



ASSER PRESS

# Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2013

Crisis and International Law:  
Decoy or Catalyst?



Springer

# **Netherlands Yearbook of International Law**

Volume 44

For further volumes:  
<http://www.springer.com/series/8913>

Mielle K. Bulterman · Willem J.M. van Genugten  
Volume Editors

# Netherlands Yearbook of International Law 2013

Crisis and International Law:  
Decoy or Catalyst?



ASSER PRESS

CAMBRIDGE  
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Springer

*Volume Editors*

Mielle K. Bulterman  
Legal Affairs Department  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs  
The Hague  
The Netherlands

Willem J.M. van Genugten  
Tilburg Law School  
University of Tilburg  
Tilburg  
The Netherlands

ISSN 0167-6768

ISBN 978-94-6265-010-7

DOI 10.1007/978-94-6265-011-4

ISSN 1574-0951 (electronic)

ISBN 978-94-6265-011-4 (eBook)

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2014

Library of Congress Control Number: 72-623109

This Volume is also available as a journal product, either as part of the subscription to Volume 60 of the Netherlands International Law Review, or as a stand-alone journal, both through Cambridge University Press. In addition to the electronic version published on <http://www.springerlink>, the Yearbook is also available online through the Cambridge Journals Online service.

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands [www.asserpress.nl](http://www.asserpress.nl)  
Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Board of Editors

## Netherlands Yearbook of International Law

*F. Amtenbrink*  
Erasmus University Rotterdam

*J.E. Nijman*  
University of Amsterdam

*M.K. Bulterman*  
Ministry of Foreign Affairs

*W.G. Werner*  
VU University, Amsterdam

*W.J.M. van Genugten*  
(General Editor)  
Tilburg University

*R.A. Wessel*  
(General Editor)  
University of Twente

*H.G. van der Wilt*  
University of Amsterdam

### Managing Editor

*M. Ambrus*  
Faculty of Law  
University of Groningen  
Oude Kijk in 't Jatstraat 26  
9712 EK Groningen  
The Netherlands

## Aims and Scope

The Netherlands Yearbook of International Law (NYIL) was first published in 1970. It offers a forum for the publication of scholarly articles in the area of public international law including the law of the European Union. In addition, each Yearbook includes a section *Dutch Practice in International Law*. The NYIL is published under the auspices of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut.

## T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Located in the ‘international zone’ of The Hague—the City of Justice, Peace and Security, The T.M.C. Asser Instituut is a leading, inter-university research institute operating in the broad field of international law.

Founded in 1965, the Institute’s international community of scholars is engaged in research, postgraduate training and dissemination of knowledge in furtherance of the purposes and principles of international law. This inter-university institute cooperates closely with and supports the Dutch universities’ activities in the relevant disciplines. The academic fields covered by the Institute are Private International Law, Public International Law, Law of the European Union, International Commercial Arbitration, International Humanitarian Law, International Criminal Law and International Sports Law.

The Institute enjoys an excellent reputation at national and international level for its development, organisation and hosting of conferences and academic meetings, demand-driven postgraduate programmes and training. Its ancillary websites and data collections all contribute to a coherent and integral strategy in the area of knowledge transfer.

The Institute has its own publishing house, T.M.C. Asser Press. The T.M.C. Asser Press not only serves the publishing needs of the T.M.C. Asser Instituut, but also those of academics and practitioners worldwide in the fields of International and European Law.

