

VOLUME 72 NUMBER 1

WINTER 2010

The
Review
of
Politics

ARTICLES

Robert S. Taylor, “Kant’s Political Religion: The Transparency of Perpetual Peace and the Highest Good”

Brandon P. Turner, “John Stuart Mill and the Antagonistic Foundation of Liberal Politics”

Paul E. Kirkland, “Nietzsche’s Tragic Realism”

Dean C. Hammer and Michael Kicey, “Simone Weil’s *Iliad*: The Power of Words”

James Gordon Finlayson, “‘Bare Life’ and *Politics* in Agamben’s Reading of Aristotle”

Review Essay: Ralph Lerner, “Northern Lights Over Tocqueville”

THE UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Editor

CATHERINE H. ZUCKERT

Executive Associate Editor

DENNIS WM MORAN

Book Review Editor

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

Assistant Editor

LES HARRIS

Editorial Interns:

Joshua M. Bandoch

Andrew W. Bramsen

Associate Editors

Fred Dallmayr
E.A. Goerner
A. James McAdams

Ruth M. Abbey
Daniel Philpott
James Turner

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian
M.A. Fitzsimons
Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson
Donald P. Kommers
Walter Nicgorski

Editorial Advisory Board

Shlomo Avineri
*Hebrew University of
Jerusalem*

Barry Cooper
University of Calgary

John Dunn
Cambridge University

Jean Bethke Elshtain
University of Chicago

Michael A. Gillespie
Duke University

Leslie Goldstein
University of Delaware

Russel Hittinger
University of Tulsa

Axel Honneth
*Institute for Social Research,
Frankfurt*

Shozo Iijima
*Waseda University,
Tokyo*

Ramin Jahanbegloo
University of Toronto

Pierre Manent
*L'Ecole des Hautes Etudes en
sciences sociales*

Harvey C. Mansfield
Harvard University

Mary Nichols
Baylor University

Bruce M. Russett
Yale University

Arlene Saxonhouse
University of Michigan

Steven B. Smith
Yale University

Peter Steinberger
Reed College

John Witte, Jr.
Emory University

Jean M. Yarbrough
Bowdoin College

Administrative Assistant: Kelli Brown

The Review of Politics publishes primarily philosophical and historical studies of politics, especially those concentrating on political theory and American political thought. The journal also includes thoughtful scholarly reflections on all aspects of politics—including analysis of institutions and techniques, international relations, comparative politics, literary reflections on politics or political interpretations of literary works, constitutional theory and practices.

TABLE OF CONTENTS WINTER 2010

Vol. 72	WINTER 2010	No. 1
<i>Robert S. Taylor</i>		
Kant's Political Religion: The Transparency of Perpetual Peace and the Highest Good		1
<i>Brandon P. Turner</i>		
John Stuart Mill and the Antagonistic Foundation of Liberal Politics		25
<i>Paul E. Kirkland</i>		
Nietzsche's Tragic Realism		55
<i>Dean C. Hammer and Michael Kicey</i>		
Simone Weil's <i>Iliad</i> : The Power of Words		79
<i>James Gordon Finlayson</i>		
"Bare Life" and Politics in Agamben's Reading of Aristotle		97
<i>Review Essay:</i>		
<i>Ralph Lerner</i>		
Northern Lights Over Tocqueville		127
<i>Reviews:</i>		
George Thomas: COMMERCE OF IDEAS IN THE EXTENDED REPUBLIC Review of Colleen A. Sheehan's <i>James Madison and the Spirit of Republican Self-Government</i>		141
Paul O. Carrese: WASHINGTON AS THINKER, AND HARMONIZER OF TRADITIONS Review of Jeffrey H. Morrison's <i>The Political Philosophy of George Washington</i>		143
Eric MacGilvray: RORTY'S SELF-CONCEPTS Review of Neil Gross's <i>Richard Rorty: The Making of an American Philosopher</i>		147
Aurelian Craiutu: THE RETURN OF CONSTANT Review of Helena Rosenblatt's <i>Liberal Values: Benjamin Constant and the Politics of Religion</i>		150

Jason Peters: THE NATURAL IN THE LIGHT OF THE SUPERNATURAL	
Review of Matthew Dickerson and David O'Hara's <i>Narnia and the Fields of Arbol: The Environmental Vision of C. S. Lewis</i>	152
Mark D. Brewer: RELIGIOUS ACTIVISM AND POLITICAL CIVILITY	
Review of Jon A. Shields's <i>The Democratic Virtues of the Christian Right</i>	155
Andrey Kordochkin: FILLING THE GAP	
Review of John and Carol Garrard's <i>Russian Orthodoxy Resurgent: Faith and Power in the New Russia</i>	157
Annika Marlen Hinze: MULTIVALENT SIGNIFICANCES	
Review of Bronwyn Winter's <i>Hijab and the Republic: Uncovering the French Headscarf Debate</i>	159
Theresa Earenfight: THE EMERGENCE OF THE STATE	
Review of Thomas N. Bisson's <i>The Crisis of the Twelfth Century: Power, Lordship, and the Origins of European Government</i>	162
Alexander Green: BETWEEN HISTORY, PHILOSOPHY, AND THE JEWISH TRADITION	
Review of Joel Kraemer's <i>Maimonides: The Life and World of One of Civilization's Greatest Minds</i>	164
Matthew D. Mendham: SYMPATHY FOR SOCIAL JUSTICE	
Review of Sharon R. Krause's <i>Civil Passions: Moral Sentiment and Democratic Deliberation</i>	167
Kenneth C. Blanchard Jr.: IMPOSSIBLE KNOWLEDGE, TRUE OPINION	
Review of Roslyn Weiss's <i>Virtue in the Cave: Moral Inquiry in Plato's Meno</i>	170
Ryan K. Balot: DEMOCRACY'S SELF-QUESTIONING	
Review of Gerald M. Mara's <i>The Civic Conversations of Thucydides and Plato: Classical Political Philosophy and the Limits of Democracy</i>	172
Kent Worcester: LESS REVOLUTIONARY THAN IT SEEMS	
Review of Richard Davis's <i>Typing Politics: The Role of Blogs in American Politics</i> and Matthew Hindman's <i>The Myth of Digital Democracy</i>	175

