The following letter has been received by the Executive Editors:

Dear Sirs,
I am grateful to Professor J.J.C. Smart for informing me that he was not the author of the article, "Utilitarianism", in the Concise Encyclopedia of Western Philosophy and Philosophers, ed. J.O. Urmson, as I asserted in my recent article, "Utilitarianism: For and Against", in this Journal. The article in Urmson's Encyclopedia is unsigned; few readers would be in a position to check the incorrectness of my assertion. I want to apologize to Professor Smart and to the unknown author of the article for my error.

## D.P. Dryer <br> University of Toronto

## Noûs

Nihil philosophici a nobis alienum putamus Hector-Neri Castañeda, editor
Volume X
Number 1
March 1976
SYMPOSIUM PAPERS to be read at the meeting of the Western Division of the American Philosophical Association in New Orleans, Louisiana, April 29-May 1, 1976.

Margaret Wilson/ Descartes: The Epistemological Argument for Mind-Body Distinctness. Commentators: Alan Donagan, George Nakhnikian
David Shwayder/ On the Identification of Bodies. Commentators: Roderick M. Chisholm, Sydney Shoemaker

Zeno Vendler/ Thinking of Individuals. Commentators: Keith Donnellan, Barbara Humphries
William Earle/ The Phenomenological Verification of Mystical Claims (Abstract). Commentators: J. N. Findlay, Richard Taylor
Kendall Walton/ Points of View in Narrative and Depictive Representation. Commentators: Marcia Eaton, Nicholas Wolterstorff
Robert StaInaker/ Possible Worlds. Commentators: John Pollock, John Wallace
Allan Gibbard/ Natural Property Rights. Commentators: Hugo A. Bedau, Norman S. Care

A quarterly, NOÛS is published in March, May, September, and November each year. In 1976, there will be a ten-year cumulative index issue in November. For individuals the subscription rates are: one year, $\$ 9.00$; two years, $\$ 17.50$; three years, $\$ 26.00$. For bona fide students: $\$ 8.50$ per year. For institutions: $\$ 17.00$ per year (plus $10 \%$ for subscriptions handled through a subscription agency). Add 75 cents per year for all non-U.S. subscriptions. Make checks for one-year subscriptions payable to INDIANA UNIVERSITYNOÛS. Checks for multiple-year subscriptions should be made payable to INDIANA UNIVERSITY FOUNDATION-NOÛS.

Order from The Secretary, NOÛS
Department of Philosophy, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 47401

## DIALOGUE

## Canadian Philosophical Review - Revue Canadienne de Philosophie

Vol XIV - 1975-No. 4<br>Editors - Redaction<br>Francois Duchesneau (Université d'Ottawa)<br>John Woods (University of Victoria)

ARTICLES
Infini, substance et attributs. Sur le spinozisme
(à propos d`une étude magistrale) Jean Bernhardt
Dieu garant de véracité ou Reid critique de Descartes Louise Marcil-Lacoste
Wilfrid Sellars on Scientific Realism
Determinism: A Small Point
Aitia a generative factor in Aristotle's philosophy Bas C. van Fraassen Jordan Howard Sobel

Dieter Henrich et "The Proof-Structure of Kant's Transcendental Deduction". Réflexions critiques
J.M. Moravesik

Raymond Brouillet
Guy Bouchard
NOTES - DISCUSSIONS
On Being Present To the Mind: A Reply
R.F. McRae

One Ought to Do What One Thinks One Ought To Do Jerome E. Bickenbach
CRITICAL NOTICE - ETUDE CRITIQUE
Catching Up With Castaneda
L.W. Sumner

COMPTES RENDUS - BOOK REVIEW

Membership - Cotisation annuelle: \$16.00; Students - Etudiants: $\mathbf{\$ 5 . 0 0}$<br>Subscriptions-Abonnements: $\mathbf{\$ 1 6 . 0 0}$; Single Copies - Le numero: $\mathbf{\$ 5 . 0 0}$

Association canadienne de philosophie - Canadian Philosophical Association
Suite 46, 1390 ouest rue Sherbrooke (Sherbrooke St. West), Montreal, Quebec H3G 1K2

## PHILOSOPHIQUES

Revue des Facultés et Départements d'expression française au Canada. La revue parait deux fois l'an, en octobre et en avril.