T.M.C. Asser Instituut

Institute for Private and Public International Law

International Commercial Arbitration and European Law

Institute Address:

R.J. Schimmelpennincklaan 20–22

2517 JN, The Hague

The Netherlands

Mailing Address:

P.O. Box 30461

2500 GL The Hague

The Netherlands

Tel.: +3170 342 0300

Fax: +3170 342 0359

Email: NYIL@asser.nl

Internet: www.asser.nl

# Contents

## Part I Crisis and International Law: Decoy or Catalyst?

<b>1 Crises: Concern and Fuel for International Law and International Lawyers</b> . . . . .	3
Willem van Genugten and Mielle Bulterman	
1.1 Introduction . . . . .	4
1.2 Overview of the Chapters . . . . .	5
1.3 Highlighting Issues of General Concern and Interest. . . . .	10
1.3.1 The Role of Crises in Developing International Law . . . . .	10
1.3.2 Do We Do the Things Right or Do We Do the Right Things?. . . . .	13
1.3.3 Reconsidering and Sharpening Compliance . . . . .	14
1.3.4 The Role of International Lawyers . . . . .	17
References . . . . .	18
<b>2 The Crisis and the Quotidian in International Human Rights Law</b> . . . . .	19
Benjamin Authers and Hilary Charlesworth	
2.1 Introduction . . . . .	20
2.2 What is a Crisis? . . . . .	21
2.3 The Crises of International Human Rights Law . . . . .	24
2.3.1 Crisis as Catalyst . . . . .	25
2.3.2 Crisis as Distraction . . . . .	28
2.4 A Crisis-Driven Distinction Between Rights . . . . .	30
2.5 Conclusion. . . . .	37
References . . . . .	38
<b>3 The Crisis of International Human Rights Law in the Global Market Economy</b> . . . . .	41
Daniel Augenstein	
3.1 Human Rights and Business. . . . .	42
3.2 The International Legal Order of States and the Challenge of Corporate Power. . . . .	44

3.3	Bhopal . . . . .	48
3.4	The 'Escape' into Tort . . . . .	51
3.5	The Turn to Governance . . . . .	55
3.6	International Human Rights Law at the Crossroads. . . . .	59
	References . . . . .	63
<b>4</b>	<b>International Refugees and Irregular Migrants: Caught in the Mundane Shadow of Crisis . . . . .</b>	<b>65</b>
	Juan M. Amaya-Castro	
4.1	Introduction: The Crisis-Mundane Distinction . . . . .	66
4.2	The Refugee Crisis: The Legal Limbo of the Refugee and the Normalization of the Camp . . . . .	69
4.2.1	Refugee Law: A Discipline of Crisis, a Discipline in Crisis . . . . .	69
4.2.2	The Temporary Nature of the Refugee . . . . .	71
4.3	Irregular Migration: Cracking the Black Box of Sovereignty . . . . .	77
4.4	Beyond the Crisis/Mundane Distinction? . . . . .	84
	References . . . . .	86
<b>5</b>	<b>Saving Humanity from Hell: International Criminal Law and Permanent Crisis . . . . .</b>	<b>89</b>
	Edwin Bikundo	
5.1	Between Utopia and Dystopia . . . . .	90
5.2	International Criminal Law: A Discipline of and for Crisis . . . . .	92
5.3	Getting to and from 'twas never thus' to 'twas ever thus' . . . . .	97
5.4	UNSC as a Force Arresting Catastrophe . . . . .	101
5.5	Conclusion: Real Versus Official Crises . . . . .	107
	References . . . . .	108
<b>6</b>	<b>Warming to Crisis: The Climate Change Law of Unintended Opportunity . . . . .</b>	<b>111</b>
	Tomer Broude	
6.1	Introduction . . . . .	112
6.2	Crisis? What Crisis? . . . . .	113
6.2.1	Reflecting on Crisis and its Models . . . . .	113
6.2.2	Climate Change: A Different Kind of Crisis? . . . . .	115
6.2.3	Crisis, Failure and the Birth of the New . . . . .	117
6.3	The Construction of Climate Crisis Framing and its Rhetoric . . . . .	118
6.3.1	The Roots of Climate Crisis Framing . . . . .	118
6.3.2	Climate Crisis Framing in Negotiations. . . . .	119
6.3.3	Climate Crisis Framing in Academia and Civil Society . . . . .	121
6.3.4	Climate Crisis Framing and Lawyers . . . . .	122



