

# THE AMERICAS



A QUARTERLY REVIEW OF INTER-AMERICAN CULTURAL HISTORY

Volume 66

January 2010

Number 3

## SPECIAL ISSUE: EVANGELIZATION AS PERFORMANCE

**JOHN F. SCHWALLER**

EVANGELIZATION AS PERFORMANCE:

*Making Music, Telling Stories*

**JONATHAN TRUITT**

ADOPTED PEDAGOGIES:

*Nahua Incorporation of European Music  
and Theater in Colonial Mexico City*

**KRISTIN DUTCHER MANN**

CHRISTMAS IN THE MISSIONS OF  
NORTHERN NEW SPAIN

**MARK CHRISTENSEN**

THE TALES OF TWO CULTURES:

*Ecclesiastical Texts and Nahua  
and Maya Catholicisms*

RESEARCH NOTE

**VINCENT PELOSO**

DEPENDENCY, HISTORY, AND SCHOLARSHIP:

*An Interview with Stanley J. Stein*

---

Published by  
Academy of American  
Franciscan History

---

## BOARD OF EDITORS

Jeffrey M. Burns, *Director*  
Academy of American Franciscan History

|                             |                         |                        |
|-----------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|
| <i>Editor</i>               | <i>Associate Editor</i> | <i>Managing Editor</i> |
| ERIC ZOLOV                  | RICHARD WARREN          | DON STEVENS            |
| Franklin & Marshall College | St. Joseph's University | Drexel University      |

*Liaison to the Academy of American Franciscan History*

JOHN F. SCHWALLER  
State University of New York, Potsdam

*Assistant Editors*

|                                |                    |                      |
|--------------------------------|--------------------|----------------------|
| GEORGETTE MAGASSY DORN         | MARY KARASCH       | JAMES M. KRIPPNER    |
| Library of Congress            | Oakland University | Haverford College    |
| JAMES D. RILEY                 | BARBARA A. SOMMER  | BARBARA A. TENENBAUM |
| Catholic University of America | Gettysburg College | Library of Congress  |

BEN VINSON III  
Johns Hopkins University

*Editorial Assistant*

JUSTIN ULMER

---

## AREA EDITORS

|                                     |                                  |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| PETER M. BEATTIE (2012)             | HENDRIK KRAAY (2011)             |
| Michigan State University           | University of Calgary            |
| SARAH C. CHAMBERS (2010)            | ALDO A. LAURIA-SANTIAGO (2012)   |
| University of Minnesota             | Rutgers University               |
| AVIVA CHOMSKY (2012)                | JEFFREY M. PILCHER (2013)        |
| Salem State University              | University of Minnesota          |
| DAVID G. GUTIÉRREZ (2013)           | BIANCA PREMIO (2013)             |
| University of California, San Diego | Florida International University |
| VICTOR URIBE-URÁN (2011)            |                                  |
| Florida International University    |                                  |

---

## SENIOR EDITORS

|   |                                     |
|---|-------------------------------------|
| ROLENA ADORNO (2010)                    | LUIS CARLOS MANTILLA, O.F.M. (2013) |
| Yale University                         | Universidad de San Buenaventura     |
| ARNOLD J. BAUER (2011)                  | CHERYL MARTIN (2015)                |
| University of California, Davis         | University of Texas, El Paso        |
| WILLIAM H. BEEZLEY (2013)               | ALIDA C. METCALF (2015)             |
| University of Arizona                   | Rice University                     |
| MARSHALL EAKIN (2011)                   | FRANCISCO MORALES, O.F.M. (2014)    |
| Vanderbilt University                   | Mexico City, Mexico                 |
| LOWELL GUDMUNDSON (2015)                | SUSAN E. RAMIREZ (2012)             |
| Mount Holyoke College                   | Texas Christian University          |
| LYMAN JOHNSON (2010)                    | STUART B. SCHWARTZ (2014)           |
| University of North Carolina, Charlotte | Yale University                     |

SUSAN SOCOLOW (2013)

Emory University

# THE AMERICAS



A QUARTERLY REVIEW OF INTER-AMERICAN CULTURAL HISTORY

Volume 66

January 2010

Number 3

- 305 EVANGELIZATION AS PERFORMANCE: *Making Music, Telling Stories*  
**JOHN F. SCHWALLER**
- 311 ADOPTED PEDAGOGIES: *Nahua Incorporation of European Music and Theater in Colonial Mexico City*  
**JONATHAN TRUITT**
- 331 CHRISTMAS IN THE MISSIONS OF NORTHERN NEW SPAIN  
**KRISTIN DUTCHER MANN**
- 353 THE TALES OF TWO CULTURES: *Ecclesiastical Texts and Nahua and Maya Catholicisms*  
**MARK Z. CHRISTENSEN**
- 379 DEPENDENCY, HISTORY, AND SCHOLARSHIP: *An Interview with Stanley J. Stein*  
**VINCENT PELOSO**
- 393 REVIEWS



