

# PHILOSOPHY

THE JOURNAL  
OF  
THE ROYAL INSTITUTE OF PHILOSOPHY

EDITED BY

H. B. ACTON

ASSISTED BY

S. C. BROWN

---

VOL. XLVI—1971

---

LONDON:  
MACMILLAN & CO., LIMITED  
LITTLE ESSEX STREET, W.C.2  
1971

## CONTENTS OF VOLUME XLVI

### ARTICLES

	PAGE
BAGCHI, K.—Kant's Transcendental Problem as a Linguistic Problem ...	341
CAMERON, J. R.—'Ought' and Institutional Obligation ...	309
DOWNIE, R. S. and ELIZABETH TELFER—Autonomy ...	293
EDWARDS, Paul.—Kierkegaard and the 'Truth' of Christianity ...	89
GALE, Richard M.—The Fictive Use of Language ...	324
GODLOVITCH, Roslind.—Animals and Morals ...	23
HAMLYN, D. W.—Unconscious Intentions ...	12
HONORE, A. M.—Reference to the Non-Existent ...	302
HUBY, Pamela M.—Kant or Cantor? That the Universe, if Real, must be Finite in both Space and Time ...	121
KOLNAI, Aurel—The Concept of Hierarchy ...	203
LUCAS, J. R.—Ethical Intuitionism II ...	1
NEU, Jerome.—Plato's Analogy of State and Individual ...	238
POLE, David.—Breadth and Depth of Understanding ...	109
ROBINSON, Richard.—Ought and Ought Not ...	193
SLOMAN, Aaron.—Tarski, Frege and the Liar Paradox. ...	133
TELFER, Elizabeth and R. S. DOWNIE.—Autonomy ...	293
VERSENYI, Laszlo G.—Plato and his Liberal Opponents ...	222
WILSON, John.—Politics and Expertise ...	34

### DISCUSSION

AGASSI, Joseph, I. C. JARVIE, TOM SETTLE.—The Grounds of Reason ...	43
ATTFIELD, R.—Talents, Abilities and Virtues ...	255
COLLINGRIDGE, D.G.—Pucetti's 'Paradox' ...	158
HAMER, Colin.—Colin Lyas on the Coherence of Christian Atheism ...	62
HICKS, David, D.—Respect for Persons and Respect for Living Things ...	346
JACK, Henry.—Note on Doubts about <i>Prima Facie</i> Duties ...	160
KEKES, John.—Watkins on Rationalism ...	51
NATHAN, N. M. L.—Common Sense Metaphysics ...	152
O'KELLEY.—Locke's Doctrine of Intuition was not borrowed from Descartes?	148
REEVE, E. G.—A Comment on some of Sir Francis Galton's Observations and Inferences with regard to Free-Will ...	259
RICHMOND, Sheldon.—Can a Rationalist be rational about his Rationalism? ...	54
ROBERTS, H. R. T.—Mercy ...	352
STEVENSON, Leslie.—An Alleged Materialist Fallacy of Mind ...	159
WALLACE, Gerald.—The Problems of Moral and Physical Evil ...	349
WATKINS, J. W. N.—CCR: A Refutation ...	56

### REVIEW ARTICLES

DILMAN, Ilham—On Wittgenstein's Last Notes (1950-51) <i>On Certainty</i> ...	162
MAYS, Wolfe.—Husserl and Phenomenology ...	262
VON LEYDEN, W.—Metaphysics and the Philosophy of Science ...	38