Direction: Y. Lafrance. Rédaction: B. Garceau, R. Nadeau, R. Brouillet, M. Lagucux, Guy Lafrance, J.N. Kaufmann, G. Charron, P. McCormick.

## Sommaire du vol. II, no. 2, octobre 1975

1. Articles: M. Gagnon, Une analyse sémantique du concept de causalité est-elle possible? L. Giroux, Heidegger et la Métapysique: vers un double dépassement. P. McCormick, L'esthétiqe de Dilthey: Phénoménologie et théorie littéraire.
2. Etudes critiques: G. Leroux, Platon. La Médiation du regard, par L. Paquet. J.Trouillard, Le Même et l'Autre dans la structure ontologique du "Timée" de Platon, par L Brisson.
3. Bulletin: B. Garceau, La Philosophie analytique de la religion: contribution canadienne (1970-1975).
4. Interventions: Autour du Bill 50 sur les Droits de l'Homme.
5. Chronique.

Abonnements: Institutions: $\$ 10.00$, Individus: $\$ 8.00$, Etudiants: $\$ 6.00$, de Soutien: $\$ 30.00$

LES EDITIONS BELLARMIN, 8100 Blva. Saint-Laurent, Montréal, Quebec H2P 2L9

## MACMILLAN ANNOUNCES

Renascent Rationalism
Helier J. Robinson
Renascent Rationalism represents a new and provocative departure from the often barren currents of twentieth-century philosophy. While the Leibniz-Russell theory of perception commands serious attention, it requires substantial
 adjustment in common-sense beliefs-all apparent worlds but one's own and the real world are beyond direct acquaintance, and the sole alternative is speculation about the radically unknowable. Theoretical scientists allow this, provided the speculation is grounded in empirical science. For Renascent Rationalism the result is a whole new philosophy of science and a tentative relational metaphysics. The latter includes the concept of 'hekergy', a generalization of the thermodynamic concept of free energy, leading to, among other things, a field-theory of mind-this, in turn, allows a new explanation of ego and other features of mind. The logical possibility of a mind in a state of maximum hekergy leads to a theory of supra-rationality, akin to those theories of Plato and Spinoza, in which seven distinct and significant meanings are found for the word 'God'.
ISBN $\quad 0-7705-1282-8 \quad 290$ pages $\$ 14.95$

## Hegel

## Charles Taylor

This comprehensive, and invaluable, new study will be the major work in English on Hegel. The author attempts throughout to provide a critical and novel account of the coherence and originality of Hegel's enterprise, relating it to the earlier history of philosophy, to the central intellectual and spiritual issues of Hegel's time, and to the development of philosophy in this century. ISBN 521-20679-0 592 pages $\$ 37.50$

[^0]
## PHILOSOPHY DOCUMENTATION CENTER

The Philosophy Research Archives. The new microfilm journal in philosophy, whose purpose is to provide, for worthwhile articles, a means of publication that is free of many of the disadvantages and constraints of ordinary journal publication. The Archives should be of particular value to those needing a prompt evaluation of the products of their research or to those wishing prompt dissemination of their papers.
Jean-Paul Sartre and His Critics: An International Bibliography (1938-1975). A comprehensive and up-to-date (thru early 1975) bibliography containing over 5,000 entries on the philosophic, literary, political, and psychological aspects of of Sartre's thought.
Henri Bergson: A Bibliography, by P. A. Y. Gunter, A comprehensive and up-to-date bibliography covering the philosophic, literary, and scientific aspects of Bergson's thought. The bibliography contains over 470 entries by Bergson, including important translations, as well as over 4,000 entries about Bergson. Almost all of the entries by Bergson are annotated, as well as many of those concerning Bergson.