COPYRIGHT © 2010  
ACADEMY OF AMERICAN  
FRANCISCAN HISTORY  
ISSN 0003-1615

## REVIEWS

- 393 Brian A. Nelson: *The Silence and the Scorpion: The Coup Against Chávez and the Making of Modern Venezuela*  
**Judith Ewell**

### ETHNOHISTORY & INDIGENOUS POLITICS

- 395 Guy Stresser-Péan: *The Sun God and the Savior: The Christianization of the Nahua and Totonac in the Sierra Norte de Puebla, Mexico*  
**Ariadna Acevedo-Rodrigo**
- 397 Sara Ortelli: *Trama de una guerra conveniente: Nueva Vizcaya y la sombra de los apaches (1748-1790)*  
**Cynthia Radding**

### FAMILY & GENDER STUDIES

- 398 Matthew Gutmann: *Fixing Men: Sex, Birth Control, and AIDS in Mexico*  
**Anne-Emanuelle Birn**
- 399 Catherine M. Jaffe and Elizabeth Franklin Lewis, eds.: *Eve's Enlightenment: Women's Experience in Spain and Spanish America, 1726-1839*  
**Heather Hennes**
- 401 Stephanie J. Smith: *Gender and the Mexican Revolution: Yucatán Women and the Realities of Patriarchy*  
**Jocelyn Olcott**

### RELIGION & RELIGIOUS PRACTICES

- 403 Hideaki Matsuoka: *Japanese Prayer Below the Equator: How Brazilians Believe in the Church of World Messianity*  
**Dan Masterson**
- 404 Thomas Hart: *The Ancient Spirituality of the Modern Maya*  
**George L. Scheper**
- 405 Edward Wright-Rios: *Revolutions in Mexican Catholicism: Reform and Revelation in Oaxaca, 1887-1934*  
**Brian Connaughton**

### POLITICS & GOVERNANCE

- 407 Susan Buck-Morss: *Hegel, Haiti, and Universal History*  
**Alyssa Goldstein Sepinwall**

- 409 Mark Goodale: *Dilemmas of Modernity: Bolivian Encounters with Law and Liberalism*  
**Andrew Orta**
- 410 Paul D. Almeida: *Waves of Protest: Popular Struggles in El Salvador, 1925-2005*  
**Lawrence Michael Ladutke**
- 412 Diane M. Nelson: *Reckoning: The Ends of War in Guatemala*  
**Robert M. Carmack**
- 413 Matthew J. Smith: *Red and Black in Haiti: Radicalism, Conflict, and Political Change, 1934-1957*  
**Mimi Sheller**

#### LATINO & BORDER STUDIES

- 415 Melanie Shell-Weiss: *Coming to Miami: A Social History*  
**Raymond A. Mohl**

#### CULTURAL & LITERARY STUDIES

- 416 Esther Gabara: *Errant Modernism: The Ethos of Photography in Mexico and Brazil*  
**James Krippner**
- 418 Anne M. Stock: *On Location in Cuba: Street Filmmaking during Times of Transition*  
**John King**
- 420 Mabel Moraña, Enrique Dussel and Carlos C. Jauregui, eds.: *Coloniality at Large: Latin America and the Postcolonial Debate*  
**Fabricio Prado**
- 421 Ramón E. Soto-Crespo: *Mainland Passage: The Cultural Anomaly of Puerto Rico*  
**Jorge Duany**
- 423 Evan R. Ward: *Packaged Vacations: Tourism Development in the Spanish Caribbean*  
**Dina Berger**

#### NATION BUILDING & NATIONALISM

- 425 Severo Martínez Peláez: *La Patria del criollo: An Interpretation of Colonial Guatemala*  
**Douglass Sullivan-González**

## HISTORY OF SCIENCE, MEDICINE & TECHNOLOGY

- 426 Daniela Bleichmar, Paula De Vos, Kristin Huffine and Kevin Sheehan, eds.: *Science in the Spanish and Portuguese Empires, 1500-1800*  
**Marshall C. Eakin**

## ATLANTIC WORLD

- 428 Alejandro de la Fuente: *Havana and the Atlantic in the Sixteenth Century*  
**Linda K. Salvucci**
- 429 Jeremy Adelman: *Sovereignty and Revolution in the Iberian Atlantic*  
**Christon I. Archer**
- 431 Jack P. Greene and Philip D. Morgan, eds.: *Atlantic History: A Critical Reappraisal*  
**Mark D. Szuchman**

(Book Reviews are indexed in BOOK REVIEW INDEX)

