

# *THE REVIEW OF POLITICS*

Are Particularistic Obligations Justified?  
*Amitai Etzioni*

Zionism and the End of Building  
*Eyal Chowers*

Plato's *Gorgias*: Socrates and Callicles  
*Devin Stauffer*

\* \* \* \*

## **New Perspectives on Hume**

Hume's Last Lessons  
*Ryan Hanley*

Hume and Religious Establishment  
*Will R. Jordan*

\* \* \* \*

*Review Essay*: Contemporary Islam and the  
Burden of History  
*Lawrence Ziring*

Book reviewers include—

Francis Canavan on Robert George  
Lawrence Cunningham on Charles Taylor  
Barry Cooper on W. J. Stankiewicz  
Thomas Kelly on Robert Nozick  
Paul Carrese on Norma Thompson

Fall, 2002

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Editor*

WALTER NICGORSKI

*Managing Editor*

DENNIS WM MORAN

*Book Review Editor*

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

*Assistant Book Review Editor*

James Paul Old

Editorial Intern: David Thunder

Associate Editors

Fred R. Dallmayr

E. A. Goerner

Thomas Werge

Philip Gleason

Alasdair MacIntyre

Catherine Zuckert

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian

M. A. Fitzsimons

Frederick J. Crosson

Thomas Stritch

Donald P. Kommers

Editorial Advisory Board

Henry J. Abraham

*University of Virginia*

Charles W. Anderson

*University of Wisconsin-Madison*

Shlomo Avineri

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

Jean Bethke Elshtain

*University of Chicago*

Ernest L. Fortin (1923-2002)

*Boston College*

Gerald Garvey (1935-2000)

*Princeton University*

James T. Kloppenberg

*Harvard University*

Arend Lijphart

*University of*

*California-San Diego*

Harvey C. Mansfield

*Harvard University*

Mary Nichols

*Fordham University*

Doris Marie Provine

*Arizona State University*

Arlene Saxonhouse

*University of Michigan*

Steven B. Smith

*Yale University*

Kenneth W. Thompson

*University of Virginia*

Glenn Tinder

*University of Massachusetts-*

*Boston*

Jean M. Yarbrough

*Bowdoin College*

Administrative Assistant: Nancy Benjamin

Production Managers: Andrea Laffey, Jonathan T. Morgan, and

Benjamin Rooney

---

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to politics.

---

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana*

---

**Vol. 64**

**Fall 2002**

**No. 4**

---

*Amitai Etzioni*

- Are Paritarian Obligations Justified?  
A Communitarian Examination . . . . . 573

*Eyal Chowers*

- The End of Building: Zionism and the Politics of  
the Concrete . . . . . 599

*Devin Stauffer*

- Socrates and Callicles: A Reading of  
Plato's *Gorgias* . . . . . 627

*Ryan Patrick Hanley*

- Hume's Last Lessons: The Civic Education of  
*My Own Life* . . . . . 659

*Will R. Jordan*

- Religion in the Public Square: A Reconsideration  
of David Hume and Religious Establishment . . . . . 687

*Review Essay*

- Lawrence Ziring*: Contemporary Islam and the Burden  
of History . . . . . 715

*Reviews:*

- Paul Carrese: REDRESSING THE BALANCE, OR TELLING  
A GOOD TALE IN POLITICS  
Review of Norma Thompson's *The Ship of State: Statecraft  
and Politics from Ancient Greece to Democratic America* . . . . . 735
- Christopher Nadon: PLATONIC FOOTBALL  
Review of Melissa Lane's *Plato's Progeny: How Plato  
and Socrates Still Captivate the Modern Mind* . . . . . 738
- Jill Frank: ENGAGING DIALECTIC  
Review of Thomas W. Smith's *Revaluing Ethics:  
Aristotle's Dialectical Pedagogy* . . . . . 740
- Joseph Lane: FULL OF SOUND AND FURY,  
SIGNIFYING SOMETHING  
Review of Leon Craig's *Of Philosophers and Kings:  
Political Philosophy in Shakespeare's Macbeth and King Lear* . 742

