *cargueros*, the ritual of the *paseo*, and finds, in the changing ingredients of the *sancocho*, or typical Colombian stew, an index to the rise and fall of a family’s fortune. The author does have blind spots—a rather uncritical view of Popayan’s aristocracy (the Mosqueras, Arboledas, and Caicedos certainly ranked their family fortunes at least equal to any regional or national interest, p. 32) and also of (then) contemporary events (the *violencia*, in full swing during Whiteford’s field research, rates nary a mention). Still, this monograph captures one Colombian city at mid-century and provides a benchmark to as much a durable as a changing reality.

The Forgotten Ones not only continues a tradition of Whiteford family interest in Popayan, but it belongs to a second generation of urban research as well. Alfonso Lopez, the “lower-class” neighborhood portrayed in Whiteford’s Popayan, has, by the 1970s, been surrounded by more recent settlements, including the barrio, Tulcan. To travel from Andrew Whiteford’s Alfonso Lopez to Whiteford the younger’s Tulcan is to note major differences in focus (from a holistic treatment of the city to a restricted study of one barrio), in technique (from impressionistic observations and random interviews, to a detailed house-by-house census and extensive interviews), and in theoretical orientation (from reliance on the United States to utilization of comparative South American models). But the trip, in the final analysis, is short.

While *An Andean City* studied aspects of “being urban” in the fifties, *The Forgotten Ones* explores the process of “becoming urban” in the seventies. In following what has become a type—the Latin-American-migrant-monograph (Butterworth, Reina, Ugalde, Kemper, among others)—Michael Whiteford proves there is certain, if limited, virtue in the well-beaten path. He asks some conventional questions: Where do migrants originate? Why do they choose Popayan? How have they adjusted to life in Tulcan? The particular merit in such an exercise, or so the author affirms, is to determine if these newcomers to Popayan, choosers of this now medium-sized (77,000 pop. 1970), rather stagnant regional center, vary much from the more extensively studied migrants to national capitals (Bogotá, Mexico City) or to industrial enclaves (Monterrey, Medellín). The answer: mostly no. Tulcanese leave the countryside due to population pressure on the land, have not sought the city as relief from rural unrest (even the *violencia*), and desire employment, better education, and health facilities. While some come directly from the countryside, others follow a step-pattern, and others are refugees from large Colombian cities. Tulcanese experience

but minor adjustments to life in the urban barrio. If anything distinguishes the Tulcan as opposed to his Bogotá or Monterrey counterpart, it is his fatalistic, yet rather pragmatic conviction that if un- or underemployment is to be a familiar feature of his life, a locale such as Popayan better combines the advantages of a city without adding the headaches of a megalopolis.

While the experience of Tulcan's migrants locate them within the mainstream of an urbanizing Colombia, Palmira's Pentecostals find themselves marked as Protestant aliens by a dominant Catholic culture. Cornelia Flora's *Pentecostalism in Colombia* explores the nature of this deviance. Mindful of Max Weber's classic linkage of Western Europe's Protestant-Entrepreneurs, and of both supporting and contradictory literature on Latin American sects (Lalive, Willems), Flora uses data collected in questionnaire surveys of Pentecostal pastors and leaders, and interviews with converts and nonconverts of similar socio-economic levels to examine Pentecostalism as institution, value system, and catalyst for change.

Contrary to the Weberian paradigm, Flora finds that Palmira's Pentecostals cannot be identified as "agents" of change. Indeed, they cannot be distinguished from their lower-class Catholic counterparts. Nor does conversion breed entrepreneurs. Although a modified asceticism, more accurately a lack of conspicuous consumption, is a Pentecostal characteristic, this meager differential in capital accumulation forms no significant base for entrepreneurial activities. Rather, Colombian Pentecostalism functions less as a catalytic changer of value systems or promoter of economic activities than as a provider of a religiously based extended kinship grouping, which, since it is subjected to continual attacks from the Catholic establishment, operates as a mutual defense network providing not only physical, but emotional and financial security to its members. The author foresees no aggressive role for Pentecostalism as a change-producing institution, although she does see churches functioning as nuclei for other more activist-oriented movements. Pentecostals, for example, were active supporters of Rojas Pinilla.

Of these three monographs, Flora's treatment is by far the most ambitious, the most conceptually and statistically sophisticated, and the most flawed. In her attempt to locate Pentecostals within Colombia's religious and political milieu, the author makes suspect generalizations. To assert that "prelates more often than royal officials exercised political control" (p. 77), is to misread colonial church-state relations, and to carry this conception into the modern period is to err twice. The complexities that unite and divide Colombia's Liberals and Conservatives could confound the most knowledgeable observer, but they clearly transcend such simplistic divisions as (Conservative) support for unitary government, the Church, and landowners and (Liberal) advocacy of federalism, secularism, and laissez-faire (p. 78). (Safford, and Bergquist provide more satisfying analyses.) For these reasons Flora's attempts to gauge the differential growth and role of Pentecostals in Liberal and Conservative municipios falls short of the mark. A consideration of some other variables (mountain versus valley settlements) or of other sites (Bogotá or Antioquia) might have provoked altered conclusions. Still this monograph pioneers, and deserves serious consideration.

