

# BBIS

Behavioral & Brain Sciences

An International journal of current research and theory  
with open peer commentary

Volume 35 | Issue 5 | October 2012 | ISSN: 0140-525X

**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Behavioral and Brain Sciences

## Editors

Paul Bloom

Barbara L. Finlay

URL: <http://www.editorialmanager.com/bbs>

## E-mail: [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org)

Behavioral and Brain Sciences  
Journals Department  
Cambridge University Press  
32 Avenue of The Americas  
New York, NY 10013-2473, U.S.A.

## Managing Editor

Gennifer Levey

## Chief Copy Editor

Sumitra Mukerji

## Proofreaders

Sylvia Elvin

Rashidah Ismaili AbuBakr

## Editorial Board

### *Affective Neuroscience*

Stephanie D. Preston/U. of Michigan

### *Atypical Neurodevelopment*

Simon Baron-Cohen/Cambridge U.

### *Behavioral Neurogenetics*

Wim E. Crusio/CNRS UMR

### *Cognition and Artificial Intelligence*

Zenon Pylyshyn/Rutgers U.

### *Cognitive and Decision Sciences*

Nick Chater/University College London

### *Cognitive Development*

Annette Karmiloff-Smith/Birbeck College

### *Cognitive Neuroscience*

Moshe Bar/Harvard Medical School

### *Computational Neuroscience*

Nestor A. Schmajuk/Duke U.

### *Evolution of Brain and Cognition*

Dean Falk/Florida State U.

### *Evolution of Cognition*

Celia Heyes/Oxford U.

### *Experimental Analysis of Behavior*

A. Charles Catania/U. Maryland, Baltimore County

### *Language and Language Disorders*

Max Coltheart/Macquarie U.

### *Linguistics*

Robert A. Freidin/Princeton U.

### *Perception*

Bruce Bridgeman/U. of California, Santa Cruz

### *Philosophy of Science*

Massimo Piattelli-Palmarini/U. of Arizona

### *Primate Cognition*

Laurie R. Santos/Yale U.

### *Social Cognition*

Mahzarin R. Banaji/Harvard U.

### *Social Cognitive Neuroscience*

Rebecca Saxe/MIT

### *Vision, Language and Computation*

Shimon Edelman/Cornell U.

## FOUNDING EDITOR (1978–2001)

Stevan Harnad

**Editorial Policy** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (BBS) is an international journal providing a special service called Open Peer Commentary\* to researchers in any area of psychology, neuroscience, behavioral biology, or cognitive science who wish to solicit, from fellow specialists within and across these BBS disciplines, multiple responses to a particularly significant and controversial piece of work. (See Instructions for Authors and Commentators, inside back cover and also at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst>) The purpose of this service is to contribute to the communication, criticism, stimulation, and particularly the unification of research in the behavioral and brain sciences, from molecular neurobiology to artificial intelligence and the philosophy of mind.

Papers judged by the editors and referees to be appropriate for Commentary are circulated to a large number of commentators selected by the editors, referees, and author to provide substantive criticism, interpretation, elaboration, and pertinent complementary and supplementary material from a full cross-disciplinary perspective. The article, accepted commentaries, and the author's response then appear simultaneously in BBS.

Commentary on BBS articles may be provided by any qualified professional in the behavioral and brain sciences, but much of it is drawn from a large body of BBS Associates who have become formally affiliated with the project (see <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/BBSAssoc>).

Qualified professionals are eligible to become BBS Associates if they have (1) been nominated by a current BBS Associate, (2) refereed for BBS, or (3) had a commentary or article accepted for publication. A special subscription rate is available to Associates. Individuals interested in serving as BBS Associates are asked to view the full instructions for joining at <http://journals.cambridge.org/BBSJournal/Inst/Assoc> and then email [bbsjournal@cambridge.org](mailto:bbsjournal@cambridge.org).

© Cambridge University Press 2012. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, in any form or by any means, electronic, photocopying, or otherwise, without permission in writing from Cambridge University Press. Policies, request forms, and contacts are available at: <http://www.cambridge.org/rights/permissions/permission.htm>.

Permission to copy (for users in the U.S.A.) is available from Copyright Clearance Center, <http://www.copyright.com>, email: [info@copyright.com](mailto:info@copyright.com).

