

STUDIES IN
CHURCH HISTORY

VOLUME 32

UNITY AND DIVERSITY
IN THE CHURCH

EDITED BY
R. N. SWANSON

For the Ecclesiastical History Society
BLACKWELL PUBLISHERS

Twentieth century ecclesiastical history has been dominated by the tension between the call for ecumenicity and continuing divisions in doctrine and practice. Yet such debates have been a constant theme in the development of the Christian Church: alongside the history of division has always run the conscious search for reintegration.

The dynamics between unity and diversity are at the heart of this important collection of over thirty original essays by scholars from around the world. Central to the discussions are crucial issues of ecclesiastical identity; the relative priorities of religion and society; and the ways in which competition between interpretations of the Christian message affect relationships both within and between the various branches of the Church. With chronological coverage extending from the fourth to the twentieth centuries and wide geographical scope, the diverse approaches in this book nevertheless offer a coherent focus for debate on this major theme in ecclesiastical history.



UNITY AND DIVERSITY IN THE CHURCH

UNITY AND DIVERSITY IN THE CHURCH

PAPERS READ AT
THE 1994 SUMMER MEETING AND
THE 1995 WINTER MEETING OF
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY

EDITED BY

R. N. SWANSON

PUBLISHED FOR
THE ECCLESIASTICAL HISTORY SOCIETY
BY
BLACKWELL PUBLISHERS LTD
1996

Copyright © Ecclesiastical History Society 1996

First published 1996

2 4 6 8 10 9 7 5 3 1

Blackwell Publishers Ltd
108 Cowley Road
Oxford OX4 1 JF
UK

Blackwell Publishers Inc.
238 Main Street
Cambridge, Massachusetts 02142
USA

All rights reserved. Except for the quotation of short passages for the purposes of criticism and review, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Except in the United States of America, this book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, resold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form of binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data

A CIP catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Ecclesiastical History Society. Summer Meeting (1994: University of Nottingham)
Unity and diversity in the church: papers read at the 1994 Summer Meeting and the 1995
Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society / edited by R. N. Swanson.
540 pp. (Studies in church history; 32)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 0-631-19892-X

1. Church history—Congresses. 2. Church—Unity—History of doctrines—Congresses.
3. Religious pluralism—Christianity—History of doctrines—Congresses.
4. Multiculturalism—Religious aspects—Christianity—History of doctrines—Congresses.
5. Schism—History—Congresses. 6. Christian union—History—Congresses.

I. Swanson, R. N. (Robert Norman) II. Ecclesiastical History Society. Winter Meeting (1995: King's College, London)

III. Title. IV. Series.

BR148.E23 1994

270—dc20

95-33575

CIP

Typeset in 11 on 12 pt Bembo

by Pure Tech India Ltd., Pondicherry

Printed in Great Britain by Hartnolls Limited, Bodmin, Cornwall

This book is printed on acid-free paper

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
List of Contributors	xi
List of Abbreviations	xiv
Introduction	xvii
Unity and Diversity in the Church of the Fourth Century ANDREW LOUTH	1
Unity in Diversity: the Liturgy of Frankish Gaul before the Carolingians YITZHAK HEN	19
Ritual Purity and the Influence of Gregory the Great in the Early Middle Ages ROB MEENS	31
Unity and Diversity in the Early Anglo-Saxon Liturgy CATHERINE CUBITT	45
Unity and Diversity in the Carolingian Church ROSAMOND McKITTERICK	59
Otto III's Penance: a Case Study of Unity and Diversity in the Eleventh-Century Church SARAH HAMILTON	83
Sancho Ramírez and the Roman Rite DAMIAN J. SMITH	95
Was there a 'the Church' in the Middle Ages? GARY MACY	107
The Carmelite Order and Greek Orthodox Monasticism: a Study in Retrospective Unity ANDREW JOTISCHKY	117
Rites and Wrongs: the Latin Mission to Nicaea, 1234 JOHN DORAN	131

CONTENTS

<p>Unity and Diversity: Perceptions of the Papacy in the Later Middle Ages</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">MARGARET HARVEY</p>	<p>145</p>
<p>Continuity and Divergence in Tudor Religion</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">EAMON DUFFY</p>	<p>171</p>
<p>Diversity or Disunity? A Reformation Controversy over Communion in Both Kinds</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">DAVID BAGCHI</p>	<p>207</p>
<p>Unity and Diversity as a Theme in Early Modern Dutch Religious History: an Interpretation</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">JOKE SPAANS</p>	<p>221</p>
<p>Pierre du Moulin's Quest for Protestant Unity, 1613–1618</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">W. B. PATTERSON</p>	<p>235</p>
<p>Arguing for Peace: Giles Firmin on New England and Godly Unity</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">SUSAN HARDMAN MOORE</p>	<p>251</p>
<p>'The Surey Demoniack': Defining Protestantism in 1690s Lancashire</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">JONATHAN WESTAWAY and RICHARD D. HARRISON</p>	<p>263</p>
<p>After the Happy Union: Presbyterians and Independents in the Provinces</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">DAVID L. WYKES</p>	<p>283</p>
<p>Unity, Pluralism, and the Spiritual Market-Place: Interdenominational Competition in the Early American Republic</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">RICHARD CARWARDINE</p>	<p>297</p>
<p>'Friends have no cause to be ashamed of being by others thought non-evangelical': Unity and Diversity of Belief among Early Nineteenth-Century British Quakers</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">SIMON BRIGHT</p>	<p>337</p>
<p>Diversity and Strivings for Unity in the Early Swiss <i>Réveil</i></p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">TIMOTHY C. F. STUNT</p>	<p>351</p>
<p>Unity in Diversity? North Atlantic Evangelical Thought in the Mid-Nineteenth Century</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">JOHN WOLFFE</p>	<p>363</p>

CONTENTS

From Diversity to Sectarianism: the Definition of Anglican Identity in Nineteenth-Century England	377
FRANCES KNIGHT	
The Politics of the Bible: Radicalism and Non-Denominational Co-operation in the Birmingham Political Union	387
EILEEN L. GROTH	
The Reshaping of Christian Tradition: Western Denominational Identity in a Non-Western Context	399
BRIAN STANLEY	
Mother Church and Colonial Daughters: New Scope for Tensions in Anglican Unity and Diversity	427
ROBERT S. M. WITHYCOMBE	
Diversity or Apostasy? The Case of the Japanese 'Hidden Christians'	441
STEPHEN TURNBULL	
Anglican Recognition of Presbyterian Orders: James Cooper and the Precedent of 1610	455
DOUGLAS M. MURRAY	
Unity, Uniformity and Diversity: the Anglican Liturgy in England and the United States, 1900–1940	465
MARTIN DUDLEY	
Ecumenism or Distinctiveness? Seventh-Day Adventist Attitudes to the World Missionary Conference of 1910	477
KEITH A. FRANCIS	
'An artisan of Christian Unity': Sir Frank Willis, Rome and the YMCA	489
CLYDE BINFIELD	
The Unity of the Church in Twentieth-Century England: Pleasing Dream or Common Calling? (<i>Presidential Address</i>)	507
DAVID M. THOMPSON	
Index	533