

VOLUME 10  
NUMBER 3  
SEPTEMBER 1987

An International Journal of Current Research  
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

---

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

---

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

**Neuroethology of releasing mechanisms: Prey-catching in toads** Jörg-Peter Ewert

**Levels of modeling of mechanisms of visually guided behavior** Michael A. Arbib

**Methodologies for studying human knowledge** John R. Anderson

Also, Continuing Commentary on

**"Verbal hallucinations and language production processes in schizophrenia"**  
(Hoffman)

**"Hypnotic behavior: A social-psychological interpretation of amnesia, analgesia, and 'trance logic'"** (Spanos)

**"The nature of the black-white difference on various psychometric tests: Spearman's hypothesis"** (Jensen)

---

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editor

Stevan Harnad  
20 Nassau St., Suite 240  
Princeton, NJ 08542

## Assistant Editor

Vera House

## Associate Editors

### *Behavioral Biology*

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin  
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

### *Biosocial Behavior*

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

### *Evolutionary Biology*

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *History and Systems*

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

### *Language and Cognition*

Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge  
Peter Wason/University College, London

*Language and Language Disorders*  
Max Coltheart/Birbeck College, London

### *Linguistics*

Robert Freidin/Princeton

### *Neurobiology*

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

### *Neuropharmacology*

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

### *Neuropsychology*

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

### *Neurophysiology*

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

### *Paleoneurology*

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

### *Perception*

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

### *Philosophy*

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts  
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

### *Philosophy of Science*

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

### *Psychobiology*

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut  
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

### *Quantitative Methods*

Donald B. Rubin/Harvard

### *Vision and Artificial Intelligence*

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

\*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

**Copying** This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 10 (1987) is US \$140.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£83.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$61.00 net (£39.00) for individuals; US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$39.00 net (£23.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

# Contents Volume 10:3 September 1987

<b>Ewert, J.-P.</b> Neuroethology of releasing mechanisms: Prey-catching in toads	<b>337</b>
---	------------

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Arbib, M. A.</b> Advantages of experimentation in neuroscience	368	<b>Grobstein, P.</b> The nervous system/behavior interface: Levels of organization and levels of approach	380
<b>Baerends, G. P.</b> Ethology and physiology: A happy marriage	369	<b>Gruberg, E.</b> Sampling and information processing	381
<b>Broom, D. M.</b> After the sensory analysers: Problems with concepts and terminology	370	<b>Horridge, G. A.</b> Presumptions based on keyhole peeping	382
<b>Camhi, J. M.</b> How is a toad not like a bug?	371	<b>Ingle, D.</b> Ewert's model: Some discoveries and some difficulties	383
<b>Comer, C. M.</b> Sensorimotor functions: What is a command, that a code may yield it?	372	<b>Kondrashev, S. L.</b> Neuroethology and color vision in amphibians	385
<b>Dennett, D.</b> Eliminate the middletoad!	372	<b>Roth, G. &amp; Nishikawa, K.</b> Worm detector replaced by network model—but still a bit worm-infested	385
<b>DiDomenico, R. &amp; Eaton, R. C.</b> Toward a reformulation of the command concept	374	<b>Roucoux, A. &amp; Crommelinck, M.</b> Sensorimotor maps in the tectum	386
<b>Doty, R. W.</b> Has the greedy toad lost its soul; and if so, what was it?	375	<b>Stevens, K. A.</b> Implicit versus explicit computation	387
<b>Ebbesson, S. O. E.</b> Prey-catching in toads: An exceptional neuroethological model	375	<b>Székely, G.</b> Intelligent neurons	388
<b>Ehret, G.</b> Networks with evolutionary potential	376	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Fentress, J. C.</b> Ethological invariants: Boxes, rubber bands, and biological processes	377	<b>Ewert, J.-P.</b> Toad's prey-catching: A complex system with heuristic value	389
<b>Fernald, R. D.</b> More than meets the eye	378		
<b>Goodale, M. A.</b> The compleat visual system: From input to output	379		

<b>Arbib, M. A.</b> Levels of modeling of mechanisms of visually guided behavior	<b>407</b>
--	------------