The Directory of American Philosophers. A handbook of philosophy covering the United States and Canada with information on faculties of philosophy, names, addresses, and specialties of philosophers, data on colleges and universities, philosophical societies, philosophical centers and institutes, philosophy journals, publishers of philosophical works and data on fellowships and assistantships (types and dollar amounts) available in philosophy.
The International Directory of Philosophy and Philosophers. A handbook of philosophy covering Europe, Central and South America, Asia, Australia, and Africa. This directory provides names, addresses, and specialties of philosophers as well as data on colleges, universitics, philosophical societies, philosophical institutes, philosophical journals, and publishers of philosophical works.

The Philosopher's Index: An International Index to Philosophical Periodicals and the Philosophy Research Archives. An up-to-date index of articles from more than 260 philosophy and interdisciplinary journals and papers of the Philosophy Research Archives. In the author index you find complete bibliographic information on an article as well as an abstract written by the author. The "Book Review Index" contains an alphabetical listing by author of recently published philosophy books, which have been reviewed in the journals which we index.
The Philosopher's Information Retrieval System (PIRS). A computerized retrieval system that will store data and provide custom bibliographies with abstracts on any logical combination of philosophical topics.
The Bibliography of Philosophy. Contains reviews and notices of books published in the western world. As the U.S. editorial center, we select important philosophy books for review. and forward all reviews and notices to the editor in Paris.
Mailing Labels of 10,500 philosophers in the United States and Canada are available as well as addresses by specialty, i.e., 1144 in Ethics, 833 in History of Modern Philosophy, etc.

For further information, please write to:


Philosophy Documentation Center Bowling Green State University Bowling Green, Ohio 43403 U.S.A.

A quarterly forum for reasoned discourse in the arts and humanities, Critical Inquiry publishes articles on literature, music, the visual arts, film, and popular culture. The authors-writers and scholars in many fields-represent a wide diversity of critical approaches, yet all are concerned with the principles and objectives of criticism itself and with the underlying assumptions brought to judgments about art. In addition to articles, Critical Inquiry presents review essays, discussions by prominent artists of their own and others' art, exchanges between major critics on their contributions to the field, and substantial commentary and debate.

## Appearing in Volume 2

Giulio Carlo Argan<br>Saul Bellow<br>Harold Bloom<br>Bertrand H. Bronson<br>Edward T. Cone

Stanley E. Fish
Northrop Frye
Ricardo Gullón
Paul de Man
Annette Kolodny
Leonard B. Meyer
J. Hillis Miller

Elder Olson
Christopher Ricks
Harold Rosenberg
ideology and iconology a world too much with us
poetry, revisionism, repression
traditional ballads musically considered
in defense of song: the contribution of Roger Sessions
interpreting the Variorum
expanding eyes
on space in the novel
political allegory in Rousseau
notes on defining a "Feminist Literary Criticism"
grammatical simplicity and relational richness:
the Trio of Mozart's G Minor Symphony
Trollope's Autobiography and fiction as "play"
the poetic process
lies
metaphysical feelings in modern art

Published quarterly by The University of Chicago Press
Sheldon Sacks, Editor; Wayne C. Booth, and Arthur Heiserman, Coeditors

Please begin my one-year subscription with vol. 2, no. 1 (Autumn 1975)
$\square$ Institutions \$16.00 $\square$ Individuals $\$ 12.00 \square$ Students $\$ 9.60$
Countries other than USA add $\$ 1.00$ to cover postage
Name
Address
City $\qquad$
Please mail with your check or purchase order to Critical Inquiry, The University of Chicago Press, 11030 Langley Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 3 60628

# IN@UIIRTE Edited by Arne Naess and Alastair Hannay 

## Volume 18 (1975)

No. 3 (Autumn)
Some Myths about 'Mental Illness' Michael S. Moore
Wittgenstein on Ostensive Definition
P. M. S. Hacker

Doubts about Moral Principles
Peter Mew
Bill Wallace: A Conversation
A. Dewey Jensen

Toward a Spinozistic Modification of Skinner's Theory of Man
What is the Ethical in Fear and Trembling?
Carl G. Hedman
Bruce Russel!
D. Shapere: Galileo: A Pbilosophical Study

Per Stromholm
A Kind of Philosopher: Comments in Connection with Some Recent Books on Kierkegaard