6.4	The ‘Technical Limitations’ of Climate Crisis Framing. . . . .	123
6.4.1	International Lawyers and the Scientific Debate. . . . .	123
6.4.2	Analytic Progress Despite Crisis Framing: The Micro and Macro . . . . .	125
6.4.3	Thickness, Depth and the Overreach of Crisis Framing . . . . .	126
6.5	The ‘Ethical Limitations’ of Climate Crisis Framing. . . . .	128
6.5.1	An Increasingly Broad, Not Narrow, Climate Agenda for International Law . . . . .	128
6.5.2	Which ‘Heroic Mission’? What Silences? . . . . .	131
6.5.3	The Unrestricted Substance of International Climate Change Law: From Multilateralism to Multilevel Engagement . . . . .	132
6.6	Conclusion: Crisis and the Opportunities of International Law . . . . .	134
	References . . . . .	136
<b>7</b>	<b>Between Crisis and Complacency: Seeking Commitment in International Environmental Law . . . . .</b>	<b>139</b>
	Karin Mickelson	
7.1	Introduction . . . . .	140
7.2	Crisis in International Environmental Law and Policy. . . . .	141
7.2.1	The Use (and Abuse) of Crisis in Environmentalism. . . . .	141
7.2.2	Differing Perspectives on Environmental Crisis . . . . .	143
7.2.3	From Crisis to Sustainability . . . . .	146
7.3	Crisis and Specific International Environmental Regimes . . . . .	148
7.3.1	The Case of Ozone. . . . .	148
7.3.2	The Contrast with Climate Change and Other Environmental Problems . . . . .	149
7.3.3	Accounting for the Difference: Downs and the Issue Attention Cycle . . . . .	153
7.4	Crisis and Commitment. . . . .	155
	References . . . . .	158
<b>8</b>	<b>The WTO and the Doha Negotiation in Crisis? . . . . .</b>	<b>161</b>
	Alexia Herwig	
8.1	Introduction . . . . .	162
8.2	The Notion of Crisis. . . . .	163
8.3	The WTO in Crisis? . . . . .	165
8.3.1	Development of the Doha Negotiations. . . . .	165
8.3.2	The WTO in a Legitimacy Crisis? . . . . .	167
8.3.3	The DDA Negotiations as the Locus of a Legitimacy Crisis? . . . . .	170

8.4	Consequences of a Perceived Legitimacy Crisis for the Development of Multilateral Trade Liberalisation Law . . . . .	178
8.5	Conclusion: How to Avert a Crisis? . . . . .	182
	References . . . . .	184
<b>9</b>	<b>The EU in Crisis: Crisis Discourse as a Technique of Government . . . . .</b>	<b>187</b>
	Jessica C. Lawrence	
9.1	Introduction . . . . .	188
9.2	Crisis as a Technique of Government . . . . .	190
9.3	The Unexceptional Crisis. . . . .	193
9.4	Crisis and the Production of Truth . . . . .	195
9.5	The Uncertain Effects of Crisis . . . . .	197
9.6	Conclusion: Crisis Discourse as a Technique of EU Government . . . . .	201
	References . . . . .	201
 <b>Part II Dutch Practice in International Law</b>		
<b>10</b>	<b>The Thin Line Between Deference and Indifference: The Supreme Court of The Netherlands and the Iranian Sanctions Case . . . . .</b>	<b>205</b>
	Marjolein Busstra	
10.1	Introduction . . . . .	206
10.2	The European Debate: <i>Kadi</i> Versus <i>Nada</i> . . . . .	207
	10.2.1 The <i>Kadi</i> -Approach of the ECJ: Moderated Dualism. . . . .	207
	10.2.2 The <i>Nada</i> -Approach of the ECtHR: Moderated Monism. . . . .	210
10.3	<i>Kadi</i> and <i>Nada</i> Merged: Position of the Supreme Court of The Netherlands . . . . .	212
10.4	The Supreme Court of The Netherlands as Subsidiary of the European Courts? . . . . .	216
	References . . . . .	219
	<b>Table of Cases. . . . .</b>	<b>221</b>
	<b>Index . . . . .</b>	<b>225</b>