

VOLUME 10  
NUMBER 4  
DECEMBER 1987

An International Journal of Current Research  
and Theory with Open Peer Commentary

---

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

---

Appearing in this issue, with Commentary . . .

**The anomaly called psi: Recent research and criticism**

K. Ramakrishna Rao & John Palmer

**Parapsychology: Science of the anomalous or search for the soul?** James E. Alcock

**The comparative psychology of intelligence** Euan M. Macphail

**Précis of *Relevance: Communication and Cognition*** Dan Sperber & Deirdre Wilson

Also, Continuing Commentary on

**"Intentionality and information"** (Sayre)

**"Unconscious semantic activation"** (Holender)

**"Hypnotic behavior"** (Spanos)

**"Unconscious processes and action"** (Libet)

**"Episodic memory"** (Tulving)

**"Reproductive success"** (Vining)

---

C A M B R I D G E U N I V E R S I T Y P R E S S

ISSN 0140-525X

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editor

Stevan Harnad  
20 Nassau St., Suite 240  
Princeton, NJ 08542

## Assistant Editor

Vera House

## Associate Editors

### *Behavioral Biology*

Jack P. Hailman/U. Wisconsin  
Hubert Markl/U. Konstanz

### *Biosocial Behavior*

Glendon Schubert/U. Hawaii, Manoa

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/U. Western Ontario

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/MRC, London and MPI, Nijmegen

### *Evolutionary Biology*

Michael T. Ghiselin/California Academy of Sciences

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *History and Systems*

Julian Jaynes/Princeton

### *Language and Cognition*

Philip Johnson-Laird/MRC, Cambridge  
Peter Wason/University College, London

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Birbeck College, London

### *Linguistics*

Robert Freidin/Princeton

### *Neurobiology*

Irving Kupfermann/Columbia

### *Neuropharmacology*

Susan D. Iversen/Merck Sharp and Dohme, Ltd.

### *Neuropsychology*

Jeffrey A. Gray/Inst. Psychiatry, London

### *Neurophysiology*

Sten Grillner/Karolinska Institutet

### *Paleoneurology*

Stephen Jay Gould/Harvard

### *Perception*

Richard Gregory/U. Bristol

### *Philosophy*

Daniel C. Dennett/Tufts  
Gilbert Harman/Princeton

### *Philosophy of Science*

Adolf Grünbaum/U. Pittsburgh

### *Psychobiology*

Victor H. Denenberg/U. Connecticut  
David S. Olton/Johns Hopkins

### *Quantitative Methods*

Donald B. Rubin/Harvard

### *Vision and Artificial Intelligence*

Stuart Sutherland/U. Sussex

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called 'Open Peer Commentary' to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See *Instructions for Authors and Commentators*, inside back cover.) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project.

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to write to the editor.

This publication was supported in part by NIH Grant LM 03539 from the National Library of Medicine.

\*Modelled on the 'CA Comment' service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

**Copying** This journal is registered with the Copyright Clearance Center (27 Congress St., Salem, MA 01970). Organizations in the U.S.A. who are also registered with the CCC may therefore copy material (beyond the limits permitted by sections 107 and 108 of U.S. Copyright Law) subject to payment to the CCC of the per-copy fee indicated in the code on the first page of the article. This consent does not extend to multiple copying for promotional or commercial purposes.

ISI Tear Sheet Service, 3501 Market Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, is authorized to supply single copies of separate articles for private use only.

For all other use, permission should be sought from the Cambridge or New York offices of the Press.

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published quarterly in March, June, September and December. Four parts form a volume. The subscription price, which includes postage, of Volume 10 (1987) is US \$140.00 net in the U.S.A. and Canada (£83.00 in the U.K. and rest of the world) for institutions; US \$61.00 net (£39.00) for individuals; US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for BBS Associates; and US \$35.00 net (£23.00) for students (in the U.S.A. and Canada only) who provide proof of eligibility with order. Single parts cost US \$39.00 net (£23.00) plus postage. Institutional orders may be sent to a bookseller or, in the U.S.A. and Canada direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022; in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 2RU, England. Individuals must order direct from the Press. Second class postage paid at New York, N.Y. and at additional mailing offices. Postmaster: send address changes in the U.S.A. and Canada to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, 32 East 57 Street, New York, N.Y. 10022.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Promotion Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