Alastair Hannay

## No. 4 (Winter) Guest Editor: Guttorm Fløistad

A Biological Approach to Sociological Functionalism
Vernon Pratt
Naess's Pluralistic Mctaphilosophy Ingemund Gullvåg
Giving the Sceptic a Good Name
Popper's Metaphysical Research Program for the Human Sciences
Alastair Hannay
Danto's Rejection of Immanent Causation
Noretta Koertge
G. Frege: Conceptual Notation and Related Articles, and
M. Dummett: Frege. Philosophy of Language Thomas E. Wren

Hans D. Sluga
J. L. Mackie: The Cement of the Universe. A Study of Causation
J. A. Foster

Subscription: $£ 4.90, \$ 15.00$ (institutions)/£3.90, $\$ 12.00$ (individuals)
Published quarterly by UNIVERSITETSFORLAGET, P.O. Box 307, Blindern, Oslo 3, Norway

## Social Theory and Practice <br> 

An International and Interdisciplinary fournal of Social Philosophy

Social Theory and Practice is a forum for the discussion of important and controversial social and political issues. This joumal publishes original work from all relevant disciplines - the humanities, social sciences, and natural sciences. Constructive and critical works on all social issues are welcome. Social Theory and Practice is published by the Department of Philosophy, Florida State University twice yearly, with four issues constituting a single volume.

## Advisory Board

Christian Bay, WiHiam Blackstone, Noam Chomsky, Garrett Hardin, Virginia Held, Robert L. Holmes, lrving L. Horowitz, Oliver M. Lee, Joseph Margolis, Rene Zavoleta Mercado, Ralph Miliband, Sidney M. Peck, John Somerville. Francis Sparshott, Georges Thibault, Richard Wasserstrom, Donald Wells, Robert Paul Wolff

All Manuscripts are submitted to Managing Editor, Social Theory and Practice / Department of Philosophy / Florida State University / Tallahassee, FL 32306

[^1]
# The Monist <br> An International Quarterly Journal of General Philosophical Inquiry 

Founded 1888 by Edward C. Hegeler

Editor, Eugene FREEMAN
Editorial Board: William P. Alston, Monroe C. Beardsley, Lewis White Beck, William A. Earle Dagfinn Follesdal, William Frankena, Maurice Mandelbaum, R. Barcan Marcus, Richard Martin, Mary Mothersill, Joseph Owens, Richard Rorty, J. B. Schneewind, Wilfrid Sellars, John E. Smith, Richard Wasserstrom.

Managing Editor, Ann FREEMAN
EACHISSUE IS LIMITED TO ARTICLES ON A SINGLE GENERAL TOPIC. Communicate with the Editor in advance for Special Instructions. Papers should be 6000-8000 words in length and must be submitted in duplicate nine months prior to the scheduled publication of the issue, accompanied by return postage.

SCHEDULED PUBLICATION DATES:
Vol. 59, No. 4 Oct., 1975 The Philosophy of Mysticism
Vol. 60, No. 1 Jan., 1976 Bioethics and Social Responsibility
Vol. 60, No. 2 Apr., 1976 Philosophy and Religion in the Nineteenth Century
Vol. 60, No. 3 July, 1976 New Directions in Semantics
Vol. 60, No. 4 Oct., 1976 Historicism and Epistemology
Vol. 61, No. 1 Jan., 1977 Conceptions of the Self: East and West
Vol. 61, No. 2 Apr., 1977 The Philosophy of Thomas Reid
Vol. 61, No. 3 July, 1977 Nominalism, Past and Present
Editorial Office: Box 1908, Los Gatos, California 95030
Business Office: Box 599, La Salle, Illinois 61301
SUBSCRIPTION RATES: United States: Annual (4 issues): Institutions, $\$ 10.00$; individuals, $\$ 7.50$. Single copies: $\$ 2.75$. Foreign postage: Add 25 cents to single copy rate or $\$ 1.00$ to subscription rate.

# Australasian Journal 

 ofPhilosophy

Editor: Robert Brown<br>Published in May, August and December

Subscriptions are $\$ 8$ (Aust.) for institutions and $\$ 5$ (Aust.) for individuals. They should be sent to the Business Manager at the Department of Philosophy, School of General Studies, A.N.U., Canberra, A.C.T., 2600.

