

# Canadian Philosophical Review

# DIALOGUE

## Revue canadienne de philosophie

### **Introduction**

Tout le mal vient de l'inégalité. . .

JOSIANE BOULAD-AYOUB et FRANK CUNNINGHAM

Louise. . .

JEAN-CLAUDE GUÉDON

### **Articles**

Condorcet et la question de l'égalité

CHARLES COUTEL

Hegel : libération formelle et inégalité dans la société civile bourgeoise

PAULE-MONIQUE VERNES

Rationalité, communication, égalité

ROBERTO MIGUELEZ

Women's Inequality and the Retreat from the Welfare State:

Downloading and Discrimination against Women

BRENDA M. BAKER

Liberal Reasonability a Critical Tool? Reflections After Rawls

KAI NIELSEN

Freedom, Equality, and the True Costs of Resources

MAURICE RICKARD

### **Critical Notices/Études critiques**

David Copp on Moral Judgements

ROBERT W. BINKLEY

Partial Equality

COLIN M. MACLEOD

### **Intervention/Discussion**

Justice in Jeopardy if Needs Not Met: A Reply to Gillian Brock

DAVID BRAYBROOKE

Special Issue: **Equality** Numéro thématique : **L'Égalité**

Editorial Advisors/Conseillers à la rédaction :

**Josiane Boulad-Ayoub et Frank Cunningham**

**VOL. XXXVII, NO. 4 Fall/Automne 1998**

---

**President/Président :** SERGE ROBERT *Université du Québec à Montréal*  
**Editors/Rédaction :** PETER LOFTSON *University of Guelph*  
CLAUDE PANACCIO *Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières*  
**Associate Editor/Rédacteur adjoint :**  
(Anglophone office) ERIC DAYTON *University of Saskatchewan*

---

**Board of Referees/Comité d'experts**

JENNIFER ASHWORTH <i>University of Waterloo</i>	ANDREW IRVINE <i>University of British Columbia</i>
JOSIANE AYOUB <i>Université du Québec à Montréal</i>	J. N. KAUFMANN <i>Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières</i>
BRENDA BAKER <i>University of Calgary</i>	WILL KYMLICKA <i>University of Ottawa</i>
CARLOS BAZAN <i>Université d'Ottawa</i>	CLAUDE LAFLEUR <i>Université Laval</i>
SAM BLACK <i>Simon Fraser University</i>	DANIEL LAURIER <i>Université de Montréal</i>
LORRAINE CODE <i>York University</i>	GEORGES LEROUX <i>Université du Québec à Montréal</i>
FRANÇOIS DUCHESNEAU <i>Université de Montréal</i>	DUNCAN MACINTOSH <i>Dalhousie University</i>
SUZANNE FOISY <i>Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières</i>	CARL MATHESON <i>University of Manitoba</i>
MAURICE GAGNON <i>Université de Sherbrooke</i>	ADAM MORTON <i>University of Bristol</i>
NICHOLAS GRIFFIN <i>McMaster University</i>	KATHLEEN OKRUHLIK <i>University of Western Ontario</i>
JEAN GRONDIN <i>Université de Montréal</i>	ARTHUR RIPSTEIN <i>University of Toronto</i>
H. S. HARRIS <i>York University</i>	DAVID SCHMIDTZ <i>University of Arizona</i>
	PAUL THAGARD <i>University of Waterloo</i>

---

**Editorial Policy**

*Dialogue* publishes, in English and French, articles in all branches of philosophy and is open to contributions from any philosophical perspective. The articles and reviews in *Dialogue* are peer reviewed.

**Politique éditoriale**

*Dialogue* publie en anglais et en français des textes appartenant aux divers domaines de la philosophie, sans discrimination d'allégeance philosophique. Les articles et les études critiques soumis à *Dialogue* font l'objet d'une évaluation par les pairs.

---

**Bibliographic Indexing/Indexation bibliographique** *Dialogue* is indexed in: /  
*Dialogue* est répertoriée dans: *The Philosopher's Index*; *The Modern Language Directory of Periodicals*; *L'année philologique*; *Bulletin signalétique*, 519: *Philosophie*; *Répertoire bibliographique de la philosophie*.

