THE BULLETIN OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC

Edited by

Frank Wagner, *Managing Editor*

Laurent Bienvenu
Patricia Blanchette
Andrea Cantini
Thierry Coquand
James Cummings
Paola D'Aquino
Leonid Libkin

Reviews Editors

Ernest Schimmerling, *Managing Editor for Reviews*

Mark van Atten
Benno van den Berg
Thomas Colcombet
Samuel Coskey
Bradd Hart
Steffen Lempp
Bernard Linsky
Antonio Montalbán
Rahim Moosa
Christian Retoré

Thesis Abstracts Editor

Christian Rosendal

VOLUME 24 • NUMBER 4 • DECEMBER 2018 • ISSN 1079-8986

Copyright © 2018 by the Association for Symbolic Logic. All rights reserved.
Reproduction by photostat, photo-print, microfilm, or like process by permission only.

PUBLISHED BY CAMBRIDGE UNIVERSITY PRESS FOR
AND ON BEHALF OF THE ASSOCIATION OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC.

https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.89 Published online by Cambridge University Press

The BULLETIN, the JOURNAL and the REVIEW OF SYMBOLIC LOGIC are the official organs of the Association for Symbolic Logic, an international organization for furthering research in logic and the exchange of ideas among mathematicians, computer scientists, linguists, and others interested in this field. The BULLETIN encourages submissions of *Articles* and *Communications* in all areas of logic, including mathematical or philosophical logic, logic in computer science or linguistics, the history or philosophy of logic, and applications of logic to other fields. It also encourages the submissions of abstracts for doctoral level theses in logic.The BULLETIN also publishes reviews of publications in logic.

Editors
Frank Wagner (Managing Editor), Insitut Camille Jordan, UMR 5208, Bâtiment Braconnier, Université Lyon 1, 21, avenue Claude Bernard, 69622 Villeurbanne Cedex, France
wagner@math.univ-lyon1.fr
Laurent Bienvenu, LIAFA, Université Paris Diderot - Paris 7 - Case 7014, 75205 Paris Cedex 13, France
laurent.bienvenu@computability.fr
Patricia Blanchette, Department of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame, 100 Malloy Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556, USA
blanchette.1@nd.edu
Andrea Cantini, Department of Philosophy, Università degli Studi di Firenze, Via Bolognese 52, I-50139 Firenze, Italy
cantini@unifi.it
Thierry Coquand, University of Gothenburg, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, SE–4196 Gothenburg, Sweden
Thierry.Coquand@gu.se
James Cummings, Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Wean Hall 6113, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA
jcumming@andrew.cmu.edu
Paola D'Aquino, Department of Mathematics and Physics, Universita' della Campania "L. Vanvitelli", viale Lincoln 5, Caserta 81100, Italy
paola.daquino@unia2.it
Leonid Libkin, Laboratory for Foundations of Computer Science, University of Edinburgh, Informatics Forum, IF 5.33, Crichton Street, Edinburgh, EH8 9AB, UK
libkin@inf.ed.ac.uk

Reviews editors
Ernest Schimmerling (Managing Editor), Department of Mathematical Sciences, Carnegie Mellon University, Pittsburgh, PA 15213, USA, eschimme@andrew.cmu.edu
Mark van Atten mark.vanatten@univ-paris1.fr,
Benno van den Berg bennovdberg@gmail.com,
Thomas Colcombet thomas.colcombet@liafa.univ-paris-diderot.fr,
Samuel Coskey scoskey@boisestate.edu,
Bradd Hart hartb@mcmaster.ca, Steffen Lempp lempp@math.wisc.edu,
Bernard Linsky bernard.linsky@ualberta.ca, Antonio Montalbán antonio@math.berkeley.edu,
Rahim Moosa rmoosa@uwaterloo.ca, and Christian Retoré christian.retore@lirmm.fr.

Thesis abstracts editor
Christian Rosendal rosendal@math.uic.edu

Articles present topics of broad interest in a way that is accessible to a large audience. They can be purely expository, survey, or historical articles or they may contain, in addition, new ideas or results or new approaches to old ones.

Communications should be announcements of important new results and ideas in any aspect of logic; they may be short papers in their final form or preliminary announcements (extended abstracts, position papers) of longer, full papers that will be published elsewhere. In any case, they should include, in addition to a description of the new results or ideas, enough history, background, and explanation to make the significance of the work apparent to a wide audience. *Communications* will be quickly refereed and published within six months of the submission of final version.

To submit *Articles* or *Communications* please follow the procedure described at http://www.aslonline.org/journals-bulletin-guide.html

To submit *Thesis Abstracts* please follow the procedure described at http://aslonline.org/LogicThesisAbstracts.html

Books for review in the BULLETIN should be sent to **ASL, Department of Mathematics, University of Connecticut, 341 Mansfield Road, U-1009, Storrs, CT 06269-1009, USA.**

https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.89 Published online by Cambridge University Press

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLE

Cantorian set theory, by ALEX OLIVER AND TIMOTHY SMILEY 393

REVIEWS

Andrew Marks and Spencer Unger, *Borel circle squaring,*
Reviewed by ALEKSANDRA KWIATKOWSKA.....452

