

# *THE REVIEW OF POLITICS*

*Caritas and Jefferson's First Inaugural*  
*Matthew S. Holland*

*Alexander Hamilton on Slavery*  
*Michael D. Chan*

*The Madisonian Vision and the  
Political Constitution*  
*George Thomas*

*The Idea of an Overlapping Consensus:  
Rawls and Taylor*  
*Michael G. Barnhart*

*Political and Perfectionist Republicanisms*  
*Paul Weithman*

Book reviewers include—

Alan Gibson on Bailyn on the Founders  
Vincent DeSantis on Gould on the Presidency  
Michael Francis on Kissinger and Stern on Crises  
Karl Walling on Odum on Fixing Intelligence  
Peter Moody on Merelman on Pluralism at Yale

Spring, 2004

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

*Editor*

WALTER NICGORSKI

*Managing Editor*

DENNIS WM MORAN

*Book Review Editor*

PETER R. MOODY, JR.

*Assistant Book Review Editor*

Geoff Bowden

Editorial Intern: Tim Dale

*Associate Editors*

Fred R. Dallmayr

E. A. Goerner

Thomas Werge

Philip Gleason

Alasdair MacIntyre

Catherine Zuckert

*Former Editors*

Waldemar Gurian

M. A. Fitzsimons

Frederick J. Crosson

Thomas Stritch

Donald P. Kommers

*Editorial Advisory Board*

Henry J. Abraham

*University of Virginia*

Charles W. Anderson

*University of Wisconsin–Madison*

Shlomo Avineri

*Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

Jean Bethke Elshtain

*University of Chicago*

James T. Kloppenberg

*Harvard University*

Arend Lijphart

*University of*

*California–San Diego*

Harvey C. Mansfield

*Harvard University*

Wilson Carey McWilliams

*Rutgers University*

Mary Nichols

*Fordham University*

Doris Marie Provine

*Arizona State University*

Bruce M. Russett

*Yale University*

Arlene Saxonhouse

*University of Michigan*

Steven B. Smith

*Yale University*

Kenneth W. Thompson

*University of Virginia*

Glenn Tinder

*University of Massachusetts–*

*Boston*

Jean M. Yarbrough

*Bowdoin College*

Administrative Assistant: Nancy Benjamin

Production Managers: Erin Horvath, Andrea Laffey,

Jonathan T. Morgan, and Katherine J. Mounts

---

THE REVIEW OF POLITICS, without neglecting the analysis of institutions and techniques, is primarily interested in the philosophical and historical approach to politics.

---

# THE REVIEW OF POLITICS

Published Quarterly by the University of Notre Dame, Indiana

Vol. 66

Spring 2004

No. 2

*Matthew S. Holland*

“To Close the Circle of our Felicities”: *Caritas* and  
Jefferson’s First Inaugural . . . . . 181

*Michael D. Chan*

Alexander Hamilton on Slavery . . . . . 207

*George Thomas*

Recovering the Political Constitution:  
The Madisonian Vision . . . . . 233

*Michael G. Barnhart*

An Overlapping Consensus: A Critique of  
Two Approaches . . . . . 257

*Paul Weithman*

Political Republicanism and Perfectionist  
Republicanism . . . . . 285

*Reviews:*

Peter McNamara: THE UNIONIST PARADIGM

Review of David C. Hendrickson’s *Peace Pact: The Lost  
World of the American Founding* . . . . . 313

Alan Gibson: NOVUS ORDO SECLORUM

Review of Bernard Bailyn’s *To Begin the World Anew:  
The Genius and Ambiguities of the American Founders* . . . . . 315

Lee Ward: FROM CONQUEST TO CONSENT

Review of Jan H. Blits’s *The Soul of Athens: Shakespeare’s A  
Midsummer Night’s Dream* . . . . . 317

Vincent P. DeSantis: THE MOST POWERFUL MEN  
IN THE WORLD

Review of Lewis L. Gould’s *The Modern American  
Presidency* . . . . . 320

Jason K. Duncan: AN UNFINISHED PRESIDENCY

Review of Robert Dallek’s *An Unfinished Life:  
John F. Kennedy, 1917-1963* . . . . . 323

Michael Francis: VERBATUM

Review of Henry Kissinger’s *Crisis: The Anatomy of Two  
Major Foreign Policy Crises* and Sheldon M. Stern’s  
*Averting the ‘Final Failure’: John F. Kennedy and the  
Secret Cuban Missile Crisis Meetings* . . . . . 325