Such is not true for the last collection of articles that appeared in a 1976 special edition of *Caravelle* (*Cahiers du Monde Hispanique et Luso-Bresilien*) dedicated to Colombia. Given the consistently high standard of some French, Colombian, and United States researchers, it is regrettable that the editors chose such mediocre samples. The introductory article, on the impact of the New Laws in mid-sixteenth century New Granada (1543–64) sets the tone: Tomas Gomez compares the printed New Laws with Juan Friede's collection of unedited documents in a shallowly researched, unanalytical piece. Other selections include a previously unpublished travel account of a trip from Cumana to Bogotá in 1749, a basic survey of Colombian urbanization, a meagerly researched and unfootnoted article on the Colombian army, and, by far the best of the lot, William McGreevey repeating in French the basic argument of his *Economic History of Colombia* (McGreevey). Better to concentrate on fifties nostalgia, ordinary migrants, or Catholic Pentecostals than to trek to the library for this unremarkable volume.

ANN TWINAM
University of Cincinnati

REFERENCES

- BEALS, RALPH L.
1953 "Social Stratification in Latin America." *American Journal of Sociology* 58:327–39.
- BERGQUIST, CHARLES
1976 "The Political Economy of the Colombian Presidential Election of 1897." *Hispanic American Historical Review* 56:1–30.
- BUSHNELL, DAVID
1954 *The Santander Regime in Gran Colombia*. Newark: University of Delaware Press.
- BUTTERWORTH, DOUGLAS
1962 "A Study of the Urbanization Process among Mixtec Migrants from Tilantongo in Mexico City." *América Indígena* 22:257–74.
- CRIST, RAYMOND D.
1952 *The Cauca Valley, Colombia: Land Tenure and Land Use*. Baltimore: Waverly Press.
- DAVIS, KINGSLEY and CASIS, ANA
1946 "Urbanization in Latin America." *The Milbank Memorial Fund Quarterly* 24:186–207.
- FALS-BORDA, ORLANDO
1955 *Peasant Society in the Colombian Andes: A Sociological Study of Saucio*. Gainesville: University of Florida Press.
- GERMANI, GINO
1950 *La clase media en la Argentina con especial referencia a sus sectores urbanos*. Vol. 1. Edited by Theo R. Crevenna. In *Publicaciones de la Oficina de Ciencias Sociales*. Washington, D.C.: Unión Panamericana.
- HAWTHORN H. B. and HAWTHORN, A. E.
1948 "Stratification in a Latin American City." *Social Forces* 27:19–29.
- HAYNER, N. S.
1948 "Differential Social Change in a Mexican Town." *Social Forces* 26:381–90.
- KEMPER, ROBERT
1974 "Tzintzuntzenos in Mexico City: The Anthropologist among Peasant Migrants." In *Anthropologists in Cities*. Edited by G. M. Foster and R. V. Kemper. Boston: Little, Brown.

LALIVE D'EPINAY, CHRISTIAN

1968 *El refugio de las masas: estudio sociológico de protestantismo chileno*. Santiago, Chile: Editorial del Pacífico, S. A.

LEWIS, OSCAR

1952 "Urbanization without Breakdown: A Case Study." *The Scientific Monthly* 31:31–41.

LOPEZ DE MESA, LUIS

1952 "Notas sobre la clase media en Colombia." *Ciencias Sociales* 3:122–28.

MCGREEVEY, WILLIAM PAUL

1971 *An Economic History of Colombia: 1845–1930*. London: Cambridge University Press.

NELSON, LOWRY

1950a *Rural Cuba*. Minneapolis, Minn.: University of Minnesota Press.

1950b "The Social Class Structure of Cuba." In *Materiales para el estudio de la clase media en la América Latina*. Vol. 2. Edited by Theo R. Crevenna. In *Publicaciones de la Oficina de Ciencias Sociales*. Washington, D.C.: Unión Panamericana.

OSPINA VASQUEZ, LUIS

1955 *Industria y protección en Colombia, 1810–1930*. Medellín, Colombia: Editorial Santa Fe.

PARSONS, JAMES J.

1949 *Antioqueño Colonization in Western Colombia*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

REINA, RUBEN E.

1973 *Parana: Social Boundaries in an Argentine City*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

SAFFORD, FRANK

1974 "Bases of Political Alignment in Early Republican Spanish America." In *New Approaches to Latin American History*. Edited by Richard Graham and Peter H. Smith. Austin: University of Texas Press.

SMITH, T. LYNN

1950 "Observations on the Middle Classes in Colombia." In *Materiales para el estudio de la clase media en América Latina*. Vol. 1. Edited by Theo R. Crevenna. In *Publicaciones de la Oficina de Ciencias Sociales*. Washington, D.C.: Unión Panamericana.

UGALDE, ANTONIO

1974 *The Urbanization Process of a Poor Mexican Neighborhood*. Austin: University of Texas Press.

WEST, ROBERT C.

1952 *Colonial Placer Mining in Colombia*. Baton Rouge, La.: University of Louisiana Press.

WHETTEN, NATHAN

1948 *Rural Mexico*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

WHITEFORD, ANDREW H.

1960 *Two Cities of Latin America: A Comparative Description of Social Classes*. Beloit, Wisconsin: Logan Museum Publications in Anthropology. No. 19.

WILLEMS, EMILIO

1967 *Followers of the New Faith: Cultural Change and the Rise of Protestantism in Brazil and Chile*. Nashville, Tenn.: Vanderbilt University Press.