

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Natural Law and Natural Rights: Old Problems  
and Recent Approaches  
*Brian Tierney*

Aquinas on *jus* and Hart on Rights: A Response  
to Tierney

*John M. Finnis*

In Defense of Fortin

*Douglas Kries*

Response to Brian Tierney

*Michael P. Zuckert*

Tierney's Response

\* \* \* \*

Joseph and the Politics of Memory  
*Clarke E. Cochran*

Aristotle and the Politics of Herodotus' *History*  
*Elliot Bartky*

Nature, Custom and Reason in Aristotelian  
Political Science  
*James Bernard Murphy*

Marsilius of Padua and Ogyu Sorai on  
Community and Language  
*Takashi Shogimen*

Book reviewers include—

Michael Francis on John Mearsheimer

Aurelian Craiutu on Sheldon Wolin

Catherine Frost on Margaret Moore

Patrick Neal on J. Judd Owen

Summer, 2002

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Editor*

WALTER NICGORSKI

*Managing Editor*

DENNIS WM MORAN

*Book Review Editor*

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

*Assistant Book Review Editor*

James Paul Old

Editorial Intern: Xavier Marquez

Associate Editors

Fred R. Dallmayr

Philip Gleason

E. A. Goerner

Alasdair MacIntyre

Thomas Werge

Catherine Zuckert

Former Editors

Waldemar Gurian

M. A. Fitzsimons

Thomas Stritch

Frederick J. Crosson

Donald P. Kommers

Editorial Advisory Board

Henry J. Abraham

*University of Virginia*

Charles W. Anderson

*University of Wisconsin-Madison*

Shlomo Avineri

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

Jean Bethke Elshtain

*University of Chicago*

Ernest L. Fortin

*Boston College*

Gerald Garvey (1935-2000)

*Princeton University*

James T. Kloppenberg

*Harvard University*

Arend Lijphart

*University of*

*California-San Diego*

Harvey C. Mansfield

*Harvard University*

Mary Nichols

*Fordham University*

Doris Marie Provine

*Arizona State University*

Arlene Saxonhouse

*University of Michigan*

Steven B. Smith

*Yale University*

Kenneth W. Thompson

*University of Virginia*

Glenn Tinder

*University of Massachusetts-*

*Boston*

Jean M. Yarbrough

*Bowdoin College*

Administrative Assistant: Nancy Benjamin

Production Managers: Stephen D. Sabrio, Brooke Warner, and

Monica Wisner

---

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to politics.

---

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

---

Vol. 64

Summer 2002

No. 3

---

*Brian Tierney*

Natural Law and Natural Rights: Old Problems  
and Recent Approaches . . . . . 389

*John M. Finnis*

Aquinas on *ius* and Hart on Rights: A Response  
to Tierney . . . . . 407

*Douglas Kries*

In Defense of Fortin . . . . . 411

*Michael P. Zuckert*

Response to Brian Tierney . . . . . 414

*Brian Tierney*

Author's Rejoinder . . . . . 416

*Clarke E. Cochran*

Joseph and the Politics of Memory . . . . . 421

*Elliot Bartky*

Aristotle and the Politics of Herodotus's *History* . . . 445

*James Bernard Murphy*

Nature, Custom and Reason as the Explanatory  
and Practical Principles of Aristotelian  
Political Science . . . . . 469

*Takashi Shogimen*

Marsilius of Padua and Ogyu Sorai: Community  
and Language in the Political Discourse in Late  
Medieval Europe and Tokugawa Japan . . . . . 497

*Reviews:*

Gilbert Meilaender: CHOOSE LIFE  
Review of John F. Kavanaugh, S.J.'s *Who Count as  
Persons? Human Identity and the Ethics of Killing* . . . . . 525

William R. Lund: SAVING VIRTUE FROM LIBERAL  
NEUTRALITY  
Review of Ludvig Beckman's *The Liberal State & the  
Politics of Virtue* . . . . . 527