**Subscriptions** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* (ISSN 0140-525X) is published bimonthly in February, April, June, August, October, and December. The subscription price of Volume 35 (2012) for *institutions* is US \$1193.00 for print and online, US \$1005.00 for online only, and US \$1093.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £703.00 for print and online, UK £594.00 for online only, and UK £643.00 for print only elsewhere. The subscription price for *individuals* is US \$346.00 for print and online and US \$321.00 for print only in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £203.00 for print and online and UK £189.20 for print only elsewhere. For *BBS Associates*, with proof of eligibility with order, US \$132.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £83.00 elsewhere. For *students*, with proof of eligibility with order, \$111.00 in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico; and UK £65.00 elsewhere. Subscription price includes surface postage. Single parts cost US \$238.00 (UK £118.00) plus postage. *Institutional orders* may be sent to a bookseller, or, in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico direct to: Cambridge University Press, 32 Avenue of The Americas, New York, NY 10013-2473 email: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.org](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.org); in the U.K. and rest of the world to: Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England, e-mail: [journals\\_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk](mailto:journals_subscriptions@cambridge.cam.ac.uk). *Individuals* must order direct from the Press. You may also subscribe through the Cambridge Journals website, <http://journals.cambridge.org/bbs>.

**Postmaster:** Send address changes in the U.S.A., Canada, and Mexico to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, Journals Dept., 100 Brook Hill Drive, West Nyack, NY 10994-2133, U.S.A. Send address change elsewhere to *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, Cambridge University Press, The Edinburgh Building, Shaftesbury Road, Cambridge CB2 8RU, England.

**Online availability** *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* is part of the Cambridge Journals Online (CJO) service at <http://journals.cambridge.org>.

*Institutional subscribers:* Access to full-text articles online is currently included with the cost of the print subscription. Subscription must be activated; see <http://cambridge.journals.org>.

**Advertising** Inquiries about advertising should be sent to the Journals Advertising Department of the Cambridge or New York Office of Cambridge University Press.

\*Modelled on the "CA Comment" service of the journal *Current Anthropology*.

# Contents Volume 35:5 October 2012

<b>Frost, R.</b> Towards a universal model of reading	263
<b>Open Peer Commentary</b>	
<b>Behme, C.</b> Can evolution provide perfectly optimal solutions for a universal model of reading?	279
<b>Beveridge, M. E. L. &amp; Bak, T. H.</b> Beyond one-way streets: The interaction of phonology, morphology, and culture with orthography	280
<b>Bowers, J. S.</b> Position-invariant letter identification is a key component of any universal model of reading	281
<b>Coltheart, M. &amp; Crain, S.</b> Are there universals of reading? We don't believe so	282
<b>Davis, C. J.</b> Developing a universal model of reading necessitates cracking the orthographic code	283
<b>Deacon, S. H.</b> Bringing development into a universal model of reading	284
<b>Feldman, L. B. &amp; Moscoso del Prado Martín, F.</b> Does a focus on universals represent a new trend in word recognition?	285
<b>Friedmann, N. &amp; Gvion, A.</b> An even more universal model of reading: Various effects of orthography on dyslexias	285
<b>Gomez, P. &amp; Silins, S.</b> Visual word recognition models should also be constrained by knowledge about the visual system	287
<b>Goswami, U.</b> Universals of reading: Developmental evidence for linguistic plausibility	287
<b>Grainger, J. &amp; Hannagan, T.</b> Explaining word recognition, reading, the universe, and beyond: A modest proposal	288
<b>Homer, B. D., Miller, R. &amp; Donnelly, S.</b> Flashing out or fleshing out? A developmental perspective on a universal model of reading	289
<b>Hyönä, J. &amp; Bertram, R.</b> Flexible letter-position coding is unlikely to hold for morphologically rich languages	290
<b>Kim, K., Lee, C. H. &amp; Lee, Y.</b> Consideration of the linguistic characteristics of letters makes the universal model of reading more universal	291
<b>Laubrock, J. &amp; Hohenstein, S.</b> Orthographic consistency and parafoveal preview benefit: A resource-sharing account of language differences in processing of phonological and semantic codes	292
<b>Levy, Y.</b> No reason to expect "reading universals"	293
<b>Liversedge, S. P., Blythe, H. I. &amp; Drieghe, D.</b> Beyond isolated word recognition	293
<b>Martelli, M., Burani, C. &amp; Zoccolotti, P.</b> Visual perceptual limitations on letter position uncertainty in reading	294
<b>McBride-Chang, C., Chen, H.-C., Kasisopa, B., Burnham, D., Reilly, R. &amp; Leppänen, P.</b> What and where is the word?	295
<b>Norris, D. &amp; Kinoshita, S.</b> Orthographic processing is universal; it's what you do with it that's different	296
<b>Pelli, D. G., Chung, S. T. L. &amp; Legge, G. E.</b> Theories of reading should predict reading speed	297
<b>Perea, M. &amp; Carreiras, M.</b> Perceptual uncertainty is a property of the cognitive system	298
<b>Perfetti, C.</b> <i>Thru</i> but not <i>wisht</i> : Language, writing, and universal reading theory	299
<b>Pitchford, N. J., van Heuven, W. J. B., Kelly, A. N., Zhang, T. &amp; Ledgeway, T.</b> Vision, development, and bilingualism are fundamental in the quest for a universal model of visual word recognition and reading	300
<b>Plaut, D. C.</b> Giving theories of reading a sporting chance	301
<b>Rao, C., Soni, S. &amp; Chatterjee Singh, N.</b> The case of the neglected alphasyllabary: Orthographic processing in Devanagari	302
<b>Rastle, K.</b> Rethinking phonological theories of reading	303
<b>Ravid, D.</b> Phono-morpho-orthographic construal: The view from spelling	304
<b>Rueckl, J. G.</b> The limitations of the reverse-engineering approach to cognitive modeling	305
<b>Seidenberg, M. S.</b> Writing systems: Not optimal, but good enough	305
<b>Share, D. L.</b> Frost and fogs, or sunny skies? Orthography, reading, and misplaced optimism	307
<b>Szwed, M., Vinckier, F., Cohen, L. &amp; Dehaene, S.</b> Towards a universal neurobiological architecture for learning to read	308
<b>Whitney, C.</b> The study of orthographic processing has broadened research in visual word recognition	309
<b>Author's Response</b>	
<b>Frost, R.</b> A universal approach to modeling visual word recognition and reading: Not only possible, but also inevitable	310