Daniella J. Kostroun: THE PUNITIVE SPIRIT	
Review of Philip F. Riley's <i>A Lust for Virtue: Louis XIV's Attack on Sin in Seventeenth-Century France</i> . . . . .	745
Francis Canavan: THE SECULARIST ESTABLISHMENT	
Review of Robert P. George's <i>The Clash of Orthodoxies</i> . . . . .	747
Lawrence S. Cunningham: ONE HUNDRED YEARS ON	
Review of Charles Taylor's <i>Varieties of Religion Today: William James Revisited</i> . . . . .	750
Mark G. Spencer: CIVIC REPUBLICAN AND CRITICAL MODERNIST	
Review of John P. Young's <i>Henry Adams: The Historian as Political Theorist</i> . . . . .	752
James Campbell: ROLE PLAYING	
Review of Mitchell Aboulafia's <i>The Cosmopolitan Self: George Herbert Mead and Continental Philosophy</i> . . . . .	754
Barry Cooper: WARRIOR, EXILE, TEACHER	
Review of W.J. Stankiewicz's <i>The Essential Stankiewicz: On the Importance of Political Theory</i> . . . . .	757
Glenn Worthington: OAKESHOTT IN HIS CONTEXT?	
Review of Terry Nardin's <i>The Philosophy of Michael Oakeshott</i> . . . . .	758
Thomas Kelly: SCIENCE OF PHILOSOPHY	
Review of Robert Nozick's <i>Invariances: The Structure of the Objective World</i> . . . . .	761
James H. Read: OUR OTHER SIDE	
Review of Stephen F. Knott's <i>Alexander Hamilton and the Persistence of Myth</i> . . . . .	763
Bethany L. Johnson: RECONSTRUCTING THE HERITAGE	
Review of David Goldfield's <i>Still Fighting the Civil War: The American South and Southern History</i> . . . . .	766
Debra L. DeLaet: SECURING COMMUNITY	
Review of Peter C. Meilaender's <i>Toward a Theory of Immigration</i> . . . . .	768

## IN MEMORIAM ERNEST L. FORTIN, A.A.

Seriously handicapped since suffering a stroke in 1997, Father Fortin died in Framingham, Massachusetts on October 22<sup>nd</sup>. Word of his death reached the offices of *The Review of Politics*, as it did many of his friends throughout the world, on the next day. Those friends and his many students know best that this passing was that of a truly remarkable person. Anyone who might have encountered him or his writings could recognize in him an outstanding scholar set apart by breadth of significant interests, awesomely rich learning and a capacity for acute and profound analysis. He wore lightly his scholarly powers and distinctions. As Werner Dannhauser observed recently, his “puckish wit” and his “irrepressible” playfulness made his presence a delight. This, along with a similarly irrepressible care and concern for his friends and students, was very much in evidence when, less than two months before his death, I had the opportunity to talk with him in the nursing home where he spent his last years on earth. One sensed, as always with him, a somewhat detached amusement at the ironies and follies of the academic and political worlds; he appeared to view all matters with a confidence and joy in things unseen.

Father Fortin was a priest of the community of the Augustinians of the Assumption. He studied philosophy at Laval University where Charles De Konick stirred his interest. Theological Studies at the Angelicum in Rome then followed before his ordination in 1949. In 1955, he completed studies for the doctorate in letters at the Sorbonne; during the time he was writing his dissertation in Paris, he became friends with Allan Bloom who directed him toward the issues of “politics” and the work of Leo Strauss. While participating in Strauss seminars at the University of Chicago in the early 1960s, I met Ernest Fortin and found him then in our earliest contacts as throughout his subsequent life a friendly and very active source of encouragement and support of what might be most significant in my aspirations as teacher, scholar, and editor. Father Fortin taught at his undergraduate alma mater, Assumption College, from 1955 to 1970, and then from 1971 until his disabling stroke, he taught theology and political philosophy at Boston College. He lectured widely in Europe and America.

My predecessor as editor, Donald Kommers, invited Ernest Fortin to be one of the twelve scholars on the initial editorial advisory board of *The Review of Politics*. From that appointment in 1984, he served continuously and most helpfully in that capacity until his death. The prior editor, Frederick Crosson, oversaw Fortin’s initial publication in *The Review*, his 1979 essay on “Augustine’s *City of God* and the Modern Historical Consciousness,” and his friendship with Father Fortin seemed to grow up,

from this point if not earlier, around their common interests in St. Augustine and in the character and impact of the work of Leo Strauss. Fortin's important essay, "The New Rights Theory and the Natural Law," appeared in *The Review* in 1982 in the wake of the appearance of John Finnis's *Natural Law and Natural Rights*. Then in 1994, Fortin provided extended comment when the Strauss-Voegelin correspondence appeared. In 1995, he addressed in this journal the modern charges about biblical Christianity's responsibility for abuse of the environment with his now often cited essay, "The Bible Made Me Do It: Christianity, Science, and the Environment." In 1979 and 1997 he took assignment to review important books by Fredrick Wilhelmsen and Jean Bethke Elshtain respectively. Nearly all of these publications and most of Fortin's writings appear in a three-volume collection of his work (*Collected Essays*, ed. J. Brian Benestad, [1996]) in which he wrote the Foreword to the initial volume. That collection, a truly impressive testimony to his scholarly excellence and energy, was reviewed in this journal by Glenn Tinder in 1998, "The Moral Amnesia of Modernity: The Scholarship of Ernest Fortin." A complete bibliography of Fortin's published work appeared within the past year in the *festschrift* edited by Michael P. Foley and Douglas Kries, *Gladly to Learn and Gladly to Teach: Essays on Religion and Political Philosophy in Honor of Ernest L. Fortin* (2002).