Karl Walling: IT IS BROKE	
Review of William E. Odom's <i>Fixing Intelligence: For a More Secure America</i> . . . . .	328
Richard Minear: HOMELAND SECURITY	
Review of Tetsuden Kashima's <i>Judgment Without Trial: Japanese American Imprisonment during World War II</i> and Louis Fisher's <i>Nazi Saboteurs on Trial: A Military Tribunal and American Law</i> . . . . .	330
Augustus B. Cochran, III: REGIONAL CAUSES, NATIONAL CONSEQUENCES	
Review of Earl Black and Merle Black's <i>The Rise of Southern Republicans</i> . . . . .	333
Calvin Townsend: IDOLS OF MODERNITY	
Review of David T. Koyzis's <i>Political Visions and Illusions</i> . . . . .	335
Kevin Hart: AMATEUR PSYCHOLOGY	
Review of Frank M. Turner's <i>John Henry Newman: The Challenge to Evangelical Religion</i> . . . . .	337
Kenneth L. Grasso: FREEDOM THROUGH TRUTH	
Review of Herminó Rico, S.J.'s <i>John Paul II and the Legacy of Dignitatis Humanae</i> . . . . .	339
Stella Gaon: RENOVATING CRITICAL THEORY	
Review of Omid A. Payrow Shabani's <i>Democracy, Power, and Legitimacy: The Critical Theory of Jürgen Habermas</i> . . . . .	342
Roger White: ETHICS AND TERROR	
Review of Ronald Santoni's <i>Sartre on Violence: Curiously Ambivalent</i> . . . . .	345
Peter R. Moody, Jr.: GLORY DAYS	
Review of Richard M. Merelman's <i>Pluralism at Yale: The Culture of Political Science in America</i> . . . . .	347
Esther-Mirjam Sent: HOW NOT TO CRITICIZE ECONOMICS	
Review of Andrew M. Kamarck's <i>Economics as a Social Science: An Approach to Nonautistic Theory</i> . . . . .	350

## CONTRIBUTORS TO THIS ISSUE

**MATTHEW S. HOLLAND** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in Brigham Young University. **MICHAEL D. CHAN**, a graduate of the Claremont Graduate University, is an independent scholar working on a book about Aristotle, Hamilton and the commercial republic. **GEORGE THOMAS** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in the University of Oklahoma. **MICHAEL BARNHART** is Associate Professor of Philosophy in Kingsborough Community College of the City University of New York. **PAUL WEITHMAN** is Professor of Philosophy and Chair of the University of Notre Dame's Department of Philosophy.

**PETER MCNAMARA** is Associate Professor and Graduate Director in the Department of Political Science at Utah State University. **ALAN GIBSON** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in California State University, Chico. **LEE WARD** is Postdoctoral Fellow in Harvard University's Program in Constitutional Government. **VINCENT P. DESANTIS** is Professor Emeritus of History in the University of Notre Dame. **JASON K. DUNCAN** is Assistant Professor of History in Aquinas College, Grand Rapids. **MICHAEL FRANCIS** is Professor of Political Science and Assistant Provost of Campus International Development in the University of Notre Dame. **KARL WALLING** teaches political science in the U.S. Naval War College. **RICHARD H. MINEAR** is Professor and Associate Chair of the History Department in the University of Massachusetts, Amherst. **AUGUSTUS B. COCHRAN III** is Loridans Professor of Political Science in Agnes Scott College and author of *Democracy Heading South* (2001). **CALVIN TOWNSEND** is Instructor of Political Science and Religious Studies in Trinity Western University, Canada. **KEVIN HART** is Professor in Notre Dame's Department of English. **KENNETH L. GRASSO** is Professor of Political Science in

Texas State University–San Marcos. **STELLA GAON** is Assistant Professor of Political Science in St. Mary's University, Halifax, Nova Scotia. **ROGER WHITE** is Associate Professor of Political Science in Loyola University of New Orleans. **PETER R. MOODY, JR.**, is Editor of Book Reviews for *The Review*. **ESTHER-MIRJAM SENT** is Associate Professor of Economics in the University of Notre Dame.

#### INSTRUCTIONS TO CONTRIBUTORS

All manuscripts should be submitted in **DUPLICATE** with an accompanying computer disk of text to Professor Walter Nicgorski, Editor, *The Review of Politics*, Box B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. If the return of the manuscript is desired, a stamped, self-addressed envelope should be enclosed. All typewritten material should be double-spaced, including notes and quotations; photocopies of a good quality are acceptable. *The Review* follows the *Chicago Manual of Style* for standards of citation, punctuation and other editorial considerations. The normal length of manuscripts published is 8,000–11,000 words. Since manuscripts are evaluated anonymously they should not bear the author's name or institutional affiliation. Submissions should be sent with an **ABSTRACT** of 100–150 words. We assume, in accordance with APSA policies, that you have not submitted your essay to another journal. All correspondence regarding book reviews should be sent to Professor Peter R. Moody, Jr. at the above address.

The articles in **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** are indexed in the International Index to Periodicals and the Catholic Periodicals and Literature Index and abstracted in the International Political Science Abstracts, and abstracted and indexed in ABC POL. SCI., HISTORICAL ABSTRACTS, SOCIAL SCIENCES INDEX (also available in the electronic versions), BOOK REVIEW INDEX, INTERNATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES.

**THE REVIEW OF POLITICS** (ISSN 0034–6705) is published quarterly for \$25.00 per year in the United States (institutional \$56.00); foreign individual, \$32.00 (institutional, \$59.00); single copies, \$14.00 (domestic) and \$15.50 (foreign) by The University of Notre Dame, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Periodicals postage paid at Notre Dame, IN and Nappanee, IN. **POSTMASTER:** Send address changes to **THE REVIEW OF POLITICS**, P.O. BOX B, Notre Dame, IN 46556. Visa and MasterCard accepted.

Abstracts, subscription, advertising and submission information can also be found on our World Wide Web Homepage at <http://www.nd.edu/~rop>.