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Baird, B.</b> Biologically applied neural networks may foster the coevolution of neurobiology and cognitive psychology	436	<b>Székely, G.</b> The computing frog	446
<b>Barnden, J. A.</b> The centrality of instantiations	437	<b>Tang, Y. Q.</b> Schema theory: A broadening viewpoint	446
<b>Ewert, J.-P.</b> Advantage of modeling in neuroscience	438	<b>Tsotsos, J. K.</b> Schemas: Not yet an interlingua for the brain sciences	447
<b>Gunderson, K.</b> Levels of psychological reality, Arbib's "schemas," and matters maybe metaphysical	439	<b>van Leeuwen, C.</b> Schemata and representational constraints	448
<b>Johannesma, P. I. M.</b> The biotope of <i>Rana computatrix</i>	440	<b>von Seelen, W.</b> Schema theory: A new approach?	448
<b>Langley, P.</b> Structure and process in schema-based architectures	442	<b>Wagemans, J. P.</b> Schemas and bridging gaps in the behavioral and brain sciences	449
<b>Lloyd, D.</b> Cognitive modeling: Of <i>Gedanken</i> beasts and human beings	442	<b>Whiting, H. T. A.</b> Grasping schemas is (are) difficult	450
<b>Mackworth, A. K.</b> What is the schema for a schema?	443	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Marshall, J. C.</b> Eye of toad, and toe of frog?	444	<b>Arbib, M. A.</b> Of schemas, neural nets, and <i>Rana computatrix</i>	451
<b>Matsumoto, N.</b> Recent physiological findings on the neuronal circuit of the frog's optic tectum	445		

<b>Anderson, J. R.</b> Methodologies for studying human knowledge	<b>467</b>
---	------------

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Arbib, M. A.</b> Many levels: More than one is algorithmic	478	<b>Goldman, A. I.</b> Ambiguities in "the algorithmic level"	484
<b>Clancey, W. J.</b> Functional principles and situated problem solving	479	<b>Hendler, J.</b> A flawed analogy?	485
<b>Clark, A.</b> The algorithm/implementation distinction	480	<b>Larkin, J. H.</b> Generality and applications	486
<b>Ericsson, K. A.</b> The scientific induction problem: A case for case studies	480	<b>Levine, D. S.</b> Connectionism and motivation are compatible	487
<b>Ewert, J.-P.</b> The evolutionary aspect of cognitive functions	481	<b>Mortensen, C.</b> Nonverbal knowledge as algorithms	487
<b>Glaser, R.</b> The study of cognition and instructional design: Mutual nurturance	483	<b>Reed, A. V.</b> Ways and means	488
		<b>Reilly, R. G.</b> Is there more than one type of mental algorithm?	489
		<b>Rosenbloom, P. S.</b> Weak versus strong claims about the algorithmic level	490

Seifert, C. & Norman, D. A. Levels of research	490	Townsend, J. T. Learning is critical, not implementation versus algorithm	497
Smolensky, P. Connectionism and implementation	492	Van Kleeck, M. Underestimating the importance of the implementational level	497
Stabler, E. P., Jr. Interactive instructional systems and models of human problem solving	493		
Stenning, K. Applying Marr to memory	494		
Taylor, M. M. & Pigeau, R. A. What is the algorithmic level?	495	<b>Author's Response</b>	
Touretzky, D. S. Connectionist models are also algorithmic	496	Anderson, J. R. Implementations, algorithms, and more	498

### **Continuing Commentary**

<i>On</i> Jensen, A. R. (1985) The nature of the black–white difference on various psychometric tests: Spearman's hypothesis. BBS 8:193–263.	507		
--	-----	--	--

Brody, N. Jensen, Gottfredson, and the black–white difference in intelligence test scores	507	<b>Author's Response</b>	
Corballis, M. C. Factoring intelligence: A longitudinal approach	508	Jensen, A. R. Further evidence for Spearman's hypothesis concerning black–white differences on psychometric tests	512
Gottfredson, L. S. The practical significance of black–white differences in intelligence	510		
Shockley, W. Jensen's data on Spearman's hypothesis: No artifact	512		

<i>On</i> Spanos, N. P. Hypnotic behavior: A social-psychological interpretation of amnesia, analgesia, and “trance logic.” BBS 9:449–502.	519		
--	-----	--	--

Gorassini, D. R. Phenomenal awareness and self-presentation	519	Wallace, B. The nonstate explanation of hypnosis: Stronger evidence is required	524
Kirmayer, L. J. Hypnosis and the limits of social-psychological reductionism	521	<b>Author's Response</b>	
Krippner, S. Can state and nonstate theorists collaborate?	521	Spanos, N. P. Hypnosis research: Paradigms in conflict	525
Stam, H. J. On attending to the data: The limiting conditions of hypnotic phenomena	522		

<i>On</i> Hoffman, R. E. Verbal hallucinations and language production processes in schizophrenia. BBS 9:503–548.	531		
---	-----	--	--

Harvey, P. D. Some information-processing models suggest possible connections between hallucinations and discourse failures	532	<b>Author's Response</b>	
Hemsley, D. R. Hallucinations: Unintended or unexpected?	532	Hoffman, R. E. Cognitive models of verbal hallucinations in schizophrenia	534
Kay, S. R. Are verbal hallucinations secondary to disordered thinking?	534		