Sunila S. Kale: INDIA'S POLITICS AND FOREIGN POLICY	
Review of Harsh V. Pant's <i>Contemporary Debates in Indian Foreign and Security Policy: India Negotiates Its Rise in the International System</i>	178
Emily M. Hill: A FULL PORTRAIT	
Review of Jay Taylor's <i>The Generalissimo: Chiang Kai-shek and the Struggle for Modern China</i>	180

CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE

ROBERT S. TAYLOR is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the University of California, Davis. **BRANDON P. TURNER** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at Clemson University. **PAUL E. KIRKLAND** is Assistant Professor of Great Ideas and Political Science at Carthage College. **DEAN C. HAMMER** is The John W. Wetzel Professor of Classics and Professor of Government at Franklin and Marshall College. **MICHAEL KICEY** is a postdoctoral candidate in the Department of Comparative Literature at the University of Michigan. **JAMES GORDON FINLAYSON** is Senior Lecturer in Philosophy at the University of Sussex.

RALPH LERNER is Benjamin Franklin Professor Emeritus in the College of Social Thought at the University of Chicago. **GEORGE THOMAS** is Associate Professor of Government at Claremont McKenna College. **PAUL O. CARRESE** is Professor of Political Science at the United States Air Force Academy. **ERIC MACGILVRAY** is Assistant Professor of Political Science at the Ohio State University. **AURELIAN CRAIUTU** is Associate Professor of Political Science at Indiana University. **JASON PETERS** is Professor of English at Augustana College. **MARK D. BREWER** is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Maine. **ANDREY KORDOCHKIN** is the Dean of the Nativity of Christ Parish in Madrid, Spain. **ANNIKA MARLEN HINZE** is a doctoral candidate at the University of Illinois at Chicago in the Department of Political Science. **THERESA EARENFIGHT** is Associate Professor of History at Seattle University. **ALEXANDER GREEN** is a doctoral candidate at the University of Toronto in the Department of Religion and the Centre for Jewish Studies. **MATTHEW D. MENDHAM** is a doctoral candidate at the University of Notre Dame in the Department of Political Science. **KENNETH C. BLANCHARD JR.** is Professor of Political Science and Philosophy at Northern State University. **RYAN K. BALOT** is Associate Professor of Political Science at the University of Toronto. **KENT WORCESTER** is Associate Professor of

Political Science and International Studies at Marymount Manhattan College. **SUNILA S. KALE** is Assistant Professor at Jackson School of International Studies, University of Washington. **EMILY M. HILL** is Associate Professor in the Department of History at Queen's University, Ontario, Canada.

Subscription Information: *The Review of Politics* (ISSN 0034-6705) is published quarterly in February, May, August and November by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA/The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK for the University of Notre Dame. Annual subscription rates for Volume 72 (2010): Institutional subscription rates, print and online: US \$120.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £68.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, online only: US \$109.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £58.00 + VAT elsewhere. Institutional subscription rates, print only: US \$115.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £62.00 + VAT elsewhere. Individual subscription rates, print only: US \$36.00 in the USA, Canada, and Mexico; UK £18.00 + VAT elsewhere. Correspondence concerning subscriptions should be sent to: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994, USA for customers in the USA, Canada, or Mexico. Customers elsewhere should contact: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

Editorial Office: All correspondence concerning submissions and manuscripts under review should be sent to *The Review of Politics*, University of Notre Dame, 547 Flanner Hall, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Phone: 574-631-6623. Email: ROP.Editor.1@nd.edu. Website: www.nd.edu/~rop

Abstracting and Indexing Information: Articles in *The Review of Politics* are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index; abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts; and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., Historical Abstracts, Social Science Index (also available in the electronic versions), Book Review Index, and International Bibliography of the Social Sciences.

Copyright © 2010 University of Notre Dame. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopy, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press, Rights and Permissions Manager, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 USA. For further information see <http://us.cambridge.org/information/rights/>.

Periodicals postage paid in New York, NY and additional mailing offices. Postmaster: Send address changes to *The Review of Politics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133 USA.

Photocopying information for users in the U.S.A.: the Item-Fee Code for the publication (0034-6705/10 \$9.00 + .10) indicates that copying for internal or personal use beyond that permitted by Sec. 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law is authorized for users duly registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) provided that the appropriate remittance of \$9.00 per article is paid directly to CCC, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923. Specific written permission must be obtained for all other copying.