# Contents Volume 10:4 December 1987

<b>Rao, K. R. &amp; Palmer, J.</b> The anomaly called psi: Recent research and criticism	539
--	-----

<b>Alcock, J. E.</b> Parapsychology: Science of the anomalous or search for the soul?	553
---	-----

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Adamenko, V. G.</b> The evolution of science and "principles of impossibility"	566	<b>Hyman, R.</b> Parapsychology: The science of ostensible anomalies	593
<b>Akers, C.</b> Parapsychology is science, but its findings are inconclusive	566	<b>Josephson, B. D.</b> Skepticism and psi: A personal view	594
<b>Alcock, J. E.</b> Where is the "anomaly" called psi?	568	<b>Krippner, S.</b> Never say never again: Rapprochement may be nearer than you think!	595
<b>Bauslaugh, C.</b> Psi and the unwilling suspension of belief	569	<b>Mackenzie, B.</b> Parapsychology's critics: A link with the past?	597
<b>de Beauregard, O. C.</b> According to "physical irreversibility," the "paranormal" is not de jure suppressed, but is de facto repressed	569	<b>Nadon, R. &amp; Kihlstrom, J. F.</b> Hypnosis, psi, and the psychology of anomalous experience	597
<b>Beloff, J.</b> In what respect is psi anomalous?	570	<b>Navon, D.</b> On rustles, wolf interpretations, and other wild speculations	599
<b>Benassi, V. A.</b> Believers, nonbelievers, and the parapsychology debate	570	<b>Nelson, R. D. &amp; Radin, D. I.</b> When immovable objections meet irresistible evidence: A case of selective reporting	600
<b>Beyerstein, B. L.</b> Neurosciennce and psi-ence	571	<b>Palmer, J.</b> Are the conventional explanations of anomalies adequate?	601
<b>Blackmore, S. J.</b> Parapsychology's choice	572	<b>Parker, A.</b> Psi in search of consensus	602
<b>Braude, S. E.</b> How to dismiss evidence without really trying	573	<b>Pinch, T.</b> Some suggestions from sociology of science to advance the psi debate	603
<b>Broch, H.</b> Struggle for reason	574	<b>Railton, P.</b> Psi: Anomalous correlation or anomalous explanation?	605
<b>Broughton, R. S.</b> Parapsychology on the couch	575	<b>Sanders, J. T.</b> Are there any "communications anomalies"?	607
<b>Bunge, M.</b> Why parapsychology cannot become a science	576	<b>Schmidt, H.</b> Alcock's critique of Schmidt's experiments	609
<b>Child, I. L.</b> Observation versus theory in parapsychology	577	<b>Spanos, N. P. &amp; de Groot, H.</b> Psi: Repeatability, falsifiability, and science	609
<b>Cicchetti, D. V.</b> Differentiating between the statistical and substantive significance of ESP phenomena: Delta, kappa, psi, phi, or it's not all Greek to me	577	<b>Stanford, R. G.</b> The status of parapsychology	610
<b>Dawes, R. M.</b> Random generators, ganzfelds, analysis, and theory	581	<b>Tart, C. T.</b> Is searching for a soul inherently unscientific?	612
<b>Donderi, D. C.</b> Orthodoxy and excommunication in science	582	<b>Tobacyk, J. J.</b> The psi controversy as a crystallization of the conflict between the mechanistic and the transcendental worldviews	613
<b>Dybvig, M.</b> Parapsychology as a search for the soul: Psi anomalies and dualist research programs	583	<b>Truzzi, M.</b> Anomaly versus artifact, or anomalous artifact?	614
<b>Eysenck, H. J.</b> Anomalous phenomena and orthodox science	584	<b>Utts, J.</b> Psi, statistics and society	615
<b>Feder, K. L.</b> Anthropology and psi	585	<b>Vassy, Z.</b> Distance, ESP, and ideology	616
<b>Flew, A.</b> Factual impossibility and concomitant variations	586	<b>Wolins, L.</b> Science and rationality	617
<b>Gardner, M.</b> Evidence of the paranormal: A skeptic's reactions	587	<b>Woodward, W. R.</b> Are scientists materialistic monists?	617
<b>Gergen, M.</b> The case of the undetermined theory	588		
<b>Gilmore, J. B.</b> Axioms in science, classical statistics, and parapsychological research	588	<b>Authors' Responses</b>	
<b>Glymour, C.</b> ESP and the Big Stuff	590	<b>Palmer, J. &amp; Rao, K. R.</b> Where lies the bias?	618
<b>Hansel, C. E. M.</b> Experimental evidence for paranormal phenomena	590	<b>Alcock, J. E.</b> A to-do about dualism or a duel about data?	627
<b>Hövelmann, G. H.</b> "Please wait to be tolerated":			