Patrick Neal: THE NEED FOR SUFFICIENT REASON Review of J. Judd Owen's <i>Religion and the Demise of Liberal Rationalism: The Foundational Crisis of the Separation of Church and State</i> .....	530
John F. Quinn: QUESTIONS OF AUTHORITY Review of George A. Kelly's <i>The Second Spring of the Church in America</i> and Robert A. Burn, O.P.'s <i>Roman Catholicism after Vatican II</i> .....	532
John A. Gueguen: WONDER, LOVE, AND PRAISE Review of James V. Schall's <i>On the Unseriousness of Human Affairs</i> .....	535
Aurelian Craiutu: NEW POLITICS FOR A NEW EPOCH Review of Sheldon S. Wolin's <i>Tocqueville Between Two Worlds: The Making of a Political and Theoretical Life</i> .....	537
Jorge I. Domínguez: POLITICS IN CONTEXT Review of Nancy R. Powers's <i>Grassroots Expectations of Democracy and Economy: Argentina in Comparative Perspective</i> .....	541
Catherine M. Frost: TRUNCATING NATIONALISM Review of Margaret Moore's <i>The Ethics of Nationalism</i> ....	543
Frank Guliuzza: CONSERVATIVE PEOPLE IN LIBERAL DEMOCRACY Review of Jeff Spinner-Halev's <i>Surviving Diversity: Religion and Democratic Citizenship</i> .....	546
Thomas W. Heilke: RELIGION AS WHAT WE CAN MAKE OF IT Review of Jan-Olav Henriksen's <i>The Reconstruction of Religion: Lessing, Kierkegaard, and Nietzsche</i> .....	549
Paul F. Glenn: THE WILL TO POWER Review of Laurence Lampert's <i>Nietzsche's Task: An Interpretation of Beyond Good and Evil</i> .....	552
Patrick H. Hutton: RUSHING TO ENTROPY Review of John Farrenkopf's <i>Prophet of Decline: Spengler on World History and Politics</i> .....	555
Thomas Mertens: WARRING TO END WAR Review of Brian Orend's <i>War and International Justice: A Kantian Perspective</i> .....	558
Michael J. Francis: TAKING OFFENSE Review of John Mearsheimer's <i>The Tragedy of Great Power Politics</i> .....	560
Dennis Wm Moran: ANSWERED PRAYERS Review of Corynne McSherry's <i>Who Owns Academic Work? Battling for Control of Intellectual Property</i> .....	563

## Contributors To This Issue

**BRIAN TIERNEY** is the Bryce and Edith M. Bowmar Professor Emeritus of Humanistic Studies in Cornell University. **JOHN M. FINNIS** is Professor and Biolchini Chair of Law and Concurrent Professor of Philosophy in the University of Notre Dame. **DOUGLAS KRIES** is Chair of the Department of Philosophy and Director of Catholic Studies in Gonzaga University. **MICHAEL P. ZUCKERT** is the Nancy R. Dreux Professor of Political Science in the University of Notre Dame. **CLARKE E. COCHRAN** is Professor of Political Science in Texas Tech University. **ELLIOT BARTKY** is a member of the Political Science Department in Indiana University-Purdue University University at Fort Wayne and Adjunct Associate Professor in the University of Notre Dame's Program of Liberal Studies. **JAMES BERNARD MURPHY** is Associate Professor of Government in Dartmouth College. **TAKASHI SHOGIMEN** is Research Assistant and Visiting Scholar in the Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, University of Toronto.

**GILBERT MEILAENDER**, Professor of Theology, teaches religious ethics in Valparaiso University. **WILLIAM R. LUND** teaches political science in the University of Idaho. **PATRICK NEAL** teaches political theory in the University of Vermont; he is the author of *Liberalism and Its Discontents* (1997). **JOHN F. QUINN**, author of *Father Mathew's Crusade: Temperance in Nineteenth Century Ireland and Irish America* (2002), is Associate Professor of History in Salve Regina University. **JOHN A. GUEGUEN** is Professor Emeritus of Political Philosophy in Illinois State University. **AURELIAN CRAIUTU** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Indiana University, Bloomington. **JORGE I. DOMINGUEZ**, former President of the Latin American Studies Association, is Director of the Weatherhead Center for International Affairs in Harvard University. **CATHERINE M. FROST** is a SSHCR Postdoctoral Fellow in McGill University, Montreal. **FRANK GULIUZZA** is a member of the political science faculty in Weber State University. **THOMAS W. HEILKE** is Associate Professor of Political Science in the University of Kansas. **PAUL F. GLENN**

is Visiting Assistant Professor of Government and Politics in the University of Puget Sound, Washington. **PATRICK H. HUTTON** is Professor of History in the University of Vermont; he is the author of *History as an Art of Memory* (1993). **THOMAS MERTENS** is Professor of Law in the University Nijmegen. **MICHAEL J. FRANCIS** is Professor of Political Science and Assistant Provost in the University of Notre Dame. **DENNIS WMMORAN** is Managing Editor of *The Review*.

*Correction:* The title of Kate A. Baldwin's review of Houston Baker's *Turning South Again: Re-thinking Modernism/Re-reading Brooker T.* (Spring 2002) should read "Interrogating Modernism's Mobility." The title used was not submitted by the reviewer.

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in **DUPLICATE** with an accompanying computer disk to Professor Walter Nicgorski, Editor, *The Review of Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 8,000–11,000 words. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an **ABSTRACT** of 100–150 words. We assume, in accordance with APSA policies, that you have not submitted your essay to another journal. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Professor Peter R. Moody, Jr. at the above address.

The articles in **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts, and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS, SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX (also available in the electronic versions), BOOK REVIEW INDEX, INTERNATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES.

**THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** (ISSN 0034–6705) is published quarterly for \$27.00 per year in the United States (institutional \$56.00); foreign individual, \$32.00 (institutional, \$61.00); single copies, \$14.00 (domestic) and \$15.50 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Periodicals postage paid at Notre Dame, IN and Nappanee, IN. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS**, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Visa and MasterCard accepted.

Abstracts, subscription, advertising and submission information can also be found on our World Wide Web Homepage at <http://www.nd.edu/~rop>.