THESIS ABSTRACTS

Will Boney, *Advances in Classification Theory for Abstract Elementary Classes,*
Carnegie Mellon University, 2014. Supervised by Rami Grossberg 454
Tomás Ibarlucía, *Model Theory Methods for Topological Groups,*
Université de Lyon, 2016. Supervised by Itaï Ben Yaacov 455
Marios Koulakis, *Coding into Inner Models at the Level of Strong*
Cardinals, University of Münster, 2015. Supervised by Ralf Schindler 456
Dominik Thomas Adolf, *On the Strength of PFA($\aleph_2$) in Conjunction with a*
Precipitous Ideal on ω_1 and Namba-Like Forcings on Successors of Regular
Cardinals, WWU Muenster, 2013. Supervised by Ralf Schindler 456
Carolin Antos, *Foundations of Higher-Order Forcing,* University of Vienna,
2015. Supervised by Sy-David Friedman.....457
Anush Tserunyan, *Finite Generators for Countable Group Actions; Finite*
Index Pairs of Equivalence Relations; Complexity Measures for Recursive
Programs, University of California at Los Angeles, 2013. Supervised by
Alexander S. Kechris and Itay Neeman.....457
Joseph Zielinski, *Compact Structures in Descriptive Classification Theory,*
University of Illinois at Chicago, 2016. Supervised by Christian Rosendal 458
Anton Bobkov, *Computations of Vapnik–Chervonenkis Density in Various*
Model- Theoretic Structures, University of California, Los Angeles, 2017.
Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner.....459
Athipat Thamrongthanyalak, *Extensions and Smooth Approximations of*
Definable Functions in O-minimal Structures, University of California,
Los Angeles, 2013. Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner.....459
Erik Walsberg, *Metric Geometry in a Tame Setting,* University of California,
Los Angeles, 2015. Supervised by Matthias Aschenbrenner.....460
Anton Freund, *Type-two well-ordering principles, admissible sets,*
and Π^1_1-comprehension, University of Leeds, UK, 2018. Supervised
by Michael Rathjen 460
Gianluca Paolini, *Independence in Model Theory and Team Semantics,*
University of Helsinki, Finland, 2016. Supervised by Tapani Hyttinen
and Jouko Väänänen.....461
Filippo Calderoni, *A Descriptive View of the Bi-embeddability Relation,*
Università degli Studi di Torino, Italy, 2018. Supervised by
Luca Motto Ros 462

https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.89 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Raphaël Carroy, *Functions of the first Baire class,* Université Paris 7 - Denis Diderot & Université de Lausanne, France, 2013. Supervised by Olivier Finkel & Jacques Duparc 462
Evandro Luís Gomes, *Sobre a história da paraconsistência e a obra de da Costa: a instauração da Lógica Paraconsistente* [*On the history of paraconsistency and da Costa's work: the establishment of paraconsistent logic*]. (*December, 2013*). *535p + appendixes*. Philosophy Ph.D., Institute of Philosophy and Human Sciences and Centre for Logic, Epistemology and the History of Sciences, The University of Campinas, Campinas, São Paulo, Brazil, 2013. Supervised by Itala M. Loffredo D'Ottaviano 464
Matthew Harrison-Trainor, *The Complexity of Countable Structures,* University of California, Berkeley, CA, USA, 2017. Supervised by Antonio Montalbán 465

Fifteenth Asian Logic Conference, An Official Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, National Institute for Mathematical Sciences, Daejeon, South Korea, July 10–14, 2017 467
2017–2018 Winter Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, San Diego Convention Center and Marriott Marquis San Diego Marina, San Diego, CA, January 12–13, 2018 484
2018 North American Annual Meeting of the Association for Symbolic Logic, Western Illinois University, Macomb, IL, USA, May 16–19, 2018 493
13th Computability in Europe Conference (CIE 2017) Unveiling Dynamics and Complexity, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Turku, Finland, June 12–16, 2017 526
VIII Conference and III School on Topology, Algebra, and Categories in Logic (TACL), 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Prague and Olomouc, Czech Republic, June 20–30, 2017 527
Model Theory in Wrocław 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Wrocław, Poland, 30 June–2 July, 2017 529
Model Theory, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Będlewo, Poland, July 2–8, 2017 530
29th European Summer School, In Logic, Language, and Information, (ESSLLI 2017), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Toulouse, France, July 17–28, 2017 532
Hilbert–Bernays Summer School on Logic and Computation 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Göttingen, Germany, July 23–29, 2017 534
14th International Conference on Computability and Complexity in Analysis, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Daejeon, Republic of Korea, July 24–27, 2017 535
Model Theory of Operator Algebras: Workshop and Conference, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Irvine, California, September 20–24, 2017 536
Tableaux 2017 / Frocos 2017 / ITP 2017, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Brasilia, Brazil, September 25–29, 2017 537
Trimester on Model Theory, Combinatorics, and Valued Fields, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Institut Henri Poincaré, Paris, France, January 8–April 6, 2018 539
Logical Foundations of Computer Science 2018, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Deerfield Beach, Florida, USA, January 8–11, 2018 543

https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.89 Published online by Cambridge University Press

Ouroboros: Workshop on Formal Criteria of Self-Reference in Mathematics and Philosophy, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Bonn, Germany, February 16–18, 2018 544
Workshop on Computability Theory and Its Applications 2018, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Waterloo, Canada, June 4–8, 2018 546
The Tenth Scandinavian Logic Symposium (SLS 2018), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Gothenburg, Sweden, June 11–13, 2018 547
25th Workshop on Logic, Language, Information, and Computation (WOLLIC 2018), Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Bogotá, Colombia, July 24–27, 2018 548
CIE 2018: Sailing Routes in the World of Computation, Co-Sponsored by the Association for Symbolic Logic, Kiel, Germany, July 31–August 3, 2018 550
Association for Symbolic Logic 551
Notices 557

https://doi.org/10.1017/bsl.2018.89 Published online by Cambridge University Press