Published by  
The Academy of American Franciscan History  
Editor: ERIC ZOLOV

*The Americas* is published quarterly (January, April, July, October). Editorial and Publication offices: 3250-60 Chestnut Street, Room 3025, Drexel University, Philadelphia, PA 19104. Printed by the Sheridan Press, Hanover, Pennsylvania 17331. Articles are indexed in American History and Life, Hispanic American Periodicals Index, Chicano Periodical Index, Humanities Index, Social Sciences Index, Social Science Citation Index, and other major references. Instructions for contributors: You may submit your manuscript via email (americas@drexel.edu) or send three copies to the editorial office at the address noted above (MS Word preferred for all files). All manuscripts should be double-spaced and use end-notes, not footnotes. Preference is for English-language manuscripts no longer than 10,000 words (excluding notes). Manuscripts in Spanish or Portuguese may be considered. Submitted manuscripts should not have been previously published or under simultaneous consideration at another journal or press. All books for review and related correspondence should be sent to the Associate Editor at the editorial office. Subscription requests should be sent to Sheridan Press (address below). Annual rates are: Pan American countries, direct subscription, \$28.00; United States and other countries: Institution, \$105.00; Individual, \$40.00. Student rate, \$25.00 (request must be accompanied by a verification of status signed by a faculty member on departmental stationery). Current single number \$30.00 each; back numbers, \$30.00. Opinions expressed are the responsibility of the contributors. Periodicals postage paid at Hanover, P.A. 17331 and at additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to *The Americas* c/o Sheridan Press, P.O. Box 465, Hanover, PA 17331.

## CONTRIBUTORS

**John F. Schwaller** is Professor of History and President of the State University of New York at Potsdam. He is the author of several books on the Church in sixteenth-century Mexico, a guide to Nahuatl language manuscripts in the United States, and editor of works on the Franciscan Order in the Americas. He is currently finishing a single volume history of the Catholic Church in the Americas. His research includes a biography of don Luis de Velasco, the Younger, and several studies of Nahuatl language works from the colonial period.

**Jonathan Truitt** received his Ph.D. in History at Tulane University. He was an Academy of American Franciscan History fellow for his dissertation entitled, "Nahuas and Catholicism in Mexico Tenochtitlan: Religious Faith and Practice and La Capilla de San Josef de los Naturales, 1523-1700." He is an Assistant Professor of History at Central Michigan University.

**Kristin Dutcher Mann** is Associate Professor of History and Social Studies Education Coordinator at the University of Arkansas at Little Rock. She is the author of *The Power of Song: Music and Dance in the Mission Communities of Northern New Spain, 1590-1810*, published jointly by the Academy of American Franciscan History and Stanford University Press, Forthcoming.

**Mark Z. Christensen** received his Ph.D. from the Pennsylvania State University. His research examines the evangelization of the Nahua and Yucatec Maya through indigenous-language religious texts. Having completed his dissertation "Nahua and Maya Catholicisms: Ecclesiastical Texts and Local Religion in Colonial Central Mexico and Yucatan," he is currently involved in several articles and book projects concerning Nahuatl and Maya religious texts and testaments.

**Vincent Peloso** is Professor of History, Emeritus, at Howard University in Washington, D.C. His article, "Racial Conflict and Identity Crisis in Wartime Peru: Revisiting the Caete Massacre of 1881," appeared in *Social Identities* in September 2005. He is currently at work on two projects related to ethnicity and race in Latin America.



## THE ACADEMY OF AMERICAN FRANCISCAN HISTORY DISSERTATION FELLOWSHIP

The Academy of American Franciscan History is accepting applications for four dissertation fellowships, each worth \$10,000. As many as two of these fellowships will be awarded for projects dealing with some aspect of the history of the Franciscan Family in Latin America, including the United States Borderlands, Mexico, Central and South America. Up to another two fellowships will be awarded to support projects dealing with some aspect of the history of the Franciscan Family in the rest of the United States and Canada.

Projects may deal with any aspect of the history of the Franciscan Family, including any of the branches of the Family, male, female, tertiary, Capuchin, etc. The projects will be evaluated by a selected group of scholars who will make recommendations to the Board of Directors of the Academy. The recipient must be engaged in full-time research during the period of the fellowship. The applicant must be a doctoral candidate at a University in the Americas, and the bulk of the research should be conducted in the Americas.

To apply for a fellowship, please provide a 10-page abstract of the proposed research. This abstract should include the title and principle arguments of the dissertation, a research plan, listing repositories where the research will be conducted, and a time-table outlining all phases of the research up to and including the conclusion and successful defense of the dissertation. The applicant must also provide three letters of support for the project, one of which must be from the chairman of the dissertation committee/major advisor. The deadline for applications will be February 1, 2010. Awards will be announced in April, and may begin as early as May.

As a condition of the fellowship award, the Academy will reserve the right of first refusal to publish any work funded under the provision of this program. The Academy has a fifty-year history of publishing works dealing with the history of the Franciscan Family in the Americas. Any royalties or other considerations resulting from publication will be separate and distinct from the dissertation fellowship.

To apply, or for further information, please address all materials to:

DR. JEFFREY M. BURNS, DIRECTOR  
ACADEMY OF AMERICAN FRANCISCAN HISTORY  
1712 EUCLID AVENUE  
BERKELEY, CA 94709-1208  
ACADAFH@FST.EDU OR 510-548-1755