---

**DIALOGUE**

ISSN 0012-2173

Published by Wilfrid Laurier University Press for the Canadian Philosophical Association. This journal has been prepared from camera-ready copy provided by the Editors of *Dialogue*. / Publiée par Wilfrid Laurier University Press pour l'Association canadienne de philosophie. Cette revue a été produite à partir de prêts-à-photographier fournis par les rédacteurs de *Dialogue*.

Published quarterly for the Canadian Philosophical Association with grant support from the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council. The assistance and support of the University of Saskatchewan and the University of Quebec in Trois-Rivières is also gratefully acknowledged. / Revue trimestrielle de l'Association canadienne de philosophie publiée avec l'assistance financière du Conseil de recherches en sciences humaines. *Dialogue* bénéficie également du soutien de l'Université du Québec à Trois-Rivières et de l'Université de Saskatchewan.

---

Printed in Canada/Imprimé au Canada



*DIALOGUE* Fall/Automne 1998 (date of issue/date de parution : December/décembre 1998)

Publications Mail Registration/Poste-publications enregistrement #2661  
Postage paid at Kitchener/Port payé à Kitchener  
Return postage guaranteed/Port de retour garanti

# DIALOGUE

Canadian Philosophical Review/Revue canadienne de philosophie

Vol. XXXVII, No. 4 Fall/Automne 1998

Special Issue: **Equality** Numéro thématique : **L'Égalité**

Editorial Advisors/Conseillers à la rédaction :

**Josiane Boulad-Ayoub** and/et **Frank Cunningham**

## **Introduction**

Tout le mal vient de l'inégalité...

JOSIANE BOULAD-AYOUB et FRANK CUNNINGHAM 669

Louise...

JEAN-CLAUDE GUÉDON 677

## **Articles**

Condorcet et la question de l'égalité

CHARLES COUTEL 681

Hegel : libération formelle et inégalité dans la société civile bourgeoise

PAULE-MONIQUE VERNES 693

Rationalité, communication, égalité

ROBERTO MIGUELEZ 703

Women's Inequality and the Retreat from the Welfare State:

Downloading and Discrimination against Women

BRENDA M. BAKER 719

Liberal Reasonability a Critical Tool? Reflections After Rawls

KAI NIELSEN 739

Freedom, Equality, and the True Costs of Resources

MAURICE RICKARD 761

## **Critical Notices/Études critiques**

David Copp on Moral Judgements

ROBERT W. BINKLEY 769

Partial Equality

COLIN M. MACLEOD 775

## **Intervention/Discussion**

Justice in Jeopardy if Needs Not Met: A Reply to Gillian Brock

DAVID BRAYBROOKE 799

## Book Reviews/Comptes rendus

MICHAEL J. ZIMMERMAN, *The Concept of Moral Obligation*  
CHRISTOPHER G. GRIFFIN 805

DAVID DYZENHAUS and ARTHUR RIPSTEIN, editors, *Law and Morality: Readings in Legal Philosophy*  
DAVID CROSSLEY 807

DAVID C. THOMASMA and THOMASINE KUSHNER, editors, *Birth to Death: Science and Bioethics*  
JASON SCOTT ROBERT 810

PHILIP KNEE, *Penser l'appartenance. Enjeux des Lumières en France*  
SÉBASTIEN CHARLES 812

JOHN C. O'NEAL, *The Authority of Experience: Sensationist Theory in the French Enlightenment*  
JØRN SCHØSLER 815

SIMONE GOYARD-FABRE, *Les principes philosophiques du droit politique moderne*  
MARCEL FILION 820

RICHARD KESHEN, *Reasonable Self-Esteem*  
TOVE FINNESTAD 822

W. WATTS MILLER, *Durkheim, Morals and Modernity*  
M. J. GANE 826

DENNIS PATTERSON, editor, *A Companion to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory*  
THEODORE M. BENDITT 828