<b>Macphail, E. M.</b> The comparative psychology of intelligence	645
---	-----

## Open Peer Commentary

<b>Anderson, R. E.</b> Intelligence and human language	657	<b>Bickerton, D.</b> The supremacy of syntax	658
<b>Barlow, H. B.</b> Efficiency, versatility, cognitive maps, and language	657	<b>Bitterman, M. E.</b> Evidence of divergence in vertebrate learning	659
		<b>Borkowski, J. G.</b> Within-species variations in <i>g</i> : The case of <i>Homo sapiens</i>	660

Dewsbury, D. A. Animal intelligence: A construct neither defined nor measured	661	Menzel, E. W., Jr. Is a Darwinian taxonomy of animal learning possible?	673
Elepfandt, A. Comparative cognition: Inadequate approach, precipitate conclusions	661	Menzel, R. Proto-, pre-, and pro-intelligence: Little evidence but a necessary assumption	674
Eysenck, H. J. The several meanings of intelligence	663	Nagoshi, C. T. The epistemology of intelligence: Contextual variables, tautologies, and external referents	675
Fantino, E. Chimps and dolphins: Intellectual bedfellows of the goldfish?	663	Papini, M. R. The quest for divergent mechanisms in vertebrate learning	676
Fetterman, J. G. & Killeen, P. R. Artifactual intelligence	664	Roitblat, H. L. Metacomparative psychology	677
Fischler, I. Cognitive science and comparative intelligence	665	Sherry, D. F. Natural selection and intelligence	678
Goldman-Rakic, P. S. & Preuss, T. M. Wither comparative psychology?	666	Shettleworth, S. J. Intelligence: More than a matter of associations	679
Greenberg, G. Comparative psychology, cognition, and levels	667	Sternberg, R. J. Difficulties in comparing intelligence across species	679
Griffin, D. R. Phylogenetically widespread "facts-of-life"	667	Thomas, R. K. Overcoming contextual variables, negative results, and Macphail's null hypothesis	680
Hodos, W. Animal general intelligence: An idea ahead of its time	668	<b>Editorial Commentary</b>	<b>681</b>
Humphreys, L. G. Psychometric considerations in the evaluation of intraspecies differences in intelligence	668	<b>Author's Response</b>	
Johnston, T. D. Logical and ecological inadequacies in Macphail's account of intelligence and learning	669	Macphail, E. M. Comparing intelligences: Not easy but not impossible	681
Jolly, A. Boiling down intelligence	671	<b>Late Commentaries</b>	
Kalat, J. W. Species differences in intelligence: Which null hypothesis?	671	Delius, J. D. Clever pigeons and another hypothesis	688
Kaplan, S. Associative learning and the cognitive map: Differences in intelligence as expression of a common learning mechanism	672	Güntürkün, O. Brain differences determine different limits of intelligence	689
Kupfermann, I. Bony argument	673	Mackintosh, N. J. From null hypothesis to null dogma	689