**Open Peer Commentary**

- Aitken, K. J.** Clinicians learn less and less about more and more until they know nothing about everything; researchers learn more and more about less and less until they know everything about nothing: Discuss 358
- Battaglia, M.** Is behavioral genetics 'too-big-to-know' science? 360
- Burt, S. A.** Twin and family studies are actually more important than ever 361
- Crusio, W. E.** Heritability estimates in behavior genetics: Wasn't that station passed long ago? 361
- Dar-Nimrod, I.** Postgenomics and genetic essentialism 362
- Deutsch, C. K. & McIlvane, W. J.** Non-Mendelian etiologic factors in neuropsychiatric illness: Pleiotropy, epigenetics, and convergence 363
- Dickins, B. J. A.** Is genomics bad for you? 364
- Garzillo, C. & Trautteur, G.** Preventing a paradigm shift: A plea for the computational genome 365
- Glatt, C. E.** Biology trumps statistics in the postgenomic era 366
- Halpern, C. T.** Affirmation of a developmental systems approach to genetics 367
- Homberg, J. R.** Genetic sensitivity to the environment, across lifetime 368
- Lewis, A. J.** A call for an expanded synthesis of developmental and evolutionary paradigms 368
- Lickliter, R.** From gene activity to behavior (and back again) 369
- MacDonald, K. & LaFreniere P. J.** The fate of heritability in the postgenomic era 370
- Michel, G. F.** A developmental science commentary on Charney's "Behavior genetics and postgenomics" 371
- Miller, M. B., DeYoung, C. G. & McGue, M.** Assumptions in studies of heritability and genotype-phenotype association 372
- Molenaar, P. C. M.** Estimating the actual subject-specific genetic correlations in behavior genetics 373
- Müller, C. P., Lenz, B. & Kornhuber, J.** Gene-independent heritability of behavioural traits: Don't we also need to rethink the "environment"? 374
- Overton, W. F. & Lerner, R. M.** Relational developmental systems: A paradigm for developmental science in the postgenomic era 375
- Pléh, C.** The history of the nature/nurture issue 376
- Schanker, B. D.** Epigenetic regulation of brain-derived neurotrophic factor: Implications in neurodevelopment and behavior 377
- Swain, J. E., Perkins, S. C., Dayton, C. J., Finegood, E. D. & Ho, S. S.** Parental brain and socioeconomic epigenetic effects in human development 378
- Teixeira, C. E. C., Carvalho-Filho, N. M. & Silveira, L. C. de L.** Neogenomic events challenge current models of heritability, neuronal plasticity dynamics, and machine learning 379
- Villarroya, O.** A straw man's neogenome 380
- Author's Response**
- Charney, E.** Humans, fruit flies, and automatons 381