Manuscripts should be sent to the Editor at the Department of Philosophy; Research School of Social Sciences, A.N.U., Canberra, A.C.T., 1600.


## CANADIAN JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY <br> PUBLISHED BY THE CANADIAN ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLISHING IN PHILOSOPHY

Editorial Board John Heintz (Calgary). John King-Farlow (Alberta). Charles Morgan (Alberta), Kai Nielsen (Calgary). Terence Penelhum (Calgary). William Rozeboom (Alberta)-La Redaction

Volume V, Number 2 - October 1975
T. Regan: "The Moral Basis of Vegetarianism"
M. Kubara: "Acrasia, Human Agency and Normative Psychology"
J. English "Abortion and the Concept of a Person"
D. Van De Veer: "Justifying 'Wholesale Slaughter'
R. G. Frey: "Some Aspects of the Doctrine of Double Effect"
F. Cunningham: Critical Notice of St. Lukes Individualism
A. Ryan: Critical Notice of F. Cunningham Objectivity in Social Science
A. Montefiore: Critical Notice of Culture et Langage
P. T. Mackenzie: Critical Notice of I. Dilman Deduction and Induction

Annual Subscription-Institutions \$12: Individuais \$10: Students \$5-Abonnement Annuel Subscriptions-Roger A. Shiner (Executive Secretary)-pour Abonnements<br>Manuscripts-Roger A. Shiner (Executive Secretary)-pour Manuscripts<br>Department of Philosophy, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, T6G 2E1, Canada

## Nevy Essays

IN THE

## Phiilasajiny of kitimal

Edited by<br>John King-Farlow and Roger A. Shiner

## Contents

## Observation and Subjectivity in Quine Harold Morick

Actions
L. H. Davis

Can Desires be Causes of Actions?
D. A. Browne

# Strawson's Transcendental Deduction of Other Minds J. L. Martin 

Physicalism and the Evolution of Consciousness
Roland Puccetti
Scientific Reduction and the Mind-Body Problem
L. F. Mucciolo
Wittgenstein on Verification and Private Language
J. S. Clegg
Can One Recognize Kinds of Private Object?Charles E. Marks
PRICE: ..... \$7

Now reprinting in second impression.
ORDER FROM: CANADIAN JOURNAL OF PHILOSOPHY, Editorial and Business Office, The University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta, Canada T6G 2 E 1.

# Jourmal off Phillosophical Logic 

Editor-in-Chief: Bas C. van Fraassen, University of Toronto, Ont, Canada.

Editorial Board: L. Aqvist, N. D. Belnap, Jr., M. J. Cresswell, J. E. Fenstad, F. Fitch, D. Follesdal, C. Hambiin, H. G. Herzberger, J. Hintikka. W. Hodges, S. Kanger, D. Kaplan, S. Kripke. K. Lambert, R. B. Marcus, G. J. Massey, D. Prawitz, N. Rescher, W. C. Salmon, D. Scott, K. Segerberg, P. F. Strawson, P. Suppes, R. H. Thomason, G. H. von Wright.

Executive Committee: N. D. Belnap, Jr., B. C. van Fraassen, G. J. Massey, N. Rescher.
The journal is concerned with philosophical studies utilizing formal methods or dealing with topics in logical theory. Specifically included are: contributions to branches of logical theory directly related to philosophical concerns; contributions to philosophical discussions that utilize the machinery of formal logic; discussions of philosophical issues relating to logic and the logical structure of language; and philosophical work relating to special sciences (for example linguistics, history of logic. or physics), with emphasis on foundational problems.
Subscription price per volume of four issues Dfl. 100,- / US $\$ 40.00$, plus Dfl. 15,- $/$ US $\$ 6.00$ for postage and handling. One volume will be published yearly. Personal subscription price on request. Reduced price for members of the Association for Symbolic Logic Dfi. 40,- / US $\$ 16.00$ per volume, including postage and handling.

D. Reidell Publishhing Compamy

Dordrecht - Holland / Boston - U.S.A.

