

## CORRESPONDENCE

## AN EXPLANATION.

*To the Editors of the CLASSICAL REVIEW.*

As I value Professor Haverfield's criticism not less than his approval, I am sorry that he partly misunderstood the article on Portus Itius in my new edition. My opinion does not differ very much from his. He remarks (*Classical Review*, December, 1911, p. 257) that I now take the view that Caesar's 'first starting-place was Boulogne, his second Wissant.' But in regard to the second I wrote (p. 103, n. 1): 'The balance of probability is greatly in favour of Boulogne'; again (p. 437), 'My only aim has been to show that the case for Boulogne cannot be regarded as absolutely proved, because, if there is only one real objection, that objection may not safely be ignored. But if there were not one gap in our knowledge, it would perhaps disappear'; and finally (p. 438), 'unless the question is settled by excavating for traces of the Roman camps, an element of doubt, however slight, will remain.'

The article in this review (May, 1909) to which Professor Haverfield refers was vitiated by a mistaken inference from an answer which an expert had given to a question. With one exception, the critics who had studied the problem (I am speaking of signed reviews) had accepted the article on the same subject in *Ancient Britain* as conclusive: Mr. Stuart Jones accepted the reasons (pp. 581-3) for identifying Caesar's point of departure in 55 B.C. with Boulogne, but in the case of Portus Itius the result seemed to him 'to lack certainty.' As I had already come to the same conclusion myself, I deemed it my duty to say so; but I ought to have waited until I had thought the matter out, in connexion with the detail on which I consulted the expert, as thoroughly as I did in revising *Caesar's Conquest of Gaul*. I called attention to the flaw and corrected it in the new edition (p. 436, n. 1); and in reprinting the essential parts of the article I made (as I pointed out) certain alterations which the correction involved. Any one who has read both new edition will have observed these alterations. The correction weakened the one serious objection which, as I said in the *C. R.*, could be brought against Boulogne, but did not remove it. That is why I believe that 'unless the question is settled by excavating . . . an element of doubt, however slight, will remain.'

T. RICE HOLMES.

11, Douro Place, Kensington, W.

*To the Editors of the CLASSICAL REVIEW.*

DEAR SIR,—I saw with great regret, which will be shared by many of his old friends, and by hundreds of his old students in Australia, the death of my friend Martin Harry Irving at the ripe age of eighty-one. He was a Balliol

scholar, and afterwards a Master at St. Paul's School. On the foundation of Melbourne University he was elected to the Professorship of Classics, which post he afterwards resigned on his election to the headmastership of the Wesley College near Melbourne. He next started a private school at Hawthorne, a suburb of Melbourne, and finally took up his residence in England in order to take an active part in the work of the Catholic Apostolic Church. As his successor in the chair at Melbourne, I had ample opportunities of judging of the great work which he successfully inaugurated in Victoria. In a young country we cannot expect to find specialists; and the Professor of Classics in the Melbourne University had to find room under his umbrella for Logic, English literature, as well as Latin and Greek. Hence it is not difficult to gather that the duties of the holder of the Chair of Classics could not find much time for writing. The organisation of the infant University alone occupied much of the leisure of the first Professors. But it must have been a consolation to Irving to witness in his old age the great success of the institution in whose foundation he took so great a part. The students have increased to hundreds; residential colleges have been established; new lectureships and professorships have been established, and the greater number of the professional men in the State of Victoria receive their education at their Alma Mater beneath the Southern Cross. It may be safely said that the foundation of the University of Melbourne inspired the whole colony with new intellectual life, and with Irving passes away the last of the original staff of the University, which has numbered amongst its teachers Professor Hearn, the jurist, Sir Frederick M'Coy, the physiologist, and Charles Henry Pearson, the historian.

H. A. STRONG.

*Clyst, Farnham Common, Slough.*

*To the Editors of the CLASSICAL REVIEW.*

DEAR SIR,—I venture to send three suggestions for passages in Propertius:

I. 20. 52.

'Formosum nymphis credere visus Hylan.'

This is the reading of all the best MSS. The second hand of V, however, reads 'rursus,' leading Palmer, in view of the weakness of 'visus,' to change the text to 'ne vis perdere.' But I suggest that by a far less violent change we may get even better sense; for Propertius has not mentioned anything to justify the 'rursus.' He simply warns Gallus by an example, but does not imply that Gallus has had one disappointment already. By a slight change, involving practically nothing but the separation of '-re' from 'crede,' and the blending of 'rursus' and 'visus,' we get the line 'Formosum nymphis

crede *reversus* Hylan.' Now, punctuating after the hexameter, we translate thus: 'Heed my warnings and thou wilt keep thy loved one: so turn thee again and abandon Hylas to the nymphs.' Surely this is a far stronger close to this otherwise fine poem, and, moreover, is in keeping with lines 6-11.

6. 10.

'Quae solet irato tristis amica viro.'