## NEW BOOKS

	PAGE
ALLEN, R. E.— <i>Plato's 'Euthyphro' and the Earlier Theory of Forms</i> (D. W. Hamlyn)	170
BECK, Lewis White (Ed.)— <i>Kant Studies Today</i> (Eva Schaper) ...	278
BRITTON, Karl.— <i>Philosophy and the Meaning of Life</i> (Keith Ward) ...	70
BROWN, Stuart C.— <i>Do Religious Claims make Sense?</i> (Ronald Hepburn) ...	68
BUTTS, Robert E. & John W. DAVIS (Ed.)— <i>The Methodological Heritage of Newton</i> (R. Niall & D. Martin) ...	366
CHARLTON, W.— <i>Aesthetics: An Introduction</i> (Eva Schaper) ...	359
CHARLTON, W. (Translation and Notes by)— <i>Aristotle's Physics I and II</i> (D. W. Hamlyn) ...	169
DOWNIE, R. S. and Elizabeth TELFER.— <i>Respect for Persons</i> (H. D. Lewis) ...	282
FURLEY, D. J. and ALLEN R. E. (Ed.)— <i>Studies in Democratic Philosophy: Vol. I The Beginning of Philosophy</i> ...	354
GIBSON, A. Boyce.— <i>Theism and Empiricism</i> (John Hick) ...	365
GROSSMAN, Reinhardt.— <i>Reflections on Frege's Philosophy</i> (Kenneth N. Montague)	283
KÖRNER, Stephan.— <i>Categorial Frameworks</i> (D. W. Hamlyn) ...	276
KÖRNER, Stephan.— <i>What is Philosophy?</i> (Martin Hollis) ...	73
KNOX, Sir Malcolm.— <i>A Layman's Quest</i> (David C. Hicks) ...	71
LAKATOS, Imre and MUSGRAVE, Alan (Ed.)— <i>Criticism and the Growth of Knowledge</i> (K. K. Lee) ...	368
LEDERMANN, E. K.— <i>Philosophy and Medicine</i> (Colin Smith) ...	181
LEWIS, H. D.— <i>The Elusive Mind</i> (Geoffrey Madell) ...	175
MARTIN, Jane R.— <i>Explaining, Understanding and Teaching</i> (Glenn Langford)	182
MELCHERT, Norman Paul.— <i>Realism, Materialism, and the Mind. The Philosophy of Roy Wood Sellars</i> (Samuel E. Gluck) ...	281
MILLER, A. V. (trans).— <i>Hegel's Philosophy of Nature</i> (T. M. Knox) ...	355
MOORE, F. C. T.— <i>The Psychology of Maine de Biran</i> (Ian W. Alexander) ...	269
PENELHUM, Terence.— <i>Survival and Disembodied Existence</i> (David Polden) ...	176
PETRY, M. J. (edited and translated by).— <i>Hegel's 'Philosophy of Nature'</i> (T. M. Knox) ...	355
PHILLIPS, D. Z. and MOUNCE, H. O.— <i>Moral Practices</i> (R. F. Atkinson) ...	179
PIKE, Nelson.— <i>God and Timelessness</i> (Martha Kneale) ...	178
PRICE, H. H.— <i>Belief: The Gifford Lecture, delivered at the University of Aberdeen in 1960</i> (A. P. Griffiths) ...	63
REID, Louis Arnaud.— <i>Meaning in the Arts</i> (Ruth Saw) ...	361
SEIDLER, G. L.— <i>The Emergence of the Eastern World</i> (Peter Burke) ...	78
SLOTE, Michael A.— <i>Reason and Scepticism</i> (T. Greenwood) ...	363
STOUGH, Charlotte L.— <i>Greek Skepticism: a Study in Epistemology</i> (A. A. Long)	77
SWINBURNE, Richard.— <i>The Concept of Miracle</i> (R. C. Wallace) ...	366
SWING, Thomas Kaehao.— <i>Kant's Transcendental Logic</i> (Eva Schaper) ...	75
TRIGG, Roger.— <i>Pain and Emotion</i> (O. Hanfling) ...	173
VANDER VEER, Garrett L.— <i>Bradley's Metaphysics and the Self</i> (G. R. G. Mure)	357
WARNOCK, Mary.— <i>Existentialism</i> (Anthony Manser) ...	270
WEIL, Simone.— <i>First and Last Notebooks</i> (Lloyd Reinhardt) ...	274
WHITE, R. J.— <i>The Anti-Philosophers: A Study of the Philosophes in Eighteenth Century France</i> (N. T. Phillipson) ...	172

## INSTITUTE NOTICES

	PAGE
<b>Membership</b> ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ...	84, 189, 291, 376
<b>Changes of Address</b> ... ... ... ... ... ... ... ...	377
<b>Contributions to <i>Philosophy</i></b> ... ... ... ... ... ...	84, 189, 291, 377
<b>Lecture Programme 1971-72</b> ... ... ... ... ... ...	378
<b>Note on Contributors</b> ... ... ... ... ... ...	85, 190, 289, 377
<b>Note to Publishers on Books for Review</b> ... ... ...	84, 189, 291, 377
<b>Philosophy of Psychology Conference 1971</b> ... ... ...	86, 191, 290
<b>1971 International Congress for Logic, Methodology and Philosophy of Science</b>	<b>87</b>
<b>Subscriptions, Receipts for</b> ... ... ... ... ... ...	377

---

Printed by S. H. Peters & Sons Ltd., London S.E.26.