Father Fortin formally received the *festschrift* and was honored by Boston College for his curricular leadership just days before his death. Little more than a month earlier, an English translation of his 1981 book on Dante appeared under the title *Dissent and Philosophy in the Middle Ages*, trans. Marc A. LePain (2002). At the same time, at the annual meeting of the American Political Science Association, a session was held in his honor under the title, "Reason and Revelation: The Legacy of Ernest Fortin."

The notice that came to most of us of Father Fortin's death was sent by his friend Father Matthew Lamb, and it concluded with the most fitting words one might imagine from his deepest and longest-standing friend in philosophic Christianity.

I do love wisdom alone and for its own sake, and it is on account of wisdom that I want or fear to be without other things, such as life, tranquility, and my friends. What limit can there be to my love of that Beauty, in which I do not only not begrudge it to others, but I even look for many who will long for it with me, sigh for it with me, possess it with me, enjoy it with me; they will be all the dearer to me the more we share that beloved wisdom in common.

St. Augustine, *Sililoquies* I, 22

Walter Nicgorski  
Editor

## Contributors To This Issue

**AMITAI ETZIONI** is University Professor in George Washington University, Washington, D.C. **EYAL CHOWERS** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Tel-Aviv University. **DEVIN STAUFFER** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Kenyon College. **RYAN PATRICK HANLEY** holds a Ph.D. from the University of Chicago's Committee on Social Thought and is currently a Mellon Postdoctoral Fellow at the Whitney Humanities Center in Yale University. **WILL R. JORDAN** is Visiting Assistant Professor of Political Science in Boise State University. **LAWRENCE ZIRING** is Arnold E. Schneider Professor of Political Science in Western Michigan University.

**PAUL CARRESE** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in the U.S. Air Force Academy. **CHRISTOPHER NADON**, author of *Xenophon's Prince*, is Associate Professor of Political Science in Trinity College. **JILL FRANK** is Assistant Professor of Government and International Studies in the University of South Carolina, Columbia. **JOSEPH LANE** teaches political science in Emory and Henry College, Virginia. **DANIELLA J. KOSTROUN** is a member of the Department of History in North Carolina State University, Raleigh. **FRANCIS CANAVAN, S.J.**, is Professor Emeritus of Political Science in Fordham University. **LAWRENCE S. CUNNINGHAM** is John A. O'Brien Professor of Theology in the University of Notre Dame. **MARK G. SPENCER** is Postdoctoral Fellow in St. Michael's College, University of Toronto. **JAMES CAMPBELL**, Distinguished University Professor in the University of Toledo, is author of *Recovering Ben Franklin*. **BARRY COOPER** is Professor of Political Science in the University of Calgary. **GLENN WORTHINGTON** has taught political theory at the Australian National University and currently works as a researcher with the Parliamentary Library in the Commonwealth Library of Australia. **THOMAS KELLY** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy in the University of Notre Dame. **JAMES H. READ** is Professor of Political Science in the College of St. Benedict and St. John's University. **BETHANY L. JOHNSON** is Associate Editor of the *Journal of Southern History*. **DEBRA L. DELAET** is

Associate Professor of Politics and International Relations in  
Drake University.

*Correction:* Takashi Shogimen, a former Research Fellow in the  
University of Cambridge, is an independent scholar in Toronto.

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in **DUPLICATE** with an accompanying computer disk of text to Professor Walter Nicgorski, Editor, *The Review of Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 8,000–11,000 words. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an **ABSTRACT** of 100–150 words. We assume, in accordance with APSA policies, that you have not submitted your essay to another journal. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Professor Peter R. Moody, Jr. at the above address.

The articles in **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts, and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS, SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX (also available in the electronic versions), BOOK REVIEW INDEX, INTERNATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES.

**THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** (ISSN 0034–6705) is published quarterly for \$25.00 per year in the United States (institutional \$56.00); foreign individual, \$32.00 (institutional, \$59.00); single copies, \$14.00 (domestic) and \$15.50 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Periodicals postage paid at Notre Dame, IN and Nappanee, IN. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS**, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Visa and MasterCard accepted.

Abstracts, subscription, advertising and submission information can also be found on our World Wide Web Homepage at <http://www.nd.edu/~rop>.