

THE JOURNAL OF THE GILDED AGE AND PROGRESSIVE ERA

VOLUME 20 • NUMBER 2 • APRIL 2021

https://doi.org/10.1017/S153778142000078X Published online by Cambridge University Press





Editors: Boyd Cothran, York University Rosanne Currarino, Queen's University

Book Review Editor: Joseph Locke, University of Houston-Victoria

Editorial Assistant: Peter Rayls, Queen's University

Founding Editor, 2000–2003: Maureen A. Flanagan, Michigan State University

Editor, 2004–2014: Alan Lessoff, Illinois State University

Editors, 2013–2018: Benjamin H. Johnson, Loyola University Chicago

Robert D. Johnston, University of Illinois at Chicago Editors, 2017–2020: Boyd Cothran, York University C. Joseph Genetin-Pilawa, George Mason University

Editorial Board

Jeffery D. Broxmeyer University of Toledo

Cathleen D. Cahill Penn State University

Laura Crossley

George Mason University

Janet Davis

University of Texas-Austin

Gregory P. Downs

University of California-Davis

Joseph M. Gabriel

Florida State University

Iulian Lim

Arizona State University

Adam Hodges

University of Houston-Clear Lake

Alvssa Neumann, ex officio

Suzanna Krivulskaya University of Notre Dame

Augsburg University Beth Lew-Williams Princeton University

Michael Lansing

Rebecca Tinio McKenna University of Notre Dame

Kevin P. Murphy

University of Minnesota, Twin Cities

Elaine Frantz

Kent State University

K. Stephen Prince

University of South Florida

Alaina Roberts

University of Pittsburgh

Cambridge University Press

Articles appearing in this journal are abstracted and indexed in America: History and Life, Historical Abstracts, Scopus, and in the Thompson Reuters Social Sciences Citation Index, Arts & Humanities Citation Index, and Current Contents: Social and Behavioral Sciences.

Instructions appear at the end of this issue for accessing the online edition at Cambridge Journals Online, http://journals.cambridge.org/jga. All content is available from Volume 1, Number 1 through the present. The journal is also archived in JSTOR, www.jstor.org, with issues older than five years available to subscribers of JSTOR's Arts & Sciences V Collection.

Change of Address: Contact alwood@ilstu.edu or go to http://journals.cambridge.org/jga

The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (1537-7814) is a peer-reviewed journal published quarterly in January, April, July, and October by Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006 / Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K., for the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE). It publishes original scholarly essays covering the period 1865 to 1920 and reviews scholarly books on that time period.

Publishing, Advertising, and Subscription Offices: Cambridge University Press, One Liberty Plaza, New York, NY 10006, U.S.A. (for U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico); or Cambridge University Press, Journals Fulfillment Department, UPH, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8BS, U.K. (for U.K. and elsewhere).

Annual institutional subscription rates for Volume 20, 2021, are \$219.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £143.00 elsewhere for print and electronic subscriptions; and \$172.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £108.00 elsewhere for electronic subscriptions only. The rate for regular members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$48.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for sustaining members of the Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) is £/\$48.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for student members is £/\$19 for print and electronic subscriptions. The rate for lifetime membership in SHGAPE is \$500.00 for print and electronic subscriptions. Single part: \$63.00 in the U.S.A., Mexico, and Canada and £41.00 elsewhere. Prices include postage and insurance. *Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era* and all other Cambridge journals can be found at http://journals.cambridge.org/.

Individual subscriptions include a membership in SHGAPE, which in addition to publishing this journal offers book and article prizes, sponsors sessions at the annual meetings of the American Historical Association and Organization of American Historians, and edits H-SHGAPE, an H-Net discussion list.

For back issues, please contact Periodicals Service Company, 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526; email: psc@periodicals.com

Manuscripts should be submitted electronically in MS Word format to co-editors, Boyd Cothran and Rosanne Currarino, at jgape@yorku.ca. Before submitting any manuscript, please consult http://journals.cambridge.org/jga for details on correct format and citation style. Information may also be obtained at https://www.shgape.org/journal/ or via email at jgape@yorku.ca.

© Society for Historians of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era (SHGAPE) 2021. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form or by any means, photocopying, electronic, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC), www.copyright.com, email: info@copyright.com.

Forwarding and return postage guaranteed, address correction requested.

The Journal of the Gilded Age and Progressive Era Volume 20 • Number 2 • April 2021

CONTENTS

EDITORS' NOTE	215
SHGAPE GRADUATE STUDENT ESSAY PRIZE	
MARK BOXELL From Native Sovereignty to an Oilman's State: Land, Race, and Petroleum in Indian Territory and Oklahoma	216
ARTICLES	
LAURENCE M. HAUPTMAN American Indians and the Right to Vote: <i>United States v. Elm</i> (1877), Its Origins, and Its Impact	234
CRISTINA STANCIU Native Acts, Immigrant Acts: Citizenship, Naturalization, and the Performance of Civic Identity during the Progressive Era	252
Deborah Varat "Their New Jerusalem": Representations of Jewish Immigrants in the American Popular Press, 1880–1903	277
JOSHUA S. SCHWARTZ Publish the Picture at Your Peril: Visual Ideas and the Commercial Apparatus of <i>Life</i> Magazine	301
ROUNDTABLE	
JOEL T. HELFRICH, MICHAEL LEROY OBERG, ALAINA E. ROBERTS, JULIE L. REED AND KEVIN BRUYNEEL NO More Nations Within Nations: Indigenous Sovereignty after the End of Treaty-Making in 1871	325
BOOK REVIEWS	
PAUL STOB, Intellectual Populism: Democracy, Inquiry, and the People (Robin Marie Averbeck)	350
MAURICE S. CRANDALL, These People Have Always Been a Republic: Indigenous Electorates in the U.SMexico Borderlands, 1598–1912 (Daniel Grant)	252
THOMAS JOHN LAPPAS, In League Against King Alcohol: Native American Women and	352
the Woman's Christian Temperance Union, 1874–1933 (Cate LiaBraaten)	254
(Cate Liadratien)	354

On the cover: The panorama shows Cimarron River-bed operations in a portion of the Cushing Oil Field on December 2, 1915. The view is looking to the southwest from a river overlook located in Creek County, Oklahoma. The panorama was constructed from two photographs taken by A.E. Fath.

JEFFREY D. BROXMEYER, Electoral Capitalism: The Party System in New York's Gilded Age (Robert Chiles)	355
KARA MURPHY SCHLICHTING, New York Recentered: Building the Metropolis from the Shore (Eric C. Cimino)	358
Susan Berfield, The Hour of Fate: Theodore Roosevelt, J. P. Morgan, and the Battle to Transform American Capitalism Char Miller and Clay S. Jenkinson eds. Theodore Roosevelt: Naturalist in the Arena (Frank Schumacher)	360
DOUGLAS J. FLOWE, Uncontrollable Blackness: African American Men and Criminality in Jim Crow New York (Elizabeth Gritter)	363
BETSY WOOD, Upon the Altar of Work: Child Labor and the Rise of a New American Sectionalism (Megan Birk)	364
ROBERT F. ZEIDEL, Robber Barons and Wretched Refuse: Ethnic and Class Dynamics during the Era of American Industrialization (Alison Efford)	366