## Sperber, D. & Wilson, D. Précis of *Relevance: Communication and Cognition*

697

### Open Peer Commentary

Adler, J. E. Comparisons with Grice	710	Macnamara, J. Logical competence	724
Bach, K. & Harnish, R. M. Relevant questions	711	Millikan, R. G. What Peter thinks when he hears Mary speak	725
Blakemore, D. Linguistic constraints on pragmatic interpretation: A reassessment of linguistic semantics	712	Morgan, J. L. & Green, G. M. On the search for relevance	726
Carston, R. Being explicit	713	Pettit, P. Inference and information	727
Clark, H. H. Relevance to what?	714	Reboul, A. The relevance of <i>Relevance</i> for fiction	729
Cutler, A. The task of the speaker and the task of the hearer	715	Recanati, F. Literalness and other pragmatic principles	729
Davies, M. Relevance and mutual knowledge	716	Russell, S. J. Rationality as an explanation of language?	730
Gerrig, R. J. Relevance theory, mutual knowledge, and accidental irrelevance	717	Seuren, P. A. M. How relevant?	731
Gibbs, R. W., Jr. The relevance of <i>Relevance</i> for psychological theory	718	Smith, C. S. The information needed for inference	733
Haegeman, L. Relevance theory and the scope of the grammar	719	Smith, N. V. On interpreting "interpretive use"	734
Hinkelman, E. Relevance: Computation and coherence	720	Wilks, Y. Relevance must be to someone	735
Kempson, R. Grammars as input systems	721	<b>Editorial Commentary</b>	<b>736</b>
Levinson, S. C. Implicature explicated?	722	<b>Authors' Response</b>	
McCawley, J. D. The multidimensionality of pragmatics	723	Sperber, D. & Wilson, D. Presumptions of relevance	736

### Continuing Commentary

On Sayre, K. M. (1986) Intentionality and information processing: An alternative model for cognitive science. <i>BBS</i> 9:121–166.			755
Bourbon, W. T. A case of different intentions concerning intentionality	755	Puccetti, R. Intentionality in the visual cortex?	758
Fields, C. & Dietrich, E. Intentionality is a red herring	756	Van Gulick, R. Information and the holism of intentional content	759
Pfeifer, K. Causal dispositions + sensory experience = intentionality	757	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		Sayre, K. M. Various senses of "intentional system"	760

<b>On Holender, D. (1986) Semantic activation without conscious identification in dichotic listening, parafoveal vision, and visual masking: A survey and appraisal. BBS 9:1–66</b>			<b>765</b>
<b>Groeger, J. A. On not knowing the meanings of words we can detect: Crucial qualitative differences</b>	765	<b>Wilding, J. M. Semantic effects without awareness: Dichotic listening and dichoptic viewing</b>	767
<b>Kurian, G. Preconscious semantic processing: Why and how?</b>	766	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Segui, J. &amp; Beauvillain, C. Why limit the availability of a prime-word in the study of automatic contextual facilitation?</b>	766	<b>Holender, D. Semantic activation without conscious identification: Can progress be made?</b>	768
<b>On Spanos, N. P. (1986) Hypnotic behavior: A social-psychological interpretation of amnesia, analgesia, and "trance logic." BBS 9:449–502</b>			<b>773</b>
<b>Chertok, L. Hypnotic state: An interminable controversy</b>	773	<b>Spiegel, D. Seeing through social influence: Hypnotic hallucinations are opaque</b>	775
<b>Glicksohn, J. Hypnotic behaviour revisited: A trait-context interaction</b>	774	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Navon, D. A puzzle about hypnosis that grandma may still have</b>	775	<b>Spanos, N. P. Hypnotic behavior: Special process accounts are still not required</b>	776
<b>On Libet, B. (1985) Unconscious cerebral initiative and the role of conscious will in voluntary action. BBS 8:529–566.</b>			<b>781</b>
<b>Deecke, L. The natural explanation for the two components of the readiness potential</b>	781	<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Hoffman, R. E. &amp; Kravitz, R. E. Feedforward action regulation and the experience of will</b>	782	<b>Libet, B. Are the mental experiences of will and self-control significant for the performance of a voluntary act?</b>	783
<b>On Tulving, E. (1984) Précis of <i>Elements of episodic memory</i>. BBS 7:223–268</b>			<b>786</b>
<b>Watkins, M. J. Ecphoria excelsa</b>	787	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		<b>Tulving, E. No eternal truth in CAPS</b>	787
<b>On Vining, D. R. (1986) Social versus reproductive success: The central theoretical problem of human sociobiology. BBS 9:167–216</b>			<b>788</b>
<b>Symons, D. Reproductive success and adaption</b>	788	<b>Author's Response</b>	
		<b>Vining, D. R. Relative fitness is enough</b>	789