The objections that have been raised to this line, resulting in the change (Itali) to 'ingrato,' which Professor Butler calls 'a tempting change,' are surely due to misinterpretation. Certainly Propertius has not lost his temper with Cynthia; but that is just what he here emphasises. To paraphrase it, we may say, 'She flouts me and threatens me just as a maiden that turns upon

an angry lover.' To this is added further point if we render 'tristis amica'—'a scold,' comparing the use of *tristis* in 'triste lupus stabulis.' Or if this interpretation be rejected, we may yet take 'irato' as a supposition. She has implored Propertius not to leave her; he has, perhaps, retorted hastily: then, after her pleading, she turns on him 'tristis.'

1. 19.

It cannot be, I think, a coincidence that in this line the charming of 'Luna' is mentioned, and that his request is the charming of 'Cynthia.' It seems to me to be an intentional play upon the name, and this is intensified by line 22: 'Et faciat nostro palleat ore magis.'

C. B. MOSS-BLUNDELL.

*New College, Oxford, January 20, 1912.*

## BOOKS RECEIVED

*Publishers and Authors forwarding Books for review are asked to send at the same time a note of the price.*

*\*\* Excerpts and Extracts from Periodicals and Collections are not included in these Lists unless stated to be separately published.*

*Agrimensores.* See *Thulin*.

*Albrecht* (F.) *Galen* Libellus an in arteriis natura sanguinis contineatur. (Doctor's Dissertation.) Pp. x+64. Marburg: Noske, 1911.

*Asmus* (R.) *Das Leben des Philosophen Isidoros von Damaskios aus Damaskos.* 7½" × 5". Pp. xvi+224. Leipzig: F. Meiner, 1911. M. 7.50.

*Cooke* (H. P.) *Maurice the Philosopher: A Dialogue.* 7½" × 5". Pp. xv+117. Cambridge: W. Heffer, 1912. Cloth, 2s. 6d. net.

*Coulter* (C. C.) *Retractatio in the Ambrosian and Palatine recensions of Plautus: a Study of the Persae, Poenulus, Pseudolus, Stichus, and Trinummus.* Bryn Mawr College Monographs, Vol. X. 9" × 6". Pp. iv+118. Bryn Mawr, U.S.A.

*Cyrene.* The Preliminary Report of the First Campaign of Excavations at Cyrene, 1910-11, by R. Norton, J. C. Hoppin, C. D. Curtis, A. F. S. Sladden. Extract from the Bulletin of the Archaeological Institute of America, Vol. II. 9½" × 6½". Pp. 141-176, with plates. New York: The Macmillan Co., 1911.

*De Sanctis* (G.) *ATΘIΣ.* Storia della Repubblica Ateniese (2ª Edizione). No. 58. Biblioteca di Scienze Moderne. 9½" × 6½". Pp. xii+508. Torino: F. Bocca, 1912. Lire 12.

*Euripides.* See *Kleine Texte*.

*Flecker* (J. E.) *The Scholar's Italian Book: An Introduction to the Study of the Latin*

*Origins of Italian.* 7½" × 5". Pp. x+114. London: David Nutt, 1911. Cloth, 3s. 6d.

*Galen.* See *Albrecht*.

*Grebe* (F. W.) *Studia Catulliana.* (Dissertation for Doctorate.) 9½" × 6½". Pp. 135. Amsterdam: Meulenhoff and Co., 1912.

*Havers* (W.) *Untersuchungen zur Kasussyntax der indogermanischen Sprachen.* 9½" × 6". Pp. xix+335. Strassburg: J. Trübner, 1911. M. 11.

*Historical and Linguistic Studies.* First Series, Vol. II., Greek Texts. Part II., The Toronto Gospels. By E. J. Goodspeed. 10" × 7". Pp. 21. Chicago: University Press; and Cambridge: University Press, 1912.

*Kleine Texte.* No. 20, *Antike Fluchttafeln*, von R. Wünsch, 2. Auflage, pp. 30, M. 0.70. No. 84, *Aus einem griechischen Zauberpapyrus*, von R. Wünsch, pp. 30, M. 0.70. 8" × 5". Bonn: Marcus and Weber.

— No. 89, *Euripides Medea mit Scholien*, von Ernst Diehl. 7¾" × 5". Pp. 116. Bonn: Marcus and Weber, 1911. M. 2.60 (bound, M. 3).

*Maurice* (J.) *Numismatique Constantinienne*, Tome II. 10" × 6½". Pp. cxxvi+612, with 17 plates. Paris: E. Le Roux, 1911. Fr. 25.

*Monist* (The) A Quarterly Magazine devoted to the Philosophy of Science. Vol. XXII., No. 1. January, 1912. 10½" × 7½". Pp. 1-160. Chicago: Open Court Publishing Company. 60 cents, yearly \$2.00. Kegan Paul, Trench, Trübner and Co. 2s. 6d., yearly 9s. 6d.