

VOLUME 21

NUMBER 2

APRIL 2012

CQ

Cambridge

Quarterly of

Healthcare

Ethics

*A Quarterly Journal Devoted to
Engaging a World Community
of Bioethicists*

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS



Cambridge
Quarterly of
Healthcare
Ethics

A Quarterly
Journal Devoted
to Engaging a
World Community
of Bioethicists

EDITORS

Thomasine Kushner, PhD, *University of California, Berkeley*
Steve Heilig, MPH, *San Francisco Medical Society*

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Matti Häyry, *School of Law, University of Manchester, England*
Tuija Takala, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

David C. Thomasma, PhD, Co-Editor, 1992–2002

THE DAVID C. THOMASMA INTERNATIONAL BIOETHICS RETREAT,

<http://www.library.berkeley.edu/~bantton/IBRetreat.html>

EDITORIAL BOARD

Akira Akabayashi, *Kyoto University, Japan*
William Andereck, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Daniel Callahan, *The Hastings Center, Garrison, New York*
Arthur Caplan, *University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia*
Andrew Dobson, *Keele University, England*
Joseph J. Fins, *Division of Medical Ethics, Weill Medical College of Cornell University, New York*
Veronique Fournier, *Center for Clinical Ethics, Cochin Hospital, Paris, France*
Amnon Goldworth, *Stanford University School of Medicine*
Chris Hackler, *Division of Medical Humanities, University of Arkansas Medical School*
John Harris, *University of Manchester, England*
Paul Hofmann, *Hofmann Healthcare Group, Moraga, California*
Albert Jonsen, *Medicine and Human Values, California Pacific Medical Center, San Francisco*
Gerrit K. Kimsma, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Glenn McGee, *Rockefeller Institute of Government, Albany, New York*
Eric M. Meslin, *Indiana University Center for Bioethics, Indianapolis*
Jonathan D. Moreno, *Center for Biomedical Ethics, University of Virginia*
Edmund D. Pellegrino, *Georgetown Center for the Advanced Study of Ethics, Georgetown University*
Rosamond Rhodes, *Mount Sinai School of Medicine, New York*
Gerd Richter, *Philipps University, Marburg, Germany*
Pablo Rodriguez del Pozo, *Weill Medical College of Cornell University in Qatar*
Richard Selzer, *Yale University*
Robyn Shapiro, *Center for the Study of Bioethics, Medical College of Wisconsin*
Pavel Tichtchenko, *Institute of Philosophy, Academy of Science, Moscow, Russia*
Griffin Trotter, *Center for Health Care Ethics, Saint Louis University*
Evert van Leeuwen, *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam*
Baroness Mary Warnock, *Girton College, Cambridge University, England*
Mark R. Wicclair, *West Virginia University & University of Pittsburgh*

EDITORIAL OFFICE: Editorial correspondence, including manuscript submission, should be addressed to Thomasine Kushner, PhD. To facilitate review, please submit manuscripts as electronic copy, preferably in MS Word, to TKushner@aol.com. Books for review should be sent to Greg Loeben, Midwestern University, Glendale Campus, Bioethics Program, 19555 N. 59th Ave., Glendale, AZ 85308.

SUBSCRIPTION INFORMATION: *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* (ISSN 0963-1801) is published quarterly, in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473/Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Annual subscription rates for volume 21 (2012) USA, Canada, and Mexico/Elsewhere: Institutional rates, print and online: \$360/£225; online only: \$300/£188; print only: \$349/£218. Individual rates, print only: \$94/£46. Single part: \$96/£60. Students and retirees: \$87/£54. American Society for Bioethics and Humanities members: Regular: \$72/£44. Student and retiree: \$87/£54. Prices include postage. Subscription offices: Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA; outside the USA, Canada, and Mexico: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK. Claims for missing issues should be made immediately after receipt of the next issue. *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* and other Cambridge journals can be found at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is a partner journal of the American Society for Bioethics and Humanities.

Periodicals postage paid at New York, NY and additional mailing offices. POSTMASTER: Send address changes in the USA, Canada, and Mexico to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, USA. Send address changes elsewhere to *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, UK.

© Cambridge University Press 2012. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics is indexed in Index Medicus and in the ASSIA, ISI, MEDLINE, Philosopher's Index, and Proquest databases.

Permission to copy (for users in the USA) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: info@copyright.com. ISI Tearsheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only. Article reprints are available from the authors. For orders of 50 or more reprints, contact Cambridge University Press.

Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics

Volume 21, Number 2, April 2012

CONTENTS

Contributors 147

Special Section: Kant, Habermas, and Bioethics

Guest Editorial: Bioethics and the Conditions
for Human Agency
VILHJÁLMUR ÁRNASON 150

Responsibilities for Healthcare: Kantian Reflections
GARRATH WILLIAMS AND RUTH CHADWICK 155

The Concept of Autonomy and Its Role in Kantian Ethics
IAIN BRASSINGTON 166

Don't Lie! . . . Why Not? How to Argue for Truthfulness
in Medical Practice
THEDA REHBOCK 177

What Is the Habermasian Perspective in Bioethics?
DARRYL GUNSON 188

Habermas, Human Agency, and Human Genetic Enhancement:
The Grown, the Made, and Responsibility for Actions
PETER HERISSONE-KELLY 200

Protecting Humanity: Habermas and His Critics on the
Ethics of Emerging Biotechnologies
MATTI HÄYRY 211

On Moral Enhancement from a Habermasian Perspective
HANS-JOERG EHNI AND DIANA AURENQUE 223

Bioethics as Science Fiction: Making Sense of Habermas's
The Future of Human Nature
DAVID GURNHAM 235

Departments and Columns

Professionalism
Professionalism Department
MARK WICCLAIR AND DAVID BARNARD 247

When Doctors Break the Rules: On the Ethics of Physician
Noncompliance
JEFFREY BLUSTEIN 249

Contents continued

Contents continued

Bioethics Education

Medical Humanities, Ethics, and Disability: One Fellow's Confession and Transformation	
STEPHANIE M. VERTREES	260
<i>Dissecting Bioethics</i>	
TUIJA TAKALA AND MATTI HÄYRY	
Disgust in Bioethics	
ARLEEN SALLES AND INMACULADA DE MELO-MARTIN	267
<i>Ethics Committees and Consultants at Work</i>	
RUCHIKA MISHRA	
The Case: IVF Treatment for an HIV-Discordant Transgender Couple?	
RUCHIKA MISHRA	281
Commentary: The Questions We Shouldn't Ask	
LANCE WAHLERT AND AUTUMN FIESTER	282
Commentary: Crossing Cultural Divides: Transgender People Who Want to Have Children	
TIMOTHY F. MURPHY	284
Commentary: Transgender People Are Not That Different after All	
SARAH HUNGER	287
What Actually Happened	289