BRIAN FAY, *Contemporary Philosophy of Social Science: A Multicultural Approach*  
JAMES VAN EVRA 831

JÜRGEN HABERMAS et JOHN RAWLS, *Débat sur la justice politique*  
STÉPHANE COURTOIS 833

CHARLES TAYLOR, *La liberté des modernes*  
GENEVIÈVE NOOTENS 837

PHILIPPE VAN PARIJS, *Refonder la solidarité*  
JOSEPH PESTIEAU 841

ANDRÉ BERTEN, PABLO DA SILVEIRA et HERVÉ POURTOIS, directeurs, *Libéraux et communautariens*  
DANIEL WEINSTOCK 844

ANDRÉ COMTE-SPONVILLE et LUC FERRY, *La sagesse des modernes. Dix questions pour notre temps*  
SÉBASTIEN CHARLES 847

HOWARD B. RADEST, *Humanism with a Human Face: Intimacy and the Enlightenment*

BYRON WILLISTON 849

MARTHA NUSSBAUM and respondents, *For Love of Country: Debating the Limits of Patriotism*

ARTHUR RIPSTEIN 851

NORMAN DANIELS, *Justice and Justification: Reflective Equilibrium in Theory and Practice*

MARK VOROBEJ 853

MARGARET JANE RADIN, *Contested Commodities: The Trouble with Trade in Sex, Children, Body Parts, and Other Things*

ROBERT K. FULLINWIDER 855

KRISTJÁN KRISTJÁNSSON, *Social Freedom: The Responsibility View*

JENNIFER WELCHMAN 858

ANDREW LIGHT and ERIC KATZ, editors, *Environmental Pragmatism*

PETER MILLER 860

KIMBERLEY HUTCHINGS, *Kant, Critique and Politics*

ROLF GEORGE 863

RICHARD BEARDSWORTH, *Derrida and the Political*

JONATHAN SALEM-WISEMAN 865

ANDREW REATH, BARBARA HERMAN, and CHRISTINE M. KORSGAARD, editors, *Reclaiming the History of Ethics: Essays for John Rawls*

WES COOPER 867

**Books Received/Livres reçus 871**

**Index/Sommaire/Volume XXXVII/1998 876**

*Journal of  
Indian Council  
of Philosophical  
Research*

Editor: DAYA KRISHNA

is a tri-annual philosophical journal published by the Indian Council of Philosophical Research (ICPR). It is devoted to the publication of original papers of high standard in any branch of philosophy. One of the objectives of the ICPR is to encourage interdisciplinary research with direct philosophical relevance. Accordingly, contributions from scholars in other fields of knowledge, dealing with specific philosophical problems connected with their respective fields of specialization, would be highly welcome. However, good and original contributions pertaining to any branch of traditional philosophy would be equally welcome.

Each regular issue of the journal will contain, besides full-length papers, discussions and comments, notes on papers, book reviews, information on new books and other relevant academic information. Each issue will contain about 160–180 pages (Royal 8vo).

*Annual Subscriptions*

	Inland	Foreign	
Institutions	Rs. 300	U.S. \$30	(Surface Mail)
Individuals	Rs. 150	U.S. \$20	-do-
Students and retired teachers	Rs. 100	U.S. \$15	-do-
Single Issue	Rs. 100	U.S. \$15	-do-
Life Membership	Rs. 1200	U.S. \$180	-do-

Bonafide students and retired teachers are requested to ask for special subscription form.

Air mail cost will be charged extra to those subscribers who want to get the Journal by air mail. Request for air mail delivery must be made in writing.

For subscription and all other business enquiries (including advertisement in the JICPR) please contact directly:

Subscription Department  
CENTRAL NEWS AGENCY PRIVATE LIMITED  
23/90 Connaught Circus, New Delhi 110 001, India

All subscriptions must be prepaid.

All contributions to the Journal, other editorial enquiries and books for review are to be sent to the Editor, Indian Council of Philosophical Research, Rajendra Bhavan (Fourth Floor), 210 Deen Dayal Upadhyaya Marg, New Delhi 110 002.