## Philosophical Studies <br> An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition

Editor: Keith Lehrer, University of Arizona. U.S.A.
Editorial Assistant: Vincent Lazara, University of Arizona, U.S.A.
Board of Consulting Editors: David Braybrooke, Joseph L. Camp. Jr.. L. J. Cohen, James Cornman, Alan Donagan, Keith Donnellan, Mary Hesse, Risto Hilpinen, R. M. Martin, Terence Parsons, Gunther Patzig. A. M. Quinton, Jerome Schneewind, Robert Sleigh. Jr., Judith Thomson.
Philosophical Studies fills the urgent and growing need for space devoted to quick publication of timely contributions to analytic philosophy. It emphasizes the rapid exchange of notes and criticism. To provide balance and scope the editors will, on occasion, solicit contributions comments and elucidations from philosophers whose voices might not otherwise be heard when the spotlight of discussion points in their direction.
Philosophical Studies welcomes papers in all areas of analytic philosophy. It recognizes that there are divergent 'tendencies' within the analytic movement, and requires only that contributions represent an application of methods of analysis and clarification of meaning. Papers the content of which falls primarily within the scope of the natural. social or psychological disciplines will be considered only if this content is subordinated to the purposes of philosophical analysis.
Subscription price per volume of six issues Dff. 95,- / US $\$ 38.00$, plus Dfi. 20, / US $\$ 8.00$ for postage and handling. Two volumes will be published yearly. Personal subscription price on request.
D. Reidel Publishhing Compamy

## Dordrecht - Holland / Boston - U.S.A.

La Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy annonce qu'elle a entrepris la publication, en plus du Canadian Journal of Philosophy, d'une série de monographies,


## LA PHILOSOPHIE AU CANADA PHILOSOPHY IN CANADA



La série comprendra des oeuvres dans tous les domaines de la philosophie, en anglais ou en français. Elle donnera la préférence a des oeuvres canadiennes, et, au moins au commencement, aux monographies d'une longueur de 15,000 a 35,000 mots - trop longues pour être des articles de revue, trop courtes pour être des livres de taille normale. Les manuscrits, une fois redigés, doivent presenter les qualités réquises pour obtenir une subvention du Conseil Canadien de Recherche sur les Humanités. Ils devront premièrement être envoyés à:

## David Braybrooke <br> Department of Philosophy <br> Dalhousie University <br> Halifax, Nouvelle-Ecosse,

qui aura qualité de directeur de la série pour la C.A.P.P., avec la collaboration d'autres membres de sọn départment.
Les premières monographies á être publiées seront
(1) Charles B. Daniels (University of Victoria), The Evaluation of Ethical Theories
et (2) George Englebretsen
(Bishop's University)
Speaking of Persons,
suivies de près - nous l'éspèrons - de deux monographies ecrites par des auteurs francophones.

The Canadian Association for Publishing in Philosophy wishes to announce that it is undertaking to publish, in addition to the Canadian Journal of Philosophy, a monograph series,


## PHILOSOPHY IN CANADA LA PHILOSOPHIE AU CANADA


which will include works in any field of philosophy, in French or English. Priority will be given to Canadian material, all else being equal; and at least initially to monographs of between 15,000 words and 35,000 - too long for journal articles, too short to be books of ordinary size. Manuscripts will have to qualify after editing for subventions from the Humanities Research Council of Canada. They should be submitted in the first instance to:

## David Braybrooke Department of Philosophy Dalhousie University Halifax, Nova Scotia,

who with the collaboration of other members of his department will edit the series on behalf of the C.A.P.P.
The first monographs to be published will be
(1) Charles B. Daniels (University of Victoria),
The Evaluation of Ethical Theories
and (2) George Englebretsen (Bishop's University),
Speaking of Persons, to be followed shortly, it is hoped, by two monographs by francophone authors.


[^0]:    MACMILLAN OFCANADA
    Macmillan of Canada, 70 Bond Street, Toronto, Ontario M5B 1X3

[^1]:    Subscription Rates - Individuals: per volume (US) $\$ 10$; single issues $\$ 3$. Libraries: per volume $\$ 21$; single issues $\$ 6$.

